The Debellation of Salem and Bizance

Sir Thomas More

Page and line numbers correspond to *The Complete Works of St. Thomas More* (Yale University Press), volume 10.

A complete concordance to this work can be found at www.thomasmorestudies.org/publications.html#Concordance.

Spelling standardized, punctuation modernized, and glosses added by Mary Gottschalk

©CTMS 2014

Punctuation

The only punctuation marks found in the original printed version of *The Debellation of Salem and Bizance* are the period, comma, question mark, slash, or "virgule" (/), and parentheses. Quotation marks, semicolons, dashes, exclamation points, italics, and suspension points have been added with the goal of making the text more readily understood by present-day readers. Many commas needed to be inserted and many removed in deference to current rules about restrictive and nonrestrictive phrases. Italics are added for titles and, occasionally, for emphasis. As for the suspension points (...), these are substitutes for many of More's slashes. He often used a slash where we would use a semicolon, a dash, or italics; but he also, quite often, used one to indicate whether a certain phrase was meant to be connected more closely with the one preceding it or with the one following it; to call attention to parallel elements in different phrases; or simply to facilitate serious reflection. He also quite often used a slash for dramatic purposes—to indicate, perhaps, a coming sly comment, or some possibly surprising conclusion. The evident thoughtfulness with which More punctuated this book leads one to suspect that he anticipated its being often read aloud, and wanted to make sure the reader got the cadence right. He writes as though he were speaking.

Chapter	page
Preface	3
1	8
2	14
3	17
4	19
5	24
6	30
7	36
8	41
9	49
10	53
11	56
12	62
13	63
14	67
15	86
16	146
17	167
18	184
19	194
20	199
21	221

The Declaration of the Title

The Debellation of Salem and Bizance—sometime two great towns, which, being under the great Turk, were between Easter and Michaelmas last past (this present year of our Lord, 1533) 5 with a marvelous metamorphosis enchanted and turned into two Englishmen by the wonderful inventive wit and witchcraft of Sir John "Some Say," the Pacifier... and so by him conveyed hither in a dialogue, to defend his Division against The Apology of Sir Thomas More, Knight. But now— 10 being thus, between the said Michaelmas and Halloweentide next ensuing, in this debellation vanquished—they be fled hence and vanished, and are become two towns again... with those old names changed, "Salem" into "Jerusalem" and "Bizance" into "Constantinople"... the one in Greece, the other in Syria... where 15 they may see them that will, and win them that can. And if the Pacifier convey them hither again, and ten such other towns with them, embattled in such dialogues: Sir Thomas More hath undertaken to put himself in the adventure alone against them all. But and if he let them tarry still there: he will 20 not utterly forswear it... but he is not much minded as yet, age now so coming on and waxing all unwieldy, to go thither and give the assault to such well-walled towns, without some such lusty company as shall be somewhat likely to leap up a little more lightly. 25

The Preface Sir Thomas More to the Christian Readers

If any man marvel (as I ween some wise men will) that ever I would vouchsafe to bestow any time about making answer to the Pacifier's *Dialogue*, considering his faint and his feeble reasoning: I cannot, in good faith, well excuse myself

1 declaration: explanation 3 debellation: conquest 5 Michaelmas: the feast of Saint Michael the Archangel (September 29) 9 hither: to here 6 *marvelous*: amazing 8, 17 Pacifier: Peacemaker; Appeaser 9 dialogue: i.e., Salem and Bizanze, by Christopher St. German 9 his Division: i.e., A Treatise concerning the Division between the Spiritualty and Temporalty, by St. German // division: discord; dissension 10 apology: apologia; defense 12 hence: away from here 14 *Bizance*: Byzantium 16 may: can // will: wish to 19 put . . . adventure: put himself in the venture; stick out his own neck 20 and if: if // tarry: remain 21 forswear: swear not to do 22 waxing: (he) becoming // unwieldy: infirm; feeble // thither: there 24 *lusty*: vigorous 28 ween: suppose // wise: sensible 29 vouchsafe: bother 29 bestow: spend 30 faint: weak 31 in good faith: in all honesty // excuse: defend

10

15

20

25

30

35

therein. For as I suddenly went in hand therewith and made it in a braid: so when I since considered how little need it was, I marveled mine own self, and repented, too, that I had not regarded the book as it was worthy, and without any one word let it even alone.

Howbeit, good readers, what one thing or twain specially moved me to make answer to it, and how it happed me to fall in hand therewith and to spend and lose a little time about it, to make the matter the more plain unto you: that thing shall I show you.

As soon as mine *Apology* was once come out abroad, anon heard I word that some were very wroth therewith. And yet in my mind had there no man cause, neither preacher nor pacifier, no, nor no heretic neither. For I had but spoken for myself, and for good folk, and for the Catholic faith—without reproach or reproof to any man's person, or willing any man any harm that were willing to amend. And whoso were willing to be naught still, had cause to be wroth with himself, you wot well, and not with me.

But all this would not serve me; for *very* wroth were they with me. Howbeit, their causeless anger did not greatly grieve me. For I was not so far unreasonable as to look for reasonable minds in unreasonable men.

But then heard I shortly that thick and threefold the pens went to work, and answers were a-making, divers, by divers very great cunning men. And of this travail of such great, mountainous hills, I heard much speech made almost every week—so far forth that at last it was told me for truth that unto one little piece one great cunning man had made a long answer of twelve whole sheets of paper, written near together and with a small hand.

But in good faith, I could but laugh at that. For as for that piece, I was very sure that the cunningest man that could come thereto, neither in twelve sheets nor in twelve quires neither, write as near as he could, should never answer it well.

For that piece was the answer that in mine Apology I make, as

```
1 suddenly: on the spur of the moment // made: wrote
                                                            1-2 in a braid: on impulse
                                      6 howbeit: however; but be that as it may
5 let it even alone: just let it alone
6 twain: two
                 10 show: tell
                                  11 anon: within a short time
12 wroth: angry
                     18 naught: wicked
                                            19 wot: know
                                                              22 far: extremely
23 minds: attitudes
                       25 divers: several: various
                                                      26 cunning: learned
26 travail: labor
                     29 made: written
30 near together: with the letters and words compressed
                                                            31 hand: handwriting
```

34 *quires*: sets of four sheets, each sheet yielding four leaves

10

15

20

25

35

you see there, unto certain sermons wherein my *Dialogue* was touched for writing against Tyndale's false translation; and wherein was also defended, against my *Confutation*, Tyndale's wise chapter in which, against my *Dialogue*, he laboreth to prove that the Word was before the Church—and in all his chapter never toucheth the point; and the sermon that defended him walketh as wide as he.

It was told me, as I say, that answer was made to that place; and what shift there was found to the remnant, that could I not hear. But to the first point I heard say that there was devised that whereas I rehearse that the preacher spoke of "poisoned bread," I rehearsed him wrong, for he spoke but of *moldy* bread. And this piece, it was told me that in that new answer it was reasoned at length, and set forth very lustily.

But come the book abroad once, I shall soon abate that courage. For first, since he taketh record that he said but "moldy bread": if I bring witness also that he said "poisoned bread," then can *his* witness stand him in none other stead but for to prove for him that he said both.

Secondly shall I prove that he said "poisoned bread" by such means that men shall see by reason that though the other were possible—yet was it far unlikely.

Finally shall I further prove that though the man had said not "poisoned bread" but only "moldy bread"—yet shall I prove, I say, that as the case stood, that same not "poisoned bread" but "moldy bread" was yet, for all that, a very poisoned word.

Hearing, therefore, that this gay book was made of the twelve sheets of paper, and lacked but overlooking, and that many more were in hand that shortly should come out: like as a husband whose wife were in her travail hearkeneth every handwhile and 30 fain would hear good tidings—so since I so much heard of so sore travail of so many, so cunning, about divers answers, I longed of their long labor to see some good speed, and some of those fair babes born that they travailed on.

And when these great hills had thus travailed long, from the week after Easter till as much before Michaelmas: the good

```
1 Dialogue: the Dialogue concerning Heresies
                                                   2 touched: criticized
2 Tyndale's false translation: i.e., Tyndale's translation of the New Testament
3 Confutation: the Confutation of Tyndale's Answer
                                                        4 wise: brilliant // laboreth: endeavors
5 the Word: the word of God // was before: preexisted; came first, before
6 toucheth: discusses
                         7 walketh as wide: misses the point by as wide a margin
8 answer: i.e., an answer
                             9 shift . . . to the remnant: tactic . . . for dealing with the rest
11 rehearse: relate
                       12 rehearsed: quoted
                                                 14 reasoned: argued
14 lustily: vigorously
                          15 courage: vigor
                                                16 taketh record: has witnesses who claim
                     26 poisoned: poisonous // word: expression
22 far: extremely
                                                                        27 gay: fine
28 overlooking: looking over; proofreading
                                               30 travail: labor
30 hearkeneth every handwhile: is on the alert at every moment
                                                                   31 fain would: is anxious to
31–32 so sore: such hard
                             33 speed: outcome
```

10

15

20

25

30

35

hour came on as God would, that one was brought abed, with sore labor at last delivered of a dead mouse. The mother is yet but green, good soul, and hath need of good keeping; women wot what caudle serveth against her afterthroes.

Now, after that the book was out and came into my hands... and that I saw the manner and the fashion thereof: two things only moved me to write and meddle with it. One, that I saw therein followed and pursued the selfsame shrewd, malicious intent that was purposed in his first book, of *Division*: that is to wit, to make the ordinaries, with fear of slander and obloquy, leave their duties undone and let heretics alone... and over that, with an evil new change of good old laws, labor to put heretics in courage, and thereby decay the faith.

This was indeed the very special point that made me write yet again. And yet found I so little reason in his reasoning that methought it should not need. For this wist I very well: that whosoever had wit, and would confer and compare together the words of his answer with the words of mine *Apology*, should soon perceive that his answers were even very dull and dead.

But then was there another thing that I considered in it—which point unprovided for might soon deceive the reader. For albeit the Pacifier hath in some places put in mine own words where it pleased him, yet hath he for the most part used a pretty craft: to misrehearse my matter and leave my words out. Yea, and besides this, the man hath in some places left out some of his own, and misrehearsed them... to make the reader ween that in the reproving them, I had written wrong.

Now had I supposed to remedy those things, and make him an answer, in three or four leaves, with only pointing the reader to the places, with writing in what leaf he should find the matter. For the words once read—the trouble should show itself.

But while I was thus minded and went thereabout—his answer

```
1 as God would: i.e., as God would have it
                                               3 green: inexperienced / sickly-looking
4 caudle: medicinal drink
                                                 8 shrewd: wicked
                              7 meddle: deal
10 ordinaries: bishops; Church authorities // slander: vilification
                                                                       11 obloquy: ill repute
12 over: besides // evil: bad
                                  13 labor . . . courage: work to embolden heretics
13 decay: cause a decline of; erode
                                       17 need: be necessary // wist: knew
18 wit: good sense // confer: put side by side; juxtapose
                                                              20 even: fully
26 pretty craft: clever tactic // misrehearse: misquote // my matter: what I said
29 ween: think // reproving them: proving them erroneous
33 the places: i.e., the places in the Apology // with: by
33–34 the matter: i.e., the text he was supposedly quoting
```

in his *Dialogue* had found such a way, with walking to and fro, keeping no manner order, and therewith making me seek so long for some one place, that I saw well I should sooner answer him all anew than find out for many things the place that I should seek for.

I made, therefore, in few days, this answer that you see. And some such places yet as I had happed to find, I have remitted the reader unto in mine *Apology...* where for his ready finding, I have numbered him the leaf. And yet have I for some folk done somewhat more, too. For I see well, surely many men are nowadays so delicate in reading, and so loath to labor, that they fare in other books as women fare with their primer... which though they be content to say sometimes the fifteen psalms, and over that, the psalms of the Passion, too, if they find them all fair set out in order at length—yet will they rather leave them

15 all unsaid than turn back to seek them out in other parts of their primer.

And therefore, lest some readers might hap in this book to do the same, some places of the Apology much necessary and not long, that with much seeking I fortuned to find out, to 20 ease the reader's labor and make all open unto him I have put in also into mine answer here. Yea, and yet over this, in the things of most weight I have put into this book his own words too. And so shall you, good readers, without any pain of seeking, have all the matter plain and open before your eyes, that ye shall 25 well see that I love the light no less than this Pacifier would fain walk in the dark. For as the dark is in this matter all his advantage: even so is verily the light in like wise mine. And whereas there are some that commend his answer for the compendious brevity thereof and shortness: I nothing 30 therein envy the man's praise. For like as no man can make a shorter course than he that lacketh both his legs: so can no man make a shorter book than he that lacketh as well words as matter. And yet when, by the places conferred so well together, the feebleness of his answer shall appear: then shall he lose the 35 praise of shortness, too. For when it shall well be seen that he saith nothing to the purpose: then shall every wise man think his

^{1–2} walking to and fro: going back and forth 7 remitted: referred

¹¹ delicate: fastidious; particular 12 fare: do // in: with // primer: prayer book

¹³ content: willing

¹³ the fifteen psalms: the Gradual Psalms, or Songs of Ascents; Psalms 120–134.

¹⁴ psalms of the Passion: the Penitential Psalms (Psalms 6, 32, 38, 51, 102, 130, and 143)

¹⁴ fair: nicely 15 at length: in full 21 open: manifest

²⁶⁻²⁷ would fain walk: is desirous of walking

10

15

20

25

30

35

book too long by altogether. And that ye may well perceive that so it is indeed, let us now leave off the preface and fall unto the matter.

The First Chapter

In his first chapter he toucheth two things. One, that I have deceived his hope, in that I have not in mine *Apology* "devised some convenient ways" to reform and redress the division between the temporalty and the spiritualty; to which point I will answer after, in the touching of his second chapter. The other point is that since he never found any fault in any work of mine (of which for "other lets" he "never read" none!), he marveleth much, therefore, that I make such objection against his... and namely in that work which I would name an "apology," which name signifieth, as he saith, "an answer or a defense."

Now, where this good man declareth what thing an apology is, and saith that it is an answer or a defense... for which cause he the more marveleth that I would in that book write against any treatise of his who never had anything written against any work of mine... as though that therefore my writing against his work would in no wise agree with the name of my book: I might answer him that the touching of his book was but an incident (as I show in the 100th leaf of my said book), and not my principal matter; and therefore of many naughty things I touch there but a few, and such as were in no wise to be dissembled. But now marvel I much more wherefore he should so marvel that I would in the work which I name an answer or a defense write against his work which nothing wrote against mine. For if the thing that I write against his words be an answer or a defense indeed: then though it be not a defense for myself, yet is the cause of all his marvel gone. For in that book that is called mine *Apology*, it is not required by the nature of that name that it be any answer or defense for mine own self at all—but it sufficeth that it be of mine own making an answer or defense for some other.

1 altogether: the whole thing 5 toucheth: criticizes
6 deceived his hope: disappointed him 7 convenient: suitable
7 division: discord; dissension 8 temporalty: laity // spiritualty: clergy
11 for: because of // lets: hindrances; things that got in his way
13 namely: especially 16 declareth: explains 21 agree: be consonant
23 an incident: something incidental 24 naughty: bad; reprehensible
26 dissembled: ignored; passed over // wherefore: why
28–29 his . . . wrote: the work of someone who wrote nothing
35 some other: someone else

10

15

20

25

And as these titles *Calvitium Synesii*, *Moriae Erasmi*, be names convenient for those books of theirs, though the matters in those books signified by those names do not only pertain unto Synesius and Erasmus, or peradventure to neither of them both at all: so may my book well bear the name of an answer or a defense if it be an answer or a defense made by me, though it were all made for other folk, and not one piece thereof made for me.

So is it now that mine *Apology* is an answer and a defense, not only for my former books, wherein the new brethren began to find certain faults... but over that, in the selfsame part wherein I touch the book of *Division*, it is an answer and a defense for many good, worshipful folk against the malicious slander and obloquy so generally set forth, with so many false "some say"s, in that seditious book.

The selfsame piece is also an answer and a defense of the very good old and long-approved laws, both of this realm and of the whole corps of Christendom... which laws this Pacifier in his book of *Division*, to the encouraging of heretics and peril of the Catholic faith, with warm words and cold reasons oppugneth.

And finally, forasmuch as many good, virtuous folk began upon that ill book of *Division* to have a right evil opinion of the maker himself, whom I, for his plain confession of the true faith, took and take yet for a man good and Catholic: therefore I in many places of mine *Apology* lay the fault from the man himself unto some wily shrews that deceived him. And so was mine *Apology* an answer also, and a defense, for the person of the Pacifier himself.

And where he goeth about now for to confute it—there is not in all the remnant of his answer one piece that anything impaireth any point of mine *Apology*. Howbeit, of truth, in this point he goeth most near me. For this answer hath he made in such manner wise that I shall have now much more ado than I then had to make any wise man ween that sever himself meant well. And yet will I not leave it so... but

```
1 Calvitium Synesii: Synesius' (In Praise of) Baldness
```

¹ Moriae Erasmi: Erasmus' (In Praise of) Folly 4 peradventure: perhaps

¹⁰ new: modern 13 worshipful: reputable 14 obloquy: bad-mouthing

¹⁷ long-approved: long-established 20 warm: heated 21 cold reasons: lame arguments

²¹ *oppugneth*: assails 23 *right evil*: very bad 24 *maker*: author

²⁶ from: away from 27 shrews: scoundrels 31 anything: at all; in any way

³³ goeth most near me: comes the closest to getting me; strikes his best blow at me

10

15

20

25

30

35

still will put it from him to some false, wily shrews, though the man do, as he doth, say contrary thereto himself.

And the more the man denieth that thing himself—the more he maketh it likely to be true. For when in the things that so plain appear so naught, he rather taketh the matter all whole upon him than suffereth any part to be laid from him—but if the man have an importunate pride, as by God's grace he hath not, else is it a sure sign and a good token that he is such a good simple soul as soon may be deceived... while we see that his wit serveth him no better but that he would rather appear malicious than unwise.

But now that I have proved him that the name of "apology" may serve very well for every piece of my book—now will I somewhat see how the matters of *his* book agree well with the name thereof. I mean not here his book of *Division* (for of that book the name and the matter agree together well), but I mean of his new book that we be now in hand with, which book, as appeareth in the first front of the first leaf, is named *Salem and Bizance*. And therein, of a hundred and six leaves (for so many be in the book), there are scant fully fifteen that anything agree with the name.

Now, if he will say that the communication between Salem and Bizance is but a by-matter beside, and that all the remnant between their talkings is the very book: then is it worse; for then hath his book never a name at all.

Moreover, if it so were: then should none of the three last chapters bear the names that they do—that is to wit, the 22nd, the 23rd, and the 24th chapter—but likewise as he calleth the beginning of their communication, before his matter, an introduction, so should he have called those three chapters after his matter an extraduction.

And yet I wot not well what I may say thereof. For in the beginning of the book, their first communication is called an introduction; and so is it entitled upon the leaves. And yet in the very end of that introduction, before the first chapter, the man saith himself—in the person of Bizance—that he hath made as yet none introduction at all. What he meaneth by this

¹ false: lying / treacherous 6 suffereth: allows 7 importunate: inopportune; ill-advised 8 token: indication 9 soon may: can easily // while: when 10 wit: mental ability 18 front: recto 20 scant fully: barely a whole 22 communication: conversation 23 a by-matter beside: an insignificant extraneous thing 24 very: actual 31 extraduction: i.e., a lead-out, as an introduction is a lead-in 32 wot not well: don't really know

10

15

20

25

30

can I not tell... but if he mean to make men ween that Salem and Bizance were two Englishmen indeed, and spoke those words themselves without any word of his.

But now—because he showeth himself so cunning in Greek words that upon this word "apology" he findeth the aforesaid fault with mine *Apology*, as though I were overseen and observed not the nature of an apology—let us see how well himself, that in the beginning calleth his book a dialogue, observeth the nature and property of a dialogue.

In the third leaf, when Salem showeth himself desirous to see the Pacifier's answer, Bizance answereth:

I shall cause it to be written hereafter in this dialogue, word for word, as it is come to my hands; and then thou shalt with good will have it. And thou shalt understand that his answer beginneth at the next chapter hereafter ensuing, and continueth to the place where I shall show thee that it endeth.

Consider, good readers, that this introduction he doth not bring in as a rehearsal of a communication had before, but as a communication present. And then let him show me where ever he hath heard in his life any two men, in their talking together, divide their present communication into chapters. This is a point not only so far from the nature of a dialogue, but also from all reason, that a very child would not, I ween, have handled the thing so childishly.

Also, that Bizance telleth Salem that the Pacifier's answer shall be written into their dialogue, that is to wit, into their communication—who saw ever the like? Who saw ever anything written into a communication, and writing planted in among words spoken?

And what reason hath it to tell him whereabout in their communication the Pacifier's words shall begin and where they shall end? As though Salem, talking with Bizance, had not the wit to perceive when Bizance speaketh himself and when he readeth him the Pacifier's words written!

⁴ *cunning*: knowledgeable 6 *overseen*: out of line

¹² cause it to be written: have it written // in: into

¹³ with good will: with cheerful consent (on my part); i.e., be welcome to

¹⁸ rehearsal: relating // communication: conversation

³⁰ what reason hath it: what sense does it make

Also, what a strange, monstrous beast maketh Bizance to Salem the Pacifier's answer, while he maketh as though Salem could neither perceive the head nor the tail but if himself pointed him to them both with a stick!

Then stand they both still thereas they first meet; and that 5 is in the street by likelihood (for there folk most commonly meet, that meet at adventure as they do); and there is all the answer perused—the reading whereof standeth them, at the least, four or five hours, I trow. Howbeit, there I was a little overseen. For they stand not there still about the reading... but 10 there stand they still, both twain, all the while that Bizance is, as you see, into their talking and communication writing it. And that is, but if Bizance write fast, I warrant the work of a week. Now, then, at the week's end, when all the twenty-one chapters are written—Bizance in the twenty-second chapter giveth Salem warning 15 that there is the answer of the Pacifier ended. And this was by the Pacifier full prudently devised. For else would Salem ween that their own talking together in the other three chapters by mouth had been still nothing else but only Bizance's writing... and else would also Salem have thought that his own 20 words of exhortation against the great Turk, and his own rehearsing of that exposition of the Apocalypse, had been still the Pacifier's words against mine Apology.

And finally in the very end, to show that he could write not in only prose, he endeth all the whole book in this wise: with a glorious rhyme—"And thus the glorious Trinity / have in his keeping both thee and me"... and maketh Bizance pray for no more but for them two, after the manner of the good man Grime, a mustard maker in Cambridge that was wont to pray for himself and his wife and his child, and grace to make good mustard, and no more.

And thus you see, good readers, that whereas this man is so cunning

3 but if himself: unless he himself 5 stand . . . still: they both keep standing 5 thereas: right there where 7 at adventure: by chance // all the: the whole 8 perused: gone through; examined // standeth: takes 9 trow: suppose 9 was a little overseen: made a little mistake 11 both twain: both of the two 13 I warrant: I'm sure 15 giveth Salem warning: notifies Salem 17 full: very 21 against: with regard to 22 exposition of the Apocalypse: commentary on the Book of Revelation

25 all the whole: the whole entire

10

15

in Greek words that he can shortly find the fault where I fail in the nature of an apology—himself in his own dialogue so well conserveth the property of a dialogue, and expresseth it so naturally, that it could never be done more naturally, not though he that wrote it were even a very natural indeed.

But where he seemeth to have marveled, when he read mine *Apology*, that I would make objections against his work while he never wrote anything against no book of mine: in good faith, if he had, I would never have been the more hasty, but somewhat, peradventure, the less, lest it might have seemed that some desire of revenging mine own displeasure had excited me thereto; whereas now, no worldly profit growing to me thereby, there is much less cause for any good man to think that I would take the labor to write against a work I wist not whose, but if that it had at the leastwise seemed to myself that there were such things therein as God would give me thank to give men warning to be well wary of them.

And where he saith he will not touch everything "particularly,"
but take another order (all out of order) in answering
thereunto—I cannot let him in his own book to use what

20
order that best may serve his purpose. But me thought, and yet
think, that I myself took a very plain, open way, when the
chapters of his which I would answer to, I perused always
everything in order. Which order while he followeth not with
me—how you shall find it, yourselves shall, good readers, judge upon
the end. But yet in the meanwhile, at the first face, it seemeth
not that with leaping out of order, he meaneth to make you the
matter very plain.

Nor *all*, he saith, he will not answer neither... for "avoiding of tediousness." And of truth if he have (as he seemeth to signify)
any other business—I think it be somewhat tedious to him to answer altogether.

Finally, where he saith that he supposeth to make it appear by his "answers," and by his "considerations" and his "declarations," that mine "objections" are "little to be pondered": first, for 35 his arguments made against the laws whereby the faith is preserved and heresies kept under, those arguments all his

3 conserveth: observes; stays true to // property: nature 4 though: even if 5 natural: born idiot 7 while: when 9 hasty: hotheaded 11 displeasure: offendedness 12 growing: coming 17 thank to give: credit for giving 25–26 upon the end: in the end; ultimately 20 let . . . to use: prevent . . . from using 26 at the first face: at first glance 30 tediousness: irksomeness 30 of . . . have: if he does actually have // signify: indicate 33 supposeth: expects 34 *declarations*: explanations 35 for: as for 37 under: suppressed

10

15

answers will never be able to maintain. And as to the remnant—in good faith, the better that he may make you his innocent mind appear, the gladder a great deal will I be thereof; nor nothing purpose I therein, by this present book, to do further than to make you clearly perceive that how well soever himself here declare his good meaning, myself was not causeless there moved to find fault in his writing.

The Second Chapter

In the second chapter, beginning in the fifth leaf, he bringeth forth the first "consideration," which is that I in the 89th leaf of mine *Apology* "confess that 'murmur and dissension against the clergy" was then already "far 'gone onward in its unhappy journey"... and that afterward, in the 106th leaf of the same book, I bring in "a very dark sentence whereby it appeareth" that I mean "that the displeasure and grudge between them 'is indeed neither so great as [he] maketh it... and yet grown to so great as it is, but even now, of late." But whoso look there in that place shall, I suppose, find it nothing dark... but if it be such a man as list not to understand it.

And where I say there that this division such as it is, which 20 is nothing such as this man maketh it, is not "grown to so great as it is but since that Tyndale's books and Frith's, and Friar Barnes', began to go abroad": therein he would seem to say the contrary, and biddeth me look better upon the matter and I shall find it otherwise. And indeed, with better looking thereon, I 25 find it somewhat otherwise. For I find the time of such increase as I speak of, much shorter than I there assign, and that by a great deal. For it was grown the greater by the occasion of the selfsame book of the Division—though the maker, as himself saith and as I trust too, intended it not of purpose. And therefore 30 where he saith that since I confess that there was division at the time of the making of mine Apology, it appeareth that I have no mind to have it ceased, because that I seek not out the causes and devise the remedies—verily, good readers, I never took and accounted myself for a man meet and able to make a 35

1 *maintain*: support; hold up 2 in good faith: really and truly 3 mind: intention 11 confess: admit; acknowledge 12 unhappy: unfortunate 6 declare: make known 14 dark: obscure // appeareth: is made obvious 15 *grudge*: ill feeling 15 them: i.e., the clergy and the laity 17 even: just // whoso: whoever 18 *nothing*: not at all 19 *list not*: does not want 24 biddeth me: tells me to 23 go abroad: get out there; be circulated 24 *look* . . . *matter*: take a better look at the thing 27 assign: specify 33 mind: wish 35 meet: suitable

10

15

20

25

30

35

reformation of such two great parties as the spiritualty and the temporalty of this whole realm be. And verily, if I knew some such great causes as this man setteth forth for true, which I know for false... and that I then knew the ways to reform them to: I would use other ways toward it than seditious slanderous books. For as I have expressly declared in mine Apology, neither never did I, nor never intend to do, put out abroad in print, under color of reformation, faults that were hateful and odious to hear, either of the one party or of the other... and especially so many at once as, if they were all true, were not all likely to be remedied at once... but the more part for the while remaining little remedied, should but make either party to the other more odious, and both parties more infamous among such others (if any such anywhere be) as would be glad and rejoice to hear much evil spoken of them both.

And this I say although that all were true. And now would I much less use that manner in making rehearsal of those things whereof many be false and untrue, and many others also very trifles... and the very chief things that this Pacifier desireth to have reformed be laws already well made, which he would have made worse. For where they have been by wise men well devised for the repressing of heresies, some by Parliament in this realm, some by the general council of Christendom: those deviseth he so to be changed now as the change which he desireth, though by God's grace he desireth not that it so should, yet out of doubt indeed should turn to the encouraging of heretics and increase of heresies, with the diminishment and decay of the Catholic, Christian faith. Whereupon would not fail to fall, which Almighty God keep from us, his grievous indignation upon us. And therefore God keep us from such reformations!

Now, to lay to me therefore as a great fault that I blame his book in those untrue "some say"s that under color of ceasing division, excite and set forth division, but if myself could cease it, when such books make it—is much like as if he would

8 put out: put in circulation // abroad: out there; at large // color: pretext 12 more part: majority (of them) 17 say: i.e., would say // although: even if 18 manner: mode of procedure; approach // rehearsal: mention 19 untrue: unjust 22 worse: less good 24 the general: an ecumenical 29 decay: falling-off

35

say that there ought no man to blame him that would burn up another man's house, but he that would build it again.

And therefore, with this good reason of his, he putteth me in remembrance of an answer that a man of mine made once much after the same fashion. I had sometime one with me 5 called Cliff, a man as well known as Master Henry Patenson. This Cliff had been many years mad; but age had taken from him the rage, so that he was meetly well waxen harmless among folk. Into Cliff's head came there sometimes in his madness such imaginations against images as these heretics 10 have in their sadness. For like as some of them, which after fled and ran away (and some fell to theft and were caught), pulled down of late upon London Bridge the image of the blessed martyr Saint Thomas: so Cliff upon the same bridge upon a time fell in talking unto an image of our blessed Lady... 15 and after such blasphemies as the devil put then in his mouth (and nowadays bloweth out by the mouths of many heretics, which, seem they never so sad, be yet more mad than he)—he set hand upon the Child in her arm and there broke off the neck. And afterward when honest men, 20 dwellers upon the bridge, came home to my house and there blamed Cliff before me, and asked him wherefore he broke off the Child's neck in our Lady's arm—when Cliff had heard them, he began to look well and earnestly upon them... and like a man of sadness and gravity, he asked them, "Tell me this, 25 among you there: Have you not yet set on his head again?" "No," quoth they, "we cannot." "No?" quoth Cliff. "By the Mass, it is the more shame for you. Why speak you to me of it, then?"

And even thus answereth me now this good man... which where his seditious "some say"s set forth division, and break the Child's neck, reckoneth it a shame for me to find any fault with him for the breaking but if myself could glue it together again.

And therefore where he saith that I should have proved that all the causes that he layeth as causes of division be no causes of division, or else I should have devised the remedies—albeit I

```
2 again: back up
                     3 reason: reasoning
                                              4 man: servant
                            8 meetly: fairly // waxen: become
5 sometime: at one time
10 imaginations: opinions / designs
                                        11, 18, 25 sad(ness): sober-minded(ness)
11 which: who // after: afterward
                                        13, 15 image: statue
                                                                 15 upon a time: one day
15 fell in: started
                     20 honest: honorable; upstanding
                                        24 well and: good and; very
22 blamed: made accusation against
26 set . . . again: put his head back on
                                          27 quoth: said
33 together again: back together
                                     35 layeth: puts forth; alleges
```

have answered him therein already, yet this I say therein further: that I have proved well and clearly that the very chief cause that he layeth is laid very untruly; that is to wit, the mishandling the people to their destruction upon suspicion of heresy. Which cause if it were as true as it is false, were so 5 weighty that it were well worthy to be laid for a matter of division. And while it is not true—yet by such books being blown about in every part of the realm for true, may well mishap to make a division... while the dwellers in every quarter about, by credence given to the book, may at the 10 first face ween that though it be not so thereas they dwell themselves, yet ween, I say, that it were so in all other places. Whereof though they shall by leisure perceive the contrary with search—yet they that ask no further question shall believe it still. And so a rumor once begun and spread abroad is not 15 after soon removed.

Now, as for his other causes of this division: divers I have touched and showed sufficiently that they be not sufficient.

But as for me to peruse his whole book of *Division* through, was no part of my purpose. For if those things that I did 20 touch had seemed to me tolerable, I would in good faith have been loath to have touched them either. In which while with his "considerations" and "declarations" he goeth about now to show that he then meant no harm, I will not therein much hinder him, but be glad rather to further him in the excuse of his meaning; and so did I, as I have said, even in mine *Apology* too. But though I be glad to excuse his own mind in the meaning—yet can I not excuse his unwise following of false, wily counsel in the doing.

The Third Chapter

The third chapter, containing his second consideration, read and consider it whoso list; for I can see nothing in it to be considered by me. For in effect it containeth nothing else but that he would the clergy should, as much as they may,

3 untruly: untruthfully / unjustly 5 were so: would be so 6 well worthy to be: well deserving of being 8 blown about: proclaimed 9 mishap: happen by misfortune 9, 23 while: since 11 thereas: there where 14–15 believe it still: go on believing it 15 abroad: around 21 in good faith: in all sincerity 25 excuse: defending 27 excuse: exculpate 27 mind: mentality 32 list: wants to 34 would . . . should: would have the clergy

10

15

35

avoid all occasion of murmur and grudge... of the temporalty toward them, but if it be pharisaical grudge; yea, and though the deed that they should forbear were good; in which point, because that one point would wax a long work, I will fall in no dispicions. But in as far forth as he giveth any man good counsel and wisheth allthing well, so far forth shall he and I not vary... but and he call me to him, I will sit and pray for it with him.

But yet where he saith, in the end of the chapter, that I "endeavor" myself "very much to oppress all them that will show such things of the spiritualty": indeed, some such as have made such lies, I have told it them. But as for any oppression, let him prove one, and let him call that one twenty. And if he can prove none, as I wot well he cannot—then, good readers, let him be believed thereafter.

Moreover, where he saith that I in my mind prove it an "intolerable default in the people," for misjudging the clergy where I think they have "no cause so to do"; and that therein I "leave them as though all the whole cause and principal default were in [the temporalty]," wherein he saith that my "judgment" 20 is "far deceived": in this point, good reader, he saith somewhat to me if he said true. And surely if he thought that he wrote herein true... then wisdom would he should have written mine own words in. And if he feared that it would be found false: then honesty would that he should have left his 25 own words out. But verily, good readers, and he seek this seven years, he shall in all mine Apology find you no such words of mine. But he shall find far the contrary. For I do there, I wot well, in such places as I show that men were unreasonable that would take this thing or that thing (such 30 as I rehearse of his bringing forth) for any reasonable cause of division—there I say, in those places, that the Pacifier missaith the people, and that the people be much more reasonable than to take it so. And therefore here he belieth me again.

And also let him show you forth any one place in which I say that all the whole fault, or the principal fault either, is in the

^{1, 2} grudge: ill feeling 5 fall in: get into // dispicions: disputations
7 vary: disagree // and: if 10 show: tell / state 11 of: about
15 thereafter: accordingly 17 intolerable: exceedingly great // default: fault; defect
21 far deceived: extremely erroneous
21–22 he . . . me: he would be giving an answer to me that was worth something
22 if he said true: if what he was saying was true
23–24 would . . . written: would have had him write 25 honesty: honor; decency
32 missaith: slanders 34 belieth: tells lies about

10

15

20

25

30

35

temporalty; and then believe him the better in another matter. And in the meanwhile till he bring it forth, or else that you find it yourselves, ye may with reason, at the leastwise in this matter, believe me better than him; and I will never desire you to believe me one day longer. For I have neither laid the principal fault in the one nor the other. And thus hath he made you of me three lies in one chapter.

The Fourth Chapter

In his fourth chapter, beginning in the eighth leaf, he first showeth a diversity between the example that I put in the 94th leaf of mine *Apology*, of a pacifier between a man and his wife, and the thing that I there resemble it unto—that is to wit, his own book, that maketh a like pacification between the temporalty and spiritualty.

But surely the difference that he putteth seemeth to my poor wit greatly to impair his part. For if it be as he saith it is—that, whereas the husband would be loath to hear any evil spoken of his wife and therefore will can such a pacifier no thank that will tell him such tales of her before his neighbors, the temporalty will be glad to hear harm spoken of the spiritualty—then was it so much the worse done to write openly to the temporalty such things of the spiritualty to feed and nourish any such evil delight; or openly to the spiritualty... being (as he said) likewise affectionate... the faults of the temporalty, either. Howbeit, I cannot in good faith say, but if I should belie him, that on that side willingly he greatly passed his bounds; but of oversight, unawares, he hath in some things slandered the temporalty too.

Then showeth he farther wherefore he wrote those things in English, though Jean Gerson wrote them but in Latin; wherein, to say the truth, he layeth a cause sufficient wherefore that Jean Gerson wrote them in Latin. But whether he lay cause sufficient wherefore himself should not rather have let them alone than write them in English, against the counsel of Jean Gerson himself, as I touched in mine *Apology*—

4 desire: ask 7 made you of: told you about 10 diversity: dissimilarity; unlikeness 12 resemble: liken 15 putteth: posits 16 wit: mind // part: side of the argument 18–19 can . . . will: not at all appreciate having such a pacifier tell 19 before: in front of 24 affectionate: disposed 25–26 cannot in good faith: really cannot say 26 willingly: deliberately 27 of oversight: inadvertently 35 touched: mentioned

10

that I leave yourselves, good readers, to consider. For I will not much strive against his excuse. For I greatly shall not need, I think, since all his excuse amounteth to no more but that he meant that some laymen reading the priests' faults in English might put them in remembrance to amend them; especially because he saith even in the same chapter, a little before, that the temporalty so much delighteth to hear of them.

Then goeth he farther in the same chapter... and whereas in his book of the *Division* he would have seemed between the temporalty and the spiritualty to have spoken indifferently and to have told them their faults on both parts equally, here (in the second side of the leaf) he telleth us the cause wherefore he did *not* so, and saith in this wise:

I have spoken of defaults and abuses in the spiritualty more than of defaults in the temporalty... because the spiritualty ought to be 15 the guiders and givers of light by their doctrine and good examples to the temporalty; and if their light be darkness, where shall the temporalty then fetch their light? Truly I wot not where. And I doubt that then they both shall walk still in darkness. And therefore it is that John Chrysostom saith upon Matthew, the twenty-first chapter: that if 20 priesthood be holy and sound, all the Church flourisheth; and if it be corrupt, the faith and virtue of the people fadeth also and vanisheth away. Let this, therefore, as to this point, be the final conclusion for this time: that whosoever proveth defaults to be in the temporalty, he proveth also defaults to reign in the spiritualty; and 25 therefore the defaults in the temporalty will never be voided till the defaults in the spiritualty be first reformed; and therefore have I first spoken of some defaults that be in the spiritualty.

Surely, good readers, I like well these words. For they be very good and they prove very well, and very true it is—nor I never said the contrary, but have in mine *Apology* plainly said the same—that every fault in a spiritual man, though the thing were of itself all one, is yet by the difference of the person far worse and more odious, both to God and man, than it is in a temporal

2 strive: argue // greatly shall not need: won't much need to 5 in remembrance: on notice 6 because: since 6 even . . . chapter: in the very same chapter 10 indifferently: impartially 11 parts: sides // in: on 17–18: See Matthew 6:22–23. 18 doubt: fear 19 walk still: keep walking 20 upon: on the basis of 20-23: This is actually from Pseudo-Chrysostom; see the section on Matthew 21:16 in Saint Thomas Aquinas' Golden Chain. 26 voided: gotten rid of 30 prove: pan out; work out 32 spiritual man: member of the clergy 33 *all one*: entirely the same // by: on account of 20/34—21/1 temporal man: lay person

10

15

35

man. But yet the worse that every private spiritual man's fault is, so much is it the more harm to defame the corps of the spiritualty openly in the face of the temporalty in such manner as the book of *Division* doth—of which I have proved those that are weighty false, and could (if I would now lose time about it, while that I have touched is sufficient) show the substance of all the remnant to have little substance too.

And therefore the words of Saint Chrysostom which he layeth for his book were in part the very cause that made me write against his book. For surely, as Saint Chrysostom saith, if the priesthood be corrupt, the faith and virtue of the people fadeth and vanisheth away... which is without any question very truth, for though Saint Chrysostom had never said it, our Savior saith as much himself: "Ye be," saith he to the clergy, "the salt of the earth, and if the salt wax once fresh and wearish, wherein shall anything be well seasoned? And you be the light of the world. And therefore if the light that is in the world be dark—how dark shall then the darkness be itself?"

But now say I, since that the priesthood being corrupted, it must 20 needs follow that the faith and virtue of the people fadeth and vanisheth away; and upon Christ's words it must follow that if the spiritualty be naught, the temporalty must needs then be worse than they: thereupon I conclude upon the other side, against the Pacifier's book, that since this realm hath (as, 25 God be thanked, indeed it hath) as good and as faithful temporalty, and (though there be a few false brethren in a great multitude of true Catholic men) as hath for the quantity any other country christened—it must needs, I say, follow that the clergy, though it have some such false, naughty brethren too, is not in 30 such sore manner corrupted as the book of *Division* goeth about to make men ween... but as good for their part as the temporalty

And therefore in like wise I say that—upon the selfsame words of Saint Chrysostom and of our Savior Christ—the

1 private: individual 3 openly: publicly 14–19: Matthew 5:13–14.
16 fresh: not salty // wearish: flat; savorless 23 naught: bad
27 false: no-good / sham 28 true: upright / true-blue 30 naughty: evil-minded
31 sore: terrible

10

15

20

35

said book of the *Division*, in defaming the spiritualty, defameth the temporalty much more; which is the thing that, as I said, seemeth me neither honorable nor profitable, in open-printed books, for any Englishman to do; nor, verily, I think the maker would not have done, if he then had thought so far.

But now goeth he farther and saith:

And though Master More cannot deny these faults [I suppose you have heard me deny such as were the chief, and proved them, I ween, untrue], yet all the amendments that he allayeth in his *Apology* is only in punishment of heresies, as is said before; whereunto he specially moveth the ordinaries not to be "slack nor the more remiss" for "fear of evil words and slander of the people." And if they be therefore "the more slack in calling, attaching, and examining, and farther ordering of heretics," he saith, "God will not fail to make fall in their necks the double slander of that from whence they fled." And in another place he moveth the temporalty to join with the spiritualty, "each with other lovingly," to "repress and keep under" those "ungracious folk," by whom he meaneth heretics. Upon which motion I shall somewhat show my mind, as hereafter followeth, in the next chapter.

Here he complaineth again that I devise no remedies, as though the whole provision for allthing lay upon mine hand. I do somewhat for my part when I pray God to give us all the grace—spiritual and temporal both—to keep well and observe such provisions as God hath given good men the grace to make already. For if we keep them well—I ween there are meetly many made. And if we break the old—so will we by likelihood break these as well, that he would have me now devise and study new. And somewhat I do better for my part, while I 30 labor to have the good old provisions kept, than this Pacifier doth for his, while he laboreth to have them broken, and namely those laws that are of the very best, and made for the faith against heresies.

4 open-printed: publicly printed 9 proved: found 10 ween: expect 10 allayeth: cites 12 moveth: urges; exhorts 13 *slander*: opprobrium 14 calling: subpoening // attaching: arresting 15 *ordering*: correcting 16 in their necks: around their necks; on their shoulders 16 the double . . . of: twice as much . . . as // slander: discredit; shame 20 upon: on // motion: proposal // show: speak 19 ungracious: ungodly; wicked 23 allthing: everything 24 *somewhat*: something 25 spiritual and temporal: clerical and lay 30 study: work up // new: from scratch 35 methinketh: it seems to me

But then laboreth he, as methinketh, to make the brethren

35

angry with me... and rehearseth and inculcateth into their ears that I exhort both the spiritualty and the temporalty too, those to whom the matter appertaineth, not to be anything the more slack in repressing of heresies for fear of infamy.

Surely, good readers, whatsoever I wrote in that behalf, I will 5 require every man to have it even here... for written and repeated again. For when we see that the words of his writing which I have in mine Apology rehearsed you, how well soever he meant therein (as I trust he meant but well), have yet that plain, open appearance in them that they were well likely to put such as 10 should see to the repressing of heresies in doubt and fear of infamy, and to be had among the people as folk suspect of mishandling good folk and of cruelty: I reckon it the part of every good man, that any zeal hath to the conservation of the Catholic faith, to encourage them on the other side—to the doing 15 of their duty therein—and not to set the respect of their estimation among men (which yet they shall also much the better conserve among all the people save those few that are naught) before the saving of their souls and keeping the favor of God; namely since the keeping of people from heresies 20 and putting the scabbed heretics out of the clean flock is one of the special things that the Apostle gave the bishop warning of. Let him find out any word of mine wherewith I would any harm to any man that would amend, and then let him lay it to me. And whosoever intendeth 25 never to be good—I am well content that the Pacifier make him not my friend.

The Fifth Chapter

In the fifth chapter he toucheth punishment of heresies, and divideth the matter into four sorts of people; wherein, forasmuch as he nothing saith that toucheth me, I let them pass, all four.

After those four sorts perused—he speaketh of the fifth, which he very earnestly dispraiseth, that are those which take and hold contrary ways... to the true faith indeed. But then, in

1 inculcateth: drums 6 require: invite // even: right 12 had: held 17 estimation: reputation 12 *mishandling*: mistreating 16 respect: consideration 22 special: specific 20-23: See Titus 3:10-11. 21 scabbed: leprous 23 warning of: instruction to do 22 the Apostle: Saint Paul 23 find out: find by searching for 24 would: (show that I) wish 25 lay it to me: level that charge against me 25–26 intendeth . . . be: has no intention of being 31 toucheth me: hurts my case 34 dispraiseth: deprecates

10

15

20

25

30

35

that part, he much misliketh in me both that I call them any evil name, as the "naughty brethren," or "heretic brethren," and also that I call them good names too, as the "blessed brethren" and "evangelical brethren."

And for the first—in calling them any such evil names—he saith I do not as I "would be done to"... as "appeareth," he saith, in mine *Apology*. Surely I suppose he may therein find that I force not what such as they be call me. And I can write no worse word by them, I wot well, than they write many by me.

And, too, as for to give evil names to such folk as are so evil indeed—let him call it "railing" at his pleasure... but howsoever it be in me, I wot well that some others have done so that yet were no railers... except Saint Paul were a railer when he called his churlish keepers "dogs," and when he called the chief priest a "whited wall," which was a spiteful word among them; and except Saint Polycarp railed when he called the heretic Marcion "the devil's eldest son," and except our Savior railed when he called the scribes and the Pharisees "hypocrites."

But then that I call them again good names—this thing, lo, this good man reckoneth a very monstrous manner: to make them both good and bad. But this is a monster, lo, of every man's making. For so call not I them alone, but the whole people too, in such manner of speaking as every man useth when he calleth one self naughty lad both a "shrewd boy" and a "good son"—the one in the proper, simple speech, the other by the figure of irony, or antiphrasis. And by a like manner figure Saint Jerome against the old heretic Vigilantius calleth him sometimes Vigilantius, and sometimes again Dormitantius; and so he calleth that heretic two contrary names, as well as I do these.

And where he cannot tell what I mean by "the new-broached brotherhood"—that am I content to tell him: I mean that they be a barrel of poison, that the devil hath late set abroach, and laboreth by them to poison other men.

And where he cannot bear it that they, being such, should be called by the name of "evangelicals"—I well allow the good

1 misliketh: dislikes 2 evil: bad // as: such as 6 appeareth: is evident 8 force: care 9 by: about 13–16: See Philippians 3:2 and Acts 23:3.

15 spiteful: insulting // word: term 16–17: See Eusebius, Church History 4:14.

17–18: See Matthew 23:13, 23, 25, 27, 29. 20 monstrous: absurd 20 make them: i.e., make them out to be 24 self: same // shrewd: naughty 25, 26 figure: figure of speech 26 antiphrasis: the use of a word to express the opposite of its literal meaning 26–29: See Saint Jerome, Against Vigilantius 1.

32 set abroach: tapped; opened so that the contents can pour out

10

15

20

mind of the good man that he therein showeth himself so to bear to the faith that it grieveth him to hear heretics called by such a good, gracious name. But he must consider that it is now, and some years already past hath been, the name by which they have been as commonly called, in all the countries Catholic, as by their own very name of "heretic." And the occasion thereof grew first of that that themselves took that name "evangelical" arrogantly to themselves, both by the "evangelical liberty" that they pretended, as folk that would live under the Gospel and under no man's law beside, and because they would also believe nothing further than the very Scripture, all which they take now under the name of "the Gospel." For the New Law they take for nothing else but for the declaration and perfection of the Old.

Now, when they had taken this name commonly upon themselves, the Catholics, telling them that they neither lived nor believed according to the Gospel, letted not, yet, to call them by the same name too; and that not to their praise, but to their rebuke and shame. And some turned in writing that name of theirs in scorn, and instead of "evangelicals" wrote them "pseudo-evangelicals."

Now, if this man cannot bear it that I call them as the old folk do—though I would myself leave it for his pleasure, that would make, ye wot well, but a small change. For other folk will call them still yet by what name they list, and neither I nor he can let them.

But to the intent he may be somewhat the less discontent with

me for calling heretics by a good name—he shall understand
that upon such occasion and such manner, it is no new-begun
thing so to do. For a certain sort there were of the heretics
that were the Manichaeans which were first among themselves
called by the name of "Catharistae"—that is to wit, pure and clean—and
afterward the Catholics called them by the same name. And so
doth Saint Augustine also call them in his writing. But yet he
declareth both their false heresies and their secret shameful
living for such that, though he call them by the name of
pure and clean, as we call now these brethren evangelical, yet

35
he meant that they were neither pure nor clean indeed, no more

3 gracious: godly 6 very: true 9 pretended: laid claim to
10 beside: in addition 13 declaration: elucidation
16 letted not: did not forbear 18 turned: altered 21 leave: drop; desist from
21 for his pleasure: to please him 23 what: whatever 24 let: stop
28 sort: subset; variety 33 declareth: shows // false: contemptible

10

15

20

25

30

than these folk in living or belief follow the very Gospel indeed.

But then cometh he forth upon me somewhat solemnly with a very folly and with a solemn lie. For lo, good readers, these are his words, I warrant you wise and true:

And now will I say somewhat further concerning this matter, and that is this. I marvel much how Master More durst, for offense of his conscience, and for dread of the King's displeasure, and of the whole realm, bring up such a slanderous name in this realm, and put it in print, that may lightly touch not only many of the common people, but also of the greatest of the realm—as well spiritual as temporal—if he and others of his affinity list to call any of them one of the "blessed brethren," or of the "good brethren." And in this point it seemeth that he forgot the honor of the realm, which he seemed much to regard when he said he could not think it to the honor of the realm that other realms should ween that the whole clergy of this realm should be "so far fallen into the grudge and indignation of the whole temporalty" as he saith it is spoken to be in the said treatise which he calleth "the book of Division"; for certainly it is more dishonor to the realm to have it noised that the realm is full of heretics than that the temporalty grudgeth against the spiritualty; and so he escheweth and fleeeth the less slander, though it were all true that he saith, and runneth headlong into the greater.

And now will *I* say somewhat further concerning this matter, and that is *this*. I marvel much how this man durst, for offense of his conscience and displeasure of God, bring up such a slanderous lie upon me, and write it in his book, that I should write in mine *Apology* that the realm is full of heretics!

If the case were now no better upon my part, nor no worse upon his, but that in mine *Apology* there could no such saying be found—what rebuke were it yet unto him, if he were a man openly known by name? As now the shame cleaveth not on his cheeks, but he soon shaketh it off, while his name is

3, 4 *solemn(ly)*: ceremonious(ly) 4 a very folly: something really ludicrous 5 warrant: guarantee // wise and true: in all seriousness 6 *somewhat*: something 7 durst: dared 9 bring up: bring into fashion 9, 27 slanderous: disgraceful 10 lightly: well // touch: taint; give a black eye to 12 affinity: affiliation; circle 20 noised: reported; spread around 12 list: choose 17 grudge: ill feeling 21 grudgeth: grumbles; complains // against: about 22 escheweth: avoids 22 less slander: lesser disgrace 27 upon: about 32 rebuke: disgrace 34 while: since not at his book. But, now, since that in mine *Apology* I plainly write the *contrary*—what words will there serve to say to this man the things that he were in this point very well worthy to hear!

Read, good Christian readers, the forty-seventh chapter of mine *Apology*, beginning in the 260th leaf, and there shall you plainly see that I say plain the contrary. For whereas this Pacifier did in his book of *Division*, under the name of "some" others, belie of likelihood some of the spiritualty then, surmitting that they "as of policy" noised "that the realm is full of heretics more than it 10 is indeed," as he now belieth me here, surmising that I do say the same: ye shall there see that I show it to be unlikely that any politic spiritual man would so say for policy... since so to say were for them, for the cause that I there show, very far against good policy. And there I further show that some *heretics* have falsely made that noise, and there I tell for what cause. 15 And afterward, in folio 268, I show that for all their busy bragging, they be yet indeed but a few.

Now, good readers, when I thus have written there, in both the places, so open and so plain, that the realm is *not* full of heretics, nor hath therein but a few, though that few be indeed over many... 20 and grown more also, by negligence in some part, than there hath been in some late years past—how may this man find in his heart, for shame, to write in this wise? And, as it were, with such authority so solemnly check me falsely, for writing that the realm is full, and then excuse his like fault by mine... and 25 yet in the comparison make mine the greater, too? But now is all the craft of that comparison discovered, and the glory of that argument defaced, while you see that his fault is true, and that mine he feigneth and findeth not in my book, but plain and expressly the contrary; and that he spinneth that fine lie without 30 flax, fetching it out of his own body as the spider spinneth her cobweb. And thus is my fault fair wiped away, and his lieth still in his neck, and another now laid unto it.

Now, as this was no little folly—for him to lose his credence with

7 plain the contrary: the exact opposite 1 at: on 9 surmitting: falsely charging 9–10 as of: out of 10, 13, 14 policy: expediency 11 surmising: falsely alleging 22 late: recent // may: can 20 over: too 16 show: state 23 find . . . shame: i.e., be so devoid of shame as to be able to find it in his heart 24 *check*: reprove 25, 28, 32 *fault*: offense 27 *craft*: guile; deceitfulness 28 while: when // true: actual 29 *feigneth*: fabricates 32 fair: completely 33 in his neck: on his shoulders // laid: added 34 folly: idiocy // credence: credibility

10

15

that open lie, that might be so soon and so plainly controlled and reproved—so is his first point also no less folly than that, wherein he marveleth so much that I dare, for my conscience, and for displeasure of my prince, "and of the whole realm," bring up that "slanderous name" in the realm, to call these heretics the "brethren"... considering that it "may lightly touch not only any man of the common people, but also of the greatest of the realm, as well spiritual as temporal," if either myself or any of mine "affinity" "list to call them one of the 'blessed brethren,' or of the 'good brethren.""

This is, forsooth, one the most simple, sought-out folly that ever I yet saw set out with high words so solemnly. For first, as for to call them by the name of the "brethren," is nothing of my bringing up, but a word walking in every man's mouth (which thing I cannot believe but this man well knoweth himself, as strange as he maketh the matter) and begun by the good, blessed brethren themselves—as well appeareth upon their own letters, enough to be showed, at sundry seasons sent between them

Now, touching the great fear and peril that he putteth lest I 20 or some of mine "affinity" may slander any of the greatest of the realm if we list to call any such man one of the "good brethren": the good man may take his rest, I warrant him, and shall not need to break his sleep therefor. For first, as for mine affinity, is not very great. For I have none affinity but as I 25 think himself hath and every other man: that is to wit, either by gossipred or by marriage; except he mean to call all the true Catholics mine affinity, and all the others his own. And then, which way soever he mean, a lewd slanderous word were as likely to happen in one of his affinity as in one of mine. 30 And as for myself, the Pacifier himself is (as his "some say"s show) somewhat more set upon an appetite of slandering than am I, which bear a little more reverence to the great men of the realm, spiritual and temporal both, and more honest mind unto the small also, than wrongfully to defame either 35

1 open: obvious // might: could // soon: easily // controlled: subjected to verification 2 reproved: disproved // no less folly: no less of an idiocy 4 prince: sovereign; king 11 one . . . folly: one of the most ridiculous, far-fetched idiocies 12 high: lofty 13 *is*: i.e., this is 14 bringing up: bringing into fashion // word: usage 14 walking: running; in operation 16 *strange*: uncommon 16 maketh the matter: makes the thing out to be 20 touching: concerning 21 slander: bring into discredit 23 warrant: guarantee 24 therefor: over it 27 gossipred: godparenthood 29 lewd: common // slanderous: derogatory 34–35 honest mind: fair-mindedness 35 wrongfully: inaccurately 29 word: expression 35 defame: denigrate; cast aspersions on

30

great or small by calling either the one or the other any of the blessed, bicched, new-broached brotherhood... except only such as by their own open writings, or by their open words, be plainly proved heretics.

But yet consider well, good readers, what a wise reason this is that 5 he bringeth forth. For what peril is there, of such slander, more by this name of "the good brethren" than by the other name of "heretics"? Is not the old name of "heretics" as slanderous as this new name of "the blessed brethren"? What name can this good man devise us himself to call them by, in which 10 name the same peril of slander may not fall as well as in this? Men may by this wise reason call them by no name at all, for fear lest I or mine affinity might, if we list, call not only any of the people, but also the greatest lords, both spiritual and temporal, by the same name, and so bring them in slander. For the 15 slander is all one whatsoever the name be, when the thing is all one that is meant and signified thereby.

And this man useth himself in this place, therefore, very circumspectly for this point in this chapter, where he speaketh of heretics after his four sorts of folk before. For he calleth them there by no name at all himself, but saith of the fourth sort:

These be the worst sort of people before all others, except only another sort of people which Sir Thomas More in his *Apology* calleth sometimes "desperate wretches," sometimes "stark heretics," and sometimes "the blessed brethren," and sometimes "the naughty brethren" [etc.].

So that this good man himself here, like a true-faithful man, affirmeth them naught... and such and so naught as there be none worse. But name (as it seemeth), for fear of occasion of slander, he durst here none call them himself, but saith they be they whom *I* call thus and thus.

Well, I will make no vow thereof as yet... but I will peradventure at a leisure hereafter, upon better advisement, use the same circumspection and policy that I learn of his example here...

2 bicched: accursed; execrable // new-broached: recently launched
3 open: publicly disseminated / publicly spoken 5, 12 wise reason: brilliant argument
6, 8, etc. slander(ous): disgrace(ful) 12 by this: according to this
14 people: commoners 15 in: into 18 useth: conducts; comports
25 desperate: hopeless // stark: arrant; out-and-out
33 at a leisure: with opportunity for deliberation // advisement: consideration
34 policy: prudence // of: from

10

15

20

30

and when I speak of such manner folk, give them no name at all myself... but for a token, that men may wit whom I mean, I shall say, "those fellows, I mean, that Saint Paul, pardie, calleth heretics so... and that be all they that obstinately hold any self-minded opinion contrary to the doctrine that the common-known Catholic Church teacheth and holdeth for necessary to salvation."

After all this, in the 14th and 15th leaf he asketh me, with a solemn driven process, whether I would not think it good and well done... that all such as have authority to punish heretics should, before they punish them, amend first their own faults. And I think yes, in good faith, that it were very well done; and I would that every man would so do indeed, that either should correct heretic or any malefactor else.

But then again I ask him, that though this were well done—if every man would wax as good as another good man would wish him, and as himself would wish another man to be—yet if there were some that were not so suddenly so well disposed as to amend their own faults so soon as the duty of their office would require of necessity that they should do correction upon the faults of some other folk: should they not yet do it, for all that, in the meanwhile, and other folk to whom it appertained... be bound to assist them therein, though their own faults were not all amended yet?

To this question, lo, he hath in the same place answered me yes, as I have him to the other. And thus, good readers, this good man and I, after our sore conflict in the other matter, have yet in these two points struck hands again and be, God be thanked, meetly well agreed together, God hold it.

The Sixth Chapter

His sixth chapter beginneth in the 16th leaf, wherein he showed that I in mine *Apology* "mistake the letter" of his "said treatise"... and he telleth which words. But he telleth neither in what place of his book his words are nor in what place of my

2 token: hint 3 pardie: by golly 9 solemn...process: dramatic drawn-out discourse 9–10 good and: very 14 any malefactor else: any other evildoer 16 wax: become 28 struck hands: shaken hands 29 hold it: keep it that way 32 showed: stated 32 letter: literal meaning

35

book you may find mine. Those two things he leaveth out, because he would, as he said in the beginning, not follow the order of my chapters, but take that way that should be best to the plain "opening of the truth." But forasmuch as meseemeth that to the plain opening of truth the readier way is to read 5 first both the places, and then this his answer after: ye may therefore, good readers, find both his words and mine in mine Apology—his in the leaf 123; and mine against which he now reasoneth in his answer, ye shall find folio 127. And now, good readers, if you read and consider those two places first, 10 and then compare well the words of mine Apology there with the words of his answer here—it shall suffice for this matter. For there shall you see well that I mistake not the letter of his words. For I say not nay but that his words go only against spiritual men... but his reason runneth out against every kind 15 of men, spiritual and temporal too. And there I show also the reason wherefore and why. And therefore I ween it will appear plainly that I mistake not the letter of his treatise at all... and that his reason runneth out indeed against every kind of men. For there is neither spiritual man nor temporal but he may take 20 harm by abundance. But so is there, as I there say, neither spiritual man nor temporal but he may with abundance do good.

But now the declaration of his mind in this answer mendeth all the matter. For here he declareth that by these words of his "in a manner strangling" he meaneth the diminishing of some fervor. As though a man would say that by "almost killing with a club" he meant the giving of a fillip in the forehead with his little finger!

But since that in this sixth chapter of his, his great, mortal "strangling" 30 is now straggled away, and turned into venial sin, we shall for this matter trouble you no longer... but every man may take holy water and go home to dinner, for service is all done here for today.

The counsel of Saint Bernard (that he there speaketh of) to the pope Eugenius is in good faith, as methinketh, very

9 reasoneth: argues 15 reason: argument 17 wherefore: on account of which 24 declaration: explanation // mind: intent 31/35—32/1: See Saint Bernard of Clairvaux, On Consideration 1:5–6.

10

15

well brought in. And I would advise every spiritual man to follow it, and to take good temporal men to him and let them do all his temporal business for him. This think I good as for mine own mind, but if there be in any part any laws made already to the contrary, by such folk as it cannot become me to control. Howbeit, I suppose that much part of their temporal business *is* done by temporal men indeed.

As for his act of Parliament that he speaketh of, I suppose verily that the clergy would not be against it. And such acts are there already made more than one, good and sufficient... but if he mean to set an addition thereto: that the King's Grace should expressly be bound by the act that if he gave any license of mortising into the Church, it should be void... except such cases as this good man list to limit and give him leave. Since His Highness is now moved by this good man here thereto—His Grace may agree to it when it pleaseth him.

As for the great matter that he maketh of that I never, in all the time that I was conversant in the Court, could perceive any of the noblemen above the number of seven, and yet not now so many, that ever thought it good that any possessions of the 20 Church should without a lawful cause be taken away therefrom: I marvel much what he meaneth, and what subtle conceit he conceiveth in his wise breast, that he so muttereth and mumbleth upon that word... as though such communication, either on the one side or the other, were of such high importance 25 that it were either felony or some heinous misprision, either in telling the tale again or else in keeping it counsel so long. For I wot ne'er, in good faith, in which of the twain this good man findeth the fault, or whether he find any or none. But if he find any—in which of 30 the twain soever he find it, he findeth but his own folly. For now shall you, good readers, see what little insight the man hath in anything that he readeth. First he rehearseth a part of my words written in mine *Apology*, folio 139, where I say that I "never found in all the time while I was conversant in the 35 Court, of all the nobility of this land, above the number of seven that ever I perceived to be of the mind that it were either

```
2 temporal men: laymen
                             3 temporal: secular; worldly
                                                              4, 10-11 but if: unless
                        10 good and: quite
6 control: challenge
                                                13 of: for
13 mortising: mortmain; a transference of land as a perpetual, inalienable possession
14 list: should choose // limit: specify
                                            15 moved: exhorted
17 great matter: big deal // of that: i.e., of the fact that
18, 35 conversant: spending a lot of time
                                           19–20 yet . . . many: now not even that many
22 subtle: abstruse // conceit: notion
                                           24 word: statement
24 communication: talk
                            26 heinous misprision: high crime bordering on felony
27–28 keeping it counsel: keeping it in confidence
                                                       28 wot ne'er: have no idea
30–31 in . . . it: in whichever of the two he finds it
                                                       31 folly: foolishness
32–33 insight . . . in: understanding . . . of
                                              33 rehearseth: quotes
```

10

right or reasonable, or could be to the realm profitable, without lawful cause to take any possessions away from the clergy."

Now upon these words ye shall see what he gathereth, by which ye shall see what wit and what learning the man hath. These are his words, lo:

Since Master More saith that he hath not known above seven (whereof, he saith, three are dead) that were of the mind that it were reasonable without cause to take possessions from the clergy—in which words it is included that he knew seven of that mind, whose opinions it liketh him to rehearse and put in writing and in print also . . .

This man hath a special insight in inclusives and exclusives, when he weeneth that in my words it were included that I knew seven of that mind that it were reasonable to take away possessions 15 from the Church without cause. My words were, you wot well, that I never knew above seven that without lawful cause to take away from the Church thought either right or reasonable, or that it could be to the realm profitable. What include these words, now? Do they include, as he saith, that I say 20 that I knew seven that thought it reasonable? This man is so cunning in his inclusives and exclusives that he discerneth nothing between copulatives and disjunctives. This man, I see well, never learned the rule that almost every boy can: that to the verity of a disjunctive, it sufficeth any one part to be true. 25 Let him now learn it, therefore... and then shall he perceive that my words include no farther but that I say that I knew seven which, among them all, thought some one of those three things—that is to wit, either some of them some one, and some of them some other, or else all seven some one of those three 30 things: that is to wit, either right or reasonable or profitable. without any determination which of the three. And neither includeth those words of mine that I say all seven thought it right, nor that all seven thought it reasonable; no, nor yet that all seven thought it profitable. But it hangeth not upon his 35

5 wit: intelligence 11 liketh: pleases // rehearse: relate 14 included: contained as an implication 21 cunning: well versed 22–23 discerneth nothing: perceives no difference 23 copulatives: conjunctions (such as and) that express addition of the meanings of the words or phrases they connect // disjunctives: conjunctions (such as either and or) that express an alternative or opposition between the meanings of the words or phrases they connect 24 can: knows 34 yet: even 35 hangeth: rests

10

determination, but upon mine own declaration, which of these three things which of those same seven thought or which one of the three they all thought; and never one of those three things is determinately included to any one of the seven. For if I would say that I never knew in all my life any man above the number of seven that had been either at El-Kahirah or at Salem or at Bizance—do these words include that I say that I have known seven that have been at Salem? That am I sure they do not. But I may well stand by those words if I said after, that I have known seven persons that have been all seen at Bizance... but as for El-Kahirah or Salem, I never knew any one that had been at any one of them both.

And in like wise will I well stand by mine other words and verify them with a good excluding of this man's including. For I say, and very truth it is, that I never found any 15 nobleman above the number of seven that without lawful cause to take away possessions from the clergy thought it either right or reasonable or that it could be for the realm profitable. I found not, I say, above seven that thought any one of all these three—is not this true but if I found seven that 20 thought all three? Yes, forsooth, true enough though I never found any one that ever thought any two of the three. And now, therefore, though I never found any nobleman so unrighteous, or so unreasonable, as to think it right or reasonable without lawful cause to take away any possessions from the 25 clergy: yet have I found seven that have thought, if right and reason would bear it, they could tell how that as for worldly policy, some of the possessions taken away might be to the realm profitable. And some one hath thought that it would be peradventure profitable to the realm that the 30 lords had the lands whose ancestors had mortised them. And peradventure he that so thought should not have lost a groat by it. And some other hath thought that it would be more profitable to put it into hospitals of some certain new-fashioned foundation, and thereof neither make priests the 35

1 declaration: clarification 3 never: not a 4 determinately: definitively 6, 11 El-Kahirah: Cairo 20 is...if: is this not true unless 27 bear: support 28 policy: expediency // some...away: the taking away of some of the possessions 30–31 the lords...ancestors: the lands should be had by the lords whose ancestors 31 mortised: given them to the Church as perpetual, inalienable possessions 33 groat: a coin roughly equivalent to a nickel

masters nor no laymen neither, but some good sad, honest, virtuous widows that would be tendable and tender to sick folk, and that should yearly yield an account unto the ordinary. And some others have thought it better to divide and cant it among good poor husbandmen that should till the ground their own 5 hands, and take the land for their labor; with divers other devices more, every man after his own mind. And what harm was there now in any of all their minds, that this good, wise man would have my words seem so heinous upon a sentence that himself includeth in them... and which sentence 10 of his, reason excludeth from them... and in which, as you plainly see proved, this man wot ne'er what he meaneth. And to the intent that he should well know that the matter is nothing fearful, therefore wrote I that three were dead—because he should well wit that there were yet the more part alive. And therefore, 15 if the good man think any great, heinous offense in the matter—let him come to me himself, and I shall bring him to some of them, that shall not make it strange to say again the same to himself; and then he may use it at his pleasure, as his high wisdom shall think convenient. 20

Then saith he farther, in the second side of the 18th leaf, that he cannot tell what cause I would think a cause reasonable to take any possessions from the Church. But yet—since it is implied in my words that some cause lawful and reasonable there may be—he thinketh, he saith, that peradventure if I "were asked the question therein by them that have the authority to do it," I "would show what" I "meant thereby." There shall in good faith need no great, solemn examination of me by men of authority for that matter. For I will not stick to tell it unto himself... but have told it already to him, and every man else that list to read it, a good while ago in my book of the *Supplication of Souls*; and there may this good man go seek it if it please him, and then use it as it like him.

But finally, after his heart somewhat eased, he cometh to himself again and endeth the chapter very well, wishing

35 the clergy the grace that the apostles had... and declaring that

1 sad: settled; firmly established in condition // honest: chaste 2 tendable: attentive 4 cant: apportion 7 devices: ideas // mind: way of thinking 5 husbandmen: farmers 10 sentence: meaning 12 wot ne'er: has no idea 14 because: so that 15 more part: majority; greater number 18 make it strange: be reluctant 20 think convenient: see fit 27 show: state 27–28 need no: be no need of any 28 *solemn*: formal 29–33: See Thomas More, The Four Last Things, The Supplication of Souls, A Dialogue on Conscience (Scepter Publishers, 2002), 109. 29 stick: hesitate 30 list: cares

10

15

20

25

30

he "never desired" them the apostles' poverty nor would them no less than they have... and exhorting "them that have abundance of possessions to be well wary" so to use it as it be not a let of the devotion "that they should have to God" and the charity that they should show to their neighbor. In these three things he saith, as methinketh, very specially well. And I pray you heartily, good readers, every man the rather at my poor request, whatsoever he wrote before, think now that he meant then but thus.

The Seventh Chapter

His seventh chapter beginneth in the 19th leaf, and therein, upon a six leaves... he argueth against a little doubt that I moved upon the beginning of his first chapter of his *Division*; which words of his and mine thereupon begin in mine Apology, folio 101. And the same point is touched again there, folio 106. When you have read there what I say, then may you read here his answer, wherein he declareth the matter, and argueth it by cases of law, much after the manner of a mootable case—full well-favoredly, in good faith—and with long labor proveth at last that it must be taken in such wise as he seeth that among other constructions I construed his mind myself... though I was loath to do so, because that way was the worst for himself. But now he remedieth that with a line or twain wherein he declareth that he meant not to prefer every secular priest before those that are in religion. Wherein I would have trusted him as well upon his word as upon the reason that he layeth for it now—which, save for the trust that I have to his word, I would ween he never thought on when he wrote the Division... but rather ended the clause in such wise as it happed; without any respect, peradventure, to the increase and growing of the sentence in the end.

I was once half in mind here to have kept schools with him yet in this point once again, even all of pleasure... and to have

1-2 would them no less: i.e., wanted them to have any less 3 well wary: very careful 3-4 a let of: a hindrance to 6 saith: speaks 6 pray: beseech 7 the rather: the more 12 upon a: on some 12 *doubt*: problem 13 moved: brought up // upon: concerning 18–19 a mootable case: a hypothetical case debated, as an exercise, by law students 19 full well-favoredly: quite nicely 21 constructions: interpretations 25 religion: i.e., religious orders 26 reason: argument 27 layeth: presents 27 to: regarding 29 clause: passage; section 30 *respect*: consideration 30-31 to . . . sentence: of what the meaning would add up and amount to 32 kept schools: engaged in academic disputations 33 even all of pleasure: all just for fun

10

15

20

25

30

35

brought it yet again in question whether the circumstances of his words were able to prove that he meant otherwise than he now argueth that it must needs be taken. And then if the circumstances so did, whether common usage and acceptance of a word should against the circumstances of the matter have like strength in all other things as it hath in matters of law; and whether the reasons used in the courts in matters of law be of like strength in every other thing as they be when they be made in matters of law... and of like vigor and force in every place abroad as they be in the courts in which they have been long received and accepted for sure and stable grounds.

And whether in this point between him and me—being no matter of the law nor pertaining to the judgment of any court, but to be considered by the whole people in every man's reason at large—the cases of the law of this realm that he bringeth in, which be judged and sure and should serve the one party in the law though the matter were the weight of a thousand pounds, should because we be Englishmen, and our matter written in England and in English words, stand for a sure and an insoluble argument though the laws both civil and canon that are called the common laws of all Christendom besides us were, as peradventure they be in the selfsame cases, fully and wholly to the contrary.

And yet would I besides this a little have assayed so to shake his cases of London and Michaelmas that peradventure to many a man in London between this and Michaelmas should they never have seemed like unto our matter, by that time that I had once declared them the difference.

These points, and haply more too, was I when I read his answer half minded, as I say, to have brought in and disputed with him upon this matter. For I was waxen with the reading of his answer very merry, and waxen, methought, a young man again... and seemed set at a vacation moot with him in some Inn of the Chancery, because of his common intendment, and his proper cases of law.

⁵ against: with regard to 7 reasons: arguments

¹⁰ abroad: out there; i.e., outside of the courts 21 insoluble: irrefutable

²¹ though: even if 25 assayed: tried; attempted 29 declared: showed

³⁴ moot: debate of a hypothetical case, engaged in by law students for practice

³⁵ common intendment: (rule) of common understanding

10

30

35

But then I considered that as I was in the reading of his answer merry—so was himself, I saw well, in the writing weary; and other readers, that were no lawyers, would in the reading wax almost as weary. Then saw I also that when himself had all said, he liked not his own all the best... but after all his pain taken in the answering, seeing that his answer liked him not, he was fain to fall to another way, and telleth me that there needeth none answer to that point at all, because that there is no fruit, he saith, in that objection.

Now, therefore, if the objection be fruitless, and therefore the answer needless, and verily fruitless too: now to reply thereto were labor half lost and more. And therefore, good readers—forasmuch as to the answer made by the manner, no law putteth us further to reply—the matter is at a demurrer in this point, and we at your judgment, wherein ye may use your 15 wisdom and judge it even as you find it. Wherein the best that he can ask is but to be dismissed, and judged that he meant not to prefer the state of chantry priests before the state of religious priests... but meant as he now declareth his mind (which very few folk could before, as I suppose, have guessed)— 20 that the variance between priests and priests, that is to wit, between secular priests and secular priests, is more to be lamented than between other priests and religious, or between religious and religious, because the variance between priests and priests is more marked and more notable than any 25 of the others, because the secular priests go more abroad.

Now, if this exposition of his mind may serve to acquit him now (which I am content it do)—it is all, I promise you, that it may do. For it will never serve him to recover damages. For he can never blame no man that perceived not that before, that is scant credible vet.

But yet, because he so much inculcate th the lack of fruit in many of mine objections, and that they be no matters of no moral virtue—I will not answer him with the like... and say that in many of his pretended causes of division is no fruit at

7 was fain to: was obliged to // fall to another way: take another tactic 8 needeth none: is no need of any 9 fruit: profit; avail 10 fruitless: unavailing; unproductive 12 lost: wasted 13 to . . . manner: as for the making of an answer according to standard protocol 14 demurrer: standstill 16 even: just 18 chantry priests: secular priests specially dedicated to saying Masses for deceased persons 21 variance: dissension; conflict 25 marked: noticed; observed // notable: conspicuous 26 go more abroad: get out more 27 exposition: explanation // mind: intent 28 may: can 32 inculcateth: harps on 35 pretended: claimed; professed

10

15

20

25

30

35

all, nor no moral virtue neither... as in procuring the people to believe untruly that the prelates handle men uncharitably, and for heresies vex them wrongfully, and give occasion that some perish both in body and soul... which if the ordinaries had handled them charitably, had been in both twain saved... and that it will be very hard to find so much as any one spiritual man such as himself deviseth and adviseth that none but such should be suffered to be judge in heresy; and laboring also the good laws of this realm and of all Christendom to be changed, to the ease of heretics, that have been made for the repressing of heresies; with such other things like (that are in his book of *Division*), more than I ever wrote word of yet, in which (as I have often said), forasmuch as I see that he professeth himself to hate and abhor these heresies that these folk now hold whom Saint Paul calleth heretics (I dare not now for him, but when I forget myself, call them by none other name), I would with good will that men should think he meant no hurt. But in the words of the writing, taken after the "common usage and acceptance" of speaking, as he will in this his seventh chapter have me take them, there is neither moral virtue nor fruit, but full unfruitful vice.

But as I said, I will not in defense of mine answer him with faults of his. For mine were never the better though his be naught too. But I say that mine objections in mine Apology be not fruitless, because they defend the truth and make good folk perceive both what harm it were to believe such evil lies, and what damage it were to put away such good laws... and how unreasonable it were in other men's faults to take small things for very heinous and great... or for them that in a fellowship are faulty, not to bear displeasure only to their persons, but to be at division in general with the whole company. And this fruit is there also: that though that book say the contrary, strangers such as are here and can read English, which are not, ye wot well, a few, may yet perceive by plain proofs in mine *Apology* that not only there is no such great general causes of division as the book of Division saith that there is, but also that there is no such great general division

2 untruly: erroneously / unjustly 5 had: would have 6 twain: of the two (i.e., body and soul) 9 laboring: endeavoring (to get) 17 would with good will: wish heartily; would be happy 18 hurt: harm 19 after: according to 21 unfruitful: unavailing 23 faults: errors; mistakes 27 put away: abolish; do away with 28 in: with regard to // faults: misdeeds 29 for them: on account of those 30 faulty: guilty (of certain misdeeds) 31 at division: at odds; in conflict 33 strangers: foreigners

10

through the realm indeed. These fruits are there in many of mine objections against his book in mine *Apology*.

Now, whereas some of mine objections peradventure lay but either lack of learning in him or lack of natural wit: since his name is not at his book, but he speaketh himself unknown, this profit is there in such objections—that without his rebuke or shame, the readers may by those faults perceive that the writer was not of any such special qualities as the book wherein so much evil was contained should be much leaned unto for credence and authority of the man.

Finally, the very self objection whereof he speaketh in that seventh chapter of his in his new book, and saith there is no profit in that objection, and that therefore it needed none answer... but he might grant me all that ever I say therein, and vet none effectual matter were there for all that: thereto I say 15 that look, whoso list, what I say therein, and he shall find that if this man grant all that, he shall grant in himself much more oversight, and much more lack of learning, too, than were requisite in him that would put out books abroad; and therefore his writing the less to be regarded while his person is 20 unknown... whereas if his person were known, he might be peradventure perceived, for all that, for such a special man beside, that his approved wisdom and learning, well known otherwise, might for the estimation of his book more than counterpoise some such oversights as at a time might haply to 25 escape a right wise man that would write by candlelight while he were half asleep.

But then I say further yet... that in that objection was a matter of no little effect. For, taking that he meant as himself saith he did, his words seemed plainly to show that he reckoned the state of chantry priests to be a state of more perfection than the state of religious priests. And therefore the objection contained matter of great effect, and which he much needed to answer and to declare that he meant not so... but that he meant as he now declareth: that division is between secular priests 35 more lamentable than between religious, because the secular priests be more abroad, and thereby their variance more

```
3 whereas: since; given that
                                 3–4 lay . . . in: impute . . . to
                                                                  4, 18 learning: education
4 natural wit: native intelligence
                                     5 at: on // himself unknown: i.e., anonymously
7 faults: errors; mistakes
                             10 credence: credibility
                                                          11 self: same
                                                                            15 effectual: valid
                    18 oversight: inadvertence
                                                   20, 21 person: identity
15 matter: case
23 beside: otherwise // approved: established
                                                    24 counterpoise: balance out; compensate for
25 oversights: slips // haply: A humorous example of such slips that can elude detection!
26 right wise: very intelligent
                                  31 chantry priests: See note for 38/18.
32 religious: i.e., religious-order
                                     35 division: discord
                                                              37 be more abroad: get out more
37 variance: dissension
```

10

15

20

25

30

35

known. Which exposition few men, I ween, would have thought upon before. But now that he saith he meant so—I am very well content therewith, and would that all folk should take it so too; and yet is it, ye wot well, but very winter ware, and an excuse as cold as a key.

The Eighth Chapter

His eighth chapter beginneth in the second side of his 25th leaf, and pretendeth to answer my words written against his, in the nineteenth chapter of mine *Apology*, which beginneth folio 116. And now he saith that I say there that I wot not well what he meaneth in that he saith that the spiritualty call the worldly honor of the Church and of spiritual persons the honor of God. And therefore he saith here that he will, and so doth, declare therein what he there meant thereby.

But here is now the craft. Whereas I did there show what I thought he meant thereby, and therefore made answer to those things that I thought he there meant: now—the matter being changed here, by his new declaration—he bringeth in mine answers made *there*, and confuteth them for insufficient *now*, when his new declaration hath made a change in the matter; as though I had then meant to answer this that I was not then aware that he would now say, nor, I ween, himself neither.

But read first, good readers, the nineteenth chapter of mine *Apology*, beginning folio 116, and there shall you see those words of his sufficiently answered, for the thing that methought he meant. And then, after that done, consider his answer here... in which, for all his holy piece of a sermon, what doth he tell me? He telleth me that honor is "only due to virtue," and that no man may "covet honor without offense... except it be to the honor of God"; and that "inordinate appetite of honor is deadly sin"; and that "if a spiritual man would accept honor by reason of any spiritual dignity," and that "God were thereby dishonored," then that honor were "not to be called honor but dishonor"—and that "yet some laymen say" that spiritual men "call it an honor to God."

1 *exposition*: explanation 2 upon: of 4 excuse: defense 4 winter ware: off-season (i.e., low-quality) produce 5 cold: nonviable 8 pretendeth: claims 10–11 I wot not well: I don't really know; I'm not sure 11 spiritualty: clergy 12 spiritual persons: members of the clergy 14 declare: explain 15 craft: trick (he plays) // show: say 18, 20 declaration: explanation 29 offense: sin 30 *appetite*: desire 31 deadly: mortal 31 *spiritual man*: member of the clergy

10

15

20

35

All this whole tale, for all this holy sermon, is yet to the matter, in maintenance of his former words which he would here seem to defend, utterly told in vain. For first, in all this tale he telleth us not well what he calleth worldly honor which he saith the spiritualty calleth the honor of God, and which was the thing that I said I wist ne'er what honor he meant. For where he would seem to declare it—there is his declaration both very bare and yet against him, too. For in the second side of the 26th leaf, he dribbleth in a word of spiritual dignity... and thus he saith:

Then I mean further, that if any spiritual man would accept a worldly honor by reason of any spiritual dignity, and God were thereby dishonored, as it may be by many circumstances, as if for such worldly honor charity be in any manner broken or denied, justice delayed, any of the seven sacraments not duly administered—or the people not diligently and plainly instructed—that then it is not to be called honor to God, but rather dishonor; and that yet, some laymen say, they call it an honor to God. And surely the truth is that many laymen say that for the maintenance of such worldly honor, spiritual men both religious and secular be negligent sometimes in such things as be before rehearsed, and that yet they call such worldly honor the honor of God.

Here he hath told us that if any spiritual man would "accept" a "worldly" honor "by reason of any spiritual dignity," whereby God were dishonored, that honor were not honor. But yet he telleth us not what manner of "worldly" honor it is that he meaneth to be accepted "by reason of a spiritual dignity"... nor yet what manner thing such worldly honor is; nor, touching that spiritual dignity, he telleth not whether he mean a desire in any man to attain any spiritual dignity for some kind of worldly honor he thinketh should follow thereon, or else some worldly honor by reason of any spiritual dignity that the man hath already.

I let pass his cold and unsavory told tale of charity "denied," and justice "delayed," and some of the seven sacraments "not duly administered," for "maintenance" of such "worldly" honor as some

2 in maintenance: for the supporting 4 telleth us not well: doesn't really tell us 6 wist ne'er: had no idea 8 bare: poor; flimsy 9 dribbleth: shoots in (as though it were an arrow), in such a way that it falls wide of the mark 13 as if: such as if 14 broken: violated; sinned against 20 negligent: remiss 21 rehearsed: mentioned 28 touching: regarding 34 cold: unpersuasive // unsavory: bland // told tale: itemized account

35

spiritual men, both secular and religious, by reason of spiritual dignities "accept," as "some laymen" say. A poor tale and a cold, by my faith, to be told for a cause of a heinous universal division. For this were an endless division, if every such fault of some should upon every "some say" be laid for a cause of division against the general body.

And yet besides all this, I say that his first words are nothing maintained with all this matter. For his first words spoke of a consent and agreement wherein secular priests and religious, for all the variance between themselves for other things, yet agree together about the maintenance of that worldly honor that they call the honor of God. And here he speaketh but of another matter: that is to wit, that for the maintenance of worldly honor spiritual men both religious and secular be negligent sometimes, and in some manner break or deny charity, delay justice, and do not duly administer some of the seven sacraments, nor diligently and plainly instruct the people.

All *this* tale, as you see, toucheth the private faults of *some*: such as for the maintenance of that worldly honor which they call

God's honor thus misuse themselves. But this tale is nothing sib to his other tale that he told and I touched before. For that spoke of such agreement all in one—that is to wit, a holding together which signifieth a maintaining each of other against other men—in maintenance of that worldly honor that they call the honor of God, in like wise as for matters of their own they be one against another among themselves.

And thus you see plainly, good readers, that this manner of maintaining of his former words is a clean going from them,

and a leaving of them unmaintained... and (because he cometh upon me before, in another place, with cases of law) were in the law a very plain departure, and should in any of the King's courts, if I demurred upon it, utterly mar all his matter.

And so it appeareth that some other "some" have said this unto him since, to gloss his first words with. And yet I marvel

³ heinous: grievous 8 nothing . . . matter: not at all upheld by all this stuff
10 variance . . . for: disagreement . . . about 11, 13, etc. maintenance: upholding
15 negligent: remiss // break: sin against 21 misuse: misconduct 22 sib: similar
22 touched: discussed 30 clean going: complete departure
34 demurred upon it: entered an objection // mar all his matter: destroy his whole case
36 gloss: put a spin on

10

15

that he could think their saying worth the rehearsing again. For who can believe that any spiritual man would be so mad as to call worldly honor used to God's dishonor the honor of God! I can scant believe that any layman would so tell him; at the leastwise not with that addition that he now putteth new thereto.

But, now, if it so be that, on the other side, all spiritual men would with one voice together call the honor of God that worldly honor that worldly folk do to the Church and unto spiritual persons for the devotion that good laymen bear to God and unto spiritual persons for God's sake, by reason of their Holy Orders and honorable rooms that they bear in Christ's church; though some of them, as this man saith, sometimes do not their duty therein, but leave some part of their duties toward God's honor undone therefor: yet, for the devotion of the temporal persons that for God's honor do it, they may all well call it God's honor indeed. And therefore is this good man in that point fully answered, as solemn a matter as he made thereof.

But now, concerning his former words—of the agreement 20 of all spiritual folk together in the maintenance of their worldly honor, for all their private displeasures and dissensions in other things among themselves—with which he cometh in after here again, and referreth him to the "common opinion of much part of the people both spiritual and 25 temporal": whether laymen so say or not, I say that though all men so said, yet is no man at division with them therefor. For there is no cause wherefore any man should. For it is none unreasonable thing that since those things which this man speaketh of—that is to wit, those spiritual dignities to which he 30 saith such worldly honor appertaineth—are lawfully their own, each of them should in all lawful ways, and such as are by no law prohibited, help and assist other to keep them, though there be for private matters of their own, variance and suit between them. And this may they with better conscience do 35 each for other than each of them for themself. For in this,

1 rehearsing: relating 8 with one voice: unanimously
12 honorable rooms: prestigious positions // bear: hold
15 therefor: i.e., on account of those honors 16 temporal: lay
17 well: rightly 18 solemn: dramatic 19 matter: thing 26 though: even if
27 at division: at odds // therefor: on that account
32–33 each of them should . . . other: they should . . . each other
32 lawful: legitimate 34 variance: discord // suit: litigation
36 each for other: for each other

10

15

20

25

30

that they do for other, is there not the sin of ambition that this man here speaketh of. And this is the part not only of spiritual men, religious and secular both, but of every good temporal man too; and not only to do so for them, but every man also for other. And therefore what reason had those same "some" that so told this man (if there were any some such indeed) to take this thing for any cause of division? Or why did not he so rather tell them than put their fond tale in his book?

But then one pretty piece he hath of two parts, by which he weeneth that the spiritualty can in no wise escape but that they must needs be betrapped in the one. For when he hath said that the people say that spiritual men be sometimes negligent in keeping or granting charity, or in speedy doing of justice or in duly administering some of the seven sacraments, or in plain and diligent instructing of the people—then with a proper piece of two parts thus he concludeth the matter:

And if it be not so as the people say: then are the spiritual rulers bound to help the people out of that judgment, or else they be not without offense themselves. And on the other side, if it be as the people say: then are spiritual men bound to reform it.

As for this two-handed sword, some young, lusty friar would boldly beat off with a two-handed staff, and tell this man again that if "the people," as he putteth for the one part, said in such things not true: then seeth he not, nor no man else neither. what the spiritual rulers could do to put them out of that judgment but tell them, "Nolite iudicare et non iudicabimini"; and so will that side of the sword do this man little service. And then on the other side, if the people in these things say true, as it is well likely they do: then true it is that the spiritual men be bound to reform it. But then is it as true again that the thing being but such as this man rehearseth—that is to wit, negligence but in some, in doing of some part of their duty, and that also but sometimes—is no

1 *ambition*: inordinate seeking of distinction 8 fond: idiotic 10 pretty: ingenious 12 the one: either the one or the other 17 *proper*: fine 20 offense: fault

²² two-handed: very large, and two-edged // lusty: vigorous 23 beat off: i.e., beat it off 24 again: in reply

^{27:} Luke 6:37 ("Judge not, and you will not be judged").

10

35

cause of division to set the whole temporalty against them all; and that side of the sword the friar would with this end of his staff beat hard unto this man's own head.

Now goeth this man farther, folio 27, and showeth that mine answer to his words which you read in the nineteenth chapter of mine *Apology* be "very dark," by the reason that I use therein so often this word "some say," which is, he saith, done after a railing fashion. But as you know well, good readers, I have taken that word "some say" of his book, in which I read it so often... that it falleth sometimes into my pen ere I be aware.

And as for the railing fashion, if I durst be bold to tell so sad a man a merry tale, I would tell him of the friar that, as he was preaching in the country, spied a poor wife of the parish whispering with her pewfellow; and he, falling angry therewith, cried out unto her aloud, "Hold thy babble, I bid thee, thou 15 wife in the red hood!" Which when the housewife heard, she waxed as angry again... and suddenly she started up and cried out unto the friar again, that all the church rang thereon: "Marry, sir, I beshrew his heart that babbleth most, of us both! For I do but whisper a word with my neighbor here, and thou hast babbled there 20 all this hour!" And surely, good readers, save for letting of the word of God in this good man's sermon—I durst well in the same word, "some say," beshrew him, and beshrew him again, that most hath railed therewith, of this good man or me. For read my words there when ye will, and you shall 25 find that I with that word do but in a manner play with him. But by Saint Mary, he, how well soever he meant, his words with his many "some say"s bring good men in slander and obloguy of the people, and peradventure in peril, too, with untrue, surmised tales of mishandling folk for heresy... 30 and all colored under "some say"s to make the lies seem somewhat likely. Such shrewd "some say"s, lo, be no merry sporting, but be sad and earnest rude railings indeed.

Then he toucheth mine answer made in the said chapter of mine *Apology*, and doubly confuteth it—that I say that he hath heard some laymen say the contrary. For first he saith he

4 showeth: says 6 dark: obscure 7, 23, 26 word: expression 3 unto: on 9 of: from 12, 33 sad: serious 12 merry tale: funny story 17 waxed . . . again: got as angry in return // started: jumped 17-18 cried . . . again: shouted back to the friar 18 that . . . thereon: so loudly that the whole church reverberated with the sound thereof 18 marry: indeed 19. 23 beshrew: accurse 21 all this: this whole 21–22 *letting* . . . *God*: i.e., the insertions of Scripture 22 durst well: would well dare 22 in the: with regard to the 28, 29 in: into 28–29 slander and obloquy of: discredit and ill repute with 30 surmised: trumped-up 32 likely: plausible // shrewd: devious // sporting: poking of fun 34 toucheth: brings up

never heard layman say to him the contrary... but that *all* the spiritual men, religious and secular, hold together in the maintenance of the worldly honor that they call the honor of God, and of the richesse of spiritual men.

Now, you wot well I speak, in the said nineteenth chapter, that of
the spiritualty such as are fallen from the faith unto heresy
hold not at all with that honor that I thought he there had
meant—that is to wit, with building and garnishing of
churches—but be both against that and tithes, and offerings,
and obits and trentals, and purgatory and Mass and all.

And I had went, in good faith, that of so great a thing, and so
much spoken of, it had happed him to hear some laymen
speak; but he saith nay. Well, we can no farther, then, but stand
unto his word, and take an oath of his honesty therein; and yet I
ween, as honest as he is, whatsoever he be, his own honest

15
friend... will be loath to swear with him therein.

But then saith he farther, that though it were so—that would not yet answer his saying. It would not, to say the sooth, in very deed, taking his word as I ween he meant it. But taking his word to the worst (as he taketh always mine) and yet but even 20 as he wrote it (but if it be printed false), it is a confutation to it. For if those spiritual persons, both religious and seculars, that are fallen from the faith to heresies hold not with the remnant—then, pardie, though they were fewer than they be, it is not all true that he saith: that in the maintenance of such 25 honor they hold together all. And yet, as I have already showed you, it would not help his part of a penny though they did every one—seculars and religious, Catholics and heretics too. And therefore can he not say but he is in this point answered, even to the very full. 30

Then, in the 28th and 29th leaf, he subtly findeth a fault that I say that there are some such of the spiritualty so fallen unto heresies that it is pity that ever they were thereof; because, he saith, we should not despair of them... but they may repent and amend. And also though they do never amend—yet I 35 should not say so. For men may not say by the devil that "it is

```
4 richesse: wealthiness
                           7 hold: accord
                                              8 garnishing: adorning
10 obits: annual memorial Masses
10 trentals: sets of thirty Masses said for the soul of a deceased person
11 had went: would have thought
                                      13 can no farther: can do nothing more
                                                                    18 his saying: what he said
13–14 stand unto: go by
                             14, 15 honest(y): upstanding(ness)
18 to say the sooth: to tell the truth
                                       19, 20 word: statement
20 to the worst: in the worst possible way // even: exactly
21 false: wrong
                    23 hold not: do not side
                                                24 remnant: rest // pardie: by golly
24, 35 though: even if
27 help...penny: give his side of the argument a penny's worth of help // though: if
31 subtly: cunningly // findeth a fault: finds fault with the fact 33 thereof: i.e., of the clergy
36 so: that // by: about
```

10

15

20

25

pity that ever he was created," because God's justice is showed on him. We will in this matter keep no long schools. But this every man knoweth: that whoso use a common word spoken among the people is reckoned so to mean therein as the common people mean that use it. And therefore, since the people that so speaketh meaneth not to speak against amendment, but against the present wretched state that the man standeth in at the time: that word may by God's grace be borne meetly well enough. And as touching the devil, though men may not grudge against God's just punishment—yet peradventure a man might say without peril of damnation that it was pity that he so misused himself; as in them that are for their heinous offenses put unto painful death, though we say they were served as they well deserved, yet we let not to say it was pity that they guided themselves no better. And Saint Chrysostom pitieth also the devil. And our Savior himself pitied Jerusalem, and for the pity wept also thereon, for the punishment that should fall thereon; and yet was it the just punishment of God.

And though the parties afterward may amend and do good again: yet for the time *till* they amend—yes, and after, too—we may pity that they were in such case as to hurt them whom they have already remediless destroyed, by their false doctrine dead in the damnable heresies that they learned of them, and lie therefore buried in hell. And therefore the thing that I may not absolutely pity: yet in some respects I may.

Finally, he saith that I should not call any heretics desperate wretches. This is a sore point, I assure you: to call a wretch such as he showeth himself to be—to call him desperate whose living showeth no manner hope of amendment. Saint Cyprian,

I see well, was sore overseen, which in the seventh epistle of his first book, for less things than these are, calleth some folk desperate. And yet was Saint Polycarp farther overseen, which calleth Marcion the first-begotten son of the devil. This man hath here, as he weeneth, found out proper fantasies, wherein I had liefer leave him in the liking than lose much time in answering of such blunt subtle trifles.

```
2 keep no long schools: engage in no long academic disputations
8 that word: that statement (i.e., that it is a pity that those heretics were ever ordained)
9 as touching: as for; as regards
                                    10 grudge: protest
                                                           12 misused: wrongly comported
                                           15 guided: conducted
                                                                     16-19: Luke 19:41-44.
13 offenses: crimes
                        14 let: forbear
23 remediless: irremediably
23-24 by . . . dead: i.e., those who on account of their false teaching have died
                27, 29 desperate: hopeless
                                               28 sore point: bad trait
                         30-33: See Saint Cyprian, "To Epictetus and to the Congregation of
30 living: way of life
Assurae, concerning Fortunatianus, Formerly Their Bishop," 5.
                                                                    31 sore: terribly
                                31 which: who
31, 33 overseen: out of line
                                                   32 less: lesser
33–35: See Eusebius, Church History 4:14.
35–36 found . . . fantasies: come up with excellent ideas
                                                             36 had liefer: would rather
37 lose: waste // blunt: pointless // subtle: pedantic
```

But to the matter, good readers, concerning the former words of his *Division*, albeit that I have here more than fully confuted this chapter of his, for any defense that he hath for his said former words, whereabout is all our matter: read yet the eighteenth chapter of mine *Apology*, wherein you shall see divers other like words of his; and apply me mine answer there to those other words of his which he defendeth here; and ye shall see that he shall have more work than enough to defend them well, and to make them serve him to purpose.

10

5

The Ninth Chapter

His ninth chapter beginneth in the 30th leaf. And his former words which he therewith defendeth, and mine answer also thereto, ye shall see in the nineteenth chapter of mine Apology, folio 119. Which when you have, good readers, there once read 15 over... then forthwith, while it is fresh in remembrance... return again unto this, the ninth chapter of his Dialogue... and then judge whether it anything touch the point or not. For all this chapter is spent in preaching of restitution, full well and full truly, forsooth... and which in my poor mind I very well 20 allow... and would have allowed in like wise his first book very well, if there had been no worse words in it than such. But now the matter standeth all in this: that this man maketh there as though the spiritualty were very busy to procure men—and to "induce the people"—"to give money to trentals, to found 25 chantries and obits, and to obtain pardons, and to go upon pilgrimages," leaving their debts unpaid, and restitution unmade, which things should be done first; and that this is the manner of the "multitude" of the spiritualty. In this standeth the question. And therefore is now the point, not whether debts 30 be first to be paid, and satisfaction of wrongs first to be made, before all these other things, wherein this man saith here surely full well; but whether (as he would have it seem by his book of Division) that the multitude of the spiritualty (that is to wit, either all save a few, or at the leastwise far the most 35 part) do solicit and labor lay people to the contrary manner:

6 divers: several // like words: similar statements // me: i.e., for me
19 of: about 19, 20 full: quite 20 truly: correctly 21 allow(ed): commend(ed)
22 worse: less good 24 procure: entice; get
26 chantries: chapels endowed for the daily singing of Masses for certain souls
26 pardons: indulgences 35–36 far the most part: the vast majority
36 labor: urge; try to push

15

20

25

30

35

that is to wit, to do those other things *rather* than to pay their debts or make restitution of their wrongs. This is, I say, the point. And of this point, wherein all the matter standeth, this man, in this ninth chapter of his, speaketh not one word. And therefore in this thing standeth mine answer made in the said twentieth chapter of mine *Apology* clean and clear untouched, as every man may perceive that readeth it. And therefore where, in the second side of his 32nd leaf, this man saith thus—

And to the intent I would have this matter the better looked upon, I would here advertise Sir Thomas More, not by way of argument, but for clearness of conscience, to consider whether is the more charitable way first to make restitution and pay debts, and relieve extreme poverty, and then to do the other, if he have to do both; or else to do the first and let the other pass . . .

—for this his good advertisement I very heartily thank him... and answer him as himself would wish I should: that surely methinketh as he doth, that the more charitable way of the twain were that that himself here moveth.

But then, lo, by and by, he giveth me another good lesson, wherewith he would I should amend mine own fault that he would it should seem I had in mine *Apology* made against him. For then, lo, thus goeth he further forth:

And if he think that this way that I move be the more charitable way, that then he help it forward, rather than the other... and then not to blame any man that maketh that motion, as though he were against trentals, obits, and such other. For he is not against them directly... but only intendeth to have them changed into a more charitable order. For though prayers be right expedient and healthful to the soul—yet they serve not in all cases as to discharge debts or restitutions, where there is enough to pay them with; no more than there can be found any one salve that can heal all manner of sores.

I neither have done, that I wot of, nor willingly intend to do, blame him for any part of this charitable motion... but think his motion right good, and that the fruit thereof, if it be followed, will be more yet than himself saith he mindeth. For

6 clean and clear: completely and absolutely // untouched: unimpugned 10, 15 *advertise(ment)*: admonish(ment) 13 have: i.e., has the means 18, 23 *move(th)*: propose(s) 19 by and by: right away 20 fault: transgression 21 would it should seem: would have it seem (that) 24 forward: go forward 25, 34 blame: rebuke; chide 27 directly: per se; as such 27 only intendeth: is only endeavoring 28 right expedient: very advantageous 31 all manner: every kind 33 *willingly*: deliberately 34, 35 motion: proposal 35 fruit: benefit; profit 36 mindeth: has in mind; is aiming at

he saith, as you see, that he mindeth but to change obits and trentals and those other things into "a more charitable order" that is to wit, into paying of debts and recompensing of wrongs, in them that have not of their own besides; and in them that have, then to pay the debts and recompense wrongs 5 first and do the other after. But methinketh there will come yet a further profit of this order, too. For whereas here we speak but of him that payeth his debt and recompenseth his wrongs—of which folk many a man is able well to do the other when both those twain be done—there is the other sort of men also, 10 besides, to whom those wrongs are done, and those debts owing, of which sort there be many that if their wrongs were once recompensed them, and their debts paid them, were able and would do those other things also themselves, which now, for lack, be not able; and so should there of likelihood be the 15 self things that bring (as his first book saith) richesse into the Church, by this good order increased. And therefore not only have I no cause to blame this good man for the motion of this good "charitable" order... but also no more have the multitude of the priests, which might of likelihood win as much by 20 this way as by the other, and more, except the multitude of priests would, for the readiness to take it where it is already, move them that have it to do these other things first and leave their debts unpaid and their wrongs unrecompensed—which that the multitude of priests do, I never heard yet any honest layman 25 that would for very shame say. For I think it were hard to meet with a priest that were so wretched but that if he were asked in that point his advice and counsel, he would in so plain a point, though it were but for very shame, well and plainly counsel the truth. And if percase there were some found so shameless 30 that they would give counsel contrary—yet am I very sure they should be far the fewer part... and not, as this good man's first book saith, the more part and the "multitude." And therefore, since this order that this good man here moveth is so good and so charitable—I never blamed him for the motion. 35

4 have not: i.e., do not have means 10, 12 sort: group; set 16 self: very same // richesse: wealth 19, 21, 25 multitude: majority 20 which . . . win: who could probably get 21 except: unless 22 move: exhort 25 honest: honorable 26 that . . . say: not consider an utterly shameful thing to say 26 were: would be 27 meet with: encounter; come across // that were: who was 29 well and: good and; quite 30 percase: by chance

But though this motion in this book be good—I might well,

10

15

20

25

30

35

and so I did, blame his other book... not for this motion, but for another matter, that is because it labored under pretext of an untrue report to bring the spiritualty in slander and obloquy among the temporalty by making men ween that of this charitable order which he now moveth, the multitude of the spiritualty induced men to the contrary.

This is, lo, the thing that I blamed. And therefore, like as this good man saith that one plaster cannot heal all sores—so surely this same salve of this good, charitable motion cannot serve this good, charitable man to salve and heal well this uncharitable sore.

In this motion, of this charitable order, this good man waxeth so warm that of a good zeal he falleth in remembrance of the soul (which our Lord pardon) of the most noble prince of very famous memory King Henry VII, father to the most excellent prince our sovereign lord the king that now is; wherein, after mention made of obits and chantries letting the due examination requisite for restitution, suddenly thus he saith:

Howbeit, the right noble prince of blessed memory King Henry VII, father of our sovereign lord the king that now is, willed restitutions to be made. But how his will was performed I cannot tell. Howbeit, whatsoever was done therein, I suppose his good intent sufficeth to him.

What if this good man cannot tell? By likelihood there is nothing owing to him thereof. For if there were—then were it likely that he could tell. For he could tell then that all the will were not performed. I have heard, I wot well, that the king our sovereign lord delivered great substance into the executors' hands to fulfill the will with. Which how they have bestowed, this good man may, if he have the authority, call them to the reckoning. And if he neither have authority to call for the account nor have nothing owing to him neither—the matter then toucheth not him so near, nor so specially pertaineth unto him, that he should greatly need to give all the

1 blame: find fault with 2 that: which // labored: endeavored 3 report: rumor 3–4 in slander and obloquy: into discredit and ill repute 8 plaster: medicinal application bandaged on 8, 11 sore(s): wound(s) 13 waxeth so warm: gets so heated // in: into 14, 16, 20 prince: monarch 16–17 the king that now is: the current king 17 letting: obstructing 25 what: i.e., so what

world warning thus, that himself is not made of counsel how the King's will is performed.

But here will this good man say that I do but mock him; wherein
I will not greatly stick with him. But surely, for my poor wit,
methinketh it somewhat more civility, in some such points as
this is, a little merrily to mock him than with odious earnest
arguments seriously to press upon him. Which I would
also be very loath to do for charging of mine own conscience.
And therefore in all things that methink are of great weight,
though I touch his words, I accuse not his own mind and
intent. For in good faith, I have of the man good trust that he
meaneth no worse, but would allthing were well himself; but
evermore my mind giveth me that some wily shrews abuse the
good man's simplicity.

The Tenth Chapter

His tenth chapter beginneth in the 33rd leaf, wherein he toucheth certain words of mine written in the twenty-seventh chapter of mine *Apology*, that beginneth folio 162, wherein he varieth not much with me, saving in that I say that if the prelates of the Church would withdraw from their worldly countenance, as is 20 keeping of honest laymen in their service, and keeping of a good, worshipful table, and would bestow their plate and the most part of all their movables at once upon poor folk, and yearly after, the most of their yearly revenues too—of which mind I said I durst warrant well that some prelates be, if that would, 25 as I say there, amend all these grudges—that I durst be bold to warrant as well also that if the prelates so did, "the selfsame folk that now grudge and call them proud for their countenance would then find as great a grudge, and call them hypocrites for, their alms, and would say that they spend 30 upon naughty beggars the good that was wont to keep good yeomen, and that thereby they both enfeeble and also dishonor

Upon these words of mine this good man maketh me, forsooth,

```
1 warning: notification
                           4 stick: argue // wit: mind
                                                           6 merrily: jocularly; jovially
8 charging: (fear of) burdening
                                10, 17 touch(eth): criticize(s)
                                                                   12 worse: harm
13 shrews: scoundrels
                          18 varieth: disagrees
                                                   19 saving: except
20 withdraw from: cut back on // countenance: bearing
21 honest: honorable; upstanding
                                     22 worshipful: respectable // plate: gold and silver
23 movables: portable possessions
                                     25 durst warrant well: well dared guarantee
26 grudges: resentments
                            26–27 be bold: venture
                                                       28 grudge: grumble
29 a grudge: an offense
                            31naughty: worthless // good: money
```

10

15

20

25

30

35

a full goodly sermon, in the 35th leaf of his book... where he beginneth it with these words "I cannot see." And verily, if he had there left and gone no further, it had been well enough. For as for the thing that he speaketh of, it appeareth by his words he cannot see very well indeed.

Because Christ commandeth in the Gospel that we shall not judge... and that Saint Paul saith also, "Who art thou that judgest another man's servant?"... and again biddeth us that we "judge not before the time"—all which places are understood of judging certain and determinate persons to do evil in the things that we see them do, where the things be but indifferent of themselves and may be done not evilly only but well also—this good man therefore layeth these texts to touch me for judging that some folk whom I neither assign by name nor as yet know not who they be will do evil hereafter by misjudging other men.

I ween verily that Saint Paul himself, at the time when he forbade us to judge before the time, did even then judge that some would after that misjudge, and judge before the time, too.

And albeit that our Savior saith that whoso call his brother "fool" is guilty to the fire—yet he meant not of him that would say that there were some fools abroad in the world. For if he so meant—then would there not ten fires be pain enough for him that wrote these words in the Scripture: "There are of fools an infinite number."

And because this good man useth sometimes this figure of examination, "I would wit of Master More this and that," I would now wit this one thing of this good man. Such faults as he findeth with the spiritualty, written in his book of *Division*— whether did he then judge that some of the spiritualty would fall in them anymore after, or not? If he judged that all their fantasies toward those faults were already past before, and that none of them would never do more so: then had he little cause to write all that work upon them.

And on the other side, if he judged that some of them would

¹ *full goodly*: quite sizable 3 there left: there left off; left it at that 4 appeareth by his words: his words make it evident that 6-9: Luke 6:37; Romans 14:4; 1 Corinthians 4:5. 10 determinate: specific 11 *indifferent*: neutral 13 layeth: cites // touch: criticize 20-21: Matthew 5:22. 14 assign: specify 18 even: right 21 guilty: liable // meant not of: did not have in mind 22 abroad: out there 24-25: Ecclesiastes 1:15. 31 fantasies: inclinations 34 *all that*: that whole // *upon*: about 35 side: hand

10

30

35

afterward do some such things again, either but if he gave them warning or else though he did—as I dare say, whatsoever himself say, in some of those things he did—then, since the time in which he judged in his mind, and made himself thereof sure, that some of them would do some such evil things afterward as were at the time of the same judgment of his mind not common, himself fell, as you see, by his own argument, in the danger of that prohibition that himself bringeth in, by which Saint Paul forbiddeth, and saith, "Nolite ante tempus iudicare" ("Judge you not before the time").

Now, if he say that I tell whom I mean, though not by name, yet by a sign and a token, in that I say even "the same" will then call them hypocrites for their alms that now call them proud for their worldly countenance: he must consider that I neither tell nor can tell who be they; nor, though I say "the 15 same," I say not yet "all the same." And therefore I no more misjudge any man determinately and in certain than he that would say thus, as many men say indeed: "Even they that go now full fresh in their guarded hose and their gay golden, riven shirts, and in their silken sleeves, that naught have to 20 bear it out but gaming, will once, I warrant you, fall from gaming to stealing, and start straight out of silk into hemp." Thus saith and thus judgeth, ye wot well, many a man—and yet meaneth not that it shall so mishap them all, but that some shall amend and do better... and that yet his word will be 25 verified in many; and so doth it prove indeed; and he that so saith before is far enough from the danger of all those texts which this good man preacheth to me.

But then he saith further, that he trusteth that those prelates whom I say I durst warrant to be of such mind "will not defer their good purpose for no such suspicion that haply will never come, nor yet for no such uncharitable words though they were spoken indeed." And thereupon he descendeth to the making of acts of Parliament.

If those prelates that I mean of reckoned themselves very sure that

4–5 made . . . sure: assured himself thereof 8, 27 danger: jurisdiction 12 even: exactly 17 determinately: specifically // in certain: in particular 18 even they: those very ones 19 full fresh: all decked out // guarded: trimmed // gay: showy 20 riven: ornamentally slashed 21 bear it out: support it 21, 22 gaming: gambling 21 once: one day 22 start: suddenly go // hemp: i.e., a noose 25 word: statement 33–34 descendeth to: goes into 35 mean of: have in mind

10

15

20

25

30

all the wit and the learning that is in the world, or within this realm either, were either in their own heads or in this good man's and mine—which, peradventure, for mine own mind, could agree well with this good man in this point, and advise those prelates that I speak of to follow their own mind therein, and out of hand even so to do—then have I little doubt but that they would even so do indeed. But some of them have ofter been, as I suppose, than once where they have heard both wise and good folk too—and peradventure yet should hear again if it were, as this man would have it, spoken of in the plain, open Parliament—that would not fail to dissuade it, and lay no little causes why.

But I will not at this time with this good man enter in this matter into serious, earnest arguments. But I shall show him a good merry cause wherefore that though I be of his mind therein, yet I dare not advise them thereto. The cause is that I see them have so great desire and fervent concupiscence toward it that I am afeard to counsel them follow it, because of the Scripture that saith, "Post concupiscentias tuas ne eas" ("After thy concupiscences go thou not").

I will make no longer tale upon this matter. For if you read my twenty-seventh chapter, in which my words are that we now dispute upon, I trust you shall not think them so very far out of the way but that they may be written without offense of Christ's Gospel well enough.

And also, concerning this word "proud worldly countenance," whereof we speak here—vouchsafe, good readers, to read my thirtieth chapter of mine *Apology*, which beginneth in the leaf 174.

The Eleventh Chapter

His eleventh chapter beginneth in the 36th leaf... wherein first he showeth that I rehearse right and construe amiss this word of his "And therefore."

You shall find my words, good readers, upon these whole

```
1 wit: intelligence
                      3 for mine own mind: as I see it
                                                           5 mind: inclination
6 out of hand: then and there
                                 6, 7 even so (to) do: (to) do just that
                                                                          8 ofter: more often
9 wise: sensible
                    15 merry: humorous
                                             19-20: Sirach 18:30.
                                                                        21 tale: discourse
24 offense: violation
                         26 word: term
                                            27 vouchsafe . . . to: be so good . . . as to; please
32 showeth: claims // rehearse right: quote correctly // amiss: incorrectly
32 word: phrase
                     34 upon: regarding
```

10

30

words that he rehearseth here, in the thirty-fourth and thirty-fifth chapters of mine *Apology*; of which the one beginneth folio 183, and the other beginneth folio 184.

Here this man declareth that the words of his book, which here also he well and truly rehearseth, do not import that himself saith the thing which I by those words (and among others, by this word "therefore") affirm there that he saith, as of himself; but he saith that the words prove plainly that he saith it but only of the report of much other folk's thinking, and not as of his own saving.

Surely neither now nor in any place of mine Apology, I neither have done nor intend to charge this man that his mind and purpose was such in his intent as the great likelihood of his words would give men occasion to think. But, on the other side, that the words have given me good occasion 15 and sufficient to say as I there have said... whoso read the said two chapters of mine *Apology* shall by the whole circumstance of the matter very well, I suppose, perceive. And you shall, over that, if after those two chapters read, you return to his own declaration here in his eleventh chapter, well perceive 20 also that to cover slyly that oversight of his (for surely I think it was none other), he leaveth out properly in one place this word "therefore" whereupon a good piece of all the matter hangeth. For in the end of the 26th leaf, lo, thus he handleth wilily the matter: 25

And in that he saith that I say plainly those words myself... he saith plainly against the letter of the said treatise... which is that "they have punished many persons, which *much people* have judged them to do upon will"; and not that I said so myself.

Now, good readers, in *this* rehearsal of his own words, he rehearseth his own words wrong. For here he leaveth out, as I told you, the word that maketh the matter. Which he rehearsed himself in the whole context before. For his words were not that "they have punished many persons, which much people have judged

```
1 words: expressions
                         4 declareth: explains
                                                   5 well and truly: quite accurately
5, 31 rehearseth: quotes
                            5 import: imply
                                                 9 much: many
12 charge this man: make against this man the charge
                                                          13 mind: thinking
13 likelihood: indication
                             19 over: besides
                                                  20 declaration: explanation
                      22 none other: nothing else // properly: specifically
21 oversight: slip
23 piece: amount // all the matter: the whole issue // hangeth: depends
27 letter: literal meaning
                             29 upon will: arbitrarily; just because they wanted to
33 context: section
```

10

15

20

25

30

35

them to do upon will," but that "therefore they have punished many persons, which much people have judged them to do upon will," etc. Now, when he saith *himself* that they have punished many "therefore," that is to wit, for the same cause; and hath before also showed a cause of his own divination too, and hath used the same word "therefore" in the same fashion before; and this word "therefore," which signifieth "for the same cause," hath here in his last clause no necessary place to the complement of the sentence following: it appeareth that he saith therein two things—both that they therefore (that is to say, for the same cause next before spoken of, the cause that himself there imagineth) have punished many... and also that (as he saith it so) much people judged the same.

And this shall you the more clearly mark if you turn these words "And therefore they have punished many, which much people," etc., into these words (whereof the sentence is all one): "And for that cause they have punished many, which much people," etc.

And therefore—that is to say, for that cause which I before told you (that is to wit, that you should not perceive this point)—this man in his last rehearsal, as you have heard, bringing the thing to the trial, left his "therefore" out. But read my said two chapters... and then as for the sentence of his open words, I trust you shall believe me. As for the secret meaning of his mind, I pray you believe him. For so that you believe not the shrewd words of his book, I would, too, choose you should believe well of the good man himself.

Now, where he saith in the 37th leaf that he thinketh I change his matter because I would be loath to have it "reported that much people take it so"—verily, I change not his matter. But truth it is that I *am* loath to have that thing so reported about. For truly the report abroad is naught although it were not untrue.

And whereas for the farther maintenance of his matter, he saith that if I make "search therein to know the truth," I shall

8 place to the complement: role in the completing
10 next: immediately
16, 23 sentence: meaning
21 rehearsal: quoting
22 trial: examination
25 so: provided // shrewd: wicked
29, 31, 34 matter: text
32 naught: bad
32 although: even
34 maintenance: support

"find" that "much people" take it so—that many which have been punished for heresy, the spiritualty have done it of no love, but of will, for such evil mind as in the book is there imagined of them—he hath of likelihood himself made search to find it so. For as for me, though I go not about to search 5 that point of purpose—yet I have talked with many one in this meanwhile, and yet, I thank God, it is not my fortune to find out that same "much people" that take it so. And if there were much people that so did, it were their own fault; wherein I cannot devise what the spiritualty might do to change them, 10 but only pray God to amend them. And as for me, if there were much people that so took it, as I trust in God verily there is not—I would, as my duty were, be surely very sorry for them; but in this cause of truth, truly I would not flatter them. For though that sort of people were never so much indeed—yet is 15 the truth in that point so clear against them that if their minds were such, it were both great shame for them to say it and also great sin to think it.

And surely that their saying is false and naught in his own secret judgment... you may see, good readers, by this: that he laboreth so sore to put it from himself and would be so loath to have it taken for his own. And therefore, while himself thought their saying so false, he should not have told it after them. Nor now should he not send me to search and seek them, but to save his own honesty—lest men might think 25 he feigned—he should seek out and bring forth some of those shrewd sayers himself.

Another thing this man toucheth in the same chapter, concerning that second sort of people whom I say, in some places of mine *Apology*, that this man calleth politiques. And 30 here he declareth that he doth not so... and proveth it by like words spoken of a good man's mouth by a hypocrite, of whom a man may say, "This man useth himself as he were a virtuous man"... and yet call him not virtuous. And so might this man say that they spoke heresies "as of policy," and yet call 35 them not politic.

3 of will: at their pleasure // mind: intent 4 imagined: supposed 7 yet: as yet; so far 4 of likelihood: probably 6 of: on // many one: i.e., many a one 14 truth: (preserving) orthodoxy 15 much: many 19, 23 saying: assertion 19 naught: wicked 21 laboreth so sore: tries so hard // put: displace 22 while: when 25 honesty: honor / good name 26 feigned: fibbed; made this up 27 *shrewd savers*: bad-mouthers 28 toucheth: criticizes 32 spoken of: spoken by 32 by: about 33 useth himself as: acts as if 35 policy: prudence; i.e., self-protection

But here must he now consider that whoso speak such words in such fashion by a hypocrite saith it in his dispraise and in detestation of such hypocrisy... and therefore he that so saith showeth that by such words he taketh not that hypocrite for virtuous. And therefore read, good readers, this man's whole 5 process of his three sorts of people together, which you shall find in the twenty-first chapter of mine Apology, folio 123... and then if you find his words of their speaking such heresies "as of policy" in like manner spoken by him in dispraise of heretics as he putteth here his example of those words spoken by a 10 good man in dispraise of hypocrites... and not spoken by a way of giving them by that word "as of policy" a colorable excuse for defense of sowing their heresy: then am I content that every man take it that I misreport him shamefully. And else, I trust, look in all the places in which I speak thereof, and 15 you shall soon judge that upon his words used to such purpose as he there useth them, I may well use the words of "his politiques" in such wise as I use it.

And as for the tinker and the tiler, that he speaketh of in the end of the chapter, and saith, "God forbid but that they were 20 dismissed and went home about their business, if they can by any reasonable and true allegeance so order themselves that it may appear that they ought to be dismissed of justice": therein hold I well with him and God-forbid else too... for else might they lose between them, the one the price of his 25 trowel, and the other of his clouted kettle. But look, good readers, in mine Apology, the forty-eighth chapter, which beginneth folio 272... and that done, I doubt not but you shall find for the tiler and the tinker... for heresy there called in of office, this good word so spoken here but a very vain word of office... 30 and that the tinker would have tinked out of his pan's bottom a reason that would at the leastwise ring a little better than this.

2 by: about 3 detestation: denunciation 6 process: discussion
12 word: expression // colorable: plausible 16 upon: on the basis of
19 tinker: a repairer of pots and kettles // tiler: a person who lays or makes tiles
22 allegeance: citation of evidence // order: comport 23 appear: become obvious
24 hold: side 26 clouted: patched 29 of office (usually expressed in the Latin—"ex officio"): by virtue of the very nature of the bishop's duty 30 good word: pious expression
30 word of office: handy expression 32 reason: argument

The Twelfth Chapter

His twelfth chapter beginneth in the 38th leaf... which because it is a good, sweet sermon and a short, made unto myself, to put me in remembrance how I should bear the like light faults of other men as I sometimes fall in myself—I shall take his chapter in here even whole. Lo, good readers, thus it saith:

Master More, in the 217th leaf of his Apology, speaking of defaults that, as he thinketh, should have been laid for causes of this division, concludeth thus: "If there be such a division"—whereby it appeareth that he doubteth whether there be any division or not; for this conjunction 10 "if" purporteth always a doubt. And after, in the same Apology, folio 241, he confesseth plainly that there is a division... and maketh no doubt at it—and he calleth it there the "late-sprung division." And so, in one place to make a doubt whether there be such a division or not... and in another to agree that there is such a division... 15 seemeth to be a variance and contradiction in itself. Howbeit, surely I do not intend to lay that variance to him as for any notable default; for a like thing may soon happen in any man by a light oversight. But the cause why I speak of it is this: to put him in remembrance 20 that he hereafter ought the rather to bear such light defaults of others the more charitably... since he himself hath likewise been overseen. For we be all frail, ignorant, and unstable... though we be esteemed, and taken, as angels in our conversation. And therefore is it said in the First Book of *The Following of Christ*, the sixteenth chapter, that no man is in this world without default, no man without 25 burden, no man sufficient to himself, no man wise enough of himself. Wherefore it behooveth each one of us to bear the burden of other, to comfort other, to help other, to inform other, and to instruct and admonish other in all charity. And if we will note well the said words, we shall the sooner learn this lesson: to do in all 30 things as we would be done to; and to do nothing that we would not have done to us. And that is, as I take it, one of the most sovereign doctrines that is... to instruct a man how he shall in everything concerning his neighbor keep himself in a clear conscience, learn it whoso may. 35

5 in: into 6 even: quite 7, 21, etc. default(s): fault(s); failing(s)
8, 9, etc. division: discord; dissension 9 appeareth: is made evident
13 late-sprung: recently arisen 16 variance: inconsistency 17 lay: charge
18, 20 light: slight; little 19 oversight: inadvertence
22 overseen: in inadvertent error 23 conversation: behavior
33 that is: i.e., that there is

10

15

20

35

Lo, good readers, first he bringeth forth mine oversight, in contradiction used between mine own words... and after, with good words and fair, excuseth my fault, by such oversight of frailty as may soon happen in a man. And then he putteth me after in remembrance that I must bear such things the more charitably in other men, since I am overseen likewise myself. He fareth, in all this tale, as though we sat together playing at post. For first he casteth my contradiction as a vie, to wit whether I would give it over with a face. And because that will not be, falleth after to entreaty, and would fain part the stake and divide all such oversights between us. But all this is in vain; for I am as sure of this game, and there lay twenty pounds upon it, as he that hath three aces in his hand.

For look, good readers, in his own first chapter of this book of his, and there shall you see the thing that shall serve me sufficiently showed even by his own words—that there is no such contradiction in mine. And then look mine answer to the same... and then shall you see it yet more clearly. Or else, if any man be loath to turn the leaves and look back—ye shall need to take no business in turning back at all. For he assoileth his argument himself against himself, even in the making thereof, and all with one word unawares.

For now read it again... and you shall see that he saith himself, in the one place I say "If there be any such division."

And so, because this conjunction "if," he saith, importeth always 25 a doubt—therefore he saith that, folio 217, I doubt whether there be any such division or not. And after, he saith that in the other place I confess that there *is* a division... and call it there the "late-sprung division." Lo, now he forgetteth this little, short word, this monosyllable "such," which he rehearsed 30 first in bringing forth my first place... and then by and by, either of forgetfulness or else of wiliness, leaveth out in his illation that he maketh upon the same words of mine.

Now, good readers, you see well that to say there is a division, and to say there is no *such* division, be nothing contrary at all. For I did indeed not deny but that some division there

2 used: carried out 3 fair: nice 4 soon: easily 8 post: a card game, in which a hand consists of three cards // casteth: throws down 8 a vie: a bet on the goodness of his own hand // wit: see 9 give it over: concede it 9 face: bluff 10-11 would . . . stake: would like to split the stakes 11 oversights: blunders 16 even: just 17 look: i.e., look at 20 business: trouble 21 assoileth: refutes 25 *importeth*: implies 29 *forgetteth*: leaves out 31 place: text 31 by and by: immediately after 33 *illation*: inference // upon: on the basis of 35 nothing: in no way

10

15

20

25

30

35

was—that is to wit, some little variance in some place begun, and by some few naughty folk blown forth too far (for a little way is too far in such a thing). But then mean I a division such as it is, not such a division as this man by his book maketh it. I may well without contradiction say to him, "There is a division"... and yet say that there is no such division as he speaketh of. For it is not all one to say there is a division and to say there is such a division.

Now, if I would stick with him upon trifles, I could prove him that "if" doth *not* always purport a doubt, as he saith that it always doth, but is sometimes used to confirm a certainty. As if a man say, "He that dieth in deadly sin shall go to the devil, if God's word be true," doubteth not of the truth of God's word... but *by* the truth thereof, meaneth to confirm the damnation of them that die in deadly sin.

But I say not this as though it should be like in mine. For I do not indeed take "if" there in such fashion. And therefore I will not do here by "if" as this man doth by "as," in his chapter next before, in heresies spoken "as" of policy... using the example of words spoken by a good man in reproaching of hypocrisy, to be like his own words spoken in the diminishing of their blame that under such pretext of policy... would speak, and sow about, plain and open heresy. I need here no such ways for my words. For here have you seen yourselves, by his own words, that there is in my words no contradiction at all.

The Thirteenth Chapter

His thirteenth chapter beginneth in the 39th leaf; and by the rehearsing of divers words of his own in divers other places of his book, here he declareth his mind that he intended not in his book of *Division* to bring in among the people any hatred against the spiritualty.

Now indeed, I do myself declare expressly, in many places of mine *Apology*, that whatsoever words I speak therein, yet I meant evermore the intent of his *book*, and not of his person. And

² naughty: bad 5 maketh it: i.e., makes it out to be 7 all one: one and the same 9 would stick: wanted to bicker 12, 15 deadly: mortal 13 doubteth . . . truth: does not doubt the trueness 18 next: right; immediately 19 in: regarding 19, 22 policy: prudence; i.e., self-protection 29 divers: several 29 words: statements

10

15

20

25

30

although that in some places I say "the Pacifier here doth this or that to this evil purpose or that"—yet I mean ever the *deed* his, the malice of the purpose some other wily shrews'... which, not being fully of so good Catholic mind as I think always this man is himself (which openly dispraiseth these new-broached heresies, and with detestation of them rehearseth them by name), have abused his plain simplicity... making him ween, good soul, that while he did put in, of his own good mind, these good words which he rehearseth here, and with them here and there in some sundry places prettily powder the book, it could not be taken that there were any hurt meant in the whole work together, how evil words and how malicious soever the subtle shrews made him stuff up the book with besides. Was not that a sinful wily way of them, to beguile a good simple soul so? For iwis it is easy to see that if the good man were not of himself very simple and plain, those double, wily shrews could never deceive him so as to make him ween that these words which he rehearseth here in his thirteenth chapter were any manner token that his book of *Division* meant not to bring the clergy in hatred among the people.

For who were there that, so intending, would yet for shame utterly say that there were *none* good... and not rather, to keep his credence in slandering the body, would cast in sometimes an exception of some? In such craft is no great sleight. It is but a common, plain point, and as easy to spy as a long nose upon a little face; especially while, as clearly as he saith that there be many good, yet, as you may see, folio 238 of mine *Apology*, he saith plainly that it is hard to find any one without that point that (if he say therein true) the very best is very naught, and as bad as a very beast. And for the further proof of this point, read mine answer to his seventeenth chapter in this book.

And whereas he speaketh here of the fear that he would every man should have of "the least censures of the Church" as though he therein meant much the favor of spiritual men—consider the place even here in his new book where he speaketh of inquisitions of heresies, in the eighteenth chapter, and you shall well perceive

^{3, 13, 16} shrews: scoundrels; creeps 5 which: who // dispraiseth: deprecates 6 new-broached: newly launched // detestation: denunciation // rehearseth: mentions 7 abused: wrongly taken advantage of; exploited // plain: manifest 8 while: when 10 prettily powder: nicely besprinkle 11 hurt: harm 12 subtle: insidiously sly 14 iwis: certainly 16 *double*: duplicitous 18 manner: kind of 19 token: evidence // in: into 21 for shame: i.e., be so shameless as to 23 credence: credibility // the body: the bulk (of the clergy) // cast: throw 24 *craft*: deviousness // *sleight*: trickery 25 plain: ordinary // point: instance 26 while: since 28-29 that point that: that trait on account of which 29 naught: wicked 35 even: right 35-36 inquisitions of: judicial investigations concerning

that they that made him there put those words in meant little good to the clergy. For it is there laid in a matter full childishly to their charge... as though they would have all the justices of the peace and all the juries of the realm accursed for inquiring of heresy.

But yet is it of all things a very special pleasure to see how he useth here for a plain, apparent proof of his good mind toward the spiritualty that he wisheth well for them and prayeth God to "send" them, "abundantly," "zeal of souls, pity, good doctrine, and devout prayer." And saith that "then a new 10 light of grace should shortly shine," etc.; and that he saith also that it is "great pity," and much "to be lamented," that the spiritualty do not fast and pray, and do other good deeds, to cease the division with... but that "all that ever they do therein, most commonly, is that they take it that they that find default at 15 their abusions and misorder love no priests, but do all of malice that they do, to destroy the Church and to have their goods and possessions themselves," and that "therefore the clergy think it a good deed to see them punished," and "therefore" (that is to say, for that same cause) "have they punished many 20 persons, which much people judge to have been done of will," etc. And saith also that they do "continue still after their old course, pretending by confederacies, worldly policy, and strait corrections to rule the people." Whereas he useth these things (which I have here rehearsed out of his thirteenth chapter of 25 this his new book, and somewhat made them more plain with adding thereto his own other words written in his Division) as you may read in mine *Apology*, folio 158, in the twenty-sixth chapter (and answered there at length, in the same chapter and divers others, in order there ensuing, of which this man hath answered 30 to some very little, and to the most part, and the chief part, nothing), now is he so simple that he useth the same things for a proof that he beareth the clergy very good will and mindeth not to bring them in obloquy... which he would we should take for a thing plainly proved because he pitieth and lamenteth 35 them therein, and so bitterly prayeth God to make them good and amend them.

2-3 laid . . . charge: very childishly leveled against them as a charge in a case 4 accursed: excommunicated 5 inquiring of heresy: holding heresy inquests 7 apparent: clear // mind: attitude 9 of: for // pity: compassion; mercy 15 default at: fault with 16 abusions: wrongdoings // misorder: mismanagement 21 of will: just for their own gratification 23 pretending: attempting 23 confederacies: conspiracies // policy: craftiness; cunning 24 strait corrections: severe punishments 32 simple: dim-witted 33–34 mindeth not to: does not intend to; is not out to 34 in obloquy: into disrepute 34 would we should: would have us 36 so . . . to: prays so hard that God

30

35

This good man many times taketh record of his own conscience that he meaneth well, in such things as his words make many good men ween that he meant very naught. And therefore will I now be bold in this point to take record of his own conscience, whether himself, if one that knew his 5 name would write such a work so touching him as his work of *Division* toucheth there the clergy... and would therein, under so many "some say"s, say that he were as evil as he saith there that they be (for worse could lightly no man say), would himself hold him satisfied and think that that writer meant 10 him no harm because he powdered his shrewd slanderous "some say"s with lamenting and pitying that the man is no better. And would he ween, by his troth, that the writer meant not to call him graceless, because he prayed God abundantly to send him grace? Nor to call him witless, 15 because he prayeth God send him wit? Surely if he can think so—then shall he well show himself so simple a soul as men may well see that some wily shrews beguile him. And, on the other side, if he be wiser than to think so—then he well showeth himself more wily in this same thirteenth chapter of his 20 than to mean so well in his work of *Division* as he would here make men ween.

Now, where he saith these words—

Also I say not, in all the said treatise, that the spiritualty make confederacies against the temporalty... but I say that they "continue still after the old course" in not doing good deeds, but "pretending by confederacies, worldly policy, and strait corrections to rule the people" . . .

—who could write thus but either he that were a man of very innocent simpleness or he that intendeth to mock of a shrewd, wily doubleness? For (saving that his word "pretending" signifieth not indeed the thing that he, for lack of language, pretendeth here thereby) to go about not to do good to the people, but by confederacies with wiliness and strait corrections to rule the people—what thing calleth he this but confederacies against the people?

1, 4–5 take(th) . . . conscience: calls his own conscience to witness 3 naught: ill 4 be bold: venture 5–6 if . . . would: i.e., if someone who knew who he is were to 6 touching: censuring 8 so: as 9 lightly: probably 10 hold him: consider himself 11 powdered: interspersed 11, 31 shrewd: cunning 13, 22 ween: think 13 by his troth: upon his word; in all seriousness 14 graceless: not in the state of grace 17 simple: naïve 19 wiser: more intelligent 30 simpleness: mental deficiency 31 doubleness: duplicity 33 pretendeth: professes

Howbeit, since this chapter goeth but to the discharging of his own personal intent, that he meant not himself maliciously whatsoever his book speak—I will not, therefore, wrestle against it much, but would he were well believed in that thing. But yet if you read the places of mine *Apology* and compare them with such parts of his book as I there speak of—ye shall well and clearly see that, though the man in his own mind meant it not himself, yet the thing that I say *was* the meaning of his *book*.

The Fourteenth Chapter

His fourteenth chapter beginneth in the 42nd leaf. In the beginning thereof he laboreth to prove that he did not (as I in mine *Apology* say that he did) go about in his book of *Division* to make men ween that the spiritual judges in this realm handled men for heresy so cruelly that all the world had cause to wonder and grudge thereat; which thing that I should so say, this good man much marveleth at.

For I said no more [saith he] but that it were pity it should be so, and that it should be true that is reported, that there should be such a desire in spiritual men to have men abjure, or to have men have extreme punishment for, heresy... as it is said that there is.

Read, good readers, the forty-fifth chapter of mine *Apology*, beginning folio 243, and then shall you find this answer of his a very bare, naked thing. This man answereth here as though he trusted that all the world were woodcocks save himself... and 25 that his fair figure of "some say" were so wilily found that men had not the wit to see thereby what his book meaneth, and what work it goeth about. But this I doubt not, but that if either himself or such another man would devise me such another book either against the nobility of the realm or against the judges of the same, or against the high court of Parliament itself—which were soon done if a man in like wise list to slander and to belie them... nor it could not, I wot well, whatsoever he said therein, be lightly worse or more false than that

1 goeth but to: goes about only // discharging: exonerating 5 places: (relevant) passages 7 well and: quite // though: even if 12 laboreth: strives 14 spiritual: ecclesiastical 16 wonder: look aghast // grudge: take offense 20 abjure: recant 24 bare: uncamouflaged // naked: transparent; easily seen through 26 fair figure: euphemism // found: contrived 32 were soon done: would be easy to do 32 list: chose 33 belie: tell lies about 34 be lightly: well be

10

5

20

15

10

15

35

book of his *Division*, concerning the point that we speak of, that is to wit, this false slander of the spiritual judges in mishandling men for heresy (as it hath ofter than once, before the lords of the King's most honorable Council, upon like false bills and complaints of particular persons, by good examination been proved)—and then if he that would make, I say, of the nobility, the judges, or the Parliament such another book would bring in all his false tales against them under the selfsame figure of "some say," and "many say," and "they say"... and then say that himself would say no piece thereof, but only that it were pity that it should be true, that it were so as many folk report it is so, and then preach and pray God send them the grace that they do not so: I dare be bold to say that there is no wise man but he would both soon see and say that the man with such false leesings went about to defame and slander them, and make the people ween that it were so.

Then, after this thing so featly excused, he declareth his words again which he spoke in his *Division* of speaking heresies of lightness, or of a passion. And because I answered him in mine *Apology* that if such things should be excused by 20 lightness and by passions, then might there pass by much lewdness and much mischief too... the beginning whereof groweth of lewd lightness and of evil passions: herein he showeth that there is difference in deeds, and that some be more and some be less. And because I did put for examples manslaughter 25 and adultery, which he thought was too high to be likened to speaking and talking heresy, he bringeth it somewhat again to base and putteth other examples, of one speaking an angry word and vet would not kill one... and one that hath a passion of adultery and yet doth not the deed... and saith that his treatise meant not obstinate 30 deadly passions, but passions of ignorance and of frailty, and done for lack of good advisement.

As for his passion of ignorance, he may put up again. For, whatsoever he say, he shall not find, I dare warrant him, while he liveth, but that the things that heretics are punished for be such things as be well and openly known for

2 slander: slandering // spiritual: ecclesiastical 2, 15 false: despicable 5 bills and complaints: indictments and accusations 2 in: concerning 6–7 *make . . . of*: write . . . about 9 figure: figure of speech 14 wise: intelligent 15 leesings: lies 17 featly: deftly // excused: defended // declareth: explains 19 *of*: out of 19, 21, etc. *lightness*: unthinkingness // passion(s): strong feeling(s) 22, 23 *lewd(ness)*: wicked(ness) 22 *mischief*: harm 23 groweth: comes 24 showeth: points out // more: i.e., more serious 25 manslaughter: murder 26 high: serious 27–28 bringeth . . . base: kind of brings it back to the starting point 28 one: someone 29 kill one: kill anyone // one that: someone who 29 a passion of: a strong desire to commit 31 of: (stemming) from 32 done: acted on 32 *advisement*: deliberation 33 may put up again: can put it back aside 35 while: as long as

10

15

20

heresies, and to have been before condemned for heresies by the common-known doctrine of the whole Catholic Church.

Now, as touching his passions for frailty and for lack of good advisement: doth there no man kill another even suddenly upon a passion of anger, for lack of good advisement? Doth never none unthrifts upon a passion of lechery suddenly fall together in adultery for lack of good advisement?

"Yea," will this man say, "but these folk do the deed." That is very truth indeed. But yet they do the deed but of a passion of frailty, for lack of good advisement. In that adultery, the malice is the lack of goodness in the will to the keeping of God's commandments.

And yet even in those passions, too, though the further deed be not done (no man neither killed nor struck, nor none adultery done in deed), though the laws of the world, for lack of power to look into the heart, cannot punish the bare intent of such things—yet our Savior saith himself very sore words therein, and saith that himself taketh their wills for their deeds.

But, now, in *heresy* the words *be* the work. For not only the speaking but also the defending thereof is in words too.

"But a man," saith he, "may speak heresy of lightness, and of a passion of frailty, and yet not intend to fall from the faith." So may a man speak very lewd and right traitorous words by his prince, too, of a passion and of a frailty, without an 25 inward intent and purpose to procure his destruction. But then will this man peradventure say that then be such words yet no treason, without some manner of overt and open actual deed therewith. Whether they be treason or not, yet in any English book that I would put in print, I would, as thus advised, advise every 30 man, for fear of treason, beware of all such lewd language; and not, under color to teach the judges their part, go tell the people without necessity that though they talk traitorous words, yet it is no treason, as this good man in his book of *Division* telleth them that to talk heresies is no heresy. 35

3 as touching: as regards 4 even: quite 6 unthrifts: dissolute individuals 16 bare: mere 17–19: See Matthew 5:28. 20 work: deed 24, 31 lewd: wicked 24 by: about 25 prince: sovereign 32 color to teach: pretext of teaching 32 their part: what they should do 33 though: even if

Now, as I said before, concerning heresy—which is the treason to God—the outward *act* thereof, by which men must judge whether the man fall from the faith or not, standeth in the *words*. And therefore both wisdom and reason will that folk well be wary, upon the peril of heresy, that they forbear all such talking of heresy as may declare their mind that they believe such heresy.

"That I will well agree," will this good man say. "But then I would that they should be wary by means of charitable warning given to their persons." I would verily ween that in a matter so heinous and of such weight, whereof so much harm may grow by the sufferance, the spiritual law that giveth him leave to abjure at the first, and in so great a crime saveth once his life, giveth him a warning as charitable and as large as, in a crime so perilous, reason can well bear. And that should we soon feel if we would give the like liberty for once-warning to every less crime than that... and shall shortly feel it in heresies if, besides that, we give them less fear and more liberty in bold talking and teaching without other peril than warning.

For as for the order of warning that this man here provideth
in this fourteenth chapter of his new book, taking a color
and a pretext of the Gospel of Christ, that speaketh of an
order of monitions, requiring a tract of time before any
open denunciation: I will not much stick upon. For I purpose
not to make a long process upon every fond piece of his
devices wherein this good man is content to lose time and spill
paper. But I will say this and say truth: that the ordinaries of this
order that he speaketh do use indeed as much as may well be
borne, and sometimes, I fear me, more too.

For this must this good man understand: that this good soft, slow, sober order that he describeth here may not all, and always, be kept, neither in heresy nor treason, nor some other great crimes neither, without great hurt and damage to the commonweal, and utter loss and destruction of many a good simple soul that should, by this order always kept, perish in the meanwhile.

```
3 standeth: consists
                        4-5 will that folk: call for folk to
5 of heresy: i.e., of being taken and punished as heretics
                                                             6 their mind: their thinking to be
9–10 to their persons: to them personally
                                              11 grow by: come of
12 sufferance: toleration // spiritual: ecclesiastical // abjure: recant
                                                                             14 large: generous
16 less: lesser
                  20 order: procedure
                                            21 color: semblance of justification
22 of the: from the // that: which
                                        23 monitions: admonitory counsels
23 requiring: calling for // tract: span
                                             24 stick upon: dwell on (that)
25 process: discourse // fond: idiotic
                                            26 content: willing // spill: waste
27 ordinaries: bishops
```

Nor our Savior meant not in his words that if I wist one that were walking about mischief, that would go give such drink about as should poison them that drank thereof... that then I should use all that tract of time, rather than cause him be taken up betimes, at the first sup that I see him give any man 5 to sip upon. Nor that tract is not, therefore, to be used with them that speak and boldly talk heresies about, and thereby do plainly teach them, though they bid not the hearers learn them. For, as Saint Paul speaketh of such heresies, "evil communication corrupteth good manners." Which words though the 10 Greek poet Menander meant by the communication of other, fleshly lewdness—yet the blessed Apostle used them and applied them specially to the lewd communication of heresies, which with such bold naughty talking creepeth forth and corrupteth, as Saint Paul also saith, "like a corrupt canker." And 15 therefore, as I say, such a long, sober tract before their calling by the ordinary course of the law is not always to be used of necessity with every such manner man, and let them poison other good simple souls in the mean season, which they may do, percase, with such communication though they neither 20 minded in their own heart to make any other men heretics nor to be heretics themselves.

And yet would there, besides this, some such as well wist their mischievous dealing to be such, and so well able to be plainly proved as the ordinary could not without God's displeasure let them after pass unpunished—they would, at the first word spoken by the ordinary to him at large, fly out of that place... and, as I have in mine *Apology* said, and as we see it often proved, go keep like schools in another.

But yet, because I have heard say, even while I was writing
this, that the mild, sober order which this good man hath here
in this chapter devised is very well liked, and hath been well
praised, with some such folk as myself have had some communication
with ere this—I will therefore not hide it nor keep it
away from you, but give you, good readers, here even his own
words, folio 45. He saith:

2 walking about mischief: going about the committing of a crime 1 one that: someone who 4-5 cause . . . taken up: have him seized 5 betimes: in good time 8 bid not . . . learn: do not tell . . . to learn 9-10: 1 Corinthians 15:33. 9 evil: bad 9, 11 communication: association 10 manners: ways 10–11 which words . . . meant by: by which words . . . meant 10-12: Menander, *Thais* 218. 12. 13 *lewd(ness)*: wicked(ness) 12 the blessed Apostle: i.e., Saint Paul 14 *naughty*: bad 12–15: 2 Timothy 2:16–17. 15 canker: gangrene 16, 31 *sober*: unhurried 16 *calling*: summoning 19 mean season: meantime 24 mischievous: criminal 20 *percase*: by chance 21 minded: intended 25-26 without God's displeasure: without offending God 24 dealing: conduct 26 after: afterward // pass: go 27 at large: i.e., while he (the heretic) was still at liberty 32 *liked*: approved of 35 even his own: his own exact

And now will I say a little farther in this matter... concerning such words; that is to say, that if any man now in this dangerous time, while this division continueth, will show unto the ordinary that he heard any speak words that, as he thought, stood not with the Catholic faith... and the ordinary misliketh the words also: I 5 would then think... that if he upon whom the information is made be such a man that he that complaineth of him may conveniently speak to him without danger, that then the ordinary shall advise him to keep the matter secret, if it be yet secret... and not openly known; and that he shall then charitably ask of him... what he meant 10 by these words. And then, when the question is asked him, if he make so reasonable an answer... that it soundeth to no heresy... then is the matter answered. And if he avow the words... and yet they be indeed against the Catholic faith: then it seemeth good... that he that accused him follow the Gospel... and take witnesses with him... and eft 15 charitably give him monition thereof. And if he will yet stand still opinatively in his opinion... and not accept the good monition of the other: then I think it good that he again inform the ordinary thereof... and then it seemeth to be convenient that the ordinary send for him... not as for a man yet notoriously known or detected for a 20 heretic... but to know farther, whether it be true as the other hath reported or not; and if he find it true by sufficient proof... or by his own confession, and he will not be reformed, then it seemeth convenient... that he upon the witness of the other... be punished as he hath deserved. And if he will be by the ordinary secretly reformed: 25 then it seemeth good that he depart without any open penance; but what were convenient to be farther done in that matter, I will commit it to others.

Consider now, good readers, the commodity of this order. You see that he speaketh of one that speaketh such words as to the

30 hearers seem heresy. For both he so taketh them that informeth the ordinary of them, and so doth the ordinary too. Now may you perceive, by the progress of his device, that though there were more than one that heard him, or more than twain, or ten

3 show: say 4 any: anyone // speak words: make statements 4 stood not: were not consistent 5 misliketh: disapproves of 5, 13 words: statements 7 of: about // may: can // conveniently: suitably 13 answered: resolved; taken care of 12 soundeth to no: does not smack of any 13 avow: stand by; maintain 15 eft: a second time 17 opinatively: with an obstinate opinionatedness 16, 17 *monition*: admonitory counsel 20 notoriously: very well; commonly 19, 24, 27 *convenient*: appropriate 20 detected: informed on 29 commodity: advantageousness 26 *open*: public 29 order: procedure 30 speaketh such words: makes such statements

either—yet would he not that the ordinary should send for him... but first assay by some such as heard him what he will say thereto when he is asked the question what thing himself meant thereby. And then if he have the wit to say he meant in his words but such a thing as that meaning soundeth to no 5 heresies (which wit heretics enough have), then is all the matter answered. For then, ye wot well, a wily heretic by this wise order may be bold, with glosses readily provided, to say what he will and where he will. For the ordinary may not send for him to lay those heretical words to his charge, and to 10 consider upon the circumstance of his dealing in such talking (peradventure in divers places used) whether he meant as himself declareth or meant to teach the thing that he spoke and to keep his declaration in store for an excuse. This first point alone of this good man's order, if it were surely observed, 15 were enough to fill a whole town shortly full of heresies.

Then goeth he farther to a second point: that if he that spoke heresies will when he is asked the question avow them—yet shall not he that heard him resort unto the ordinary, but go fetch 20 witnesses first, before whom if the fellow be so foolish to confess them, and so frantic as to avow them, then this good man giveth them leave to go tell the ordinary the tale and accuse him. But, now, if he have the wit before the witnesses to lie and say that he never said them, or to say that he will say 25 so no more—then is all the matter yet safe enough again; it shall never need that ever the ordinary hear any more word of him... but let him go forth and use that fashion still, in as many companies as he cometh. For that, ye wot well, can do no hurt. But and if every man to whom he speaketh heresy secretly, and 30 secretly would make more heretics, should secretly inform the ordinary... and that he should upon twenty such secret informations afterward call him forth openly, and after, upon their open depositions, openly make him abjure and bear a faggot, or accurse him for his obstinacy; and after a whole 35 year's sufferance finally, for his immedicable malice, as a desperate

```
2 assay by: find out by way of
                                  4, 6, 24 wit: (good) sense
                                           7 wise: brilliant
                                                               8, 15 order: procedure
5 soundeth to no: does not involve any
8 glosses: specious explanations; spins
                                           11 circumstance: circumstances; context
12 used: engaged in
                        13 declareth: explains
                                                   14 declaration: explanation
16 were: would be
                       20 resort: betake himself; go
                                                        21 to: as to
21 confess: admit; acknowledge
                                    22 frantic: insane // avow: stand by
                                                                              23 tale: report
27 need: be necessary
                          29 cometh: i.e., comes into // hurt: harm
                                                                         30 and if: if
33, 34 open(ly): public(ly)
                              33 after: later
                                                 34 bear: carry
35 faggot: bundle of sticks // accurse: excommunicate
                                                             36 for: on account of
36 immedicable: irremediable // desperate: hopeless
```

10

15

20

wretch deliver him to the secular hands, where a faggot should bear him: this were a cruel dealing of the ordinary, and a mishandling of a good, honest man for heresy.

And yet goeth he farther a little: that though he hold it and avow his heresies before the witnesses—the ordinary should not yet, for all that, proceed against him openly, but speak with him secretly. And though he avow them before himself too—yet should he not, by this good man's advice, proceed against him by ordinary means openly, but let him depart without open penance, if the fellow be so wise as at last (rather than he would come thereto) say that he will amend and will say such things no more.

But then after all this, what were convenient to be farther done, he will, he saith, remit unto other men. And so were it much need indeed. Howbeit, if this order that he deviseth here were well observed for so far forth as he goeth—I ween all the world could not well devise farther, sufficiently to reform and remedy the mischief that his charitable device would do.

Howbeit, the best is, therein, that he deviseth not this order for a thing to stand forever, but for this time "now," he saith, which is, he saith, a "dangerous time, while this division continueth."

But now so is it, good readers, that whether this time be so 25 dangerous as he speaketh of or no, or whether there be in this time such division as he maketh or no—sure it is, I say, that even in this same time heresies begin to grow a great deal faster than they have been wont in some other times past... and therefore is this time so much the worse to use such order in than 30 were another time wherein there were many fewer. For if this Pacifier will now be so peaceable as to devise such an order that all mischievous, factious folk should be suffered in peace, he shall with his peaceable order (if it were observed) bring the world in that case that good peaceable folk that 35 fain would live in peace should not, for such unquiet and unrestful wretches, without some ruffle live in peace long.

1 deliver... hands: hand him over to the civil authorities 2 were: would be 2 dealing: behavior 3 mishandling: mistreating // honest: honorable 5 hold it: i.e., stick to what he previously said 8 secretly: in private 8 himself: him (i.e., the bishop) 11 wise: sensible 12 thereto: i.e., to public penance 16, 21, etc. order: procedure; system 28 even: precisely 33 mischievous: injurious 35 in that case: into such a situation 36 fain would: would like to 37 unrestful: agitative; contentious // ruffle: disturbance

10

15

20

Were it not a wise order, ween you, if he would in like wise devise for thieves the same soft, charitable fashion that he deviseth here for heretics—that is to wit, that men should to him that had stolen a horse, or robbed a house, go give him a monition first, and then if he say that he did it not, or that he would do so no more, take all the matter for safe—and then say that he would not have that order always kept, but only in such dangerous times as many folk would fall to theft; for then were it good to spare them and speak them fair, and suffer them till they would wax fewer of themselves... and then, after that, use against them the laws and the old order again. Would not this wise way, trow you, do well in theft? Forsooth, it were a way as far unwise and as far against reason in heresy as either in theft or murder or any other manner crime.

And surely meseemeth that where he calleth this a "dangerous" time, he useth a very dangerous word... and to fear the ordinaries with, would make the world ween that heretics were here so many and so strong that the ordinaries might not now do their duties in subduing heresies without great danger. Wherein there is as great danger yet—and shall, I doubt not, in the King's Grace's days that now is, and long mote be—as there is in the paring of an apple. Howbeit, I will not deny him this indeed, but that if such dangerous words of his *Division* may make the ordinaries afeard of their own shadow a while—it may grow to some danger at the last.

own shadow a while—it may grow to some danger at the last.

But then goeth he farther, with another remedy that I trust in God shall never need. For I trust in God there never shall in this realm any such great personage fall into heresy as the ordinary "dare" not "proceed according to the law against him."

Howbeit, in case it should happen—then this good man provideth for the remedy (to say the truth) very well: that is to wit, that the ordinary should have recourse unto the King, that His Highness, upon petition made unto him and information given him, may (as no doubt were there but he would) with his royal assistance provide a means sufficient that the course of the law might proceed.

6 safe: taken care of 9 speak them fair: talk nicely to them // suffer: tolerate 10 wax: become // of themselves: on their own 11 against: with regard to 11 order: system 12 wise: brilliant // trow you: don't you suppose 16 fear: frighten // ordinaries: bishops 18 strong: militarily powerful 18 might: could 19 subduing: suppressing 20 yet: as yet 21–22 the . . . be: the days of the one who is now king, and long may he be 27 need: be needed

10

15

20

25

This is well devised. And herein he playeth the good cow, and giveth us a good gallon of milk. But then shall you see how he playeth the shrewd cow again, and turneth over the pail even by and by with his heel. For upon this good device, he forthwith addeth this shrewd saying to it:

But as long as there is an opinion among the people... that the ordinaries and their officers will give light credence upon informations made to them of heresy... and that they will noise them that be complained on as heretics... before due examination in that behalf: so long will the people grudge and peradventure the King not give his assistance so readily to have them attached as he would do if he heard that the ordinaries noised no man to be a heretic without due examination, as is before rehearsed.

If this good man had as much wit as I see well he lacketh, I would wax evil-content with him that he should once conceive any such opinion of the King's gracious Highness as that His Grace would anything be the more remiss to give royal assistance unto the ordinaries about the attaching of such as are suspect of heresy as long as His Grace heard that the ordinaries noised that any man were a heretic without such due examination as this man before rehearsed. For the King's high prudence very well perceiveth that if he should forbear till that time that he should hear no such thing said by them—it were almost as much to say as he should give no assistance against heretics till all heretics were gone. For never shall there lack such a false, seditious fame against the ordinaries as long as there are heretics here and there to sow it, and such seditious books of division, with such untrue "some say"s, to blow it farther abroad.

The untruth of such false fame hath been before the King's honorable Council of late well and plainly proved already, upon sundry such false complaints by the King's gracious commandment examined. And albeit that this is a thing notoriously known, and that I have also myself in mine *Apology* spoken thereof, and that since that 35 book gone abroad, it hath been in like wise before the lords well

4 even by and by: literally right away 3. 5 shrewd: bad 5 saving: statement 7 give . . . upon: readily give credence to; readily believe // informations: accusations 8–9 noise . . . heretics: spread rumors that those complained about are heretics 10 grudge: murmur 11 attached: arrested 12 noised: reported 13 rehearsed: described in detail 15 evil-content: ill-content 17 anything: at all 18 attaching: arresting 22 forbear: hold back; wait 23 by: about 26 fame: rumor 26 against: about 30 fame: report 32 complaints: accusations 34 *a* . . . *known*: a matter of common knowledge 36 gone abroad: got out; was published

10

15

20

and plainly proved in more matters afresh; and albeit that this water washeth away all his matter: yet goeth ever this water over this goose's back... and for anything that any man can do, no man can make it sink unto the skin that she may once feel it... but ever she shaketh such plain proofs off with her feathers of "some say" and "they say" the contrary. Is not this a pretty, proper way? And therefore thus you see, good readers, that this man's devices in his order to be taken with such as speak heresies be very vicious, and have they never so fair a fleering at the first face, yet when they be considered well, they be found far worse than naught. And yet was I not minded, as you may see, to have examined them so far, saving that even while I was in writing of this chapter, and about to leave off-word was brought me that this device of his order for heresy was with some folk whom myself have known, so specially well commended.

But yet will this man say, and in effect so he doth, "Master More will not say, for all this, that everything that a man speaketh which if he obstinately would hold, he were a heretic, is enough to judge every such man a heretic as doth in any manner speak it."

I will not at this time vary with this good man for that, nor dispute with him upon the truth of that tale, there be so many manner ways of speaking. For a man may speak thereof in dispraise thereof. But this will I say to him: That tale and 25 such others like, were they never so true, were yet, as meseemeth, much better out of his English-printed book than in it.

For if he think it necessary to write it because of any folk whom he thinketh necessary to learn it: either he meaneth that they need it which are the spiritual judges, or else the common people. Now as for the judges, verily I have known and do know many of them, and yet knew I never none so simple of wit, nor so far unlearned, but for any wit or learning that I perceive in this man, the worst of them wist a great deal better what pertained unto their part and their duty in such 35 points as these are, than doth this good man here.

Then if he say he putteth it in because that though they

1 matters: cases // afresh: anew 2 all his matter: his whole case
6–7 a pretty, proper way: an ingenious, excellent tactic 9 vicious: immoral
9 fair: nice-looking // a fleering: an obsequious appearance
10 at the first face: at first glance 11 naught: worthless 15 order: system
22 vary . . . for: quarrel . . . over 23 dispute . . . upon: argue . . . about
24 manner: kinds of 30 spiritual: ecclesiastical
32–33 simple of wit: lacking in intelligence

know it they misuse it, and do the contrary and so do thereby mishandle the King's people, and put them to cruel punishment unjustly: then I ask him how he proveth that lie to be true. Thereto, ye wot well, he will bring forth for the plain proof of his plain truth in the matter his old three 5 worshipful witnesses which stand yet all unsworn: that is to wit, "Some Say" and "They Say" and "Folk Say." And then hath he now brought forth another two, whom he maketh, as meseemeth, both as witnesses and judges too: that is, the good seely soul Simkin Salem and his right honest neighbor Brother Bizance. Well, I 10 am content, I, that all his five witnesses be sworn and well examined, how they know the things that they report; and then those spiritual judges of whom they shall so speak and prove, let it be laid unto their charges. And if you find of such so many. and their dealing so cruel or unjust, as this man maketh 15 it, or anything well toward it: then am I content that ye shall for them belie all the remnant the worse. And yet is that iwis somewhat with the most. And then am I content that you believe also that this man had for that cause a necessary occasion and a profitable, to put that tale in his bate-making book. 20

But in the meanwhile, I lay against him for that point, and against all his five worshipful witnesses too, the deed and the report of the greatest and the most honorable temporal lords of the King's most honorable Council, and other right worshipful temporal men of the same with them, which by

25 the gracious commandment of the King's Highness have examined divers such complaints at the suit of the parties themselves and their friends, and have thereupon found the same complaints false, and that the ordinaries have done them but right, and that with great favor, too.

And therefore as for this point, the truth being so substantially proved upon this side, by all his five forenamed witnesses on the other side set I not five straws. And therefore, good readers, as for this point, his putting of that piece in his book of *Division* had neither necessity nor profit... except 35 it were either necessary or profitable to sow an evil seed

2 mishandle: mistreat 6, 22, 25 worshipful: reputable 1 misuse it: carry it out wrongly 9 seely: simple // Simkin: Simple Simon 10 honest: honorable 11 sworn: put under oath 17 for them: on their account // belie: slander 17 remnant: rest // that: i.e., the rest // iwis: certainly 18 somewhat: something 18 with the most: i.e., that is the majority 20 bate-making: strife-causing 23 temporal: secular 27 *suit*: supplication 28 friends: relatives and friends: loved ones 30 favor: kindness 35 except: unless 36 evil: bad

10

15

20

25

against good folk, of untrue, reprovable slander, in his own writing, under the color of some other men's unproved words.

Then resteth there, as far as I can see, but one cause behind, that should excuse him. And that is that it was a thing profitable for the people, to know that though a man of a lightness, or of a passion growing of ignorance, or of frailty, speak and talk heresies at liberty—yet but if he defend it opinatively, he should not be taken for a heretic thereby. Verily, good readers, if this tale were true—yet would I ween, as I said, this tale unto the people as good unwritten as written, and a great deal better too.

As for this good man or any man else, I cannot let them to write what they list, and say they think it good be it never so bad indeed. But I durst in my conscience no more use this fashion of writing concerning heresy than I would use it in writing any book whereof I would speak of either treason or any other felony... except some other necessary occasion should haply drive me thereto, as no good occasion in his book of *Division* drove this good man thereto.

If I were again to read in Lincoln's Inn, and *there* were in hand with a statute that touched treason and all other felonies—I would not let to look, seek out, and rehearse whether any heinous words spoken against the prince were for the only speaking to be taken for treason or not.

Nor I would not let in like wise to declare if I found out any cases in which a man, though he took another man's horse against the law, should yet not be judged for a felon thereby. And this would I not only be bold there to tell them, but would also be bold in such French as is peculiar to the laws of this realm 30 to leave it with them in writing, too. But yet would I reckon myself sore overseen if all such things as I would in that school speak in a reading, I would in English into every man's hand put out abroad in print. For there is no such necessity therein as is in the other. For in the places of court these companies must 35 needs be taught it... out of which companies they must after be taken that shall be made judges to judge it. But as for the common people to be told that tale, shall, as far as I see, do many folk little good, but rather very great harm. For by perceiving

1 reprovable: disprovable 2 color: disguise 4 resteth: remains 6, 7 of a: out of a 7 lightness: unthinkingness // passion: strong feeling // growing: coming 7 or of: or out of 9 opinatively: with an obstinate opinionatedness 8 but if: unless 13–14 let . . . say: prevent them from writing what they please, and from saying 23, 26 let: forbear 22 touched: concerned; had to do with 15 *durst*: would dare 23 rehearse: state 24 *heinous*: highly criminal 32 sore overseen: terribly imprudent 34 *abroad*: at large 35, 36 *companies*: assemblies 38 shall: i.e., that will

10

15

that in some things were nothing the peril that they feared, some may wax therein more negligent... and by less fearing the less danger, may soon step into the more. And therefore have I wist ere this, the judges of a great wisdom in great open audience, where they have had occasion to speak of high misprision or of treason, forbear yet the saying of some such things as they would not have letted to speak among themselves.

If any man would haply think that it were well done that every man were taught all... and would allege therefore that if he know surely what thing would make his behavior high treason or heresy, then though he would adventure all that ever were under that, yet would he be peradventure the more wary to keep himself well from that—as many a man, though he believe that he shall abide great pain in purgatory for his venial sins, doth, for all that, no great diligence in forbearing of them, and yet, for the fear of perpetual pain in hell, taketh very great heed to keep himself from those sins that he surely knoweth for mortal . . .

As for such venial sins as folk, of frailty, so commonly do
fall in that no man is almost any time without them: though
the profit would be more if men did ween they were mortal,
so that the dread thereof could make men utterly forbear
them—yet since it will not be that men will utterly forbear
them, the knowledge of the truth is necessary for them... lest
every time that they do such a venial sin indeed, weening
that it were mortal, the doing of the deed with the conscience
of a mortal sin might make it mortal indeed.

But of any such kind of venial sins as be not so much in custom, and may be more easily forborne—I never found
any wise man, to my remembrance, that would either write or teach the common people so exactly as to say, "Though you do thus far, yet is it no deadly sin"... but will in such things, since the venial sin itself is a drawing toward the deadly, rather leave the people in doubt, and in dread of deadly sin, and
35 thereby cause them to keep themselves far off from it... than by telling them it is but a venial sin, make them the less

1 *nothing*: not at all 2 *negligent*: careless 3 *the less*: the lesser 4 *more*: greater 4, 20 *of*: out of 6 *high misprision*: a serious crime bordering on felony 8 *letted*: forborne 12 *adventure*: venture upon 21 *in*: into 23 *so*: provided 26 *a venial sin indeed*: a sin that is objectively a venial one 27–28 *the conscience of*: i.e., their conscience telling them it is 33, 34, 35 *deadly*: mortal

10

15

20

25

30

afeard to do it... and so come so much the nearer to mortal sin, and assay how near he can come to it and not do it, till he come at last so near the brink that his foot slippeth and down he falleth into it. For as the Scripture saith, "Qui amat periculum, peribit in illo" ("He that loveth peril shall perish in it").

Now, as for heinous words speaking against the prince, or talking of heresy against the known Catholic faith—these are no things like these common venial sins... but be things, both twain, which they that do them may much more easily forbear them. And therefore were it more profit unto the people to think rather the more peril therein than the less.

The judges' part is to see that the punishment pass not the gravity of the offense. And therefore shall the common people take no harm though themselves, concerning treason or heresy, fall not by such books to the mincing of such matters, and dispute how far they may go forward in them without the extreme danger and peril of them... but shall the better keep themselves from the greater if for fear of greater they keep themselves well from the less.

But surely such tales told unto the people, and given every man and woman at adventure in printed English books abroad, as may give them such boldness in talking as this man here in this fourteenth chapter doth—and to tell them that there is not therein so much peril as many men would ween—may be much harm, both unto themselves and unto others too. To themselves, for with a little less fear than they had before, they may soon fall further than they did before, or ever would have done. And then should he in whom it so should happen find that it were (as holy Saint Jerome saith) better to leave some things unknown than with peril to learn them.

To other men also may a man do thereby much harm. For some man with boldness talking heresies, whereby he maketh

2 assay: see 4–6: See Sirach 3:25–27. 16 take: suffer 23 at adventure: at random 30–32: Possibly a reference to Saint Jerome's *Commentary on Ephesians* (4:17), which is quoted in *Summa Theologica* II–II, q. 167, art. 1.

10

other men first to take them for light, and little and little after to believe them, too (while they hear him so boldly speak them, and hear him nothing reprove them), may do much more harm by making many others fall from the faith, though he were not fallen from it himself, than he should do if he held his tongue though secretly in his heart he were a stark heretic indeed.

And therefore surely, good reader, whatsoever the man meant in his own secret mind, the fashion of his doctrine is yet, in my mind, plainly a thing to the people much more perilous than profitable... and in his book of *Division* very evil put in, and here evil repeated again.

Now, whereas he referreth the remnant of the matter concerning heresy unto them that can better skill... of whom he desireth me to ask what were to be done with such as speak

15 heresies and are no heretics in their heart: surely if ever any such case should happen as I should need to make search for that point, I would with good will so do. But I look for no such necessity. For it is enough for me, if I should hap to hear any talk heresies, then to declare it unto their ordinaries—

20 to whom the further charge appertaineth to make thereupon further search, such as he may; and thereupon, as he may further find thereof, so further do therein.

And as for this man himself, as he canneth therein, for anything that I see, very little skill, so would I that he had less 25 meddled therewith than to tell and teach the people, first by his book of Division and afterward by this book again, that they may speak and talk heresies well enough, without the danger or peril to be, for such speaking, lawfully taken for heretics. With which tale though it were true, he doth 30 them yet little good. For the using of such speaking of heresies, if it fully prove not a man a heretic, yet may it make him, ye wot well, of heresy in his heart very right sore suspect. For as our Savior saith himself, "Ex abundantia cordis os loquitur" ("The mouth speaketh such things as in the heart be 35 plenteous and aboundeth"). And therefore I say that though he neither defend it obstinately nor can be precisely

1 light: innocuous // little and little: little by little
3 nothing reprove: not at all express disapproval of 6 stark: arrant; out-and-out
11, 12 evil: ill 14 can better skill: are more knowledgeable 18 with good will: happily
18 look for: anticipate 21 charge: responsibility // appertaineth: belongs
24–25 canneth . . . skill: has . . . expertise 26 meddled: involved himself
31 using of: engaging in; carrying on of 33 right: rightly; properly // sore: strongly
34–36: Luke 6:45.

10

15

20

25

30

35

proved a heretic in his secret heart—yet may his open words be such (though they were spoken of I cannot tell you what manner passion) that for the sore suspicion that his own words hath brought himself into, he may well and with good reason be compelled to abjure. And therein were there, iwis, no great honesty nor no very great profit neither. And yet is it all the profit that I see can come of this good man's doctrine.

And this is the thing, lo, that this good man boasteth in this chapter (the second side of his 44th leaf) that I do not deny—as though he had gotten thereby a great overhand on me in the matter. But yet would I, good readers, save for the length, let him perceive his oversight and ignorance in another manner touching the thing that he so boasteth that I deny him not... and would make him look a little better even upon *Summa rosella*, whom he so much allegeth here himself.

And whereas in the same leaf and side, he maketh a certain certificate (as though I were a bishop, and had sent him a commission to inquire) that he knoweth not one heretic in all this realm in word nor deed: marry, I would marvel much if he did. For it must needs be very long ere he can know any, while the man is so little suspicious in matters of heresy that though he should hear them talk heresy by him, yet because, though he hear what their mouths speak, he cannot yet, pardie, lo, look into their hearts there and see what they think—nor knoweth not also whether, if they were asked where they were well afeard, they would hold it opinatively or else (rather than be burned or bear a faggot) say that they said it all but of a passion of ignorance or frailty—he cannot, therefore, lightly know any one heretic (as he saith he doth not), neither in word nor deed, in all this whole realm.

And then, for hearing by report, therein goeth he farther and saith:

For howbeit that I have heard sometimes reported that there be many heretics... yet I never heard so far proof therein that I might with conscience judge or report... that this man or that man is a heretic.

3 what manner passion: what kind of strong feeling // for: on account of // sore: strong 6 honesty: honor 10 overhand: edge 12 oversight: blunder 14 even upon: right at 14–15 Summa rosella: A manual for confessors, completed in 1483 by Baptista Trovamala. 17 certificate: attestation 18 inquire: investigate 19 marry: indeed // marvel much: be very surprised 21 while: as long as 22 by: near 23 pardie: by golly 28 passion: fit 29 lightly: likely 31 for: as for

10

15

20

And to every light word a man may not give full credence in that behalf... nor report it lightly... that any man is a heretic, by such light tales. And surely this point is much to be noted of all men... but most especially of them that daily administer the sacraments of the Church, lest haply through such reports they administer them sometimes in deadly sin, and yet would not think so themselves.

It would have done very well that this good man had given as light a credence to such reports in mishandling of heretics as some have made him of the spiritualty (if himself therein say true) as he seemeth to have given to them that have reported unto him that there are many heretics. For then—since, after his own preaching here, a man ought to be so well wary how he lightly report again any evil light reports that he hath heard to the slander of any one man—himself would not of likelihood so lightly have made such evil report in that point, to the slander and obloquy of the prelates of the spiritualty, thereby to bring them in grudge of the whole temporalty, upon such light reports made unto him by some light, simple persons... whereas by the King's honorable Council the truth hath been so plainly proved to be contrary.

But yet, whereas he confesseth that he hath heard it sometimes reported that there be many heretics: I would fain wit of him whether that such report have been made unto him by 25 any of the temporalty. If he say nay, but that all that so told him were spiritual men: then may they believe him that think his answer likely. For I would ween, in my mind, that between him and spiritual persons were not so much familiar company as to come to tell him that tale. For he seemeth not very 30 meet for spiritual men in that matter to make their moan unto. And then if he heard it either of temporal men besides or of temporal men only and no spiritual men at all: then did he not very well when he wrote in his Division that spiritual men make that noise for a policy. And yet also would I 35 farther wit, whether he have heard any speak heresies in any place where himself was present in company. If he answer

1 light: spontaneous; unconsidered 2, 14, 16 lightly: readily; without good cause 3, 15, 19 light: unreliable 3, 4 *of*: by 6 deadly: mortal 11 say true: is telling the truth 13 after: according to 15, 17 evil: bad 15, 17 *slander*: discredit 17 *obloquy*: disrepute 18 spiritualty: clergy 18–19 *bring* . . . *temporalty*: turn all the laity against them 20 *light*: unthinking 20 simple: dim-witted 24–25 would . . . of: would like to know from 27, 33 spiritual men: clergymen 31 meet: suitable 32, 33 of: from 32, 33 temporal men: lay people 35 make that noise: spread that rumor // policy: tactic

10

15

me nay: then will I press no farther upon him, but let every man, as I said before, believe it that thinketh it likely. But on the other side, if he answer me yea: then would I fain farther wit, whether ever himself went so far with them as to prove whether he should, by his own rule in this chapter, have cause to show their ordinary of them, that he might send for them... or else that, hearing folk so speak heresies by him, he took all to the best always, of his own special goodness... and, lest he might with questioning hap to find it worse, followed ever in that matter the good counsel that Saint Paul gave in another matter, "Nolite interrogare, propter conscientiam" ("Ask no question, lest you bring a scruple into your conscience"). If he used any diligence in questioning: then were it well likely that he found, in all this long while, somewhere, at the leastwise some one.

But, now, if he heard them speak heresy and found no fault therewith, nor no question asked: then is it, as I said, little marvel though he never nowhere in all England found one. And that is even one of the very things, while many folk now fall to the same fashion (to hear heresies talked and let the 20 talkers alone) which yet will, if they be brought into the Court before the judge, tell then the truth, and will not be so false as to be forsworn—this is, I say, one of the very special things for which in crime of heresy the suit ex officio (which in the next chapter following he laboreth sore to destroy) may, 25 whatsoever this man say, in no wise be forborne but if we would have the streets swarm full of heretics, which very likely were to follow, though he say nay forty times. And that have I, against his book of *Division*, well declared in mine Apology. And he hath again here in this book defended in 30 that point his book of *Division* (as yourselves shall anon see), God wot, with much work full feebly.

4 prove: find out; ascertain 6 show . . . of: tell their bishop about 9 worse: less good 10–13: See 1 Corinthians 10:25–30. 18 marvel: wonder // though: if 19 even: precisely // while: given that 20 fall . . . fashion: go in for the same behavior 22 false: dishonest 23 be forsworn: commit perjury 24 ex officio: See the note for 60/29. 29 declared: explained 31 anon: soon 32 wot: knows // full: yery

10

15

20

25

30

The Second Part

The Fifteenth Chapter

His fifteenth chapter, concerning the suit *ex officio*, beginneth in the 48th leaf of his book, and holdeth on into the 54th.

And forasmuch, good Christian readers, as it may well appear that this point is the special thing that he fain would bring about—that is to wit, to sow an opinion in men's heads that it were good to change and put away that suit—toward which purpose all his book of *Division* bendeth... laboring first, with his so many "some say"s, to bring the spiritual judges in suspicion and obloquy and make the people ween that they marvelously did, with much wrong and cruelty, mishandle men for heresy: therefore I shall in this point here confute his arguments so plainly, and in such wise, that whoso list indifferently to read both the parts shall find here causes good and sufficient why by his unreasonable reasons never after to set a fly.

And first, because ye shall well see that I will not wrestle in the dark, but bring the matter into light open and plain at your eyes... I will in this matter leave you not out one word of this his fifteenth chapter, but bring forth his words with mine. And then—while you read the one first and the other even afterhand—there shall neither he nor I... by any sly sleight deceive you.

But two things for this matter will I require you first: one, that you reject one wily sleight of his, with which he goeth about even from the beginning to corrupt our judgment that are temporal men, and in the reading to blind us with affection.

For in all this matter he maketh as there were two parties. The one he maketh the spiritualty. And this cause he so maketh theirs as though the commodity of that suit to be kept were a thing that pertained only unto them. The other party he maketh us of the temporalty, whom he would have put that same

6 fain would bring: is bent on bringing 11 marvelously: terribly 12 wrong: injustice 12 mishandle: mistreat 14 such wise: such a way // whoso: whoever 14 list: cares; chooses // indifferently: impartially; without bias 16–17 by . . . set a fly: for . . . have the least regard 16 unreasonable reasons: irrational arguments 18 because: so that 22 while: when // even afterhand: right afterward 23, 26 sleight: trick 26 reject: refuse to go along with; not let yourselves be taken in by 25 require: ask of 27 even from the: from the very 27–28 our . . . men: the judgment of us laypersons 28 affection: bias 29 as: as though 30 spiritualty: clergy 31 the . . . kept: i.e., the benefit of having the suit ex officio kept in force 33 temporalty: laity

10

15

20

25

suit away. For though that in the Parliament be spiritual men also—yet all were they all upon one side sure, he seeth well they were too few.

But it is necessary that we consider in this point that though the judges be spiritual, yet if that suit be necessary for preservation of the Catholic faith, then is the profit not the spiritual men's only, but that profit and advantage is our own too. And if by the change of that suit *ex officio* the decay of the Catholic faith shall follow in this realm: then is not the loss and damage unto the spiritualty alone, but the harm is importable unto the whole realm.

Therefore have this point in this matter ever before your eyes: that the change of that law if that law be good, but if he change it into a better, or at the least as good, is a common harm to the whole realm. And that harm happeneth in the greatest thing that we could possibly take harm in, if we be (as I wot well we be and ever intend to be) faithful, true Christian people.

Look, therefore, good readers, both to his reasons and mine, and if you find by his reasons that the putting away of that law be better for the keeping of the Catholic faith in this land—yea, or better otherwise for this land, without the diminishment of the faith in the same—then am I well content that ye account this good man both for very wise and for very faithful too.

But, now, if you find by mine answer on the other side, that all his reasons in this point are not worth one rush toward the proof of any necessary cause of change... but his reason and his arguments always such therein that either they be built upon a false ground... or else, if he make any that happen to be true, if ye find it yet but such as by the selfsame reason, if men would unwisely follow it, there might no law neither long last nor yet no law be made—if you find, I say, his reasons against this law but such—ye will then, I doubt not, think it but good reason, for all his royal reasoning, to let the law stand.

1 spiritual men: clergymen 2 all were they all: even if they all were 2 upon one side sure: firmly on the same side 3 were: would be 5 spiritual: of the clergy 8 decay: decline; falling-off 11 importable: communicable 19 to: at 19, 20, etc. reasons: arguments 20 putting away: abolishing 27 rush: straw 28, 31 reason: reasoning 33 yet: even 34 good reason: good sense; something that well accords with reason

20

But then if ye find further yet, as I wot well ye shall, that the change that he would make under a needless pretense of preserving innocents out of danger and peril, and cannot prove that this hundred years anyone was wronged with it, should cause heretics to be bold, take courage, and increase, and for lack of this law the Catholic faith to decay: then will you not, I wot well, let to tell this man that he lacketh in this matter, how gay soever he make it, either wit or (which worse were) love to the Christian faith.

The other thing that I require, you shall yourselves see reasonable.

For it serveth to the clear perceiving of us both, how both he and I bear ourselves in this matter. And I shall not require therein partially for my part, but a request indifferent and equal for us both, since ye shall the clearer thereby perceive whereabout we both go, and where any of us both swerve aside from the matter and, to hide the truth out of sight, slink into Lurkies' Lane.

My request is no more but that it may like you to take the labor and pain, for perceiving of the truth, from the beginning to peruse the whole matter as far as pertaineth to the change of this law.

Read first his own words in his own book of *Division*.

And after, read mine answer in mine *Apology*, which you shall find in the fortieth chapter, the 218th leaf; and his words too, therewith. And when those two things be both fresh in your mind, read then this his fifteenth chapter of this book, with mine answers everywhere added thereunto... and then have I when this is done little doubt of your judgment, ye shall see the matter prove against this good man so plain.

In his fifteenth chapter, good readers, he would make men ween that he sufficiently proveth three things. The one is that it were no hurt to change now this old law. The second thing is that it were great hurt to keep it. The third, that such examples of the laws of this realm as I resembled unto the suit *ex officio*, I resemble against reason, they be so far unlike.

2 pretense: professed aspiration 4 it: i.e., the suit ex officio
6 decay: suffer a decline; wane 7 let: forbear // matter: thing
8 how . . . it: no matter how good he makes it look // wit: intelligence 10, 12 require: ask
10 see: i.e., see as 13 part: side // indifferent: impartial 15 any: either
17 Lurkies' Lane: a back alley 18 like: please 20 peruse: examine
33 were no hurt: would do no harm 35, 36 resemble(d): liken(ed)

Into these three points, therefore, will I divide this chapter, that the reader may the better see in what part he is.

I shall rehearse you first here his whole words together, that he bringeth for the first point. Lo, good readers, these they be:

Then to the conventing of men before spiritual judges ex officio, 5 and whereupon Master More saith in his *Apology*, folio 219, that if it were left, "the streets were likely to swarm full of heretics"—verily I marvel right much at his saying therein, and that for this cause: it is certain that no man may, after the law, be detected of heresy but 10 that there is some man that knoweth the cause before, why he ought so to be. For if it be secret in his own breast, none can be his judge but God only, that is the searcher of man's heart. And if any will avow that he knoweth the cause, and will denounce him as a heretic therefor: then it is reason that he be taken as his accuser. And if he will not avow to be his accuser, it is to think that he doth it of some 15 malice or craft, rather than for the truth of the matter. And if he say he dare not for fear of his life avow it, I have showed a means, in the seventh chapter of the said treatise, how the witnesses may be saved from danger, as by showing the matter to the King and his Council, and that then it is not to suppose nor so to think but that they 20 will provide sufficiently for the indemnity of the witnesses in that behalf. And this remedy Master More denieth not to be convenient for this realm. And yet he will not assent that a law be made that it shall be so. And then if the witness will not avow it, but another 25 will give credence to him and avow it: then it seemeth reasonable that they that will give credence thereto, and will report it... be taken as accusers taking those witnesses for their warrant, if it be denied.

In these words, lo, good readers, you see how he proveth his first point: that of the change of this law by putting away this suit *ex officio* (wherein without any special accuser offering himself as party, the suspect may be called in before the judge *ex officio*; that is to wit, by reason of his office) there could no harm grow at all.

5 conventing: summoning 7 left: done away with 9 may: can // after: according to 9 detected: formally accused 12 avow: assert 14 therefor: on account of it 14 it...he: reason calls for him to 15 avow: agree 16 craft: guile 19 showing: presenting 21 indemnity: security; protection against retaliation 22 convenient: suitable 29 putting away: abolishing 30 special: particular 33 grow: come

And how doth he now prove us this point? He proveth it, as you see, first by a certain reason put and presupposed for a ground... and then, after that, by a certain order that himself shortly deviseth and setteth up upon the same. His ground and his foundation is this:

5

It is certain [he saith] that no man may, after the law, be detected of heresy... but that there is some man that knoweth the cause before, why he ought so to be.

Very truth it is that no man can be detected, except a man detect himself, but if some other see something in him wherefore he should seem naught—some one thing or other that they which perceive it suspect him therefore themselves. And therefore, as for this ground, this good man and I will not greatly strive.

10

Then followeth his order that he deviseth and buildeth up thereupon thus:

15

And if any will avow that he knoweth the cause, and will denounce him a heretic therefor: then is it reason that he be taken as his accuser.

This is a right good reason... and the spiritual law will not refuse so to take him and accept him for an accuser if he will... and then will they not in that case use the suit *ex officio*. For in that case it needeth not. But, now, what if he that knoweth it, and secretly detecteth it, peradventure four or five and sometimes more too, and yet not one of them all will openly be called an accuser, but will be content to be taken and known for a witness, called in by the Court and sworn, and to tell the truth as of a necessity, and not as accusers of their neighbor of their own offer, willingly—what shall the ordinary do then?

25

20

Against this peril this good man giveth us this remedy:

30

If they will not be his accusers, it is to think that they do it of some malice or craft, rather than for the truth of the matter.

I ween, good readers, that there is no man but when he heareth

2 reason: consideration 3, 15 order: procedure 10 but . . . other: unless someone else 18 is it reason: it is in accord with reason 20 reason: argument 20 spiritual: ecclesiastical; Church 23 needeth not: is not necessary

24 *detecteth it*: reports it (to the bishop) 26 *content*: willing

28 of their own offer: on their own initiative // willingly: voluntarily

10

15

20

this answer, he would ween there were yet for the farther remedy some other more matter behind. For what madman would think that this were a sufficient remedy, so fully provided for this matter, that if there were any heretics, they could not fail so fully to be detected by this way of accusation that there should need no suit *ex officio*, because they that know it may either hold their peace if they list, or else, if they will algates detect any man, may be taken and accepted for accusers... and if they will not openly be taken so, then be taken for malicious and crafty, and therefore believe them not, but bid them like false harlots hence and go get them home!

But how shall we do yet for one thing? For though that their refusing to become open accusers were a conjecture to lead us somewhat to believe them false or malicious—yet were it not so great a conjecture on that side, nor so sure, but that we might be therein deceived and they both charitable and true, and the man they detected a very perilous heretic in very deed. And then, for aught that this man deviseth yet, we should need the suit *ex officio* to bolt out this matter better... or else that man that they detected shall (if he be such as they said he was) teach heresies still, and do much harm a great while.

Also, good readers, this good man hath no such cause so sore to mistrust such a denouncer only because that he refuseth 25 to be taken of his own offer for a party and an open accuser, considering that he refuseth not to be brought in by process and depose in the party's own presence as a witness, and will be content that his depositions, himself standing by, be published and read openly before the world. And therefore any 30 wise man would ween that this good man to prove that we should not need the suit ex officio, if he would make his suit by way of accusation sufficient to serve in the stead, he had need to have devised some farther thing than this. But this good host of ours prayeth you for this feast to be merry with such as you 35 have, for here is all your fare... saving that to make us like this

5 detected: made known 2 *matter*: thing 8 algates: at any rate 8, 18, 21 detect(ed): report(ed); inform(ed) on 10 crafty: fraudulent 11 false: contemptible // hence: vamoose; scram 13 though that: even if 14, 16 conjecture: indication; basis for judgment 15 false: dishonest 17 deceived: mistaken // true: truthful 18 perilous: dangerous 19 aught: anything 22 teach heresies still: go on teaching heresies 20 bolt out: sift out: investigate 30 published: given public notice of 35 merry: happy 26 offer: accord 36 here . . . fare: i.e., this is all you get

10

15

20

25

30

35

meat the better, and fill our bellies somewhat the better therewith, he giveth us one little mess of sauce to it, in showing us a cause... wherefore it is good reason that we should give them no credence that detect a man of heresy and yet will refuse to become his open accusers. And the cause that he giveth us is this:

For if he say [saith this good man] that he dare not for fear of his life avow it, I have showed a means, in the seventh chapter of the said treatise, how the witnesses may be saved from danger, as by showing the matter to the King and his Council... and that then it is not to suppose nor to think but that they will provide sufficiently for the indemnity of the witnesses in that behalf.

Now, good readers, heard any man any reason made for sufficient, by any man that any reason had in his head—and handled so insufficiently? By this wise reason he maketh as though no man detecting any man of heresy, except he surmised the matter of falsehood and malice, would refuse to be his open accuser for anything save for only fear; nor for no less fear, neither, than only the fear of death. And then for that fear, he hath, as he saith, devised sufficient remedy.

Now, that none other thing can let a man to make himself a party and an open accuser but only fear, I ween there will no man grant him; and that, no less fear than only fear of death—and add fear of all bodily harm thereto—that will, I ween, every wise man less grant him.

But now let us consider whether the fear that himself granteth to be sufficient to let a detector from taking upon him to be an accuser be so sufficiently provided for by this good man that it must needs be that by his provision that fear shall be quite gone. For if that it may be that all his provision notwithstanding, the man's fear may still remain in his heart—then may it also be, pardie, that be his detection never so true, yet he may for that fear refuse to make himself a party and become an open accuser.

Consider now, therefore, what is the remedy that he hath devised in his seventh chapter. He rehearseth it here again:

1 meat: food 2 mess: serving // showing: telling
3 is good reason: makes good sense 12 indemnity: protection
15 wise reason: brilliant argument 16 except: unless
16–17 surmised . . . falsehood: trumped up the charge out of treachery
21 let . . . to make: deter . . . from making 25 wise: sensible 27 let: deter
32 pardie: by George 33 never so true: no matter how truthful 36 rehearseth: repeats

that upon complaint made to the King and his Council, "it is not to suppose nor think but that they would provide sufficiently for the indemnity of the witnesses in that behalf."

I am content to grant him, for the while, that they will sufficiently provide for the indemnity of the witnesses. But 5 first, all this provision is in our case here very needless. And his provision in the seventh chapter of his Division is brought in for another manner of matter: that is to wit, against a provision made in the spiritual law, by which it is there devised that in some cases, for dread of peril that may fall to the witnesses, the 10 ordinary shall not suffer the party that is detected to know who hath witnessed against him. And now would this good man beguile his readers in this chapter, and make them ween that that special provision in that one special case, which provision, I ween, was yet in England never put in ure, were a common 15 order in every man's case. But consider, good reader, that our case is now that the man refuseth not to be a witness... but is content both to be sworn when he is as a witness called in and to avow then his deposition true, before the judge, in the party's own presence... and if he may so be used, as a witness, 20 will neither be afraid nor ashamed, nor desire to put the King's Council to any business about the provision of his indemnity at all. And therefore in our case, this good man's provision devised for witnesses shall not need for our witnesses, if he let the suit ex officio proceed, and receive them 25 as only witnesses.

But on the other side, if this good man put away that suit, and will receive no man first for a denouncer secretly, and after that for a witness too, that will refuse at the beginning to make himself a party and become an open accuser; but,

30 though they were such twenty, will take them all for false shrews and put them to silence except some one of them will take upon him the name and person of an accuser:

I say that his provision doth not suffice, not even in his own case of fear, to make every true man content to accuse a heretic...

35 but that we must either let that heretic alone and

6 needless: unnecessary 8 manner: kind 9 spiritual: Church
10 dread . . . fall: fear of danger that could come 11 suffer: allow 15 in ure: into use
16 order: carried-out procedure 25, 28 receive: admit; accept 27 put away: get rid of
31–32 false shrews: lying scoundrels 32 except: unless 35 true: right-believing
35 content: willing

10

15

let him go make more, or else must we use the suit *ex officio* still.

"That is not so," saith this good man. "For if he become an accuser I have devised a remedy for his indemnity." That is well and properly said. But we speak not of his loss, but of his fear. "Why, what should he need to fear when he can take no loss?" Hath this good man never heard in his life that some man hath been worse afeard than hurt? A man may fear, pardie, though he fear causeless. And if he so do still, then will he not become the accuser and anger him whom he feareth, though the man be bound—and right good sureties with him—that he shall do his accuser no bodily harm at all.

His fear is also, for all the provision that can be made by sufficient surety, not all causeless yet. For he may well and with good reason fear that he that is bound may by some secret shrews of his acquaintance murder him; and that in such wise as when he doth it, he may ween and have hope that it shall never be known for his deed, nor he thereby lose forfeiture of his bond.

There can no man (ye wot well) also kill another but with the 20 peril of his own life. And yet is there daily many a man that standeth, for all that, in dread that another man will for evil will and malice destroy him. And the common laws of this realm so far forth allow and approve his dread, for all that his enemy is upon loss of his own life bound to the contrary, 25 that upon his own oath, they compel the party to be bound, with other sureties for him, in certain sums of money, that he shall not. And yet the man that feared before may peradventure be full feared still, that his enemy will as well adventure the forfeiture of his friends' money, as he before feared that he 30 would adventure his own life. But yet because it may be that his respect unto friendship will temper his respect of malice and make him loath, for hurting of one whom he hateth, to hurt twain whom he loveth—the man is content, since he can go no farther, to take that may be gotten, and so to sue for such 35 surety to live thereby, though not in full surety, nor clean out

5 well and properly: quite rightly 10 though: even if 11 bound: obligated by legal authority 11, 27 sureties: guarantors; bond posters 14 surety: guarantee 16 secret: clandestine; underground 18, 30 forfeiture: the fine 20–21 but . . . life: without putting his own life in jeopardy 22 evil will: ill will 24 allow and approve: condone and sanction 29 full: quite 29, 31 adventure: risk 32 his: i.e., that enemy's // respect: consideration; regard 35 that may be gotten: what he can get // sue: take legal action 35–36 *such surety*: such security 36 full surety: complete safety

10

15

20

of fear, yet in surety somewhat the more, and in fear somewhat the less.

But, now, this man that doth detect this heretic, against whom he feareth to make himself an open adversary and accuser, is not in the case before he become his accuser, but may sit still, you see well, and hold his peace, and needeth not to make that heretic his adversary by his willful accusation; which if he should once do, he will never after, haply while he liveth, reckon himself so sure from bodily harm that he may after hap to have by him and by his means, as he will reckon to be in if he accuse him not, nor by such open accusation give him an open occasion of displeasure; no, not for all the provision that all the world can imagine for his surety—except only such surety as a poor man devised once for himself, when he came to a king and complained how sore he feared that such a servant of his would kill him. And the king bade him, "Fear not, fellow, for I promise ye, if he kill thee he shall be hanged within a little while after." "Nay, my liege lord," quoth the poor soul, "I beseech Your Grace let him be hanged for it a great while before. For I shall never live in the less fear till I see him hanged first."

Now will this good man haply say that this manner of reasoning should prove not only that a man for fear would refuse to be an accuser, but also to be a witness... and then were it against myself, too.

That is not so in every case. For commonly no man is in such wise
angry with them that are in a matter witnesses against him, and
may seem to witness against their wills, for the necessity of
their oaths whereto they may be or may seem to be compelled, as
with him whom he seeth willingly, no man calling him, come
forth of his own offer to accuse him. And therefore the cases be
very far unlike. But yet in some cases when the party that is
detected is known for mighty, and for so malicious
therewith that he will of likelihood hate and mischief any man
by whom he taketh any harm, though the other man do it
never so much against his will: in such cases the fear may

35
be such indeed that it may peradventure cause some that

5 case: legal action 7 willful: voluntary 8 haply while: perhaps as long as 9 sure: safe 13 imagine: think up; devise 15 such a: such-and-such a; a certain 26 matter: court action 27 for: on account of // necessity: constraining power 29 willingly: voluntarily // calling: subpoenaing 33 mischief: do physical harm to; inflict injury on

10

15

20

25

30

35

else would tell the truth, if he should never know them, for dread of his displeasure to be forsworn rather than abide the adventure, whatsoever provision any man should devise for their surety.

And for such case, if it happened, was the law made which in his seventh chapter this man so sore complaineth of: that the party detected should in such case be kept from the knowledge of the witnesses... and as (with the provisions that are in that law made farther) very good reason is that he should. And therefore is even here that point of his seventh chapter of his *Division*, and all that ever he can farther devise for the farther defense thereof, fully answered here by the way.

But now saith this good man thereto, that I deny not in mine *Apology* that "remedy" of his device to be "convenient for this realm"... and yet I will not, he saith, "assent that a law be made that it shall be so."

In this tale this good, honest man saith untrue. The words in mine *Apology* whereupon he taketh hold to say that I deny not his device to be convenient for this realm be these:

His device, though peradventure it would serve in some one land, would yet not serve in some other. And they that made that law of the Church made it as it might serve most generally through Christendom... whereas this device, though it might serve in England, might not have served in many places of Almaine that are perverted since; not even while that matter was in a mammering, before the change was made.

But surely that same law and others of old made against heresies, if they had been in Almaine duly followed in the beginning, the matter had not there gone out at length to such an ungracious ending.

These be, lo, the words of mine *Apology*, the forty-second chapter, folio 232, whereof this man taketh hold to say that I deny not in mine *Apology* that his device is convenient for this realm. For in these words indeed I do not deny it... but then, you see well, I do not grant it, neither.

But afterward, in the selfsame chapter, the very next leaf after, against the sufficiency of his device write I these words following:

And on the other side, the remedy that he deviseth for the surety of the

2 be forsworn: commit perjury 2–3 abide the adventure: sustain the risk 9 very good reason is: it very much stands to reason 14, 19, 31 convenient: suitable 17 honest: honorable 23 though: even if 24, 27 Almaine: Germany 24 perverted: become apostate 25 in a mammering: not yet settled; up in the air 28 ungracious: ungodly / unfortunate 37 side: hand

10

15

witnesses should not peradventure make the men so bold as in a cause of heresy to meddle in the matter against some manner of man... but that they rather would for their own surety keep their own tongues still than, with all the surety that could be found them beside, have their persons disclosed unto the party.

Lo, good readers, the thing that he saith I deny not, because that in the first words I neither said yea nor nay (for I said not that it might serve in England... but that *though* it might serve in England, yet might it not serve in Almaine; which words I might have said though I had, in the next line before, expressly said that it might not serve in England)—that thing do I (as you see) forthwith in the next leaf well and plainly deny. And yet you see that he saith here again in this book that I deny it not. This good man seemeth not very shamefast, lo, but if his logic lead him to think that this were a good argument: "In these words he denieth it not: ergo, he denieth it not." Which argument is even as good as this: "He denieth it not in one place: ergo, he denieth it not in no place."

Now, where he saith that though I deny not his device to be convenient, yet I will not assent that a law be made that it shall 20 be so: surely as much of his device as I think convenient for the realm, so much thereof will I not be against that a law be made that it shall be so. For where this good man thinketh it convenient for this realm that he which is detected or accused of heresy should be bound, and find sureties, that he shall not 25 hurt neither accuser nor witness: I will not be against it that a law be made that it shall be so. But yet, though that law were made (since, for all that law, there would remain a fear behind in the men's hearts for whose safeguard such sureties should be found, and peril and danger, too, sufficient to make them 30 draw back from making themselves in heresy open accusers, and in some cases from bearing witness also, but if they thought their names should from the person against whom they should witness be surely kept close and unknown), I would not assent, for my part, to put away the said law that he 35 speaketh of in his seventh chapter of his Division, for chances that might hereafter happen. And much less would I grant to

2 meddle: involve themselves // matter: court action 4 beside: otherwise 4 persons: identities 8, 10 though: even if 10 might: could 10 next line before: line right before 14 shamefast: decent 14, 32 but if: unless 15, 17 good: sound 17 even: just 34 surely: securely // close: secret 35 put away: do away with 36 for: because of // chances: misfortunes 37 grant: agree

10

15

20

put away the suit against heretics *ex officio*, into his device of only open accusers, for the harm that would undoubtedly daily grow by the increase of heretics and hindrance of the Catholic faith—no more than, though I blame not the law by which he that is afeard of killing shall have his adversary bound to the peace, I would yet, when the other is so bound by recognizance, have that law stand instead of the other by which he shall if he kill that man fall thereby further into the danger of hanging.

And yet this his gay, glorious device, that he devised in his former book and here now repeateth again, no man needeth to give him any great thank for. For who knew not that always—that whosoever be afeard may desire and have surety for the peace, if he fear himself of his life or bodily harm, and may ask it of course upon his oath as soon as he is afeard (and sooner, pardie, this man deviseth it not), of the King's ordinary justices, without any other, further suit to trouble the King's Grace or his Council with.

But yet will all this surety-finding, as you see, never so take away the fear of harm from men's hearts but that they will rather forbear to be accusers than by the becoming of an open accuser run in the deadly malice of that man by whom, for all his bond and all his sureties found, they fear still always that they shall take hurt.

But here will haply this good man tell me now that I 25 am a man importunate, and one whom no reason can satisfy... and bid me therefore go devise some further thing mine own self for help of the matter, and assay also what further thing any other folk can find therein. And if neither mine own wit nor no man's else can find no further remedy, wherefore should I then 30 blame him when he deviseth as full a remedy as any man's reason can find? Forsooth, I can, with any wit that I have—nor, I ween, no more can no man else—find no further remedy than he findeth here himself. But yet, since the furthest that he can find is very far insufficient with change of the suit ex officio to keep 35 heresies from great increase and preserve the Catholic faith, I can therefore find at hand a much nearer remedy than this that he

1 *into*: in favor of 4 *blame not*: find no fault with; have nothing against 5 *of killing*: i.e., of being killed 10 *gay*: brilliant // *glorious*: impressive 12 *thank*: credit 13 *desire and have*: request and obtain 13 *surety for the peace*: a protection like a peace bond or restraining order 14–15 *of course*: by standard procedure 22 *run in*: incur 26 *importunate*: vexatious; exasperating 26, 32 *reason*: reasoning 28 *help*: remedy 28 *assay*: see 29, 32 *wit*: mental ability 31 *blame*: find fault with 98/37—99/1 *this*... *far*: i.e., this one that is so far-fetched

10

15

20

fetcheth so far: that is to wit, to let his new devices pass and let the old law stand still.

And thus you see, good readers, that this piece, wherein he so boasteth the provision that he hath devised so sufficient to deliver the accusers from fear, leaveth them so in dread and fear still, that though there were no let but the fear of bodily harm—yet of many true men that will detect and bear witness, ye should find but very few that would become accusers.

But, now, though there were found provision good and sure to drive out of the accuser's heart all fear of bodily hurt—yet are there many that dare secretly detect, and by whom the ordinary shall know who can tell more, and will also, if they be called and sworn, and will not uncalled and unsworn tell no tale at all... and they themselves, also, will neither accuse nor yet bear witness neither, nor so much as have it known that ever they spoke word therein. And that not for any fear of their life, for which this good man findeth, as he saith, a "remedy"... but for loss of their living, for which he findeth none, nor never once thought thereon. And yet is the living to some folk as lief almost as the life. And their living they fear utterly to lose (that they get, peradventure, by them whom yet of charity, for their amendment, they detect) if they were once perceived anything to meddle in the matter.

And yet, as I said before, every wise man well wotteth there are many other affections besides all such fear that let men 25 to become accusers in heresy, and yet letteth them not to do otherwise truly and charitably their duty, both in secret detecting of them and also in open bearing witness against them, when they be called forth and commanded by the Court to depose, that will never, as I said, of their own offer make 30 themselves a party and openly become their accuser.

Now, what if there were but two witnesses of the matter, such as were well able plainly to prove the thing? If neither of both may be heard but if the one should become the accuser—when the one were made party, then were the proof lost. But we shall not need much, I warrant you, to care for this case. For of them both, you shall have neither nother that will.

2 stand still: remain in effect 6 let: deterrent 7 true: orthodox; right-believing 9–10 good and sure: quite certain 13 called: subpoenaed // sworn: put under oath 14 yet: even 20 lief: dear 23 anything to meddle: to have any involvement 24 wise: sensible 25 affections: feelings // let men: make people unwilling 27 truly: uprightly 36 care for this case: worry about this situation

Howbeit, yet hath this good man at last found a good way for that. For lo, sir, thus he saith:

And then if the witness will not avow it, but another will give credence to him and avow it: then it seemeth reasonable that they that will give credence thereto, and will report it, be taken as accuserstaking those witnesses for their warrant if they be denied.

5

If he think it likely that none of them will become accusers that were present and heard it themselves—then is it yet less likely that he will become the accuser that heareth it but at a second hand. And therefore methinketh that this device is not much wiser than the device that a good fellow devised once for his neighbor, that had a great hillock in his close... which for planing of the ground he counseled him to have it away. "Marry," quoth his neighbor, "I must carry it, then, so far that it were less loss to me to give away the close and all." "Marry, neighbor," quoth the other, "I shall soon find a way for that. For I shall devise a provision that it shall be had away and yet never carried hence. For even thereas it lieth, lo, dig me a great pit, and carry it never further, but bury it even in that." "Where shall I then lay that heap," quoth his neighbor, "that cometh out of the pit?" At that the other studied a little. But when he had well bethought him—"Marry," quoth he, "even dig another great pit under that, and bury me that heap there."

15

10

20

25

30

So this man will in any wise, lo, have away this hillock, this suit ex officio, that he saith doth here much hurt, "How shall we have it away," say we, "without yet much more hurt?" "Good remedy," saith this good man, "shortly shall I devise. Put accusers in the stead of that suit, and they shall do much better." "Who shall be the accusers?" say we. "Marry," saith he, "they that hear them." "They will not," say we, "become accusers in no manner case." "No will they," saith he, "then be they but false shrews." "What remedy, then," say we, "to supply the said suit?" "A ready way," saith he: "Take some other that heareth the other that heard the heretic speak."

1, 16 for that: i.e., to take care of that 11 wiser: more sensible 12, 18, 22 great: large 12, 15 close: enclosed field 13 have it away: get rid of it 14, 15, etc. marry: indeed 18 hence: away from here // even thereas: right there where 19 bury it even: just bury it 22 even: just 31 no will they: if they will not // false shrews: lying scoundrels

"He will much less become accuser," say we, "than they that heard it themselves." What hath this good man farther to say than bid us take then another that will? And ever we follow still and say we shall never find him; and that word he denieth not, but always biddeth us go get one. And now if the 5 second man were content, or the fifteenth after—yet hath this man marred all this matter with one thing. For you wot well that if the witness that saith he was present and heard it his own ears will refuse to become the accuser himself—this good man will that the ordinary shall take him for malicious or false. 10 Now, then, if we get, with long labor, some other man to accuse yet him that heard it and would not be the accuser himself, since the bishop must take him always for malicious or false in the matter, he may never accept him therein for a witness. For if we take him for fraudulent and malicious to the 15 party... this man's credence is ten times less, in all reason, than his is that afterward deposeth to his harm where he was first forsworn while he would fain have done him good; and that man would not this good man believe after, in no wise. 20

And thus both for the one cause and the other, for lack of an accuser and credence of the witness, you see plainly, good readers, that by this man's device, if we dig up and bury this hillock *ex officio*, we shall when we have all done, say he what he list, make and leave that never will then be voided, as great a hillock of heretics in the stead.

And this you see, good readers: that this good man showeth us yet no let, but that for anything that he saith here, if the suit *ex officio* were changed as he would have it, and instead thereof trust all unto accusers—of which, for anything that he deviseth,
we were likely to find few, and as I fear me, verily rather none at all—it were well likely to come to pass, as I said, that the streets should swarm full of heretics ere ever they were convented and repressed by his way. Of which saying of mine as much marvel as he saith he hath, yet showeth he nothing
(as you see) wherefore he should marvel of it; nor to the things

3 follow: keep on 4 word: statement 6 content: willing
7 marred all this matter: ruined this whole case 8 heard it: i.e., heard it with
10, 14 false: dishonest 11 accuse: i.e., do the accusing
17–18 was first forsworn: first perjured himself 22 credence: credibility
25 voided: gotten rid of 28 yet: so far // no let: i.e., nothing to keep this from happening
34 convented: summoned // repressed: suppressed
34–35 of . . . hath: as surprised as he says he is at this claim of mine
36 wherefore: on account of which // marvel of: be surprised at

that I prove it with... he no more answereth than though he never heard them.

Which dealing of his you may clearly perceive even by the very same leaf wherein I wrote those words of which he marveleth so much and hath so little cause. For there, lo, my words be these:

5

For surely if the conventing of heretics *ex officio* were left, and changed into another order by which no man should be called, be he never so sore suspected nor by never so many men detected, but if some man make himself party against him as his accuser: the streets were likely to swarm full of heretics before that right few were accused, or peradventure any one, either.

10

These were, lo, my words in mine *Apology*, against which you have heard what he saith. Then, because he should *not* need to marvel at the matter, I show by and by what maketh me so to say. For there it followeth thus:

15

For, whatsoever the cause be, it is not unknown, I am sure, that many will give to a judge secret information of such things as, though they be true, yet gladly he will not, or peradventure dare not, be openly known that the matter came out by him.

20

Consider here, good readers, that as to become open accusers, I speak here of two lets. One, that men *will* not; another, that some men *dare* not. And yet that they dare not... I put as the more rare and more seldom. Now cometh this good answerer, and for the more seldom, that is to wit, where they dare not, he deviseth a "remedy" which seldom yet, or never, sufficiently shall serve the matter. And the other cause, that I call most common, as in very deed it is—that cause he neither denieth nor any one word speaketh of it, but softly slinketh beside it, as though he had never read it. What manner of answering, good readers, call you this?

25

Moreover, lest he might deny me that I said true therein, I laid there for the proof the plain, common experience, which this good man himself, I am very sure, but if he be a recluse and have been all his life, knoweth well to be true; and, indeed, he saith not nay.

30

35

Then go I there farther yet, and I declare what profit there

8 order: procedure; system // called: subpoenaed 9 sore: strongly // detected: reported 14 because: so that 15 show by and by: state immediately 19 be: i.e., have it be 22 lets: hindrances // will not: do not want to 26 serve: take care of 37 declare: explain

cometh to the commonweal to give such folk hearing—such folk, I say, as this good man would have rejected back, and taken for false or malicious, because they come secretly and will not themselves openly become accusers. Therein, lo, these are my words:

5

And yet shall he sometimes give the names of divers others... which being called by the judge, and examined as witnesses against their wills, both know and will also depose the truth, and he that first gave information also; and yet will never one of them willingly make himself an open accuser of the party, nor dare, peradventure, for his ears.

10

This thing, good readers, every man everywhere findeth true that any order of justice hath in his hand. And in these words, you see well, I told him there once again not only that some dare not, but that though men dare they *will* not (except the thing do privately touch themselves), for the causes of the commonweal become open accusers. And as I again there told it him—so he here again forgetteth it.

15

Then go I yet forth a little farther, and these are there my words:

20

And this find we not only in heresy, but in many temporal matters among ourselves... whereof I have had experience many a time and oft, both in the disclosing of felonies and, sometimes, of much other oppression used by some one man or twain in a shire, whereby all their neighbors sore smarted—and yet not one durst openly complain.

25

Lo, thus I there declared, good readers, by common experience, that if men should do as this man here deviseth—reject every man for malicious and crafty that will give secret information, but if he be content to become an accuser openly—there should much harm grow thereof... not in heresies only, but besides that, in much other mischief too. To all this gear you see, good readers, that this good man playeth as though he came in in a mummery, for any one word he saith; which should not so have escaped him, ye may be very sure, but that he saw full surely that he could never answer them. For though he would have denied all that I speak of mine own experience, yet in the like

30

9 willingly: voluntarily 10–11 for his ears: for fear of serious harm
13 any . . . hand: presides over any legal proceeding 15 except: unless
16 do . . . themselves: affects them personally 18 forgetteth: disregards
25 sore smarted: suffered greatly 26 declared: showed 30 grow: come
31 mischief: wickedness // gear: stuff 32 mummery: mime show
33 which: i.e., which things 33–34 escaped him: gotten by him; gone unmentioned by him
34 full surely: quite certainly 35 though . . . denied: even if he had wanted to deny
36 all . . . of: everything I say from

35

10

15

things so many men of worship daily do prove the thing true that I tell it for, that he could nothing win in his cause by all that denying. And yet did I not mine own self my business in such wise but that I can, if need require, prove it plain enough. But of this gear, as I said, he denieth nothing, nor answereth nothing neither thereunto. And sure may you be that if he had could, he would not have failed to have done the one.

And therefore, good readers, my words stand still so sure that this good man hath not yet, nor never shall while he liveth, be able to void them with all the craft he can, but that if men would be so far overseen as in this matter to follow his device—to put away this old law, the suit *ex officio*, and trust that all would be well helped by means of open accusers—it would at length come to pass, the thing that I have said: that the streets were well likely to swarm full of heretics ere ever that right few should be thereof accused, or peradventure any one heretic either.

And now, good Christian readers—since you see so clearly that by such changing of that law, the Catholic faith should decay—I 20 care not now greatly what he say for his second part, since he hath so foul an overthrow in the first, upon which first part all the matter hangeth. For though he could in his second part make you now good proof not only that there might, but also that there did and hath done, great harm grow by that 25 suit (which he shall never prove you while he liveth; but at sundry times and that of late, where it hath been so surmised, it hath always been proved the contrary): yet since you see well that by this change that he deviseth, while we would help these harms that he speaketh of (that is to wit, that no man should be 30 convented of heresy causeless), we should by the providing for that harm be the cause of far more hurt and harm in the stead—that is to wit, that when that suit were so changed, the Catholic faith should decay, and heretics so should increase that (by such insurrections as they have herebefore 35 made, not in other countries only, but in this realm of England

1 worship: high standing // prove: find by their own experience 5 gear: stuff 9 words: statements // sure: indisputably true 7–8 *the one*: either the one or the other 10, 26 while: as long as 11 void: nullify // craft he can: trickery he knows 12 far overseen: very imprudent // follow: go along with // device: idea 14 *helped*: remedied 20, 34 decay: fall off; erode 22 foul: disgraceful; shameful 22 overthrow: defeat 23 *all the matter*: the whole case 25 grow by: result from 27 surmised: alleged 29 help: remedy 31 convented . . . causeless: hauled in for heresy without cause

10

15

20

25

30

35

have also attempted the same) put it upon the peril and assay to rob, despoil, and *kill*, also, much innocent people openly, and turn folk from the faith by force, and work other manner of masteries many more, such as my heart abhorreth so much as to rehearse or name—since every man may see, I say, that such harm were in peril to fall by this change of his, there will, I ween, no wise man follow his fond device in putting this law away, although he proved well in his second part that there were harm in the keeping... while he cannot defend the contrary but that there were incomparably much more harm in the leaving.

But by what way he proveth that there is great hurt in the keeping, that shall we now consider. After which well examined... I shall again return, good readers, eftsoons unto the first: that this suit *ex officio* taken once away, the streets were likely to swarm full of heretics. And as clear as you see that point already—and that this man hath therein neither answered nor once touched such things as yourselves see that I said therein before—yet shall I make it you anon, with the farther folly of his device, doubly (ere we depart) so clear.

Concerning the second part, thus, lo, this man beginneth:

But to put the party that is complained on to answer, and to condemn him if he say contrary to that the witnesses have said, not knowing who *be* the witnesses, nor who be his accusers: it seemeth not reasonable to be accepted for a law. For as I have said in the said treatise, if he that is accused knew their names that accused him, he might percase allege and prove so great and so vehement cause of rancor and malice in them that accuse him, or bear witness against him, that their sayings by no law ought to stand against him. As if there were two men that had sworn the death of another... and because they cannot bring it about, they imagine how they may bring him to all the shame and vexation that they can, and thereupon they appeach him of heresy—if he in this case knew their names, he might prove their rancor and malice. And because he knoweth them not, he cannot prove it. And also the witness may be such as shall

1 put . . . peril: take the risk 2 assay: make bold // much: a lot of 3–4 work . . . more: use many more kinds of strong-arm tactics 5 rehearse: relate 5, 32 *may*: can 6 were . . . by: was in danger of resulting from 7–8 follow . . . away: go along with his idiotic idea of getting rid of this law 8 although: even if 9 while: when 11 the leaving: the doing away with (it) 14 eftsoons: a second time 18 touched: mentioned 19 anon: within a little while 19 folly: foolishness 24 condemn: convict // that: what 27 their names that: the names of those who 28 percase: by chance 28 vehement: serious // cause: a case 30 sayings: statements 32 imagine: plot 30 stand: count 31 as: such as 34 appeach: accuse

have his lands by escheat after his death. And if it be said that these cases fall so seldom that it ought little to be pondered—so may it be said likewise that it falleth but seldom that the witnesses in heresy stand in any fear of them that they accuse. And then to make a general law to prohibit all men that they should not have knowledge of the witnesses in no case, it is not reasonable.

5

Now, good readers, one thing opened unto you which is truth, which this man of wiliness hideth from you and would make you ween the truth were contrary—divide, after that known, all this mischief and unreasonableness that he telleth us here into twenty parts... and with the bare knowledge of that one truth, nineteen and a half of all his false, feigned mischiefs are gone.

10

The truth is, good Christian readers, that except only one case, whereof he speaketh in his seventh chapter of his *Division*, where to let the party know the witnesses were peril—to which I have answered him both in mine *Apology*, first, and since even in this same chapter before—else, in all other cases, the witnesses whose depositions shall be taken and laid against him to prove him a heretic, and upon which deposition sentence of condemning him for a heretic shall be given against him, he shall see them and shall hear their depositions too. So that if there be any such great causes as this good man here imagineth that might happen, of enmity, or hope of lucre, or any much less either, the judge both may and will consider them before the sentence.

20

15

"But why shall he not know them forthwith, when he is first convented?" For it were not well done he should, no more than the King's Council, that many times call malefactors before them upon secret information first, use always there by and by to disclose who told them the matter and what; which if they should, and by and by bring him forth, then though the suspect would confess haply something thereby the sooner—yet should it be but that thing which he thought the other knew. Whereas while the thief knoweth not who hath given the information,

25

2, 3 fall(eth): occur(s) 7 opened: explained 1 have: get // escheat: forfeiture 8 of: out of 9 *contrary*: the opposite 10, 12 *mischief(s)*: harm(s) 11 bare: mere 12 feigned: fabricated 16 the witnesses: i.e., who the witnesses are 16 were peril: would be dangerous 21 sentence of: the verdict with regard to 22 against: about 25 *lucre*: monetary gain 26 the sentence: i.e., giving the verdict 28 convented: summoned // for . . . done: because it would not be good that 29 call: summon // malefactors: criminals 30 use: make it their practice 30, 32 by and by: immediately 33 *haply*: perhaps 35 while: when

30

35

10

15

20

and yet thinketh by his examination that among his many fellows, though they be thieves all, yet some false shrews there be, he misguesseth among and weeneth it were one where indeed it was another... and so instead of one felony, to light there cometh twain.

But at another time and in another place, before he shall have any judgment thereupon, he shall commonly see them sworn and hear them speak, too.

And here I say "commonly" because that sometimes, percase, in point of judgment, he shall not have them brought forth and sworn in his presence, nor peradventure never hear them speak in the matter. For they may happen to be some that deposed and died, too, before himself were taken; and some haply that were his fellows confessed his felonies at the gallows, when they were on the ladder. And some peradventure became approvers when they were cast, and called for a coroner... and the law, keeping no store of him but hanging him up forthwith, useth yet his information and all these others' too, which may happen to come so many together and so likely to be true that his life may go therefore, and be well worthy to, and yet neither himself nor the inquest never hear any one witness sworn, neither the first nor the second, neither at the indicting nor at his arraigning neither.

Now may it so fortune in like wise, and sometimes so doth it, too, that folk some good and honest depose in cause of heresy 25 against some one man that is detected thereof. And haply there depose also some others of his own affinity... and in deposing against that one man, detect by their depositions another man, of the selfsame company, that is then walked far off (no man can tell where), that appeareth plainly, upon all their oaths, 30 peradventure the very chief heretic of all. If he hap long after, when these witnesses be dead, to come again into the country and teach heresies afresh, and one or twain detect him—they shall now be sworn and shall be brought forth face to face before him, that he shall object against 35 them what he can before his judgment pass. But yet those

2 false shrews: double-crossing scoundrels 1, 14 *fellows*: accomplices 3 misguesseth: guesses wrong // among: now and then // indeed: actually 4 felony: crime 6 have: receive 7 commonly: ordinarily 7, 11, 34 sworn: put under oath 9 percase: perhaps 9-10 in point: at the time 13 himself were taken: he was arrested 14 felonies: crimes 15 approvers: sworn informants on their accomplices 16 cast: convicted 16 coroner: an officer of the Crown (to enter his accusations against his accomplices) 18 information: accusation 20 be well worthy to: well deserve to 24 fortune: happen 25 folk . . . honest: some quite honorable folk 26 detected: accused 27 *affinity*: companionship 28 *detect*: make known (to be a heretic) 29 walked: gone 32 again: back 33 detect: report

10

15

20

25

30

35

old depositions shall not serve for naught, but are *adminicula probationis*, though the men be dead. And against all reason were it that it were otherwise. Howbeit, what they said he shall hear... and also who they were.

Lo, this is, good Christian readers, the manner of that suit, whereof this good man would here make us ween the contrary, and that men were commonly condemned of heresy by depositions of those men whom he should never know. And therefore, since the truth is indeed that all the wrong which he speaketh of, he groundeth upon a plain untruth, though he make not this lie wittingly himself, but, hearing some folk say so, weeneth that it were true: yet is, as I said before, all his reason spilt... and, as I told you, the harm that he layeth in that point, if he should divide it into twenty parts, nineteen parts and a half were now clearly gone. For there remained but that one case which he would have here seem common, and yet in his seventh chapter of his first book he declareth himself that the case is but special; that is to wit, where the witnesses are kept away for fear. Else, in all the remnant, this man's harms that he layeth here against the law be very clearly gone.

And therefore his two gay cases of swearing a man's death and winning a man's land by escheat have place but in the special point of that one special law. And yet are his two cases such as, well considered, are of no great effect. For if we should regard those two cases—the publishing of the witnesses' names would seldom remedy the matter. For it might then as well hap that such folk might hire others that should bear such false witness as do the thing themselves, and of likelihood so would they rather do.

But seeing that his cases, for the far fetching and likelihood of so seldom fortuning, were likely to be taken for fond—yet, for the favor of his own devising, he was loath to scrape them out, but excuseth the devising of them thus:

And if it be said that these cases fall so seldom that it ought little to be pondered—so may it be said likewise that it falleth but seldom that the witnesses in heresy stand in any fear of them that they accuse.

1-2 adminicula probationis: aids to proof 7 condemned: found guilty 7 by: on the basis of 9 wrong: injustice 11 make: tell // wittingly: knowingly 12 so: that // weeneth: supposes 12–13 all . . . spilt: his whole argument ruined 13 *layeth*: claims that there is 18, 22 *special*: exceptional 20 layeth: alleges 22 escheat: forfeiture 21 gay: brilliant 23 *special*: particular 25 publishing: making publicly known 27 hire: bribe 29 rather do: do instead 31 fortuning: occurring // fond: foolish 34, 35 *fall(eth)*: occur(s) 36 in heresy: concerning heresy

10

15

35

Now, if this answer of his were good and true, that it happeth as seldom that the witnesses stand in any such fear: then he assoileth his own reason himself. For then hath he no cause to complain, for the law to keep the witness close is made but for to serve in that special, seldom case where it happeth such fear to fall.

And therefore is his last cause verily not very shamefast, where he maketh as though the law were made general, "to prohibit all men that they should not have knowledge of the witnesses in no case."

And as for in this point of his, whereupon all his whole matter hangeth, to show you that he saith plain untrue, and groundeth all this gear, of always keeping witnesses close, upon a plain, open lie: I will for this time take none other witnesses against him but his own plain, open words. For in his seventh chapter of his *Division*, lo, thus, good readers, he saith:

And in the chapter there that beginneth "Statuta quaedam," it is decreed... that if the bishop or other inquirers of heresy see that any great danger might come to the accusers or witnesses of heresy 20 by the great power of them that be accused: that then they may command that the names of the accusers or witnesses shall not be showed but to the bishop or inquirers... or such other learned men as be called to them, and that shall suffice... though they be not showed to the party. And for the more indemnity of the said accusers 25 and witnesses it is there decreed... that the bishop or inquirers may enjoin such as they have showed the names of such witnesses unto... to keep them close upon pain of excommunication, for disclosing that secret without their license. And surely this is a sore law: that a man shall be condemned... and not know the names of 30 them that be causers thereof.

Now, good Christian readers, here you see plainly, by his own words, that the cause of that law is special, and serveth but whereas there is fear that the witnesses might stand in danger by reason that the person detected were a man of great might and power, which happeth very seldom, and almost never till it be well nigh past remedy. And therefore now you see by these

3 assoileth: refutes 4, 13, 28 *close*: secret 5, 33 *special*: exceptional 5 seldom: infrequent 6 fall: occur 7 shamefast: respectable 11–12 all . . . matter: his whole entire case 13 gear: stuff // of: about 14 open: obvious 19, 23, 26 inquirers: investigators 18 there: i.e., of canon law 23, 25, 27 showed: disclosed; made known 24 called: summoned 25 more: further // indemnity: security 27 enjoin: order // such as: those whom 29 *license*: permission 30 sore: sorry; terrible // condemned: convicted 33 whereas: wherever

10

15

20

25

30

35

words of his own that those other words of his are too shameful—where he now saith, here, that the law is general and forbiddeth "all men that they should not have knowledge of the witnesses in no case." Upon my faith, except this good man see better how to salve this sore than I see—I would not have written such another point in my book, for more than all the paper cost, and the printing too.

But now, as I say, since you see that all these griefs of his be gone save in this one only case of so great probable fear, while he groundeth all the remnant upon a great, open untruth—it is, you see well, a very seldom grief that is left. For I never saw, nor to my remembrance read, nor, trust in God, never shall see the need, that ever any great man whom folk needed to fear was condemned in this realm for heresy, save only Sir Hugh Oldcastle once (in the time of King Henry V), that was then Lord Cobham; nor yet he neither, till that through his heresy he fell to treason too, and would have been the captain of heretics in a sudden traitorous insurrection.

And therefore as for this harm that this good man telleth us here, that ariseth by the suit *ex officio* in heresy, this point is, as you see, both reasonable if it happed, and in law sufficiently provided for... and yet, besides that, so seldom happeth here in this realm that it was folly for him to speak thereof... and yet no more toucheth indeed the suit *ex officio* than if the suit were begun and pursued by some great man that would and feared not to profess himself for accuser. And thus is this case utterly nothing to purpose... and all the remnant is (as you see also by his own words proved) grounded upon great untruth. And therefore, all this that he hath said set aside for naught—let us now see what other harm the good man findeth further. Lo, good readers, therein thus he saith:

Also Sir Thomas More denieth not but that by reason of the law *Ex. de hereticis, ca. Ad abolendam*, which is recited in the seventh chapter of the said treatise, that a man may be driven to a purgation without any offense in him, or be accursed, as if he be notably suspected, and yet not guilty, as it may well be; and yet he will not condescend that that

8 griefs: beefs; grievances 9 while: since 10, 27 remnant: rest 10 great: big // open: obvious 11 seldom: infrequent // grief: hardship 12 trust: i.e., I trust 15 that: who 17 would have been: aspired to be 24 toucheth indeed: actually puts in a negative light 25 would: wanted 27 to purpose: relevant 29 *naught*: worthless 32 law: i.e., canon law 34 purgation: compurgation; process by which he can get himself 33 *recited*: quoted cleared of suspicion by having others attest to his innocence 34–35 without . . . him: without his being at all guilty 35 accursed: excommunicated 35 notably: glaringly 36 condescend: concede

10

15

35

law should be changed, but saith, in fortifying thereof, that "verily" he thinketh that "he which cannot be proved guilty in heresy, and yet useth such manner of ways that all his honest neighbors ween he were one... and therefore in their conscience dare not swear that he is any other... is well worthy to do some penance." Truly this is a marvelous persuasion: that a man should be put to his purgation... because his neighbors dare not swear that he is no heretic.

Now, good readers, because this good man beginneth here to fortify his word with that I did not in my said fortieth chapter of mine *Apology* deny "that a man may be driven to a purgation without any offense in him, or be accursed, as if he be notably suspected, and yet not guilty": I will first bring you forth mine own words written in the said chapter; and afterward, then, shall we see whether he can take such great hold upon my words as he would it should seem. Lo, good readers, these are my words (folio 220):

It may be sometime (albeit very seldom it happeth) that in heresy, upon other vehement suspicions, without witnesses a man may be put to his purgation, and to penance also if he fail thereof; which thing why so many should now think so hard a law as this Pacifier saith there do, I cannot 20 see... nor those wise men, neither, that made the law. And yet were they many wise men... and not only as wise, but peradventure many more also in number, than those that this Pacifier calleth many now, that, as he saith, now do find the fault. For though it be alleged in the Extra. de hereticis yet was that law *made* in a general council. And verily methinketh 25 that he which cannot be proved guilty in heresy, and yet useth such manner of ways that all his honest neighbors ween he were one indeed, and therefore dare not swear that in their conscience they think him any other... is well worthy to do some penance for that manner of behavior whereby he giveth all other men occasion to take him for so 30 naughty.

Now, good readers, where this man taketh me that I say a man may be driven to his purgation without offense: you see well I say not so... but I say that he *doth* a *great* offense, and well worthy were to be driven to his purgation and to do penance, too, if he be not able to purge himself... but have used himself so like a

1, 9 fortify(ing): back(ing) up 2, 26 in: of 3, 26–27 useth . . . ways: acts in such kinds of ways 3, 27 honest: upstanding 3–4, 27 ween . . . one: think he is one (i.e., a heretic) 5, 29 is . . . do: well deserves to have to do 5 marvelous: astonishing 9 word: assertion 18 vehement suspicions: strong grounds for suspicion 20 *hard*: oppressive 24 alleged: cited 25 general: ecumenical 31 naughty: bad 33 without offense: i.e., without having done anything wrong 34 *so*: that 34-35 well worthy were: would well deserve 36 purge: clear // used: conducted

10

15

20

25

30

35

heretic in all good folk's opinion that he can find no good folk that dare in their conscience swear that they think otherwise. This, say I, is a great offense and worthy to drive him to this point. And this good man saith that I deny not but that he may by the law be driven to it without offense!

And whereas he saith I deny not that he may be driven thereto without witness: wherefore not, I pray you? For the suspicions being proved by witnesses to be notable and vehement, will they not be cause sufficient to drive him to purge himself of that infamy, or else to do penance for bringing himself thereinto, but if there be witnesses of his express heretical words? *No*, saith this good man, and marveleth that I could think this any reason. But why he should so marvel at the matter, or why I should be ashamed to think so, thereof telleth us this good man no tale at all, but only saith...

Truly this is a marvelous persuasion: that a man should be put to his purgation because his neighbors dare not swear that he is no heretic.

Marvelous God, where was this man's mind when he wrote these words? Do I say that he shall be put to his purgation *because* his neighbors will not swear with him? Nay, I say that when there be, by witnesses sworn before his face, suspicions of heresy proved upon him—*then* may the ordinary put him to such purgation, to prove whether they will swear with him or no. For when they will not, but refuse it, what madman would say that he shall be put to that purgation *then*, when he hath failed thereof, and it already past? This man speaketh here as one that perceived no piece of the matter.

For whereas I declare that he is in great offense that so useth himself that none of his honest neighbors dare swear that in their consciences he is any other than a heretic: this man taketh it as though they that should swear with him in his purgation should precisely swear that he *were* no heretic; whereas their oath shall not be what he is indeed, but what themselves think of his oath; they shall not swear that he is no heretic, but that they believe that he hath sworn true in denying the articles

7 wherefore: why // pray: ask 8 notable: widespread // vehement: cogent 11 but if: unless 13 any reason: at all reasonable 17, 20, etc. purgation: See note for 110/34. 24 prove: test out 28 perceived: understood 29 useth: conducts 30 honest: upstanding 36 true: truthfully

laid unto his charge. Like as in the wager of a law, they shall not swear that the defendant oweth not the money, but that they believe that he sweareth truth.

I marvel, in good faith, that this good man handleth this matter in this manner, and without any telling why, marveleth so 5 much that I would think that law reasonable. But surely, though he could make me a proper reason for his part, and myself another for the same side also—yet would I think myself right unreasonable if I should upon his reason and mine advise and counsel this realm, in a matter concerning the conservation of 10 the faith, to alter and change that law that was made, by so great advice, by a whole general council of all Christendom... wherein there were (I doubt it not) men that had as good zeal to keep innocents out of trouble as any of us twain... and much more reason also than we both have, too. But that point that I 15 showed him in my *Apology*—that the same provision that is made in the law Ad abolendam was also made in a general council that tale he letteth go by, as though he heard it not.

But then he cometh forth with a word or two of a further fault in the law, which either the man understandeth not what it meaneth, or else is it hard for any man to think that he meaneth well. These are his words, lo:

And verily the law is that their oath in that case should not be accepted for the said chapter Ad abolendam is that if a man be notably suspected of heresy, that he shall purge himself after the will of 25 the ordinary or be accursed; and so the purgation of his neighbor will not serve. Let every man therefore consider whether the said law be indifferent or not. And if it be not, let them put to their hand to have it broken. And I think, verily, they shall deserve great thank of God if they turn it to a more indifferent way than it is at 30 now. For under this manner the most innocent man that is may of malice be reported to be suspected of heresy and be not so indeed, and so be driven to his purgation or be accursed; and then there is another law, that if he in that case of an indurate mind stand so accursed a year, he shall be punished as a heretic, and that is by the 35 law Extra. de hereticis, ca. Excommunicamus.

1 wager of a law: a form of trial in which the defendant could gain acquittal by producing eleven witnesses who would swear to belief that what he or she had said under oath was said truthfully 3 sweareth truth: is swearing truthfully 6 though: even if 7 proper: fine // part: side 14 any: either 17, 36 law: i.e., canon law 18 tale: bit of information 19 word: statement 24 chapter: i.e., canon 26, 33, 35 accursed: excommunicated 25 after: according to 26 *ordinary*: bishop 26 purgation of: compurgation of; character witness given by 28, 30 *indifferent*: impartial; unbiased 28–29 *put . . . broken*: set about having it changed 29–30 *deserve* . . . *of*: merit a great reward from 33 purgation: compurgation 34 indurate: obstinate

This provision, good readers, that he speaketh, which is in the law Ad abolendam (recited in the fifth book of the decretals, in the title De hereticis)—that such as were suspect should purge themselves at the arbitrament and discretion of the ordinary—was, as I before have said, afterward looked upon and allowed in the general 5 council called Concilium Lateranense, as every man may soon perceive that will well consider the paragraph "Excommunicamus" afterward in the same title. For whereas that law there saith, "Qui inventi fuerint sola suspicione notabiles, nisi statim innocentiam suam congrua purgatione monstraverint," these 10 words "congrua purgatione" be referred unto the other law (Ad abolendam) thereof made before, as both appeareth by such doctors as write upon the laws... and also, to him that will consider it well, it well appeareth by the self text. For in the paragraph "Excom." be rehearsed part of the very words of the law Ad abolendam, 15 whereby we may see that the council there looked upon that law. And so was, I say, that provision which this man calleth so unreasonable not only made by Pope Lucius III, but after also made again, by ratification, by Pope Innocent III in a whole general council. And read the stories whoso will, and he 20 shall find, both by Platina and Cronica cronicarum too, that both this Pope Lucius and this Pope Innocent were very virtuous men. And here had it been reason now, therefore, that this good man, since he findeth in this point so great a fault in the wits of both these good popes, and in all them that were members of that 25 general council, and in all the wits of all Christian regions that have used and allowed that law for good ever since—reason would, I say, that he should at the least have laid some reason here wherefore the law cannot please him that he which, though he be not proved guilty of the deed, is yet proved suspect, 30 should purge himself after the arbitrament of the ordinary; that is to wit, in such manner wise as the ordinary should think convenient, upon the qualities of the person and circumstances of the cause considered. Suppose, now, that there were none other manner of purgation 35 but by his neighbors' swearing with him, and that those words

```
2 recited: quoted // decretals: papal decrees concerning canon law
1 speaketh: mentions
2–3, 8 in the (same) title: under the (same) heading
                                                       3, 31 purge: clear
4, 31 arbitrament: determination; choice of means
                                                       5, 16 upon: at
                                                                         5 allowed: approved
6 Concilium Lateranense: i.e., the Fourth Lateran Council
                                                              7, 14 paragraph: article
11 be referred: have reference
                                  12 doctors: theologians
                                                               13 upon: about
14 the self text: the text itself
                                 15 rehearsed: quoted
                                                           20 stories: historical accounts
23 had it been reason: would reason have dictated
                                                      27 approved: taken
28 would: i.e., would dictate // laid: given
                                                29 wherefore: why // which: who
32 manner wise: kind of way
                                 33 convenient: appropriate
33–34 upon . . . cause considered: upon consideration of . . . case
```

10

15

20

25

"ad arbitrium episcopi" were not written in the law: were it yet reason to accept his oath in whatsoever manner the man would himself devise it? And with as few hands as himself list appoint? And with what manner folk soever himself would bring?

Nay, sir! For it may so be that there shall be good cause why, sometime and in some place, that the ordinary should not put some man to that kind of purgation which if he did, were he never so naughty, he should be sure of compurgators, peradventure more than enough.

For it hath been seen in many countries ere this, and sometimes in England too, that some evil preacher, preaching plain, open heresies, should yet, if he might have been put to such purgation, have lacked no hands to lay on the Book with him, that he never spoke such words. Howbeit, where the words are open and plain heresy, the law hath provided another way for the remedy good enough.

But then have there been some preachers such ere this, that teaching plain heresies to their familiars secretly, would preach in such wise abroad that their words should have two senses, and one boot serve for either leg, like a shipman's hose... and so should be tempered as the people should have occasion always to take them to the worst... and himself if he were examined would say before the ordinary, and swear too, that he never meant but the best.

Now, when it should by good witnesses appear that his manner was such the people took much harm thereby, and always took his words so that they thought he so meant them that he purposed by them to set forth and advance those things that were stark heresies indeed: if the ordinary should then appoint him with other compurgators to purge this suspicion—were these suspicions never so vehement, he should lack no compurgators to purge himself every week, and then do as he did before. And many good simple folk, taking him even as he meant, should fall into his heresies the while... and ween while he preached so still, that to believe that way were no peril.

1 *ad arbitrium episcopi*: at the determination of the bishop
3–4 *as*... *appoint*: i.e., as he himself arranges to have put on the Bible on his behalf
9 *naughty*: wicked 12, 15 *open*: obvious / publicly witnessed 14 *Book*: Bible
15, 20 *words*: statements 19 *familiars*: close associates 20 *abroad*: in public
21 *shipman's hose*: very loose-fitting trousers worn by sailors
23 *to the worst*: in the worse way 26 *appear*: be made evident 30 *appoint*: arrange for
32 *never so vehement*: no matter how cogent 33 *purge himself*: clear himself (of them)
34 *even*: just

20

25

30

35

And therefore those wise men that made the law left the thing in the ordinary's discretion to assign him that is proved suspect of heresy such kind of purgation as the circumstances of the person, and the people and the time, shall most require.

And therefore will the ordinary, to some man so suspect, sometimes assign him (to purge his suspicion that with his lewd manner of preaching he is fallen in, to the great hurt of his hearers) that he shall openly confess that those heresies that the people took him to mean be very false heresies indeed... and openly shall detest them and swear that he so believeth them to be... and swear that he neither meant to teach them nor never was minded that any man should take him so, nor never would afterward teach nor hold heresies, but abjure them for ever.

And yet for the further purgation of such suspicion, the ordinary might also enjoin him some certain things to do such as may declare the more clearly that he is not of such mind—as open preaching against the selfsame heresies, and the doing of some such things as those heresies did stand against.

And now, by this purgation, this good shall he do—that if he would after preach the same things again, though he used again such another wily fashion, yet would his audience then think thus (as many as had any mind to be good): "Either this man meaneth not now by his words to teach us that point that himself hath abjured, and then let us not learn the thing of him that he would in no wise we should; or else he meaneth to teach it us still, for all his abjuration. And then wherefore should we be so mad to believe a false wretch that would make us believe now that that thing were true... which himself hath openly confessed and sworn to be false?"

But then will haply this good man say that this abjuration is perilous, for jeopardy of the relapse. The peril of death by relapse is not upon every abjuration. But of truth, he that is abjured upon such things proved as maketh him not slightly but very vehemently suspected, if he fall after into

6 lewd: bad 7 hurt: harm 8, 9 openly: publicly 8, 30 confess(ed): admit(ted) 9 *false*: despicable 10 detest: denounce 15 enjoin: assign; impose on 16 declare: show 17 as: such as // open: public 23 mind to be: intention of being 25, 29 himself: he himself 25 *of*: from 26 in . . . should: not at all want us to 27 wherefore: why 28 so mad: so crazy as // false: dishonest / sorry 33 upon: attached to 35 vehemently: seriously

10

15

heresy, putteth himself in peril to fall into the fire. And very good reason it is that it be so. And a man may sometime be so suspect of felony by reason of sore presumptions, that though no man saw him do it, nor himself never confess it, but say and swear too that he never did it, yet may he be found guilty of it, and thereupon hanged for it, and have no wrong at all.

And thus this provision for purgation at the discretion of the ordinary is not, I trust, so unreasonable, nor they so unreasonable that made it, nor they so unreasonable that ratified it, nor all they so unreasonable that this two or three hundred years have accepted and allowed it, but that it may now stand by this good man's leave at this day as well as it hath stood all this while before. But yet is there one thing that he taketh for a thing very sore. "For then is there," saith he, "another law: that if he that is so proved suspect refuse to purge himself at the discretion of the ordinary, and be for his contumacy excommunicated—that in that case if he of an obdurate heart stand, so accursed, a whole year, he shall be punished as a heretic. And that is," as he saith, "by the law *Extra. de hereticis, capitulo Excommunicamus.*"

This provision was made, as I told you, in the said general 20 council. And whereas he bringeth it forth as though it were a very sore thing and a cruel—it is indeed very favorable. For, saving that I will not do as he doth—go find faults in their doings that were so many so much better and had so much more wit than I—else could I lay a little better cause to prove 25 that provision over-favorable than ever this good man shall find, while he liveth, to prove that provision too sore. And surely he that being proved suspect, and refuseth in such reasonable manner to purge himself thereof as his ordinary shall by his discretion assign him—which must both by law and 30 all reason be his judge, and not himself—showeth himself little to force or care though folk ween he were a heretic: which thing sore aggrieveth the suspicion that he verily is one indeed. And then when he will rather be once accursed than of such suspicion yet to purge and clear himself: he yet increaseth that 35 suspicion twice so sore. But finally, when rather than to purge

3 sore presumptions: strong presumptive evidence 2 reason it is: sense it makes 6 have no wrong: be done no injustice 11 allowed: sanctioned 14, 22, 27 sore: harsh 16 contumacy: willful contempt of court 17, 34 accursed: excommunicated 22 indeed: actually 23 will not: do not want to 23–24 their . . . many: the doings of people so many of whom were 25 wit: sense 25 *lav . . . cause*: make . . . case 27 while: as long as 30 *which*: who (referring to the ordinary) 32 force or care though: care or worry if 32 ween: think 33 sore: strongly // aggrieveth: increases 34 *once*: at some point 36 so sore: as badly

that suspicion, he continueth excommunicated all the whole year, and never will be purged in the while but if he may have it accepted in such a faint fashion as himself list to offer: the suspicion of his heresies from sore and vehement turn by such dealing into plain, open, and violent, so that he can in 5 reason be none other reckoned but a plain heretic indeed, whom to tolerate so long doth sometimes little good. And then since the law is that such as the favor of the Church shall preserve from the temporal hands should by the law be only those which, upon their detection, turn of their own offer 10 meekly by and by, and show good tokens of right hearty repentance— I will let no man from the inclination toward pity, in preserving the life of any man... whensoever he seem penitent. But yet surely when the Church receiveth again that man that, by his obstinate dealing, with abiding excommunicated 15 and contemning the great curse all the whole year rather than he would purge the suspicion of his heresy but if he may purge it after his own sweet will, proveth himself at last to have been a heretic so long, and all that while would not return but evermore draw back—if the ordinary, for 20 all that, receive him to grace again, and keep him still and preserve him from the secular hands—I will not say that he doth wrong; but finding him yet repentant, fain would I see him saved. 25

But yet without doubt, as far as I can see, the ordinary to save the man's life of pity stretcheth out with his teeth the law and reason both so far that even scantly can any of the both hold.

And therefore, these laws being such as they be, made and ratified by whole general council, accepted and used so
long through all Christendom... when this good man cometh now forth, and upon his own bare reason (as bare as ever I heard yet in all my life!), because only that an innocent may sometime take harm (which may happen upon any law that ever all the world can make whereby there shall be devised any punishment for the evil folk), he biddeth every man consider now whether the law be just or not, and if it be not, biddeth every man put to their hands to have it broken and make a better, and saith that he thinketh they shall have great thank

```
1, 16 all the whole: the whole entire
                                         2 while: interim
                                                                               4 sore: serious
                                                              3 list: cares
4 vehement: strong
                        5, 15 dealing: behavior
                                                    5 violent: raging; full-blown
9 temporal: secular
                        9, 22 hands: authorities
                                                     10 detection: being reported (to the bishop)
10 turn . . . offer: repent on their own initiative
                                                    11 by and by: right away
11 tokens: indications
                           12 let: dissuade
                                                14 receiveth again: takes back
                                    16 contemning: pooh-poohing
15 abiding: staying; remaining
                                                                       18 after: according to
23 fain would I: I would be glad to
                                        26 of pity: out of compassion
27 even scantly: just barely // any: either
                                                30 used: kept in effect
38-39 put . . . better: set about having it abrogated and getting a better one enacted
39 have great thank: receive a great reward
```

10

15

30

35

of God therefor—his request is now no better, but in effect even this: that against every wise man's reason well approved hitherto, every man should in this matter now, either trust unto his, or else at the leastwise every man to his own... and instead of a better old law, make a new much worse. For if his device were followed, it appeareth plainly so there should... and heresies should grow up on height, and the Catholic faith decay. And then God save us from that thank of God that shortly we should with such dealing deserve!

Thus have I, good readers, as you see, clearly confuted this good man's answer in both the principal points, of which the one was wherein he minded to show that in heresy the suit of office might be left, and that by the leaving there should no harm follow to the Catholic faith... because heretics might as well come to correction by the way of open accusers as by that manner suit.

But in this point you have seen clearly that his device would never so serve the matter... but that it were very likely so to diminish in this realm the Catholic faith with increase of heresies that the indignation of God were sore to be feared thereby to follow thereon—and the realm to fall in trouble and business, with insurrection of the same rebellious heretics that by the change of that law had so been suffered to grow, as other countries have been of late, and this realm was, ere this, so near likely to have been... that for the avoiding of the like peril to fall afterward, it was provided by Parliament of great policy... for the better repressing of heresies, to fortify that law and give the ordinaries yet greater power to maintain it... and with temporal assistance to make it more strong.

His second point was to show that of the keeping of that law there should grow great harm... because the law is so unreasonable, he saith, that innocents may come to trouble thereby without offense.

This part how properly this good man hath proved, that have you seen also... and that he therein is so fully and wholly confuted that when he readeth it again, I suppose he will not now greatly like it.

1 of: from // therefor: for that // even: just 3 hitherto: to this point 7 grow up on height: rise to ascendancy // decay: suffer a decline 8 *thank of*: reward from 9 dealing: conduct // deserve: earn 12 minded: intended 13 of office: i.e., ex officio; see note for 60/29. 13, 15 might: could 13 *left*: done away with 18 serve: take care of 21 *in*: into 21 trouble: civil unrest // business: turmoil 23 suffered: allowed 23 grow: increase in number 26 of: out of // policy: prudence 31 grow: come 32 come to: get into 33 without offense: without having done anything wrong 34 *properly*: admirably

10

15

20

25

30

35

Now, these two thus handled, he cometh to the third point, which though I granted him altogether, yet were he never the nearer. For that point is such as if I win it, then it maketh my part more plain; but on the other side, if I lost it and he won it, yet were mine plain enough. And strong enough were my part with the first point alone. For if by the leaving of the suit of office should follow the increase of heretics—as every man, I think, that wit hath may well see that there would—then though there would some other harm happen sometime thereof, yet must that other harm in reason rather be borne than that.

But now to come, good readers, unto the third point, which if he won altogether could very little serve him—ye shall see him yet, by God's grace, win him never a piece.

The third point, good readers, in mine *Apology*, you see well yourselves intendeth nothing else but by example of the common laws of this realm to show that the same spiritual law which this man would prove unreasonable is not indeed proved unreasonable by this thing that he here putteth for the proof: that is to say, because that by that law sometime it might hap that a man might fall in peril of a crime which he committed not. For if it so were, now, that in all the cases that I rehearsed of the common law, there could never no man that had not done the deed take any harm so much as a fillip—yet though I had missed in those examples, the thing might yet be true. For there might be, for all that, other examples enough, both in other good laws and in the same too, that a law were not unreasonable, nor to be put away, though there might hap sometime some man take some harm that never did the deed that were laid to his charge. And of truth this conclusion is so clear that it needeth no proof at all. And therefore though he won all that point... yet had he lost the matter. But let us now a little see whether he win this point

And because the effect of all his answer lieth always in this—that he saith always that the example of the common law that I lay is not like the thing that I resemble it unto in the

^{2, 9,} etc. *though*: even if 2–3 were . . . nearer: would he have gotten nowhere

^{4, 6} part: side of the argument 4, 5 plain: clear

⁷ leaving: getting rid; abolishing 8 that wit hath: who has any sense // may: can

²¹ fall in peril of: incur the penalty for 23 rehearsed: mentioned

²⁸ put away: abolished 32 all that: that whole 33 matter: case 37 resemble: liken

10

35

spiritual law—I shall first rehearse you mine own words in mine *Apology*... and then shall I rehearse you his words here, that when you have heard both twain, whether they be like or unlike ye may the more surely judge. These were, lo, good readers, my words:

And verily methinketh that he which cannot be proved guilty in heresy, and yet useth such manner of ways that all his honest neighbors ween he were one, and therefore dare not swear that in their conscience they think him any other... is well worthy, methinketh, to do some penance for that manner of behavior whereby he giveth all other folk occasion to take him for so naughty.

And by the common law of this realm, many times upon suspicion the judges award writ to inquire of what fame and behavior the man is in his county; and himself lieth sometimes still in prison till the return; and if he be returned good—that is to wit, if he be in a manner purged—then 15 is he delivered; and yet he payeth his fees ere he go. And if he be returned naught—then use the judges to bind him for his good abearing, and sometimes sureties with him too, such as their discretion will allow. And then to lie still till he find them is sometimes as much penance to the one as the spiritual judge enjoineth to the other. For the one 20 cometh to the bar as openly as the other to the consistory; and sometimes his fetters weigh a good piece of a faggot, besides that they lie longer on the one man's legs than the faggot on the other's shoulder. And yet is there no remedy but both these must be done, both in the one court and in the other; or else, instead of one harm (which to him that deserveth it 25 not, happeth seldom, and as seldom, I am sure, in heresy as in theft, and much more seldom too), ve shall have ten times more harm happen daily to folk as innocent as they; and of innocents many made nocents, to the destruction of themselves and others too, both in goods, body, and 30 soul.

To this piece, lo, good reader, this is this good man's answer:

Then he goeth further for maintenance of the said suit *Ex officio*, and resembleth it to arresting for suspicion of felony, and to the surety of good abearing, and to indictments—whereupon men be put to answer at the common law. And how far these resemblances

1, 2 rehearse: quote 4 surely: accurately; unerringly 7 useth such manner: acts in such kinds // honest: upstanding 8 ween: think // were: is 9 is . . . do: well deserves, it seems to me, to have to do 11 *naughty*: wicked 13 fame: reputation // the man: i.e., the person suspected of having violated the common law 14 lieth: is kept // till the return: i.e., till the reports come back 15 purged: cleared 16 delivered: released 17 use the judges: the judges are wont 17 bind . . . abearing: put him under a peace bond 18 sureties: bond posters 19 lie still: i.e., go on being kept in prison 20 spiritual: ecclesiastical 21 *consistory*: Church tribunal 22 faggot: bundle of sticks (carried by a convicted heretic as a punishment) 28 *nocents*: guilty people 33 for maintenance: in support 34 resembleth: likens // felony: a crime such as murder or theft 35 surety of good abearing: peace bond 36 put to answer: put on trial

30

35

vary from the suit Ex officio, he in some place openeth it himself. But yet, for a more plain declaration therein, I shall say a little farther in that matter. First, as to the arresting for suspicion of felony, it is indeed an old law of this realm that for suspicion of felony a man may be arrested, so that he that doth arrest him 5 upon a reasonable cause doth suspect him; but it is a general rule that he shall never be put to answer upon that arrest, but proclamation shall be made that if any man will lay anything against him that is so suspected, that it shall be heard; and if none such come, he shall be 10 delivered, without fine or any other punishment, with a good exhortation of the judges that he shall take good heed how he ordereth himself in time to come. And then Master More likeneth the penance of such a man that hath been in prison upon suspicion of felony, and so delivered by proclamation, to the bearing of a faggot for heresy. For he saith that the one of them shall come "as openly to the 15 bar as the other to the consistory." And that sometimes his fetters shall "weigh a good piece of the faggot, besides that they lie longer on the one man's legs than the faggot on the other man's shoulder"; but he rehearseth not how they lie many times longer in prison for heresy than they do either for suspicion of felony or for good abearing. 20 And over that, I dare say that there are but few but that they had well liefer abide the pain to be thrice acquitted by proclamation, and peradventure ofter, than once bear a faggot for heresy.

How goeth now, good readers, this answer of this good man unto the purpose: to prove the trouble of him that is arrested upon suspicion of felony to be unlike to the trouble of him that is sued *ex officio* for heresy, touching the point that I resemble them for?

The point, ye wot well, for which I speak of the arresting for suspicion of felony is to show that, likewise as it may happen a man for heresy to fall in trouble sometime though he were no heretic indeed, so may it happen a man sometime to be troubled upon suspicion of felony though he be no felon indeed—and yet both the one law necessary and the other too... and neither of both may be forborne. Hath this good man

1 vary: differ // openeth: explains 2 declaration: clarification 2 therein: i.e., on it (the subject) 3 in that matter: on that subject 4, 5, etc. felony: a crime such as murder or theft 5 so: provided 7 put to answer: put on trial 8 lay anything: make any accusation 10, 14 delivered: released; set free 11 of: from // ordereth: conducts 16 *consistory*: Church tribunal 19 rehearseth not: does not mention 20 good abearing: (a breach of) good conduct 21 over: besides 21–22 had well liefer: would much rather 23 ofter: more often (than that) 27 *touching*: concerning 29 wot: know 35 forborne: dispensed with

10

15

30

proved us the contrary of this? That, you see well, he hath not. And then hath he not, pardie, proved them unlike.

He weeneth he saith somewhat when he telleth us that upon the arresting upon suspicion of felony, he shall not be put to answer till he be indicted. What is his trouble the less for that? If he lie in prison till the session, as he may hap to do, were it not more his ease to be put to answer before and acquitted, if he be not faulty (for of such folk we speak), than for lack of putting to answer lie still in prison the longer?

As for that that in conclusion, if no man lay naught to his charge at the sessions, he shall be delivered by proclamations—so shall he that is suspected of heresy, too. For if there be nothing found against him, he shall neither be driven to abjuration nor purgation, but delivered quite, howsoever that either this man mistake or would make other men mistake the matter to the contrary.

And as to that that the one shall pay no fine—no more shall the other neither.

If this man will peradventure say, "Since that the ordinary findeth the man not suspect in the end, why did he take and arrest 20 him for suspect in the beginning?"—because that in the beginning the man seemed upon good considerations suspect, and seemed likely to flee; and upon his examination, the matter fully searched out, the causes of suspicion so well voided that the ordinary declareth him for discharged without any other purgation. 25 "But yet hath it mishapped him to have some harm the meanwhile"—and so hath it him also that was arrested upon suspicion of felony, that never was after indicted, but delivered forth free upon the proclamation.

I see no great difference between these two men in all this matter yet, save that the one lieth at his own finding, the other at the bishop's cost.

For whereas this man saith that he which is delivered by proclamation hath always given him by the justices a good lesson at his departing: if the bishop give not the other a good lesson at his departing too, then is he somewhat to blame indeed;

² pardie: by George 3 somewhat: something 6 lie: remain // session: court session 7 were . . . answer: would it not be more to his advantage if he were put on trial 8 faulty: guilty 14 delivered quite: completely set free 24 voided: refuted 25 purgation: clearing of the defendant from suspicion 31 lieth: is kept in prison 31 finding: provision; i.e., expense 36 to blame: at fault

10

15

20

25

but in good faith, I hear say that he doth so too. And therefore where is this difference yet? I look always for that. For as for the shame of open bringing forth, is both one, as I said—saving that the session hath commonly much more people present to gaze upon the one than in the consistory looketh upon the other.

And where this man saith that they lie longer in prison for heresy than they do either for suspicion of felony or for good abearing—if he speak of those which are in conclusion found in no more fault concerning heresy than those that are delivered by proclamation be found at the session concerning felony... I dare be bold to tell him nay. And I am very sure the truth will prove so too. But, now, if he speak of those that appear upon the end in such fault that by the law they be bound to abjure... then is it good reason that they lie longer indeed. And so lie there, as reason is, sometimes some for felony, too, reprieved upon causes from one session to another, and sometimes kept, you see well, all the whole year and more—and that, sometimes, such as are in conclusion never indicted neither, but, after all that, delivered by proclamation; and yet good causes in the meanwhile why they were kept so. And, therefore, whereas this man saith that they be in worse case that bear a faggot: very truth it is somewhat, and so is it reason they be. For they be not faultless, but convicted of the fault. And our dispicions is of *innocents* that happen by the law, the one law or the other, to take harm without their fault. For if he would compare the faulty with the faulty, then must he compare the one bearing the faggot with the other at the very first time borne up with the rope.

And therefore I did in that place not only show that he that
is innocent may by arresting for felony hap to have as
much harm as he that is innocent and arrested for heresy, but
that he may happen to have sometime also as much harm as
he that for the first time is found *faulty* in heresy and
plainly convicted thereof. And surely, save for the further peril
upon his further fault, so may it hap indeed; and yet, as I
said in my *Apology*, the law must needs be kept, but if

```
3 is both one: i.e., that is the same in both cases
9 good abearing: (a breach of) good conduct
                                                   10, 14, etc. fault: guilt
15 is it good reason: it well stands to reason
                                                   16 as reason is: as is reasonable
17 reprieved: remanded
                             22 whereas this man saith: as regards this man's claim
22-23 they . . . faggot: those who (have to) carry a faggot are in a worse situation
24 faultless: guiltless
                           25 dispicions: discussion // of innocents: about innocent people
26-27 their fault: their being guilty
                                         27 faulty: guilty
28 the other: i.e., the thief or murderer
                                             29 at . . . time: i.e., for the very first offense
29 borne up with the rope: i.e., hanged
                                             30 show: point out
31 by arresting: i.e., through getting arrested // have: receive
                                                                      34 faulty in: guilty of
35 the further peril: i.e., that of being burned at the stake
                                                               37 but if: unless
```

10

15

20

25

you will by the change have five thieves for one. And thus, as for this piece, of arresting for suspicion of felony, the case hath he not proved unlike, touching the purpose that I put it for, but for my part very strong. And so hath this good man, in this first piece of the third point, a very great fall.

Then cometh he next unto another case that I spoke of also: that is to wit, arresting upon good abearing. And whereas in mine *Apology* that piece is the third, that piece in his answer he maketh the second; and I see why well enough. For since himself seeth that he answereth it so slenderly, he wrappeth it up in the midst because it should be the less marked, and would end with another piece wherein himself weeneth that he saith somewhat better.

Now, as for this good abearing, to the end that ye may see the better how gaily this good man answereth it, I shall first rehearse you the words of mine *Apology* that he maketh this answer to.

After that I have showed there that the judges of the spiritual court be not so foolish but that they had liefer not meddle with any man save only upon some such open inquisition as are indictments of felony, for avoiding of obloquy, saving that necessity compelleth them to take this way, for fear that with sufferance of heresies to go forth and grow, all might at length through God's displeasure very far grow to naught... I say there farther thus (folio 225):

Necessity sometimes causeth also both the temporal judges and the King's Council to put some folk to business, or dishonesty sometimes, without either jury or bringing of the accuser to the proof of the matter in the party's presence.

For if the judge know by sure information that some one man is of such evil demeanor among his neighbors that they may not bear it; and yet that the man is, besides, so violent and so jeopardous that none of them dare be known to speak of it: will there no judges upon many secret complaints made unto them, without making the party privy who told him that tale, bind that busy, troublesome man to good abearing?

I suppose yes, and have seen it so, too; and wrong would it be sometimes with good, poor, peaceable folk in the county but if it were so done

3 touching: concerning // put: posed 4 part: side of the argument 7 upon good abearing: with reference to good conduct; i.e., for disturbance of the peace 10 *slenderly*: ineffectively 11 midst: middle // because: so that // marked: noticed 15 gaily: brilliantly 18 spiritual: ecclesiastical 12 saith: speaks 16 rehearse: quote 19 had liefer: would rather // meddle: concern themselves 20 inquisition: judicial investigation 21 obloguy: ill repute 23 sufferance: allowing 23 grow: spread 24 grow to naught: come to ill 26 temporal: secular 27 business: trouble // dishonesty: disgrace 28 proof: trial // matter: case 31 evil demeanor: bad behavior // may not bear it: cannot endure it 30 *sure*: trustworthy 34 making the party privy: giving the party knowledge of 32 *jeopardous*: dangerous 35 bind . . . abearing: put that pesky, troublemaking man under a peace bond

among. And myself, when I was Chancellor, upon such secret information have put some out of commission and office of justice of the peace, which else, for much money, I would not have done, and yet if I were in the one room still and they in the other again, but if they be amended (whereof I neither then saw nor yet hear any likelihood), I would put them out again, and never tell them who told me the tales that made me so to do.

Lo, good readers, here you see that in this piece I mean nothing else but that whereas this good man findeth a fault that the spiritual judge should meddle with any man for heresy without an open accuser complaining to him, or an open presentment in the beginning... I show there that necessity is the cause, and forthwith afterward I prove it, which this good man dissembleth here and inverteth here the order for the nonce. And I show that necessity (lest much more harm should 15

grow thereon) causeth the temporal judges and the King's honorable
Council, too, to put some man to business sometimes and
some to dishonesty, both without either indictment or open
accuser, or suffering him to make answer either... and thus be
they fain to do, but if they should suffer many great harms to
grow. Now mark well, I require you, how substantially
this good man answereth this. These are his wise words, lo:

And then as to the arresting for good abearing, truth it is that a man by commandment of the justices may so be arrested, but he shall never be put to answer upon that arrest, but only bound, and 25 sureties with him, of his good abearing. And if he can no such surety find, and he have lain there long in prison, then the judges by their discretion may send a writ to inquire of his fame, and of his behavior, which is called a writ De gestu et fama, whereof Sir Thomas More maketh mention in his *Apology*; and if it be found for him, 30 upon that writ, that he is of good fame and behavior, then he shall be delivered. Whereby, Master More saith, he is "in a manner purged"; and by that saying it seemeth that his meaning is that that delivery should be resembled to his purgation upon the suspicion of heresy, as is said before. But how far they be unlike, it appeareth 35 thus: when a man is delivered upon the said writ De gestu et fama,

1 among: now and then 4 *room*: position; office 5 likelihood: indication 12 presentment: lodging of charges, made by a grand jury, a justice of the peace, or a parish official 14 dissembleth: ignores; turns a blind eye to 14–15 for the nonce: on purpose; i.e., for the purpose of having my proof bypassed 16 grow thereon: i.e., come of leaving the situation alone 19 *suffering*: allowing 20 fain: obliged 21 require: ask of 22 wise: brilliant 23 for good abearing: with regard to good conduct; i.e., for disturbance of the peace 25 to answer: on trial 25-26 bound . . . of his good abearing: put . . . under a peace bond 26 *sureties*: (other) bond posters 28 of: about 28, 31 *fame*: reputation 29, 36 *gestu*: behavior 32, 36 *delivered*: released 33 purged: cleared 34 *delivery*: release // resembled: likened 34 purgation upon: getting himself cleared of

10

15

20

25

30

35

he is delivered as a man proved to be of good honesty and to be cleared by his neighbors of that he was suspected of. And when he is purged upon the suit *Ex officio*, or for suspicion of heresy, he is put to penance by the ordinary, as a man suspected, whereof he is not cleared, and so shall he be taken among his neighbors as a man worthy to do that penance for his offenses; wherefore it appeareth evidently that they be nothing like.

In this answer, good reader, one piece he answereth with an untruth, another piece he leaveth half unanswered, and to another piece he maketh none answer at all.

For whereas he saith that he that is purged of heresy in the suit ex officio is put unto penance by the ordinary as a man suspect, whereof he is not cleared: this man saith untrue, and wotteth not, also, what he meaneth. For the spiritual judge not only (as I have said), though he were sore suspected in the beginning, when he took him, yet if he find in the examination those suspicions cleared he putteth him to no further business at all; but also, if it be not so fully cleared but that there remain some tokens of suspicion, of which he think it good to purge him by the oath of himself and some other compurgators with him, he putteth him after that purgation unto no penance neither. But, now, if it so be that there be well proved such suspicions as are so vehement that, though they prove not precisely the deed, yet make every man that heareth them, that he can none otherwise think: there will the ordinary cause him to abjure... and the rather to purge him of the suspicion that he were still naught, and afterward still would be naught, than that he was not such before. And then, for using himself in such wise before: though he do penance he hath but right.

But in all those other cases of suspicion purged, he saith untrue; for they do no penance at all.

Now, concerning the good abearing awarded by the justices: he answereth that it is true... but it is, he saith, unlike unto this matter, because the justices (saith he), when he hath long lain in prison, may by their discretion (if he can find no sureties) award a writ *de gestu et fama*.

1 *honesty*: repute 2 *that*: what; that which 6 *worthy to do*: deserving of having to do 7 *evidently*: plainly; manifestly

¹⁴ wotteth . . . meaneth: also doesn't know what he's talking about 15 sore: strongly

¹⁶ took: arrested 19 tokens: traces 23 vehement: cogent

^{25–26} cause him to: have him 26 purge: clear 27 naught: wicked

²⁸ using: conducting 29 hath but: is done nothing but 32 good abearing: peace bond

³⁵ sureties: bond posters 36 de gestu et fama: of behavior and reputation

10

15

20

25

30

This is but half an answer, nor scant so much neither. For first himself saith that this writ they may send out after that the man hath long lain in prison... so that then the man, yet without presentment or open accuser, hath had that long lying in prison in the meanwhile for his evil demeanor at home among his neighbors, whereof they durst not openly make complaint. And this doth, as you see, this good man not deny, which is for my purpose enough.

But then saith he further for me, in that he saith they *may* award that writ *if they will*. Wherein he implieth that if they will not, they may upon good discretion let him yet lie still and let the writ alone. And so hath he therefore put in one point further for me.

But yet hath this good man one stopgap for me still, to prove always that my example is not like... and that is that whereas in the suit *ex officio*, men be put to answer, upon this arrest and imprisonment upon good abearing, the man shall never be put to answer.

For answer of this evasion I will ask this good man this: that he which is in prison upon good abearing shall never be put to answer, whether is it his profit or his loss? If his loss: then his not putting to answer maketh the matter of my resembling much the more strong for me. And if this good man dare answer me that it is his profit: then will I no more but pray him to put the fellow in choice, and then if himself choose it for the better, let him lie still for me.

This you see, good readers: that this man saith not nay but that upon good abearing, by discretion of the justices, for all the writ *de gestu et fama*, a man may lie long in prison and some peradventure ever; howbeit, of truth I trow it happeth not so.

And yet can neither this good man say, nor, I suppose, no man else, but that it may sometime hap by possibility that all that information were wrong. But that is a thing not likely to hap so often but that if we should for such may-haps put away that order which order very necessity brought up—there

35

5 evil demeanor: bad behavior 6 durst: dared 7 make complaint: file charges 10 will: want to 14 stopgap: argument (to put up) in defense of the attacked point 16, 18, 20–21 to answer: on trial

- 17, 20, 28 upon good abearing: i.e., for disturbance of the peace
- 21 is . . . loss: this is to his advantage or to his disadvantage
- 22 his . . . answer: the not putting him on trial 24 pray: ask
- 25 put . . . choice: let the fellow choose 26 lie . . . me: stay in prison for all I care
- 27 saith not nay but: does not deny 30 peradventure ever: perhaps forever
- 30 howbeit . . . so: however, I really feel sure that does not happen 34 for: on account of
- 35 put away: do away with // order: procedure; system // brought up: gave rise to

10

15

20

25

30

35

would much mischief grow, and many great harms would there then hap indeed.

Now, as touching that I said that the King's Council used also sometimes upon great secret information to put some folk to business and to some dishonesty too... and I letted not to lay some example in mine own deed while I was Chancellor myself, by putting some out of commission in their counties... which dishonesty, save for such secret information, I would not for a hundred pounds have done them, and dare yet upon such secret information very well avow the doing... and doubt not but that if I should declare the cause openly, both good men and wise men would allow my deed: to all this point, lo, this good man saith nothing at all, but letteth it go by his ears as though he never heard it.

And thus, as I told you, concerning this piece of good abearing—this good answerer hath here borne himself so well that some part he answereth with untruth, some part he answereth a great deal less than half, and some part never a deal. If men be content to take this fashion for answering—let any man make then against me as many books as he will, and put in what matter he list, and I shall never need to study much for an answer, but may make answers to them all shortly and short enough, and answer a long book in space of one paper leaf.

But now let us see how he handleth this third piece, of indictments at the sessions. For that piece he setteth in the rear ward, to stay therewith all the field. But now, that you may see what strength he hath in that ward—I shall first bring you forth that ward against which it fighteth. In mine *Apology*, folio 222, these are my words, lo:

And because this Pacifier taketh it for so sore a thing in the spiritual law that a man shall be called *ex officio* for heresy, where he shall not know his accuser: if we should change the spiritual law for that cause, then had we need to change the temporal, too, in some such points as change it when ye will, and ye shall change it into the worse for aught that I can see, but if it be better to have more thieves than fewer.

For, now, if a man be indicted at a sessions and none evidence given

1 mischief: evil // grow: come 3 as touching: as regards 5 business: trouble 5-6 letted . . . in: did not forbear to use for an example 5, 8 dishonesty: disgrace 6 while: when 7 *by*: in 10 avow: stand by 12 allow: approve of 15, 25 of: on 16 borne: conducted 18-19 never a deal: not any amount 20 make: write // will: wants to 21 what . . . list: whatever stuff he chooses to 27 stay: defend // all the field: the whole battlefield 27, 28, 29 ward: guard 31 *sore*: sorry; terrible 31, 33 *spiritual*: Church 34 had we: we would 34 *temporal*: civil 36 but if: unless 37 evidence: testimony

openly at the bar (as many be, and many may well be; for the indicters may have evidence given them apart, or have heard of the matter ere they came there, and of whom be they not bound to tell, but be, rather, bound to keep it close, for they be sworn to keep the King's counsel and their own), shall, then, the party that is indicted be put 5 unto no business about his acquittal? And who shall tell him there the names of his accusers, to entitle him to his writ of conspiracy? This Pacifier will peradventure say that the same twelve men that are his indicters are his accusers, and therefore he may know them. But what 10 helpeth that his undeserved vexation if he were faultless? For amends the law giveth him none against any of them, nor it were not well done he should; but may when he is after by other twelve acquitted, go get him home and be merry that he hath had so fair a day—as a man getteth him to the fire and shaketh his hat after a shower of rain. And, now, as it often happeth that a man cometh into a shower by his own oversight. 15 though sometimes of chance and of adventure: so surely, though sometimes it hap that a man be accused or indicted of malice, or of some likelihood which happed him of chance and not his fault therein... yet happeth it in comparison very seldom but that the party by some demeanor of himself giveth occasion that folk have him so suspected. 20

In this piece my purpose is, good readers, as you see, to show that likewise as a man shall in the suit *ex officio*, for heresy, not know his accuser—so may it also happen, many times, that no more he shall neither, when he is at the common law indicted of felony. And I show also therein, as you see, that though it may sometime hap either of malice or chance—yet it seldom happeth, for all that, that the party so falleth in trouble without some default of himself; and that the common, general law may not for such seldom, special haps be forborne. To this piece, lo, this good man answereth me thus:

And then Master More saith yet farther, that upon indictments at sessions, the indicters use not to show the names of them that gave them information. And he saith farther, that they *may not* show their names; for they may not disclose the King's counsel nor their own. But as I take it, that prohibition of opening of the counsel in this case is only to be understood of their own counsel among

2 *evidence*: testimony 3 *of*: from 3, 4 bound: obliged 4 *close*: secret 5, 34, etc. *counsel*: confidential knowledge 10 faultless: not guilty 13 merry: happy 13 fair: good 15 oversight: heedlessness 16, 18 of chance: by misfortune 16 of adventure: by chance 17 of: because of // likelihood: similar thing 19 *demeanor*: comportment 25 of: with 27 falleth in: gets into 29 for: on account of // seldom: infrequent 28 default of himself: fault of his 29 special: exceptional // haps: occurrences 30 forborne: dispensed with 32 use not: are not wont 32, 33 show: disclose 35 opening: revealing

themselves, after that they be sworn; but for opening of the names of them that gave them information before they were sworn, I know no prohibition. And if they will not show their names, they be not bound to do it... for they be not bound to help the party to his writ of conspiracy, but as they list to do in conscience.

5

Now, good readers, all this pretended defense is nothing else in effect but a fair confession that it is indeed true, the thing that I said myself: that he which is indicted of felony may be (as for any advantage that he can take thereby) as ignorant sometimes who be his accusers as he shall in the suit ex officio. And thereby may happen sometimes that he which is faultless shall not be all saved harmless... and when he hath had his harm, shall be remediless. And yet, for all that, the law not unreasonable, nor, for avoiding of much more harm, may not be forborne. And therefore, as for my purpose, even at that point might I have left, and needed to go no farther. And then, as you see, this good man had been quite

10

15

answerless. But yet went I farther, where me needed not, and that this good man saith that I did of necessity whereof for this matter I had of truth no need. And yet would I not now but I so had done indeed. For I have thereby the better brought to light what

20

Now, if this Pacifier say that yet here is at the leastwise in a temporal judge an open cause appearing, whereupon men may see that the judge calleth him not but upon a matter brought unto him; whereas the spiritual judge may call a man upon his own pleasure if he bear the party displeasure: this is very well said as for the temporal judge. But what saith he now for the temporal twelve men? For ye wot well, they may do the same if they were so disposed; and then had I as lief the judge might do it as they. For in good faith, I never saw the day yet but that I durst as well trust the troth of one judge as of two juries. But the judges be so wise men that for the avoiding of obloquy, they will not be

lack this good man hath of any sufficient answer. For these are there, lo, good readers, therein my farther words:

25

30

And I dare say the ordinaries be not so foolish neither but that they

```
1 after that they be: after they are
                                      1, 2 sworn: put under oath
                                                                      1 opening: revealing
2 know: i.e., know of
                         3 will not: do not want to // show: disclose
3, 4 bound: obliged
                        5 list: choose // conscience: i.e., good conscience
6 pretended: alleged
                         7 effect: fact; actuality // a fair confession: an open admission
12 faultless: not guilty // harmless: unharmed
                                                    13 had: suffered
15 forborne: dispensed with
                                 16 even: right // might: could // left: left off
17 had: would have
                        19–20 that this . . . necessity whereof: this . . . necessity that of which
21 of truth: in actuality // would . . . but: I would not now have it any other way but that
26, 29, 30 temporal: secular
                                27, 28 call(eth): summon(s)
                                                                 28 spiritual: ecclesiastical
31-32 had . . . they: I would as soon have it done by the judge as by them
                                                                       34 obloquy: ill repute
32 in good faith: in all honesty
                                   33 troth: uprightness; integrity
36 ordinaries: bishops
```

35

would as fain avoid it too, if they might... saving that very necessity, lest all should fall to naught, compelleth them to take this way.

Here you see that I mean in these words that though the Pacifier would tell me that the temporal judge hath by such indictment at the leastwise an open cause appearing, 5 whereupon a man may see that the judge calleth him not of his own mind, but upon a matter brought unto him-I would then grant him that this is indeed a good ease to the temporal judge, to keep him out of obloquy. And the spiritual judges be not so unwise but that they would be glad of such another 10 pavis, saving that they be bound to take the other way, and suffer themselves evil people's obloquy, for avoiding of the harm that else would follow, by the decay of Christ's Catholic faith. Which thing I there prove well too, as you shall after see. This, as I say, would I have granted always this good 15 man. But then I would always therewith have told him too that yet all that tale of his had nothing touched the point... but that always, for all this tale, the man that was indicted, if the matter were indeed untrue, was never the nearer the knowledge who were his accusers, to get any amends thereby, no 20 more than he that is called of office for heresy before a spiritual judge. And hear now what he saith to this, and whether we be by his answer, for the point that was meant by me, any one inch yet the nearer. Lo, good readers, this is his proper answer: 25

And then because he can none otherwise do but confess a great diversity betwixt them that be put to answer *Ex officio* and them that be put to answer before the King's justices upon indictments at the common law—for there the judges have sufficient and apparent matter to put them to answer upon, and in the other there 30 is none, but that the spiritual judge upon a displeasure may do it *ex officio*, if he will—therefore he goeth yet farther and saith that the twelve men may yet do the same, and make a man to be called that is not guilty, if they were so disposed. And truth it is, they may indict a man that is absent, and that is also not guilty, and be untrue, if they 35 will; but yet in such case the twelve men be known that do it, and be

1 as fain: be as glad to 2 fall to naught: come to ruin 8 ease: advantage 9 *obloguy*: ill repute 11 pavis: a large shield protecting the whole body from harm 11 bound: obliged 12 evil: bad // obloquy: bad-mouthing 13 *decay*: falling into decline; erosion 15 after: later 17 all that tale: that whole speech 17 had . . . point: had no relevance at all 19 matter: charge 21 of office: See note for 60/29. 22 spiritual: ecclesiastical 24 proper: excellent 26 *confess*: acknowledge (that there is) 26-27 a great diversity: a big difference 27, 28 put to answer: put on trial 33 called: summoned 30 apparent: discernible 35 untrue: unjust

20

25

30

also *compelled* to be upon the inquiry—for they *may* not be upon it, but they be thereto *assigned*—and also, the party upon their verdict shall not be put to answer before *them*, as it is upon the suit *Ex officio*, but before the King's judges, before whom the indictment is no attainder to the party... but that he may be found not guilty, notwithstanding that indictment. And though Master More say that he never saw the day yet but that he durst as well trust the troth of one judge as of two juries—I think the judges will can him but little thank for that praise; for surely juries must needly be believed and trusted. And therefore it is not the manner of the judges to lay untroth upon a jury, nor yet to commend them that do it, but it be proved before them of record after the order of the law.

Here you see, good readers, that touching the point that we spoke of, all this tale helpeth nothing, but goeth all about another matter: to prove another difference between the suit of office and indictments, as though I had said there were no difference between them at all. But I was never yet so mad to be of that mind. For then must I say they were both one. And then were every indictment a suit of office, and every suit of office an indictment, if there were no diversities between them at all.

And therefore if his diversity shall serve aught for the purpose, he must make it appear that the suit of office *because* of *that* difference, and because it is not like indictments in *that* point, is therefore in heresy either very clearly naught or else that at the leastwise it were somewhat better that they should never put any man to answer in heresy but either upon open accusation or presentment had before. For else if he ween to win this point of me with showing forth a difference—if his difference prove me no such thing as I tell you—he may for the matter as well bring us forth any verse difference, at adventure, that he learned at grammar school.

Now, when he hath laid all his diversities on a heap, and would thereupon conclude that because of those diversities, the suit of office were naught and unreasonable: I say that followeth nothing;
for it proveth yet no farther, at the farthest, but that the order

1 inquiry: inquest 3 put to answer: put on trial 5 is no attainder: has no legal consequence 7 troth: uprightness; integrity 8–9 can . . . thank: offer . . . thanks 9 needly: necessarily 10–11 *lay* . . . *jury*: accuse a jury of a lack of integrity 11 yet: even // but: unless 12 of record: on record // after: according to // the order of: the procedure called for by 13 touching: concerning 14 all this tale: this whole speech 18 one: the same 20, 33, 34 diversities: differences 22 aught: at all 23 make it appear: make it evident; show 25, 35 *naught*: bad 26 were: would be 27 to answer in: on trial for 28 else if he ween: if he otherwise think 29 of: from 35 followeth nothing: does not at all follow 31 at adventure: at random 133/36—134/1 order of: procedure prescribed by

10

15

20

25

of the common law were better, and not that the other were naught. For it might well be, for all that, that the common law might be good enough though they that secretly or openly come now and inform the inquest came either secretly or openly and likewise informed the Court.

And now saw I well that to this point was there none answer for this good man again... but to tell me that in such things as they now trust the inquests, it were peril instead of juries so much to trust the Court, because the judges might then feign matter against men, and say they were secretly informed. To this, since I saw what trust the realm must needs put in the judges' hands, so far above the weight of the first indictment, that serveth for nothing but for an information; and seeing also what manner of men they be that be chosen to be judges, so that there is nothing of so great weight but that it well may be put in their hands—I reckoned them of such troth that, save for evil folk's obloquy to-themselves-ward... else to the people there should come no harm though the trust that we put in the indicters were instead of them put in the judge himself. This I there said, lo, and this I think indeed. For as I said there, I never saw yet the day but that I durst as well trust the troth of one judge as I durst trust the troth of two juries. What hath this good man answered me now to this? To all this gear here is, lo, his worshipful answer:

I think the judges will can him but little thank for that praise. For surely juries must needs be believed and trusted. And therefore it is not the manner of the judges to lay untroth to a jury... nor yet to commend them that do it... but it be proved before them of record after the order of the law.

This answer of truth is not worth a straw. For as for that he saith the judges will for that praise can me little thank: that word were somewhat if I had said it for their thank.

But I said it, in good faith, not for their thank at all, but because it is very truth that I never saw the day yet indeed, nor never, I trust in God, I shall, but that I may well, and so will I do indeed, trust the troth of one judge as well as the troth of two juries. I would here wit of this good man, what dispraise is this to any

1 naught: bad 8 were peril: would be dangerous
8–9 so... Court: to trust the Court as much 9 feign matter: trump up charges
17 evil: bad // obloquy: verbal abuse // to-themselves-ward: (coming) toward them
24 gear: stuff // worshipful: impressive 30 of truth: truly
32 that... somewhat: that statement would have some merit; he would have something there
33 in good faith: in all honesty 37 wit of: (like to) know from

jury? What untroth is there here laid unto them, or to any one man of them? I will use one word now, this once, which this good man useth often. For now will I "say a little farther, and that is this" (though this man may hap to think the saying strange): I will not let to believe the troth of some one man, of 5 whose troth I make myself sure and doubt nothing at all, even as well as the troth of a great many at once, though they be all such as I believe every one of them as well as I believe himself. And I also believe some one judge alone, not in cunning but in truth, as well as I will believe both himself and all his 10 fellows too. For some one man may be such that if he should tell me a tale as of his own perfect knowledge—I would so little doubt it to be true that I could believe it no better though all the town told it with him. Lo what a great untroth I lay here to the juries!

And this I say for myself. And now will I, with this good
man's leave, say yet a little farther, and I ween I shall not say so
alone. I suppose verily that there be very few but so that it
might make a final end in their matter—except haply
some such as trust more in the favor of the county than in the
troth of their cause—they would rather be content to put it
wholly into the judge's hands than trouble the county
with calling up of the juries; whose troth yet many times
deceiveth them that in an evil cause have very great trust unto
them.

And yet in all this say not I that the common order and long-continued
law of this realm, to try the matters by juries and in
felony or treason never to proceed but upon indictments, is
not good; nor that the contrary way were better. Marry, two
things I say: that in treason and felony this ordinary law of
indictments is many times fain to be helped forth by another
means much like in many things to the suit *ex officio*;
and that is by diligent, politic search and examinations
besides, both by the King's honorable Council and the
judges, and justices of peace, every man for their part in every
part of the realm; and else would there many such mischiefs pass
by, and by indictment never would be found. And some

1, 14 untroth: lack of integrity 1 laid: ascribed 2 word: turn of phrase 5, 6, 22 troth: integrity 5 let: forbear // believe: believe in 6 make . . . all: feel confident and have no doubt at all // even: just 11 fellows: colleagues; fellow judges 9 *cunning*: deviousness 14 lo: look 14 lav: ascribe 18 make . . . matter: put a definitive end to the charge against them 18 haply: perhaps 20 *troth*: uprightness 23 deceiveth: disappoints 23 evil: meritless; not legitimate 26 matters: cases 28 marry: indeed 30 is . . be: many times has to be 32 politic: sagacious 35 mischiefs: crimes 36 found: established as having been committed

great and clearly proved felonies before divers and right worshipful of the King's Council... have I wist, ere this, that never could be gotten to be found by indictment in their counties, for all that. Howbeit, such examinations hath caused yet many mischievous people to be brought to their punishment... and have put also many such other unthrifts in fear, and made them refrain from thieving and draw themselves to thrift... or else, notwithstanding that there are yet thieves enough, there would be without doubt many more.

The other thing that I will say is this: that all these 10 differences and diversities that this good man putteth here between indictments and the suit ex officio prove yet nothing that the suit ex officio is not good... but only, at the very uttermost, that the order not to proceed without an open presentment were better. For as I said before, though this law by 15 indictments be better in felony now—yet were not the other way naught: if the law were so that the judges might proceed and put felons to answer without indictments... as in treason is used in this realm, by the law martial, upon war reared, as we saw by experience in Captain Quintyn, Captain 20 Genyn, Corbet, and Belke. And yet is that law not evil, though that our own common law be better; and that though we trust the juries never so well, yet might we trust the judges as well. And this may I say, methinketh, without any dispraise or fault finding in the juries at all. For let him assign me two 25 juries of very well-known good men... and then if he will ask me, "What fault find you, sir, in these men?"—I will answer him, "Marry, sir, no fault at all, I. I take them all for good men and true, and think they will not say but truth; nor I never said nor thought otherwise." But then would I assign him by name one of 30 our judges again... and say, "Now, sir, that I trust the troth of your two juries well, what fault is that that you find in this judge's troth, that maketh you to check me so because I will trust him no worse than I will trust them?" For that is, ye wot well, all that ever I said: that I would trust the judge as well, and 35 not that I would trust him better. And yet if I had said I would

1-2 great . . . worshipful: serious crimes clearly proved before several very prestigious members 6 unthrifts: profligates; dissolute people 2 wist: known 5 mischievous: evil-doing 7 draw: betake 8 thrift: decent occupation 11 diversities: dissimilarities 11 putteth: posits 12 nothing: not at all 14 order not to proceed: policy of not proceeding // presentment: formal lodging of charges 15 were: would be // though: even if // by: i.e., of proceeding by way of 16, 18, 20 in: with regard to 16 felony: a crime such as murder or theft 17 naught: bad 17 *so*: such 18 to answer: on trial 21 evil: bad 21-22 though that: even if 25, 30 assign: present to 27 marry: indeed 28 true: honest 31, 33 troth: integrity 34 worse: less well

10

15

20

25

30

35

of the both trust the judge better—I had not by that word, neither, dispraised the troth of juries. For he that saith he will better believe twenty-four than twelve dispraiseth not the troth of the petit juries, but believeth them well also, save such as be found false. And thus I have showed you that I may well say the words that I said without any finding of any fault in any juries. And it appeareth also meetly well that himself cannot well say the contrary—that is to wit, that he will not trust a judge so well—this can he not say without some manner of distrust in their troth. And yet since their Worships be so well known that this good man's distrust cannot impair it—they will, I dare say, forgive him. Howbeit, since the judges would (as this man saith, and as I dare also say they would) be sore discontent with me if I distrusted the troth of the juries, the juries may now no less do again of courtesy than for his worse opinion of the judges' troth somewhat be angry with him.

Now herein see I none other shift for this good man but, for the maintenance of his matter, to say that in the common law, the law would be good enough in felony, though the trust were put in the judges, to put traitors and felons to answer without indictment... but in heresy it could not be good before an ordinary; and would lay for his cause a diversity between the one judge and the other, and say that our judges be good men and worshipful, and ever have been and ever shall... and that the *ordinaries* be, and ever have been and shall be, very false and naught. Other shift hath this man none, that I see, than even to say thus. And verily his book of Division, save that it saith nothing to the praise of temporal judges, that I now remember, yet to the dispraise of the spiritual (for those, algates, that be now) saith even, in effect, as much—yea, and rather yet worse too, save that the color of "some say" saveth him from saying it himself.

But, now, if he defend himself with that fashion again—what the juries will say, that can I not tell; for the panels be not yet called. But as for our judges, I know their Wisdoms

¹ had not: would not have // word: statement 2 dispraised: cast aspersions on 5, 26 false: dishonest 7 meetly: fairly 10 Worships: Honors 18 maintenance of his matter: support of his case 24 worshipful: respectable 26 naught: wicked 27 even: just 29 algates: at any rate 30 even: quite 31 color: subterfuge

10

15

20

25

30

35

and their Worships such, that I am very sure in his so saying and his so lying upon the spiritual judges, they would can him no thank at all.

And verily, that the spiritual ordinaries be not at these days likely to be such, the temporal judges being so good as they be, there is among many other one likelihood this—that he hath chosen the one that hath chosen the other: the King's gracious Highness himself; which, having on both sides very good to choose of, hath, I dare say, been as circumspect in choosing of the ordinaries as of the judges. And yet, lest in their absence the officers of their own choice might hap to misorder the matters—His Grace keepeth not two bishops of all the realm out of their dioceses, nor, to say the truth, not so much as one. For he whose attendance His Grace useth most is far the most part of the year in his own diocese every day.

And therefore, as I said before, all these verse differences, and all these diversities, which this good man layeth between the suit *ex officio* in heresy and the not proceeding without indictments upon treason or felony, proveth at the very furthest not that the suit *ex officio* is naught, but that not to proceed but upon a presentment were the better a way. And then I say that it is a poor tale and a cold, if a man would come forth and labor us to break every old law long used in this realm, which he could not prove but that it were good enough... but yet would needs have it changed because that if it were now to make, himself could, he saith, make it better.

But now will I come a little nearer unto this good man, with the other point that I touched before; that is to wit, that it is not in this matter enough for this good man to prove us that not to proceed without open accusation or presentment is the better way both upon treason and felony, but if he prove us further, that the same way were also better in heresy.

But then have I showed before, in mine *Apology*, that in heresy that way will not serve. And that have I there proved by the plainest proof that in such manner things any man can

2 *upon*: about 3 *can* . . . *thank*: give . . . thanks 6 *likelihood*: indication 6–7 *he* . . . *other*: i.e., the same person has chosen both the one and the other 8 *which*: who 9 *good*: i.e., good ones 9, 10 *of*: from 11 *misorder*: mismanage 22 *tale*: speech // *cold*: unpersuasive 23 *labor us to break*: try to get us to change 28 *touched*: touched upon

10

15

20

make: that is to wit, by common, open experience... whereunto this good man of policy would give none ear, but in his answer he hath left it quite out.

And therein he fareth, lo, like a guest that maketh his reckoning himself, without his host... which is therefore after fain to reckon again... as I shall now bring in here one penny more into this good man's reckoning which I perceive well himself would very fain forget. Lo, thus wrote I further, good readers, touching this point in that selfsame chapter of mine *Apology* (folio 226):

But yet will peradventure this Pacifier say that sometime, in some very special case, he could be content that the spiritual judge should upon his discretion call one for suspicion of heresy *ex officio*; but he would not have men commonly called but either by accusation or presentment in their senes or indictments at the common law. I had as lief, for anything that I see, that this Pacifier should say thus: "By this way that they be called I would not have them called; but I would have them called after such an order as they might be sure that then should they never be called." For as for accuse folk openly for heresy, every man hath experience enough that ye shall seldom find any man that will... but if the judge should set an officer of the Court thereto, without any peril of expenses; and then were this way and that way all of one effect. And as for presentments and indictments, what effect would come of them concerning heresy, ye see the proof, I trow, meetly well already.

For this is a thing well known unto every man: that in every sene,
every session of peace, every session of jail delivery, every leet through
the realm, the first thing that the jury have given them in charge is
heresy. And for all this, through the whole realm how many presentments
be there made in the whole year? I ween in some seven years not one.

And I suppose no man doubteth but that in the meantime some there be. I
will not be curious about the searching out of the cause, why it is either
never or so very seldom presented, not five in fifteen years. But this I
say: that since some will not, some cannot, and none doth... if he should put
away the process ex officio, the thing should be left undone; and then
should soon after, with heretics increased and multiplied, the faith be

35
undone; and after that, through the stroke of God revenging their

1 common: general 2 of policy: out of expediency 4 maketh: writes up 4 reckoning: (hotel) bill 5–6 which . . . again: who therefore has to redo the billing 8 very fain forget: very much like to leave out 9 touching: concerning 11, 16 Pacifier: Peacemaker; Appeaser 13, 14, etc. *call(ed)*: summon(ed) 13 one: someone 15, 25 sene(s): ecclesiastical visitation(s) 15 had as lief: would just as soon 17–18 after such an order: in accordance with such a procedure 19 for heresy: of heresy 20 but if: unless 21 thereto: i.e., to do this 21 peril of expenses: danger of having to pay the court expenses if the defendant is acquitted 24 trow: suppose // meetly: fairly 22 one: the same 26 session of peace: sitting of the justices of the peace 26 of jail delivery: concerning a release from jail // leet: session of a misdemeanor court 29 ween: think 31 curious: solicitous; studious 32 *presented*: formally charged against a person 33 will not: do not want to 33–34 put away: do away with

10

15

35

malice and our negligence, should by sedition, and trouble, and dearth, and death, in this realm many men, both good and bad, be undone. And therefore, for conclusion of this piece, my poor advice and counsel shall be that for heresy—and *especially* now, this time—men shall suffer the processes *ex officio* stand; and for as many other sins also as are only reformable by the spiritual law, except there be any such sins of them as ye think were good to grow.

What hath this good man, good readers, said unto this piece? What shall we, good readers, say now to this good man, that in this goodly answer of his (which he would were taken for so strong), unto this piece—upon which great part of the matter hangeth—saith not so much as mum... but letteth it slip even by, as though he were one that had for this point been born deaf and thereby dumb!

And now, concerning this point, I will yet say a little further: that in places more than one, good evidences have been given unto inquests of plain and open heresy, which yet would not find it... that would upon much less evidence have shortly presented felony.

And one of these matters, with the priest that preached it, when I 20 was Chancellor was brought unto me by right worshipful folk, that before me avowed it in his face. And yet could not all they cause the inquest to present it, but some folk began to fall to favor him; and had he not been taken by good worshipful temporal men, many would have flocked after him, and have 25 followed him about, for pleasure of his new-fashion preaching. And yet, for all that flocking, though they had made two or three hundred (as they should haply within a while if a few good men had not letted it), they had been yet but a handful to their good Catholic neighbors; and yet, by such flocking together, 30 and following on a plump, they should have seemed in folk's eyes far the more part; and at length, peradventure, if they went on and were not letted, they might grow to it indeed.

That priest I delivered unto his ordinary, and that with good and plain proof of his heresy... which was indeed, soon after that, abjured. But for this I tell it you: that the jury would not find

1 trouble: civil unrest // dearth: scarcity 5 stand: i.e., to remain in effect 6 spiritual: ecclesiastical // except: unless 7 were: would be // grow: cultivate 12 mum: hmm // even: right 10 *goodly*: sizable 17 find it: i.e., find the defendant guilty of it 18-19 presented felony: formally charged someone with a crime such as murder or theft 20 *matters*: cases (concerning plain and open heresy) 21, 24 worshipful: respectable 23 present: file charges of // fall: come 24 taken: seized 25 temporal men: laymen 26 about: around 27 though: even if 29 letted: prevented // had: would have 31 on: in // plump: band; cluster 29 to: compared to 32 far the more part: the vast majority // at length: eventually // peradventure: perhaps 33 letted: hindered

10

15

20

25

30

35

it, for all the good folk that gave them open evidence. And that this is not in one case, nor a thing that happeth seldom, as I said in mine *Apology*, plain experience proveth. Whereby you may see that in heresy, if the judge should not *ex officio* proceed, till the matter were presented by the juries—heretics might be bold to proceed on apace, and so they would, I warrant you, and multiply full fast.

And thus you see, good readers, that concerning this piece, this good man hath in every point a great overthrow.

And therefore, now, the last clause of this fifteenth chapter of his is clearly wrested awry. For as though he had all proved (whereas all is disproved!)—he finisheth his chapter thus:

And thus it appeareth that Master More can neither prove the suit *Ex officio* to be like to the arresting of men for suspicion of felony or for good abearing, to putting of men to answer upon indictments, nor yet to them that may be accused by twelve men and know not of it; and that for the causes before remembered. Wherefore it seemeth that though it were clearly put away, the streets should not swarm full of heretics never a whit.

This good man saith here I cannot prove any of all these things like. But every man may well see, that list to look back and read it, that there is not any one piece, of all these that he speaketh of, but I have very plainly proved it very like, for the purpose and intent that I resemble it for. And this shall every man clearly see that will advise piece by piece.

And therefore—while upon differences and diversities that he putteth between them such as let them not to be like in the thing that I liken them for, he boasteth in conclusion that I cannot prove them like—I shall show you what thing, now, this boast of his is like.

If it had come in this good man's head to devise a law, and write a book therefor, to kill up all the bandogs throughout all the realm (wherein his time, as unwisely as it were bestowed, had not yet been so ill spent as it hath been in this), and then would lay for the cause that bandogs do spend victual, and will sometimes bite folk, too: if I would then write against his wise

- 10 clause: section 13 appeareth: is evident
- 15 good abearing: i.e., disturbance of the peace // to answer: on trial
- 17 before remembered: previously mentioned 18 though: even if
- 18 clearly put away: completely done away with 21 list: cares 24 resemble: liken
- 25 advise: consider (all this) 27 let . . . like: do not keep them from being similar
- 31 in: into 32 therefor: for it // up: off 32, 35 bandogs: guard dogs
- 33 were bestowed: would be spent 34 had not yet: would yet not have
- 35 lay for the cause: give as the reason // spend victual: consume food 36 wise: brilliant

book and say that he might by that reason kill up hounds and greyhounds and all, for they must eat too, and will sometimes bite children too... but likewise yet as they may not yet, for all that, be forborne, both for the pleasure that they do and also for that they help to take us some such beasts of venery as men eat, 5 and hunt and kill also such other beasts and vermin as else would destroy much victual... so the bandogs may not be forborne neither, for they both defend husbandmen's houses from thieves and help folk home, with their beasts too, sometimes, such as would not else come home—now might this good 10 man, by this reason that he useth here, write again and defend his politic device against bandogs... and therein answer me thus. First, that for defense of folk's houses there shall need no bandogs at all... for men may make their servants watch, or make fast all their doors... and when thieves would break in, 15 defend their houses themselves. And as for such beasts as would not come home, if they be not over heavy they may bear them home... and those that be too heavy to be borne home, tie ropes to their tails and draw them home. And then might he say yet a little further... and that is this: that he marveled much that I could, 20 for shame and fear of mine own conscience, resemble and liken together gentle hounds, or goodly greyhounds, to such ill-favored mastiffs. And then, to prove them very far unlike, put his differences and his diversities and say, "A mastiff hath, you wot well, a great jolt head, and a great muzzle and a thick, 25 boistous body... whereas a greyhound hath a proper head, with a goodly small, long snout, and fair long, slender sides; and the hounds yet much less like, too." And thereupon might he there conclude as he now concludeth here... and say thus: 30 "And thus it appeareth that Master More can neither prove the mastiffs to be like to the greyhounds nor to the other gentle hounds neither, and that for the causes before remembered. Wherefore it seemeth that though all bandogs and mastiffs were clearly put away, yet men's houses should be defended 35 well enough, and their beasts brought home well enough too, so they should, lo." 1, 11 reason: reasoning 1 *up*: off 4, 8 forborne: dispensed with 4 do: give 6 vermin: birds injurious to game or to crops 5 venery: game 8 husbandmen's: country folks' 12 politic device against: sagacious expedient regarding 14 watch: keep vigil; stand guard 13 need: be needed 17 over: too // may: could 17 bear: carry 18 borne: carried 19 draw: pull 21 resemble: compare 22, 32 gentle: noble; of an excellent breed 22 goodly: handsome // ill-favored: ugly 24 put: state 25 great: big // jolt: clumsy 26 boistous: bulky

27 *goodly*: nice-looking // *small*: narrow // *fair*: attractive dent 33 *before remembered*: previously mentioned

26 proper: fine

31 *appeareth*: is evident

35 clearly put away: completely done away with

10

15

20

Now, if he royally triumphed upon this, and thought he had avoided me well—I could no farther go therein, in good faith, but let him take that glory to him. And surely with any wise man that readeth over, here in this chapter, both his words and mine, and one after another considereth wherefore I resemble them together... shall find, I dare boldly warrant, that with his differences and his diversities he winneth like worship in this.

But now to turn again, as I promised, to the first point; that is to wit, his device of open accusers. Consider well this, good Christian reader: that whereas this good man in his book of *Division*, where he would have the suit *ex officio* left off—he then reserved us yet both open accusations and presentments, to put heretics to answer upon. But now, in this fifteenth chapter of his in his book of *Salem and Bizance*, for favor toward the Catholic faith he deviseth no more against heretics but open accusers alone... and saith that open accusers shall sufficiently serve the matter. And unto that here that I say, and that every man seeth—that no man will in heresy make himself a party by way of open accusing—thereto saith this good man nothing.

He seeth, pardie, very well that in many things forbidden by sundry statutes for the common weal—as against the great excess of apparel, and some such other things—the law doth invite and hire every man to the accusing of the breakers of the same by giving them the one half of the forfeiture. And 25 yet for all that—as long and as many laws, and as sore, as have been made against such excess of apparel, and as much as some men might have won by the suit—yet how few folk have been found that have taken those actions and thereby accused those offenders, the King's courts can declare, and 30 the little amendment may show.

Riots be open things and inquirable, with pains also set upon the concealers, yet many great riots go by unfound and the concealers never spoken of; and a statute was there fain to be made that it might be pursued and punished by the King's Council 35 without presentment, and that even by suit in manner *ex officio*, too. For though the parties that made the riot and the party upon whom it was made were so well agreed

```
2 avoided: refuted
                      3 wise man: sensible person
                                                      5 wherefore: why
5–6 resemble them together: liken them to one another
                                                          7 worship: honor
12 left off: dropped; discontinued
                                    18 serve the matter: take care of the problem
21 pardie: by golly
                       22 common weal: common good
                                                            24 hire: bribe
                                                                              26 sore: harsh
30 declare: make known
                            31 may: can
                                             32 inquirable: subject to investigation
32 pains: penalties
                      33 great: large-scale
33 unfound: i.e., with no one ever being found guilty
                                                    35 pursued: prosecuted
34-35 \ a \dots made: there had to be made a statute
                     143/38—144/1 agreed again: reconciled
37 though: even if
```

10

15

again that neither nother would by their wills have the matter moved or any more spoken of it—yet may the King's Council, upon secret information, cause the King's attorney to make a bill of the riot, and put the parties to answer, and send for what witnesses they will.

Now this man will not be so mad, I trow, to lay me for a difference that in the suit *ex officio* there is none accuser, and that here, the King's attorney is. For as I have said before, if the spiritual court should assign in like wise an officer of their own without either peril or cost—what would it avail the party?

If this good man had, therefore, devised rewards for accusers, and great pains of forfeitures for them that would conceal and hide—yet would not all that have helped well the matter in heresies. And weeneth he then that his bare device of open accusers alone, neither compelled nor hired, will help it? Nay—not and take indictments and presentments to them, with pains set upon the concealers, too.

And this hath all Christendom, good Christian readers, perceived; and therefore in every good Christian country do they 20 use the same suit of office which upon a light reason this man calleth unreasonable, and have used many long years. This law also which this good man thus impugneth upon his own unreasonable reason was thought a law right reasonable, as I told you, in a general council at Rome there held 25 by Pope Innocent III, and many great, wise, and well-learned virtuous men thereat. There were the ambassadors of all the realms and countries christened... and among the others, the ambassadors of England. There were the ambassadors of both the emperors; that is to wit, of Almaine and Greece. There were 30 also the four great patriarchs; that is to wit, the patriarch of Antioch and the patriarch of Alexandria by their deputies... and the patriarch of Constantinople and the patriarch of Jerusalem in their own proper persons. In this great full and whole council of Christendom was this law agreed and approved. And from the 35

1 *nother*: the one nor the other 2 *moved*: brought to trial 3–4 *cause*... *to make*: have... write up 4 *a bill of*: i.e., a bill of indictment for 4 *to answer*: on trial 9 *spiritual*: ecclesiastical 10–11 *what would it avail*: what good would it do 16 *hired*: bribed 17 *not and take*: i.e., not even if you add 18 *pains*: penalties 21 *light*: not weighty 28 *realms*... *christened*: Christian realms and countries 30 *Almaine*: Germany 33–34 *in*... *persons*: in person; their own very selves 35 *agreed*: agreed on

first making, all Christian countries received it... and have by the continual use ever since allowed it. And this realm hath found it so necessary that by statutes it hath strengthened it. And all true Christian countries to this day still observe it... nor no country hath there anywhere left and forsaken it except such places 5 only as have left and forsaken the faith of Christ withal... whose examples I trust this realm is too faithful to follow, upon such good reason as this good man here bringeth... whereof the very whole sum, when it is gathered together, amounteth to no more but that it may sometime happen that an innocent 10 may take harm thereby—a reason that, once received, may suffer no law to stand. For what law can he give so made in all this world, whereby none innocent can possibly take hurt? But here you see plainly proved against this good man that by the changing there would surely follow another manner of peril: 15 the decay of the Catholic faith by the encouraging of heretics... which would be well content that we made laws to burn them twice when they be proved heretics, so that the good counsel of this good man be followed, that the suit ex officio may be changed into such open accusers as in seven 20 years shall never one come forth, nor one heretic of likelihood once be put to answer; with another good counsel of this good man's also devised for their farther safeguard against arresting of them, whereof we be to speak afterward, in another chapter. Say this good man what he will, if we break this law 25 so long approved through Christendom, and take his device in the stead—his word will never so stay the thing but that after his ways once taken, and by his new, evil counsel the good old laws broken, men should shortly see, without any doubt, great increase of heretics... which, whereas they were wont 30 but to creep together in corners and secretly skulk together in lurkies' lanes, shall soon wax bold and put out their horns and flock and swarm together so thick in the open streets that such mischief would finally follow thereon as woe will every good man be that should live to see it. And yet would God, 35 of his goodness, turn at length the chief harm upon their

5, 6 left: dropped 1 received: accepted 2 allowed: sanctioned 5, 6 forsaken: abandoned 6 withal: therewith 8, 11 reason: reasoning 11 received: accepted as valid 12 suffer: allow 16 decay: diminution; erosion 18 so: provided 22 to answer: on trial 17, 30 which: who 25 break: change 28 evil: bad 29 broken: changed 32 lurkies' lanes: back alleys // get 34 mischief: harm

heads. But better folk should first feel so much thereof that it were better for both that, by these good laws well kept which this good man would break, these heretics be well repressed and kept under betimes.

The Sixteenth Chapter

5

10

15

His sixteenth chapter beginneth in the 54th leaf, wherein he first reciteth again his own words written in his book of *Division* wherein he disputed against the law in the chapter "Accusatus," paragraph "Licet," whereby it is ordained that though one being accused and sworn confess nothing, and yet afterward he confesseth, both of himself and others, such things as it may well appear that if he were not forsworn in the second, he was forsworn in the first... and yet that law there admitteth him for a witness in that same court and in that matter of heresy, if there appear manifest tokens that he doth it not of lightness of mind, nor of hatred, nor for other corruption; which he saith is therefore "a dangerous law, and more likely to cause untrue and unlawful men to condemn innocents than to condemn offenders."

And you shall understand, good readers, that in his book of *Division*he not only did impugn the law that he speaketh of here...
but also another chapter, "In fidei favorem," because that thereby such as are accursed, and such as are parties to the same offense, shall be witnesses in heresy.

This reason of his, good reader, albeit that me then thought
and yet think so unreasonable that I reckoned it little worth
the answering, as a reason reproved by the common law and by the
course and usage of all realms christened, and in other crimes
besides heresy plainly reproved, and the contrary well used in
this realm here also—yet in the forty-first chapter of mine *Apology*, folio
228, in this manner wise I answered him:

This piece, concerning the testimony of known evil persons to be received and taken in heresy... I have somewhat touched in the third chapter of the Third Book of my *Dialogue*; where since they may read it that will, I will make here no long tale again thereof. But well he wotteth

35

3 break: change 4 betimes: in good time 8, 22 chapter: i.e., chapter of canon law 8 disputed: argued 9 paragraph: article // ordained: decreed 10 sworn: put under oath 12, 13 forsworn: perjured 14 matter of heresy: heresy case 15 tokens: indications // lightness: unsteadiness 18 *untrue*: unjust 23 accursed: excommunicated 25, 27 reason: reasoning 27, 29 *reproved*: proved erroneous 28 course: custom 28 usage: practice // realms christened: Christian realms 29 used: kept in force 31 manner wise: kind of way 32 known evil persons: persons known to be bad 33 received: accepted // heresy: i.e., heresy cases 33 somewhat touched: to some extent discussed 35 tale: speech // thereof: about it

25

that heresy, whereby a Christian man becometh a false traitor to God, is in all laws, spiritual and temporal both, accounted as great a crime as is the treason committed against any worldly man. And then why should we find so great a fault that such witnesses should be received in a cause of heresy as are received not only in a cause of treason, but of 5 murder also, and of other more single felony; not only in favor of the prince, and detestation of such odious crimes, but also for the necessity which the nature of the matter worketh in the proof. For since evil folk use not to make good folk of counsel in doing of their evil deeds... those 10 that are done should pass unpunished, and more like be committed afresh, but if they were received for records to their condemning that were of their counsel and partners to the doing. Which kind of folk will not let to swear twice nay before they confess once yea; and yet their one yea more true upon their bare word than their twice nay upon a solemn oath; and yet confess they not so simply but that it is 15 commonly helped with some such circumstances as make the matter more clear.

Now, as to those things that I wrote in my *Dialogue* concerning great criminous witnesses to be taken in great criminal causes, he answereth with no word at all. Howbeit, to say the truth, he the less needed. For he giveth over here all that fault that he found in the chapter "In fidei favorem," as a thing wherein himself seeth now that he was overseen then, and therefore he letteth that here pass by, as though he had never spoken thereof, and sticketh only upon that one case of him that is once forsworn.

But now let us see what he saith here concerning this selfsame case. First he saith that the laws, though they must devise such ways as evil persons may be punished—yet the makers of the laws must "as much as in them is" provide that innocents shall be saved harmless. This is very true—"as much as in them is . . ."—the other point being provided for too: that offenders may be punished. But then say I that it is not in all the wits of the world, for punishment of mischievous wretches, to devise a law in such wise that men may be sure that none significant to the said of the world. And then if he grant me this

2 spiritual and temporal: ecclesiastical and secular 1 *false*: despicable; sorry 3 worldly: earthly 4, 11 received: accepted 5 cause: case // of: concerning 6 single: solitary; not committed in the presence of many witnesses 7 prince: sovereign 8–9 use not: are not wont 9 make . . . of counsel: take . . . into their confidence 10 should pass: would go 11 but if they: unless those 11 for records: as givers of testimony 12 were . . . to: were taken into their confidence and were accomplices in 13 *let*: forbear 14 true: trustworthy // bare word: mere statement 15 so simply: in such an unadorned way 19 great criminous witnesses: witnesses who are guilty of great crime 19–20 great criminal causes: cases concerning great crime 21 giveth . . . that: here drops that whole 22 in the: with the 23 overseen: in error 25 sticketh: dwells 26 forsworn: perjured 30, 31-32 as much as in them is: to the best of their ability 31 saved harmless: kept free from liability to punishment 34 mischievous: evil-doing

15

(which whether he grant or no, yet very true it is), then say I that his only reason against the suit *ex officio* and against this law too—that is to wit, that innocents may take harm thereby—is such a reason that if it were followed in every law whereby misguided folk are punished, there should no law stand for their punishment at all, but lest it might mishap that some innocent might take harm, we should let all mischievous folk alone, and thereby suffer many more good innocent men take harm.

But then goeth this good man further and saith that the punishment of an offender must be by a due and reasonable order.

And that is very true also... and therefore we shall agree well in that. But then goeth he further and saith:

I cannot see what due or reasonable order of trial it is that he that upon his oath hath first cleared himself and his neighbor of heresies should after, contrary to his first oath, be received again as a witness to condemn him that he cleared before, and that in the same court, and in the same matter.

Though this good man cannot see it—other men can see it... and have seen it, and daily do see it too, well enough. I have seen such things as this is myself proved, I cannot tell how often—that 20 in the excuse of a thief, some have taken an oath that the felon was with him in his own house at such time as the felony should be done in another place. And a man would have went he had been credible and said truth. And yet afterward hath himself confessed that the felon and himself also were 25 at the robbery, both twain; and his bare word then more true than before was his solemn oath. And every man that hath meddled much with such examinations hath a sure experience that this is a common fashion of murderers and thieves and such as are thieves' receivers... of whom at the 30 first face some seem honest men, and are so sometimes reputed, and come forth for declaration of them that are suspected and in trouble, and depose for them... and yet after, upon some other occasion in examining of the matter, begin to be suspected themselves, and afterward confess it too, both of themselves 35

4 followed: gone along with // in: with regard to 2, 4 reason: argument 4 misguided: ill-behaved 6 mishap: unfortunately happen 7 mischievous: evil-doing 8 *suffer*: let 10, 13 *order*: procedure 15 received: accepted 17 matter: case 20 *proved*: borne out by experience 21 *excuse*: defense 23 went: thought 24 credible: worthy of being believed // said truth: told the truth 26 bare word: mere statement 27 true: trustworthy 29 sure: soundly established 28 meddled much: had much involvement 30-31 at the first face: at first glance 30 receivers: receivers of stolen goods 31 *honest*: honorable 32 declaration: clearing

10

15

20

25

30

35

and them whom they came to clear by their perjury before. And I am very sure there be not a few that have heard such evidence given in causes of felony divers times to the jury.

But hereupon, because I spoke in mine *Apology* of such witnesses in felony: this good man maketh here a doubt what manner witnesses I mean—whether I mean the twelve men that are the jury, or other witnesses that are brought into the court for to inform them. And then first, if I mean the twelve men, then he answereth me certain things to show that he can skill of the law. But verily as for me, I shall put him out of that doubt that I meant not them. For I never took the twelve men for witnesses in my life. For why should I call them *witnesses*, whose *verdict* the judge taketh for a sure sentence concerning the fact without any examination of the circumstances whereby they know or be led to believe their verdict to be true?

And also, wherefore should I mean to call them witnesses, whom I see desire witnesses at the bar to inform them in the matter as witnesses inform a judge? He might therefore have spared his labor in that piece well enough. For I neither meant the jury nor never took them for witnesses.

If he will ask me what they be, then: I say they be the *jury*! And if he will wit furthermore what person they represent of those that are usual in other courts, wherein there be no juries used: that can I meetly well tell him too, if the tale were as necessary as it would be long.

But then cometh he to the other part, and saith:

And if Master More by that term "witness" mean such witness as be sometimes brought into the King's courts to give evidences to an inquest, then is that witness no such witness as the witness be in the spiritual court, that shall acquit or condemn the parties; for of those witnesses so brought into the King's court to give evidence to an inquest at the common law, no mention shall be made in the records, nor the jury be not bound always to follow those witnesses. For if the jury, of their own knowledge or otherwise, know the truth against the saying of such witnesses, they be bound to find

3 causes of felony: murder or theft cases // divers: several
5 maketh here a doubt: expresses here a doubt as to 9 can skill: has knowledge
13 sentence: pronouncement 15 true: correct 16 wherefore: why
17 desire: ask 18 matter: case 24 tale: telling 28 evidences: testimonies
30 condemn: convict 31 evidence: testimony 33 follow: go along with
35 against . . . witnesses: to be contrary to what such witnesses have said

10

15

20

according to the truth, and let those witnesses go. And yet if it happened that such collateral witnesses first testified upon their oath that the party were not guilty; and after it were informed the judges that they revoked their first saying and would say that the party were guilty: I cannot think that the judges would anymore call them to hear their saying therein. And though they would, yet, as I said before, it were far unlike to this case. For their saying there is but as an evidence, which the jury should not be bound to believe, but as the truth is. I cannot see, therefore, how Master More can prove his saying that such witnesses—that is to say, such as be perjured in the same court—should be afterward received as witness in any of the King's courts.

Now, good readers, evermore remember this: that it is not enough for him that will avoid a resemblance between two things—it is not enough, I say, for him to prove that in *some* point those two things are unlike (for so must every two things needs be, for else were they not two but one), but he must prove that they be unlike in the selfsame point wherein, and to the selfsame purpose wherefor, they were so resembled together.

And now I say that in that point, for that purpose for which I resemble them, I say that they be like. I did not say that they were like in the manner of the examination, and putting of their names and their depositions in the record, in which things this man saith and I confess that they be unlike; but I 25 said that they were like in this point: that like as he that hath been sworn, and cleared one (as far forth as in him was) of heresy, may yet be received, sworn again, and heard, and by his new, contrary deposition may hurt the same party whom he did clear, before the same spiritual judge, which lawfully may 30 give credence unto him upon certain circumstances by his wisdom well weighed—so may in like wise he that hath been sworn, and by his oath cleared a man (as much as in him was) of felony, be yet received and sworn again and heard, and by his new, contrary deposition may hurt the same party whom he 35 did before clear in a temporal court, before the selfsame

2 collateral witnesses: witnesses coming from the same pool as the jurors, but not serving on the jury 6 though: even if 7–8 an evidence: a testimony 14 will: wishes to 14 avoid: disprove 19 wherefor: for which 27, 28, etc. sworn: put under oath 27 one: someone // as far . . . was: to the extent that he could 33 as much . . . was: as much as he could

10

15

20

30

35

judges... by the reason that the jury may lawfully believe him in the second oath, upon certain considerations by their wisdoms wisely weighed, notwithstanding his former oath in the same court to the contrary.

And albeit that herebefore I thought upon no further than upon such witnesses taken before the King's Council, or justices of the peace, men of worship in the county, and afterward those depositions with such contrary oaths and all the circumstances therewith given in evidence to the jury at the bar, in the face of the King's ordinary court, sitting upon the deliverance of the prisoner: yet since this good man dissembleth that point and draweth me forth before the judges, I am well content to wait upon him thither. And I nothing doubt but that even there he should—the case might so fall—find it true that I tell him.

"That is not so," saith this good man. "For if it happened that such collateral witnesses first testified upon their oath that the party were not guilty; and after it were informed the judges that they revoked their first saying, and would say that the party were guilty: I cannot think that the judges would anymore call them to hear their saying therein."

Here you see, good readers, that he proveth this point by none other thing than only by his own thinking. Now, albeit that against his thinking that they would not, it were enough for me to say that I think they would: yet will I not leave it so bare, but

I will show you some cause wherefore in some case they should; and I will also put you some such case which, if the case happed, I nothing doubt but they would.

First, the cause wherefore a person once perjured is repelled from bearing witness again is because the law presumeth that he setteth not so much by an oath but that his oath notwithstanding, he were likely enough to lie.

Now, since this presumption is the general let, and therefore the reason of the general law: if the case happen that this presumption be more than counterpoised with a contrary presumption

7 worship: high standing 11 the deliverance of: consideration of what should be done with 11 dissembleth: turns a blind eye to 13 thither: there 13–14, 28 nothing doubt: doubt not at all 14 even: right 14 the . . . fall: this could turn out to be the case 24, 32 were: would be 29 repelled: debarred 31 setteth . . . by: has not so much regard for 33 let: deterrent 34 of: for 35 counterpoised with: balanced out by

10

15

upon the other side, there is the contrary presumption a reason sufficient to make in that case a contrary law, or a law that shall be for that case an exception out of that general rule.

Now, sir, as he that on his oath cleareth himself and his fellow too (either in heresy or in felony), doth after confess and swear also the contrary—if we would not believe him in the second oath because we find him thereby perjured in the first... then, in that we judge him in the first to have sworn false, it implies that even thereby we judge him in the second to say true.

If we will refuse his second oath, and not think him worthy to be believed, because that he swore the contrary before, and thereby presume him a false shrew when he should by the second oath prove himself once perjured, and then we could not tell in whither oath of the twain—here I say that the first presumption is overborne with the second. For it is another presumption that no man will cast away his soul for naught. And yet a greater presumption that no man will cast away his soul to do hurt either to his own body or to his friend's.

Now look me, then, upon this man's two oaths, his first oath
and his second. And though there be a common presumption
therein also, whereupon the credence of all oaths resteth; that is to
wit, that a man reputed good and honest will not for his friend's
body nor for his own, neither, cast his soul away by perjury:
yet when himself after showeth upon his second oath that
25
he was perjured in the first, the presumption of his
troth in his first oath is taken away by the second.

Now, the second, if it be to the accusing of himself and his friend both, whom his first oath excused, hath these other two presumptions for to bear against the first presumption

30 general of his untroth for his perjury: the one, that though it be presumed in the law that he would be false and forsworn for somewhat—yet is it presumed that he will not be forsworn for right naught. And yet, as I said, it is more strongly presumed that he will not be forsworn to the hurt of himself and his

35 friend. And therefore hath his second oath enough to bear it

10 say true: be telling the truth 5 fellow: accomplice 13 false shrew: lying scoundrel 15 whither: which // twain: two 16 overborne with: removed by 17, 18, 24 cast: throw 17 naught: nothing 20 me: for me // upon: at 23 honest: honorable 27 troth: truthfulness 29 excused: defended 31 *untroth*: untruthfulness // for: on account of 32 false: dishonest 32, 33, 35 forsworn: periured 33 *somewhat*: something 34 right naught: absolutely nothing 36 bear: sustain

10

15

20

against the first, since in the first he swore for his friend's advantage and his own, for which (since he now appeareth false in the one oath or the other) he was then likely to be forsworn. And in the second if he were forsworn, it were to their both harm. And therefore is that oath presumed to be true, though the man himself be presumed false.

This is, I trow, to no man any doubt, but that though a man had been openly perjured thrice—yet if the world might (as it may not) be sure that in another matter he would, for all that, swear true, the world would receive his oath. Now, forasmuch as of no man's oath any man can be so sure but that he may be by possibility deceived: the law goeth as far forth as it can, and taketh their oaths for a proof which are in that case by presumption likely to swear true. And since that he, therefore, whom the respect of his friend's safeguard and his own gave occasion to be forsworn in the first, in the second sweareth contrariwise to their both peril and harm—therefore in that case reason beareth the law that in such heinous crimes his second oath should be received.

Here have I showed you a reason which seemeth me sufficient that both in heresy and felony, the judges should be content, notwithstanding the first oath, in some case to suffer him swear the contrary.

But now for the temporal courts let us put some case for an example, to see whether the judges would, if the case happed so, hear the witness again or not.

I will not put the case in treason, wherein there would, I ween, be no doubt... but that if, after his evidence given upon his oath in clearing there the prisoner, he happed even suddenly there at the bar to repent himself, and say that he was hired to be 30 forsworn, and that he was forsworn indeed, and then would tell another tale far contrary to the first, ere ever he went from the bar: would his tale not be heard, trow you? Yes, and (the jury so desiring, as peradventure they would) the judges would swear him, too, I suppose; and very good reason would bear it that they 35 should.

But, as I say, let treason go, and come but even unto felony. If

```
2–3 appeareth false: is shown to be untruthful
                                                  4, 16 forsworn: perjured
5 were . . . harm: was to the detriment of them both
                                                       6 true: truthful // false: untruthful
8 might: could
                   8–9 may not: cannot
                                            12 deceived: mistaken
13 their . . . which: for a proof the oaths of those who
                                                         15 respect of: regard for
15 safeguard: safety
                        17 their . . . harm: the peril and harm of them both
18, 35 bear(eth): support(s)
                                22 suffer him: allow him to
                                                                24 temporal: secular
                           29 even: quite
28 evidence: testimony
                                              30 repent himself: have a change of heart
30 hired: bribed
                    30–31 be forsworn: commit perjury
31 was forsworn indeed: had indeed committed perjury
34–35 swear him: put him under oath
                                         37 even: just
```

10

15

20

25

30

35

two or three witnesses would at the bar excuse upon their oaths some one man of felony... and afterward, when they were stepped from the bar, happed to be heard round and rejoice together that they had given good evidence for acquittal of their fellow, with whom themselves had been at the same robbery: if they were suddenly brought again to the judges, the jury not yet departed from the bar; and, being severally questioned in that sudden abashment, seeing that God had so uttered their falsehood, began to have remorse and came forth with the truth, and agreed in the circumstances and told all one tale, confessing both the prisoner and themselves guilty, and would be content to swear that this tale were true, contrary to the oath that they swore there before—would not the judges, trow you, give them the hearing? Yes, yes, I doubt not, and the jury too.

And thus you see clearly, good readers, that in this point if this man had wisely wrought, he should have given it over.

And now, albeit that here I might end this chapter, and have no need at all to go any further—yet to the further opening how little hold there is in the causes that he layeth of dissimilitude and unlikeness between the witnesses brought into a spiritual court and the witnesses brought into the temporal for information of the jury... I marvel much if himself know not that like as the jury may, if they see cause why, weigh the witnesses at light and acquit the prisoner for all the witnesses' words, so may the ordinary do too. For in his estimation the power lieth to weigh and consider the qualities of the witnesses... and all such other circumstances as may diminish or increase their credence.

Yea, and unto the other side, the witnesses are not in the temporal courts weighed and esteemed so light but that the jury shall if they believe them not, be sometimes driven to yield a good reckoning why. For though the words of the witnesses be not entered in the record, yet in attaint they shall again be given in evidence against the petit jury, and be testified by the court and by the oaths of them that before heard them depose.

1 excuse: exculpate 3 round: whisper 4 evidence: testimony 4 *fellow*: companion 6 again: back 7 severally: separately 8 abashment: embarrassment // uttered: exposed 10 circumstances: details 10 told all one tale: all told the same story 11 *content*: willing 16 wisely wrought: acted wisely // given it over: conceded it 17 might: could 18 opening: making clear 19 hold: substance // layeth: alleges 23 weigh . . . light: regard the witnesses as unreliable 24 for: despite 24, 32 words: statements 25 ordinary: bishop // estimation: judging 28 credence: credibility 29 unto . . . side: on the other hand 31–32 driven . . . reckoning: made to give a good accounting as to 33 attaint: the attempt to convict the jury of having given a wrongful verdict, and to get the verdict reversed

10

15

20

25

30

And then if it appear unto the grand jury in their conscience that the petit jury willfully, of some corrupt mind, regarded not the witnesses, and therefore in the giving of their verdict passed against their own conscience: every man well wotteth that they shall be attainted.

And necessity hath also driven the King's Grace and his Council, for the sure punishment of felons, to provide that if the jury likewise regard the witnesses so slightly that the judges think they acquit the felon against their own conscience—they bind them sometimes to appear before the King's Council. And there have divers juries been proved so to have misused themselves therein that they have been punished therefor.

Now will I, good readers, come unto that piece which (as a thing already confuted and of itself unworthy to be touched) I would have passed over and not once vouchsafed to write one word therein, saving that I see him to have taken such labor thereabout that he seemeth to ween that he hath defended it well—which whether he have well defended or not, yourselves shall, good readers, judge. These were his words in his book of *Division*:

This is a dangerous law, and more likely to cause untrue and unlawful men to condemn innocents than to condemn offenders. And it helpeth little that if there be tokens that it is not done of hatred, nor for corruption of money, that it should be taken; for sometimes a wolf may show himself in the apparel of a lamb. And if the judge be partial, such tokens may be sooner accepted than truly showed.

To this piece these were my words in mine *Apology* (folio 229):

Since evil folk use not to make good folk of their counsel in doing of their evil deeds... those that are done should pass unpunished, and more like be committed afresh, but if they were received for records to their condemning that were of their counsel and partners to the doing. Which kind of folk will not let to swear twice nay before they confess once yea; and yet their one yea more true upon their bare word than their twice nay upon a solemn oath; and yet confess they not so

4 passed: went 11 *misused*: misconducted 12 therefor: for that 14 unworthy to be touched: not worth discussing 15 vouchsafed: bothered 20 *untrue*: unjust 22, 25 tokens: indications; signs 22 of: out of 25 truly: truthfully 28 use . . . doing: are not wont to take good folk into their confidence in the doing 29 should pass: would go 30 but . . . received: unless those were accepted 30 for records: as givers of testimony 31 were . . . to: were taken into their confidence and were accomplices in 33 true: trustworthy // bare word: mere statement 155/34—156/1 so simply: in such an unadorned way

10

15

20

25

30

35

simply but that it is commonly helped with some such circumstances as make the matter more clear.

Now see you well that, as himself showeth, the law provideth well against all light receiving of such confession. And yet this Pacifier saith that all that helpeth little, because the judge may be "partial," and the witness may be a "wolf" showing himself appareled "in the apparel of a lamb"—which appearing in apparel poor men that cannot apparel their speech with apparel of rhetoric use commonly to call a wolf in a lamb's skin.

But what order may serve against such objections? What place is there in this world, spiritual or temporal, of which the judge may not have some say that he is, or at the leastwise (as he saith here) may be, partial? And therefore not only such witness should be by this reason of his rejected in heresy, treason, murder, or felony; but also, by his other reason of a wolf in a lamb's skin, all manner of witness in every matter. For in every matter may it happen that he that seemeth a lamb may be indeed a wolf... and be naught where he seemeth good... and swear false where he seemeth to say true. And therefore this patch of this Pacifier concerning witness—every wise man may bear witness that there is little wit therein... and less good would grow thereof if folk would follow his invention and make of the laws a change.

Now that you have, good readers, heard what we say both before: now shall you see how substantially this man defendeth his first words again. These are, lo, in this sixteenth chapter of his new book, his words:

Now, by reason of this objection, I will speak somewhat farther in this matter than I did in the said treatise. And first I will say thus: that it is to me a great marvel to see Master More so far overseen—or else, if he be not overseen therein, that then he would, if he could, deceive others and make them so far overseen—to believe that it should be one like reason of a perjured witness, that will look like a lamb and say contrary to that he hath deposed before, and of a witness that cometh to depose in a matter that he was never yet sworn upon. For when a witness is brought in that was never sworn upon the matter before... the judge may not by the law refuse him, nor judge any default in him... unless he know a sufficient

3 himself showeth: he himself points out 7 poor: intellectually inferior 10 order: procedure 18 say true: be telling the truth 18 patch: i.e., section of the patchwork argument 20 grow: come 20–21 follow his invention: go along with his plan 22 we say both: both of us say 28, 29, 30 overseen: in inadvertent error 30 to: as to 30–31 it . . . reason: the same reasoning holds true 32 that: what; that which 34, 35 sworn upon: put under oath with regard to 36 judge: i.e., judge there to be 36 judge: i.e., judge there to be // default in: defect in; i.e., problem with

10

15

20

25

30

35

cause himself in that behalf... or that the parties do allege it; but he must believe... that he is honest, good, and indifferent... till the contrary be showed... as every man is in charity bound to do of his neighbor. But when a witness hath deposed in the court... and then will offer himself to depose to the contrary that he said before: the judge may with good conscience mistrust and think that he doth it of lightness of mind, hatred, or for corruption of money.

If I were in this point overseen, I need not greatly to be ashamed of the oversight. For then hath there been many such other men overseen also, as I would not wish to be wiser. And I no more intend to deceive other men in this matter than many others have intended that used and allowed this thing that I defend now before—such men as, with the condition that I were never worse, I would never wish to be better. This man maketh as though it were great shame for me to liken together a person once perjured and a person that was never yet once sworn. I would indeed be ashamed to liken them together in every point, although there were no more difference between them but that the one had a long nose and the other a short. But I am not much ashamed to say that for some purpose, where he speaketh of the one I may speak of the other, and liken them well enough together. For I may say (as I said) that likewise as he that hath forsworn himself may feign himself to say true, and look like a lamb, and yet be a wolf indeed—even so, I say, may he that never was sworn before.

"Yea," saith this man, "but yet these two be not like. For he that was never sworn, there is no cause to mistrust nor presume that he will play the wolf in a lamb's skin. But he that hath been forsworn is of reason to be mistrusted... and it is to be presumed that he will play the wolf in a lamb's skin."

Mark yet, in the meanwhile, that if I could make no farther answer—yet had I won and he lost. For his first words were, in his book of *Division*, that he that confesseth himself forsworn should in no case be received to swear again the

2 honest: honorable // indifferent: impartial 5 offer himself: volunteer
7 lightness: unsteadiness 13 allowed: approved of 18 once: ever
18, 26, 29 sworn: put under oath 19 although: even if 24, 31, 36 forsworn: perjured
25 feign . . . true: make himself appear to be telling the truth 33 mark: note

10

15

20

contrary... because that though there seem a good cause to believe him in his second oath, yet it may be that he doth but feign; and I said so may he too feign and dissemble that never was sworn before. And then if the only power and ability to feign were a cause sufficient to put any one man from bearing witness upon his oath—every man were by that reason repelled... for every man is able to feign. This was, as you see, the thing that I then said. Which thing neither this man nor any man else is able to confute, nor prove the forsworn man and the man unsworn unlike in the point that I likened them; that is to wit, in power and ability to feign. And farther than that went not I. For I had no farther cause in answering him there, while he went no farther there, nor said none other, but that he that was forsworn may feign. And now read yourselves his words, and look whether I say true.

But now, this being proved, as it is proved plain—that he hath a fall in those words which he spoke before—let us a little see whether with this leisure after, his matter again considered afresh, he hath caught any better hold now. And surely methinketh not one whit.

For where his new reason resteth in this—that he which confesseth himself once forsworn is by reason mistrusted, as one not only to be able to swear false, and wilily cloak his falsehood under a color of truth, but also presumed that he so will do indeed—to this I say that he saith truth, as long as 25 there is no greater presumption on the other side to serve for his second oath. But when the case happeth that there is, as it happeth in the case of this law—then is the presumption that he will swear false gone, as I showed you before. And then—that presumption by a greater presumption being purged—this man 30 forsworn and the man unsworn are, in the thing that I resembled them for, waxen well like again. And that the said presumption is purged—I showed you before, in that it is now a greater presumption for his second oath, that he will not forswear himself to the peril of his friend and himself 35 too.

4 *the only*: the mere; just the 5 *put*: bar 6 *were*: would be 7 *repelled*: debarred 13 *while*: since 15 *look*... *true*: see if I'm telling the truth 24 *color*: semblance 30, 33 *purged*: removed; cleared away 32 *waxen*: become 35 *forswear*: perjure

Then goeth he farther, and enforceth his reason with the reason of the law before that paragraph "Licet" was made. And therein thus he saith:

... insomuch that before that paragraph "Licet" was made, the judge might none otherwise have done of justice but to have refused to have taken any farther examination of him. And if he had, and the other had said contrary to that he had said before—his saying had been void in the law.

5

And this thing wherewith he thinketh his reason made the stronger maketh his reason a great deal feebler. For while the general rule of refusing such witness in all cases was made so long *before*—it appeareth plainly that necessity found the fault, and caused out of the general rule this case to be made an exception... and so the law made by better deliberation.

10

And in such other horrible crimes, the same law is used in temporal courts, and was also before that law made by the Church.

15

But against all this yet, this man maketh me this reason:

What the makers of the said paragraph meant, to put into the discretion of the judge that if he saw by evident tokens that it is not done of lightness of mind, nor of hatred, nor for corruption of money, that his saying shall stand as well against himself as against others: I cannot tell. For I cannot see how there can be any evident token in any such case, but that there might be in such a perjured witness sometimes inward hatred or corruption that the judge cannot know, so that he cannot judge of certainty that there is none.

20

25

30

Consider now, good readers, that all the strength of this reason hangeth in this: that the judge cannot surely see sometimes whether the perjured witness do it for the truth, or have a hatred in his breast so secret that the judge cannot see it; and therefore he cannot certainly judge that he hath none. Consider here, now, that he saith not that it is presumed, or must be presumed, that the perjured witness hath so (for if he so said, he should say to

1 enforceth: reinforces 1, 2, etc. reason: argument 2, 4, 20 paragraph: i.e., article of canon law 7 that: what // had: would have 10 while: given that 17 made: i.e., was made 22 lightness: unsteadiness 34 hath: i.e., has done // should say: would be saying it

10

15

20

25

no purpose; for, as I have showed you how, that presumption may be overweighed with greater presumptions to the contrary); but he saith that it *may* be indeed that the forsworn witness hath so. And then say I yet again, if we go to the *possibility* of the deed, and not unto the presumption and likelihood... he that was never sworn before *may* have a secret hatred which the judge cannot see, as well as he may that was twice sworn before. And thereon I say also yet again that if the judge were charged to give no sentence but such as he knew of certainty sure to be true, he could never upon any witnesses in this world give any sentence at all. For no witness were there but he might swear false and the judge might ween he swore true.

Now, if this man would say that he meaneth no farther certainty than only a sure thinking in the judge's own conscience, and that therefore he moderated all his other words with this word "conscience," saying that the judge could not with *conscience* judge of certainty that there were no hatred: this meaning were a very marring of all that he goeth about there to prove. For though the perjured witness might have (and haply had indeed) a secret hatred in his own breast, as another witness might have (and haply had indeed) that never was sworn before—yet might the judge, being induced by certain tokens and likelihoods, have a sure and a certain persuasion and belief in his own conscience that neither the one nor the other had any hatred at the time, but only deposed the truth. And therefore if he would say that he meant thus: he marred all his matter.

But it appeareth plainly that he meant in the other manner, upon which there must needs follow (if he were not in his saying deceived) that every judge in every sentence that he should give upon any witnesses, were they never so honest in appearance, were in a danger inevitable. And that he meaneth in that manner—that the belief of his own conscience induced reasonably thereto could not excuse the judge if he were deceived and the thing otherwise indeed—he declareth farther by the words that next ensue, where he goeth farther thus:

4 hath: has done 9, 11, 30 sentence: verdict 10, 31 upon: on the basis of 12 ween: think 16 moderated: qualified 19 were a very marring: would be a real destroying 24 tokens and likelihoods: signs and indications 27 marred all his matter: ruined his whole case 31 honest: honorable 34 deceived: mistaken 35 declareth: shows

And therefore meseemeth that the makers of the said paragraph laid over great a danger to the judges, that they should have liberty to accept, if they would, the saying of him that so offereth himself against his first oath... forsomuch as the judge cannot be sure to save his conscience therein but if he clearly refuse to accept anything that the witness would say contrary to his first oath. For if the judge did otherwise, and thereupon the witnesses testify against the party, and yet the party not guilty indeed: I suppose verily that the judge were party to the same offense.

And I suppose not the contrary, but am very sure of the contrary. 10 For I am very sure that where the judge seeth such tokens as seem unto him manifest and open tokens to prove that his second oath is not offered of any corrupt affection, but of remorse of his perjury and of a mind to amend his fault and say true: he falleth in no danger of conscience, 15 though the truth be otherwise indeed. For if there never had law been made at all to refuse any witness because he was once perjured: the judge had been clear at liberty, upon reasons and likelihoods leading his conscience, to have received him again without any peril of his own conscience at all, wheresoever himself 20 had thought greater likelihood that he would say truth at the second oath than he did before at the first. And then, since he was now letted to receive him, and his liberty therein restrained, but by a law made: what peril can he more fall in when a second law hath set him at large, than if the 25 former law had never made the restraint?

And where the law there provideth that the judge shall still reject that witness which offereth to tell the truth upon a second oath contrary to his first, but if there appear manifest tokens that he do it not of any corrupt affection: it meaneth none other but that if the tokens seem such unto the judge that they induce him in his conscience so to believe and think—and not that he shall be certain and sure that the thing is so indeed, by looking into the secret corners of the man's heart... no more than the King's judges at the common law, by what words soever they give the inquest an oath, nor by what precise words soever

1 makers: authors // paragraph: article (of canon law) 1–2 *laid* . . . *danger*: gave too great a power 4 forsomuch: inasmuch 5 but if: unless 5 *clearly*: completely; utterly 8 were: would be 13 *of*: out of 13, 30 *affection*: motivation 14 of his: for his // a mind: an intention 14 fault: wrongdoing 15 say true: tell the truth 16 though: even if 18 had: would have // clear: completely 16 otherwise indeed: actually otherwise 18–19 *upon . . . likelihoods*: on the basis of reasonings and indications 23 letted to receive: prevented from accepting 27 still: always 29 but if: unless 36 give . . . an: administer to . . . an; put . . . under

10

15

20

25

30

35

they receive their verdict, mean not to charge them upon peril of their souls to say none otherwise than the truth of the thing shall be indeed... but as the truth shall seem to them to be, upon such things as they shall perceive either by the evidence given them at the bar or otherwise ere they came there. Nor the judges themselves, in the judging of a matter of law, never mean precisely that the law *is* so. For then if other judges after reversed that judgment or judged the same case otherwise in another time between other men, the one judges or the other had put their souls in peril, doing both twain their best to judge as well as they could.

But since no man can see farther than his eyes will serve him; no, nor no man can see farther than his own reason can upon the matter thoroughly debated perceive: if either the twelve men or the judges, neither negligent nor corrupt, judge as they think true, their souls are safe enough—as safe as is the soul of the carpenter that putteth in his frame no timber but such as is good and sound as far as men can see... and yet some of it secretly may be such in very deed as soon after shall fail and fall down all the roof. His soul is safe enough, though his purse may hap to sweat, if he bound himself to provide the timber at his own peril. But so bindeth himself neither judge nor jury for the witness on peril of their own souls, that the other shall swear true.

And thus you see, good readers, that the judge is out of peril using diligence and troth, though the witness be false and have hatred in his heart... where the judge weeneth none, upon tokens that he thinketh manifest, although the witness were forsworn before. And thus is this good man in this matter all gone quite awry.

But yet being sore troubled with the wild wolf, that may swear false and seem true, nothing mistrusted because he cometh lapped in a lamb's skin—this good man goeth further yet, and therein thus he saith:

And where I said in the said treatise, as before appeareth, that sometimes a wolf may show himself in the apparel of a lamb, and that if the judge be partial, such tokens may sooner be accepted than truly showed—it is evident enough that by those words I note no judge to be partial, but I say that *if* the judge be partial, such tokens may be

5 evidence: testimony 4, 27 *upon*: on the basis of 8 after: later 10 one: i.e., one set of // had: would have 11 doing both twain: both of the two doing 11 well: rightly 12 serve him: allow him to 14 debated: pondered 15 true: correct 21 *sweat*: suffer loss 22 peril: risk 26 *troth*: uprightness 26, 28 (al)though: even if 26 *false*: dishonest 27 weeneth: supposes (there to be) 28–29 were forsworn: committed perjury 32 true: truthful // nothing: not at all 37 *truly*: truthfully 38–39 note . . . to be: accuse . . . of being

10

15

20

sooner accepted than truly showed. As who saith, the judge may accept such a token to be true though there appear some suspicion of untruth in the witness. In which acceptance he shall more liberally and without offense of the law do wrong to the party that is accused... than he could do by accepting of any other witness against the law, that were never sworn before. For if he accept any such witness contrary to the rules of the law, it appeareth to all them that know the law that he doth against the law therein; and that will sound somewhat to his rebuke, and that will make him the more loath to do it. But if the judge accept such a perjured witness where there is no sufficient token to prove that he doth it not for lightness of mind, hatred, corruption, nor such other: yet he breaketh no law therein. For all is committed to his discretion. And that may haply give a boldness to some judge to accept such a perjured witness where he ought not to accept him. And though the said paragraph say that if there be such tokens as before appeareth, that then in favor of the faith his witness shall be taken—yet I cannot see, if the party accused be guiltless indeed, as he may be for all that witness, how it can be taken in favor of the faith to accept the witness. For it cannot be said in favor of the faith to condemn an innocent.

All this tale, when it is all told, weigheth unto no more but that if the judge be partial, then he may abuse the law, and then that law in that case may do harm in heresy.

Now, besides that the inquest hearing the same witness sworn first, and after contrary, may, if they be partial, do like 25 harm in felony—what law was there ever made wherein the judge could do no harm if he would be partial? What laws may there serve, if the ministers would be false? This man is content that to a man's condemnation, the presumption shall serve that the witnesses will swear but true—such witnesses, 30 at the leastwise, as are not proved false before; and yet may they mar all if they be false and partial. And when he presumeth such indifference in a witness—why feareth he so sore partiality in a judge? If he say he mistrust the judges because of "some say"s—then must he mistrust witnesses, 35 juries, and judges, and altogether. For such "some say"s there lack not that can say well by no man.

```
1 as who saith: that is to say; in other words
                                                 3 untruth: untruthfulness
3 more liberally: more freely; with less constraint
                                                       7 appeareth: is obvious
8 doth: acts; goes // sound: have repercussions
                                                      9 rebuke: shame // loath: reluctant
11 he doth it: i.e., the witness does not offer to change his testimony
11 lightness: unsteadiness
                               15 paragraph: article (of canon law)
18 guiltless indeed: in fact not guilty
                                          19 taken: i.e., taken as being
20 said: i.e., said to be // condemn an innocent: convict an innocent person
21 all this tale: this whole speech // weigheth: amounts
22 abuse: take a wrong advantage of
                                         23 heresy: i.e., heresy cases
26 felony: i.e., murder or theft cases
                                         28 the ministers: i.e., those administering it
28 would be false: wish to be dishonest
29 to a man's condemnation: toward the convicting of someone
32 may they mar all: they can wreck everything // false: dishonest
33 indifference: impartiality
33–34 why . . . judge: why is he so afraid that a judge will be biased
37 say well by no man: speak well of no one
```

10

15

20

25

30

35

This reason of his doth but put a suspicion in men's heads against the judges for everything that is put in their discretion. But surely (as I have often heard that great, wise, and right worshipful man Sir John Fineux say, late Chief Justice of the King's Bench), whoso taketh from a justice the order of his discretion taketh surely from him more than half his office. If this realm should mistrust justices—it must in the laws then make many such changes as I never saw need yet, nor trust I never shall. What harm might any justice of the peace do, if he were disposed to be false and partial? And ever shall be able to do, make what laws men will, but if men would utterly put away that office. And then instead of one harm that *may* hap, we shall have a hundred hap in very deed.

Consider also, good readers, that by the laws before made, there was not only forbidden to bear witness he that appeared to be once forsworn, but also many other manner of criminous persons, for the general presumption that they were unworthy credence; and yet have been, by other laws after made, received to bear witness against themselves and their fellows in heresy and in treason both, for the necessity, as I have said, and upon presumptions more probable that they were in that case well likely to swear true.

Now, if this good man, for fear of such harm as may by possibility fall upon an innocent, will put one of these from witnessing—he must repel them all. For as the latter laws have since received all—so the former laws generally did first refuse them all. For the general rule is naturally before its particular exceptions.

And then if he would in like wise repel them all, then for one harm that may hap—and haply never shall—he should have many mischievous people very bold, while they might be sure they must needs pass unpunished, because their privy mischief could never well be proved but if they would, when they went about it, take honest men with them to bear record of it.

1 reason: argument 4 right worshipful: very reputable 7, 13 office: competence 12 put away: do away with 17 *forsworn*: perjured 18 unworthy: undeserving of 25 *put*: bar 26, 30 repel: debar 20 fellows: accomplices 28 refuse: reject 28 is naturally before: naturally preexists 32 *mischievous*: crime-committing 33 pass: go // privy mischief: clandestine crime 32 *while*: given that // *might*: could 34 but if: unless 35 honest men: honorable people // record of: witness to

And thus you see, good readers, very clear and plain, that this good man hath hitherto brought you forth no reason. And I think he saw that himself... and therefore he thought he would say better at last, and not leave it so. For then goeth he further and saith:

And furthermore, it appeareth also that the words of the said treatise extend no further but to such as be judges where there is before them such a perjured witness, and not to all judges. And in like wise those words that "a wolf may show himself in the apparel of a lamb" stretch only to such a perjured witness. For there is no other witness spoken of in the said treatise in that place.

This man goeth to his words and forgetteth what I say—which is that though his *words* go no further, yet the *reason* of his words (if it were reason, as I have proved it none) would stretch so far farther that it would mar all. And this point have I proved you very clear and plain.

And thereby is meant that such a perjured witness may haply show himself to deny that he said before of a compunct heart and of a new knowledge of the truth, and of a very zeal unto the faith—and yet do it indeed of covetousness, falsehood, rancor, and malice to the party. And so, as the Gospel saith, he may hap outward to appear in the apparel of a sheep, and withinforth be a ramping wolf. And such one may that perjured witness be, that is spoken of in the said treatise. And of such a witness in heresy the said treatise speaketh only there, and of none other witness, as to the readers will appear. And therefore, as meseemeth, Master More findeth default in this behalf where he had no cause reasonable so to do.

Now, good readers, whereas this man saith that he meant that such a forsworn witness may haply play the wolf in a lamb's skin: I grant that he meant so. But as I grant it to him—so must he grant this again to me: that so may he play, too, that was never sworn before. And then while he goeth no further but that the one haply may, and cannot himself

2 hitherto: thus far 13, 14 reason: reasoning 15 mar all: bring everything to ruin 18 that: what; that which 18, 19, 20 of: out of 19 very: true 20 do it indeed: actually do it // falsehood: dishonesty 24–25 and of . . . only there: and of only . . . there 26 appear: be obvious // default: fault 32 while: since

10

5

15

20

25

30

10

15

20

say nay but that the other haply may so too—there followeth upon that the thing that I said before, which this man saith he marveleth much that I would say: that is to wit, that by that wise reason there should be received in such criminal causes no manner witness at all!

Now, if he leave his "may haply" and say that it is *likely* that the forsworn witnesses will say false, and the other true that never was sworn before... and that the witness once forsworn before is, in his second oath contrary to his first, more likely to play the wily wolf in the lamb's skin than such a plain, simple man as was never sworn: I will be so bold for this once as in some case to tell him boldly nay. For whereas he said a little before that he could not see how there could be any such evident token in any such case but that such a perjured witness might do it of a secret hatred, and seem charitable, and so play the wily wolf in the simple lamb's skin: I can see well enough that in some case there may be an evident token that some such witness as was so first forsworn were after, in his second oath swearing the contrary, less likely to lie and play the wily wolf in the lamb's skin than were another that never was in his life before neither forsworn nor sworn.

For if he that was before, upon his oath, examined both of himself and his son, or himself and his father, or his other special-known friend, and on his oath cleared them all, do at another time upon a new oath confess them all guilty, and himself 25 also... and where peradventure himself must to the fire, because he was abjured before, and they may turn yet in time and be but abjured: were not this an evident token that he doth it not of any secret hatred, nor playeth not the wily wolf in a lamb's skin? For iwis, to confess himself guilty in such case, and 30 putting himself in worse case than his fellows, were but a poor point of a wily wolf. And as I put this case for example so may there be many others. For the tokens might be plain enough though they were less plain than thus. And therefore, to conclude in this matter, this man hath no reason in this world 35 to defend his first book with.

And therefore where he spendeth a patch in the end about

1 say nay but: deny 4 wise: brilliant 4, 35 reason: reasoning 5 causes: cases 6 leave: drop 26 must: i.e., must go 30 iwis: indeed // case: a situation 31 worse case: a worse situation // fellows: accomplices // were: would be 32 point: characteristic 166/37—167/1 spendeth . . . declaration: tacks on in the end his explanation

his declaration that it may be lawful for him to find default at laws made by the Church, so that he find them upon a sufficient reason: because all that point nothing helpeth him here in this law—against which he showeth no reason reasonable, but a reason as unreasonable as ever reasonable man heard—I shall, I say, therefore let that piece pass by, and here make an end of his sixteenth chapter.

The Seventeenth Chapter

His seventeenth chapter beginneth folio 62. In the beginning whereof, he marveleth that I speak so often in mine Apology of his 10 using this word "some say." And he showeth that in a tale told him by other folk, there is good reason that he so should say... and that I use the same word myself too sometimes, and telleth two places where: folio 77 and folio 100. I neither did nor will find fault that he use this word "some say"; nor I will not let 15 (where the case requireth) to say myself that "some say" this or that. For I know well it is English. But the fault that I found, and yet find, is that his book of Division abuseth the figure of so many "some say"s to the seditious slander of the clergy... and especially of the ordinaries in the punishment of 20 heresy, to bring them in obloquy of the people thereby. And whereas upon complaints made, the matters have late been examined, and the truth hath been plainly proved contrary—yet hath he never one "some say" thereof in all his book, neither in the one book nor the other... but all his "some say"s evermore say 25 evil, and never a "some say" well. This is the fault that I find. For if he made a book with five times as many good "some say"s as his "some say"s in that book be naught—I would find in his "some say"s no default at all. For "some say" is, as I say, good English. But when a book is full of shrewd "some say"s—there do some 30 men say that "some say" is as shrewd English as any Deutsch woman speaketh.

But now, to show that in all his "some say"s he meaneth none

```
1–2 default at: fault with
                              2 so: provided // them: i.e., the faults
3 all . . . helpeth: that whole point does not at all help
4 showeth . . . reasonable: presents no rational argument
                                                              11, 13, 15 word: expression
11 showeth: says // in: with regard to // a tale told: something said to
                                                                               15 let: forbear
16 case requireth: situation calls for it
                                           17 English: i.e., good English
                                                           21 in obloauv of: into disrepute with
19 figure: figure of speech
                                20 ordinaries: bishops
22 complaints made: the filing of charges // late: of late; recently
                                                                        25-26 say evil: speak ill
27 made: wrote
                    28 naught: wicked // in: with
                                                         29 default: fault
30, 31 shrewd: bad
                        31 Deutsch: German
```

harm, he goeth further, and for an example he bringeth forth one which is in very deed a very malicious, naughty, pestilent "some say," whereof the pretense is the safeguard of innocents, the effect is the decay of the faith by the emboldening of heretics, the instrument is a false, imagined slander against the ordinaries. And as wilily as those shrews that beguile him have helped him to involve and intricate the matter—I shall use so plain and open a way therein that every man shall well see the truth.

Lo, these are this good man's words:

10 And one of the "some say"s that he findeth default at is this. I say in the eighth chapter of the said treatise thus: "And here some say that because there is so great a desire in spiritual men to have men abjured or to be noted with heresy; and that some, as it were, of a policy do noise it that the realm is full of heretics, more than it is 15 indeed: that it is very perilous that spiritual men should have authority to arrest a man for every light suspicion or complaint of heresy, till that desire of punishment in spiritual men be ceased and gone; but that they should make process against them to bring them in upon pain of accursing—and then, if they tarry forty days, the King's laws to bring them in by a writ of Excommunicato 20 capiendo, and so to be brought forth out of the King's jail to answer." And it followeth in the said eighth chapter thus: "But surely, as it is somewhat touched before in the seventh chapter, it seemeth that the Church in times past have done what they could to bring about that they might punish heresy of themselves, without calling for any help 25 therein of the secular power. And therefore they have made laws that heretics might be arrested and put in prison, and stocks if need were; as appeareth in Clementinis de hereticis, Cap. Multorum querela. And after, at the special calling on of the spiritualty, it was enacted by Parliament that ordinaries might arrest men that preach, hold, 30 teach, or inform others in heresy, there prohibited, or that thereof hold any conventicles or schools. For some men think that the said Clementine was not of effect in the King's laws to arrest any man for heresy. But if a man were openly and notably suspected of heresy, and there were sufficient record and witness against him, and 35 there were also a doubt that he would flee and not appear, whereby he

2 naughty: wicked // pestilent: pernicious 3 pretense: pretext 4 decay: erosion 3 safeguard: keeping safe; protection 5 imagined: invented 6 *shrews*: wretches 7 *involve*: entangle 10 default at: fault with 12, 15, 17 spiritual men: clergymen 13 noted: branded 16 light: slight; trivial 13–14 *a policy*: an expediency 14 noise it: spread the rumor 18 make process: initiate legal proceedings 16 complaint: accusation 22 answer: be put on trial 23 touched: discussed 19 accursing: excommunication 29 calling on: appeal; request 30 ordinaries: bishops // might: could 32 conventicles: clandestine heretical meetings 36 doubt: fear // appear: i.e., show up in court

10

15

20

25

30

35

might infect others, it seemeth convenient that he be arrested by the body; but not upon every light complaint that full lightly may be untrue. And that it will be right expedient that the King's Highness and his Council look specially upon this matter, and not to cease, till it be brought to more quietness than it is yet; and to see with great diligence that pride, covetousness, nor worldly love be not judges, nor innocents be punished, nor yet that willful offenders go not without due correction."

And when Master More in his *Apology* hath recited the said words of the said treatise, then he endeavoreth himself very much to make it appear that the motions that be made in the said treatise in the place before-rehearsed be unreasonable and cannot be brought about; or else that if they were brought about, they should do hurt and no good. And to make his sayings the more acceptable... he layeth sometimes default in my sayings and saith that I thereby defame the judges spiritual, where I defame them not... but say only that it is expedient that the King's Highness and his Council see that "pride, covetousness, nor worldly love be no judges." And whether those words amount to that effect... that Master More saith they do—that is to say, that I defame all spiritual judges—it appeareth evidently they do not.

Now, good readers, to the intent that you may the more plainly perceive both the good mind of this good man's first book of *Division*, and also his second book here in defense of the same: take the labor to read the forty-sixth chapter of mine *Apology*, folio 232. And then shall you think, I suppose, that all his defense is so faint that I little need to reply.

For first, where he saith that I say that in those words he defameth the judges spiritual: I would he had rehearsed my words with which I say so. For I am sure enough my words be no larger than the truth. But that is his usual craft: to leave out, for the more part, both my words and the place, because men might ween it were in some part of my book though they remember not where.

But now, because he saith that it is evident that those words of his do not amount unto the defamation of the spiritual judges: I have showed and proved indeed, in one or two places

1 convenient: appropriate 1–2 by the body: bodily; physically 2 light: trivial 2 complaint: accusation // full lightly: very well 11 motions: proposals 13 hurt: harm 14 layeth: alleges 15 default: error // sayings: assertions 22 mind: intent 24 labor: trouble 26 faint: weak 28 would: wish // rehearsed: quoted 29–30 be no larger than: do not exaggerate 31 more: most // because: so that

of mine Apology, that all the great matter of his complaint upon the cruelty of the spiritual judges in handling men for heresy, since there hath been very few troubled therefor in any diocese in England or Wales... by the space of these twenty years or thirty last past... except only Lincoln and London... 5 and that therefore the false complaint of mishandling could have little color any farther than those two dioceses... and yet, to say the truth, never complaint brought forth by any such man but in London diocese, nor yet not but in London and some piece of Essex alone... and the complaints, upon 10 examination had by the King's honorable Council, always found causeless and false—since this is, I say, so clear that no man can say the contrary but that this is true—I declare and show in my said *Apology* that where with his false "some say"s he defameth and laboreth to bring in obloquy of the 15 people all the spiritual judges in the realm... of wrong and cruel handling men for heresy... all the men that his false "some say"s (if they were true) did touch were yet indeed so few that he might in a manner as well speak of them by name. And in very deed so few they be. For they be as few or fewer than are 20 the judges either of the one bench or the other.

And therefore when he cometh now forth under shadow of a shrewd "some say" and showeth that the spiritual men have a great desire to put men to abjuration, and to have men noted of heresy, and that therefore till they leave that condition, it were 25 well done they should have less authority... and that it will be "right expedient" that "the King and his Council look specially upon this matter," and "to see with great diligence" that "pride, covetousness, nor worldly love be not judges," nor innocents punished, nor yet that offenders go not without due correction: 30 is not this a lewd colored slander and (without any such thing proved) a shameless defamation?

If this good man would in like wise write and put in print another book, and therein speak first of justices in general, as it might seem to touch all the judges of every base court and justices of the peace too... and then, by some certain circumstances, restrain it in such wise that every man may see that he meaneth only the King's judges at Westminster, and say that some say that, especially of late, the matters of common pleas be evil-handled

```
1, 6, etc. complaint: accusation; charge 2 upon: concerning 7 color: plausibility
11 had: held 23 shrewd: cunning; devious // showeth: says 24 noted of: branded with
25 leave that condition: cease to have that disposition 31 lewd: vile
31 colored: camouflaged 35 touch: be referring to // base: lower
36 circumstances: details 37 restrain: restrict 39 evil-handled: handled badly
```

10

25

30

by the judges... and that in writs of error and in pleas of the Crown the judges mishandle the people sore and do much wrong... and that some say that they have this evil desire, and that... and that till they have left them, it were well done that they had less authority; and then, after such a false, foolish "some say," come forth with *his* saying, and in approbation of his other saying, conclude and say thus much farther—"It will be right expedient, therefore, that the King's Highness and his Council look specially upon this matter, and to see with great diligence that pride, covetousness, nor worldly love be not judges," etc.—were this wily, foolish handling no false defamation at all?

And now, when he handleth the spiritual ordinaries with like words for heresy and his "some say"s' false, imagined lies—and... though his book of *Division* laboreth to draw that false suspicion farther... yet himself seeth by experience that while 15 there hath in long while but in two dioceses very few been punished for heresy, the slander that he soweth toucheth some very few, no less than though he wrote in their names—how can he, therefore, for very shame, say that it is no defamation? Weeneth he the readers of his work were all such fools that 20 he might void his plain, open deed with his bare, bold word?—where he saith it appeareth evidently nay, where every wise man that readeth it seeth well himself that it well appeareth evidently yes!

Now goeth he farther with another piece, and saith:

Nor yet my words prove not that I would have all spiritual judges changed. For the spiritual judges that be now may be judges still, and have all the properties before-rehearsed, as well as others, for anything that I have said. And yet Master More taketh it otherwise, and saith... I would have such judges as have no spice of any of the said points. And he saith that till such judges may be found, heretics may "make merry for a little season... while men walk about and seek for such judges"... which he weeneth will not be done in a "week's work."

Here he leaveth out again the place of mine that he toucheth.

For when that is once read, all his gay tale is gone. For
there shall you see that I consider his words, and declare two

2 mishandle: mistreat // sore: terribly 4 left them: ceased to have those bad desires 11 false: untruthful / despicable 13 imagined: fabricated 15 while: since 23 wise: sensible 30 spice: trace 31 points: characteristics // may: can 34 place: text; passage // toucheth: is referring to 35 all his gay tale: his whole fine speech 36 declare: set forth

10

15

20

25

30

35

ways that the good man might mean... of which twain he taketh here the one, and the other he letteth slip. And yet in taking his words as he would now seem, my words which he dissembleth here turn up all his tale; and that the man saw full well... and therefore winked at them. But I shall bring them in again here, and repeat them for him. Lo, good readers, in the forty-sixth chapter, folio 253, after his words rehearsed at length, thus I begin mine own:

In this process, lo, good readers, this Pacifier declareth that he would have the King's Highness and his Council so specially look upon this matter that neither innocents should be punished nor yet willful offenders go without due correction. Who could end and conclude all his matter more fruitfully?

But, now, the special ways whereby he deviseth that the King's Highness and his Council should bring this thing about be twain.

The one is if they provide that neither men that be proud nor covetous, nor have love to the world, be suffered to be judges in any cause of heresy.

The other is that the bishops shall arrest no man for heresy till the desire that spiritual men have to cause men abjure heresies, and to punish them for heresies, be ceased and gone.

And surely I think that his two devices will serve sufficiently for the one part—that is to wit, that none innocents shall be punished. But I fear me very sore that they will not serve half so sufficiently for the other part—that is to wit, that willful offenders go not without correction.

For now, to begin with his first device, that none be suffered to be judges in cause of heresy that are proud or covetous, or have love to the world: if he mean of such as have none of these affections with notable enormity, then till he prove them that are already, worse than he proveth them yet—that is to say, till he prove it otherwise, by some of their outrageous deeds in the dealing and mishandling of men for heresy that he here defameth them of, than he hath yet proved, and that he prove their cruel, wrongful dealing otherwise than by "some say"s, or by his own saying—the King's Highness and his Council can see, for all his

4 dissembleth: ignores // turn up all his. tale: overthrow everything he's said

5 winked at: turned a blind eye to 7 his words rehearsed: quoting his words

9 Pacifier: Peacemaker 12–13 all his matter: his whole case 14 special: specific

17 suffered: allowed 18, 28 cause of heresy: (a) heresy case 20 cause: make

24 fear me very sore: am very much afraid 29 affections: dispositions

30 enormity: departure from moral rectitude

30 them that are already: the ones already in office; the current ones

32 outrageous: grossly immoral

wholesome counsel, no cause to change those judges that are already, but to leave them still; and then serveth that device of naught.

And on the other side, if he mean that the King's Highness shall suffer none to be judges in cause of heresy that hath any spice at all either of pride or of covetousness, or any love at all unto this world: heretics may sit still and make merry for a little season, while men walk about and seek for such judges. For it will not be less than one whole week's work, I ween, both to find such and to be sure that they be such.

Here have you heard, good readers, a reasonable cause why that I should take him that he would have the spiritual judges 10 such as should have no spice of pride, covetousness, nor worldly love. For either he must mean so... or else (as I said) he must mean on the other manner which I rehearse first, and which he would now seem to mean. But then (as I have said), if he meant in the first fashion, as he would now seem—all his tale is overturned. 15 For then had he no cause of any such complaint. For he neither had himself when he wrote, nor any man else, proved by any of them the contrary. And then needed he not to spend out his profound wisdom in making such exhortations to the King's Highness and his Council to see with 20 so great diligence (as though they had been so long negligent!) to the thing that himself could not say nay but that it was meetly well enough already. And thus you see, good readers, that he left out and dissembled that first part of my words because he wist ne'er what to say thereto. And therefore, since except he 25 meant in the first manner (which he could not do without the marring of all his matter)—you see well that himself drove me to think that he would have the King's Grace and his Council see diligently that there should be no spiritual judges but they that had no spice of pride, covetousness, or worldly love at all. And then 30 might heretics, as I said, while such judges were in seeking make merry for a little while. And I kept myself meetly well within my bounds. For whereas I said it would be a week's work to seek them—I ween it would be fortnight full ere we found them. 35

2 of naught: for nothing 4 cause of heresy: a heresy case 4, 11, 30 spice: trace 15 all his tale: everything he has said // overturned: invalidated 16 of any such complaint: to make any such accusation 24 dissembled: ignored 25 wist ne'er: had no idea // except: unless 26–27 without . . . matter: without his whole case being destroyed 31–32 in seeking: being sought 34 fortnight full: a whole two weeks

10

15

But then goeth he farther, somewhat about, to show that I have mishandled his words and, with joining mine own unto his, have made it seem that he saith much worse by the spiritualty than he either said or meant. But when you have heard all his tale and mine too, you shall well see, good readers, that he shall never while he liveth convey this gear so clean. For these are, first, his words here:

And he saith... that it will be the "more hard" to find such judges. For he saith that I have "put" that matter "out of doubt" that "whereas men would have went soonest to have found them, that there" I say "it will be marvelous hard to find any one of them"— either "prelates, secular priests, or religious persons." For he saith that I say "plainly" that, "have they never so many virtues beside," that yet I say "it will be hard to find any one spiritual man... but that he is so infected with desire and affection to have the worldly honor of priests exalted... that he is through such pride far from such indifference and equity as ought and must be in such judges" which, as he saith, I "assign" to be such that they "must have no spice of pride, covetousness, nor love toward the world."

20 As to this last-rehearsed sentence of Master More, this is the truth therein: I say in another place of the said treatise, other than that... that Master More hath rehearsed here... that is to say, in the seventh chapter of the said treatise, that "though many spiritual men may be found that have many great virtues and great gifts of Godas chastity, liberality, patience, soberness, temperance, cunning, 25 and such others—yet it will be hard to find any one spiritual man that is not infected with the said desire and affection... to have the worldly honor of priests exalted." And there my sentence endeth, as to this purpose. But then, as it appeareth before, Master More, in his said Apology, addeth immediately to those words of mine, words 30 of his own putting in... which be these: "that he is, through such pride, far from such indifference and equity... as ought and must be in the judges" which he saith I assign. And he combineth those words to mine... in such manner as though I spoke them myself. So that they that shall read them can none otherwise take them but as my 35 words; whereby he perverteth clearly my meaning and my sentence

1 about: circuitously 4 spiritualty: clergy 5 all his tale: his whole speech 6 while: as long as // convey: make off with // gear: stuff 7 clean: completely 10 went: thought 11 marvelous: terribly 11, 26 any: so much as; even 13 beside: otherwise 15, 27 affection: liking 17, 32 indifference: impartiality 17, 32 *equity*: fairness 18, 33 assign: designate 19 spice: trace 25 as: such as // liberality: generosity // cunning: erudition 36 perverteth clearly: completely distorts

therein. For my sentence, nor yet my meaning therein... is not but that judges spiritual may have some spice of pride, covetousness, and worldly love, and yet be meet judges in heresy... as the frailty of man suffereth. For we be no angels but sinners, that lightly may fall and be deceived. Nor I mean not, nor yet my words amount not to it, but that a man may have a desire and affection... to have the worldly honor of priests exalted... and yet be a meet judge in heresy. For I suppose... that a man may have that desire in some degree, and to some intent... and not offend therein... especially deadly. Howbeit, he may also lightly offend therein, if he be not right well wary.

If this good man here say true in these aforesaid words of his "And there my sentence endeth as to this purpose," then am I content to confess that he saith well, and I wrong. But on the other side, now, if he say not true, but that in the defaming and slandering of the spiritualty his sentence ended not there, but went there much farther forth, and so far forth also... as amounted unto as much as I say that he said, and unto much more too: then will every man bear me record that I misreport not him but he me.

Now shall you, good readers, soon see this tried between us. For his whole words as they lie there together, I shall now rehearse you here. Lo, these they be as you shall find them both in his book of *Division* and in mine *Apology*, folio 237:

And though many spiritual men may be found that have right many great virtues and great gifts of God, as chastity, liberality, patience, soberness, temperance, cunning, and such others... yet it will be hard to find any one spiritual man that is not infected with the said desire and affection to have the worldly honor of priests exalted and preferred; and therefore if any layman report any evil of a priest... though it be openly known that it is as he saith—yet they will be more diligent to cause the layman to cease off that saying... than to do that in them is to reform that is amiss in the priest that it is spoken of... taking, as it were, an occasion to do the less in such reformations... because laymen speak so much against them. But surely that will be none excuse to spiritual rulers

3, 7 meet: fit 4 suffereth: allows 4, 10 lightly: easily 4 may: can 5 deceived: mistaken 6, 28 affection: liking 9 offend: sin // deadly: mortally 11 say true: tells the truth 13 content: willing // confess: admit 18 record: witness 29 preferred: advanced 31 cause: get 32 that in them is: their best 32 that is: what is

10

15

before God... when he shall ask account of his people... that were committed unto their keeping.

Now you see, good readers, how untrue it is that this man telleth you. For here you see that his sentence leaveth not where he saith it left as to that purpose; but you see that it goeth forth farther about that purpose still, to show that it will be hard to find any one spiritual man just and indifferent, but that the desire and affection to have the worldly honor of priests exalted and preferred hath so far infected them that if a layman report any evil of a priest, though it be openly known that it is as he saith, yet they will not only rather put the layman to silence than anything amend the priest—but that they will also do the *less* to the amendment of the priest *because* the laymen speaketh of it. Which affection cannot be but a very proud, damnable frowardness.

And therefore while this good Pacifier there saith that all the priests be so far infected with such a proud, damnable desire of their worldly exaltation that it will be hard to find any one of them any other, and then a little before those words (as you may see in his said chapter in mine Apology, folio 235) he saith 20 under the figure of "a great rumor among the people" that spiritual men punish heresies "rather to oppress them that speak anything against their worldly honor and richesse," etc., than for "zeal of the faith": these words of his being there such, judge now, good reader, whether I might not well say that 25 this good man saith it will be hard to find any one spiritual man but that he is so infected with the desire and affection to have the worldly honor of priests exalted that he is through such pride far from such indifference and equity as ought and must be in such judges as himself assigneth 30 to be such as they must have no spice of pride, covetousness, or love toward the world. I am very sure that his words maintain mine and more too.

4 leaveth not: does not leave off 5 left: left off 7 any . . . man: even one clergyman who is 9 preferred: advanced 7 *indifferent*: impartial 8, 28 affection: liking 12 anything: at all 14 affection: attitude 15 frowardness: perversity 16 while: when 21 *figure*: figure of speech 22 *spiritual men*: clergymen 23 richesse: wealth 25 well: rightly 29 indifference and equity: impartiality and fairness 30 assigneth: calls for 31 spice: trace 32 maintain: support

10

15

20

25

30

Nay [saith he], for I do not mean that they should have *no* spice thereof. For they may have some spice thereof—and yet may be judges in heresy well enough. For they may have that desire in some degree and some intent, and not offend therein, especially deadly.

But I have against that proved before that he must mean so or else must have left his tale untold. For if he meant to be content with folk of mean conditions without notable enormities, such they were already, and then had his great exhortation little place.

Also, this pride with which his words say that they be all so sore infected that it will be very hard to find any one other... is a very pestilent pride... and in a high degree, and such as he could not well devise a more deadly defamation of the whole spiritualty... than those words be, which if they were true (as they be false) plainly proved that in all the whole clergy it were hard to find any one good, honest man, or meet to be a judge, either in heresy or in anything else. And so would he by this device of his take away, as I said, from examination of heresy, all the spiritual judges, and leave them none at all.

And yet, good readers, to the end that you may the better perceive what those words of this man amount unto... which he would make you ween here that I both misrehearse and misconstrue: vouchsafe to read my words that I write upon them in mine *Apology*, folio 238.

But now, this good Pacifier perceiving that it will be hard to bear it but that his words clearly take away from the clergy all such indifference and justice as himself assigneth to be required of necessity in every man that should be suffered to be judge in heresy—he falleth to another shift to save the matter upright. And therein thus he saith:

And furthermore, though it were as Master More taketh it to be—that my words should sound to that effect that the judges that were then were through such pride far from the indifference and equity that I assign—yet that proveth not... but that they be now indifferent and

4 offend: sin // deadly: mortally 6 tale untold: speech unsaid 7 mean: tolerable 7 conditions: dispositions 8 enormities: departures from moral rectitude 12 pestilent: pernicious 16 honest: honorable // meet: fit 17 in: regarding 22 misrehearse: misquote 23 vouchsafe: be so good as

32 that were then: who were then in office 34 but that they be: i.e., that they are not

10

15

20

25

30

rightwise. For they might since the making of the said treatise become through grace indifferent, rightwise, meek, liberal, and loving to God and their neighbor... though they were not so then. And if they be so, then heretics shall not make merry for lack of judges a week, nor yet a day. For the same judges may sit still without changing... to hear and examine them when need shall be. Thus, as meseemeth, it appeareth every way... that the exception that Master More taketh of changing of spiritual judges is but of small effect.

This reason hath, lo, some subtlety; but it hath no substance. For if they were all so naughty so late as this good man saith they were, it will be but hardly believed that so many of them, upon so short a sermon of this poor preacher, should be so well changed so soon but that, as I said, heretics were well likely yet one week longer to make merry, before men might have so sure experience as to put them so soon in trust to be judges in heresy whom this Pacifier had persuaded to be so far unmeet for the matter so lately. And therefore it appeareth every way that this good man's invention is toward evil of very great, toward good of very small, effect.

Then goeth he forth on with the matter, and thus he saith:

Then saith Master More further, that "if 'some say' be no sufficient proof," then is my "tale" all "lost." And to these words I will answer thus. I will agree that my saying that some say this or this... is no proof... neither to prove that some say so... nor yet to prove that it is so. For in every proof must be two witnesses at the least. But if two will say it is so, then it is a proof.

And surely if Master More will inquire for the truth in this matter, he shall find that there be many more than two that say so. And verily if many men say so, though the truth be not so, yet the tale is not all lost to say that some men say so. For then it shall put the bishops and rulers spiritual in mind that they are bound in conscience to help them that say so all that they can, from the danger that they run in by that saying. And if it be true, then may the spiritual rulers order the matter as they shall see cause, and reform it in such

1 making: writing 2 *liberal*: generous 5 yet: even // sit still: continue to preside 6 *changing*: i.e., being switched out for others 7 exception: objection 8 taketh of: makes regarding the 9 reason: argument // subtlety: craftiness 10 naughty: wicked // late: recently 16 persuaded: argued 17 unmeet: unfit 17 lately: recently 18 invention: plan 24 say so: say that 27 inquire for: go in search of 29 though: even if 29–30 the tale is not all lost: the telling is not entirely in vain 32 help . . . can: do as much as they can to help those who are saying that, to get away 33 run in by that saying: incur by so saying 34 order: correct // cause: reason (to) 34 in such: into such a

charitable manner that none shall say so hereafter but they will of malice do it, and run into the slander of the Pharisees. And that would charitably be examined, whether it be so or not.

This is a pretty piece, and such as I have seldom seen the like come out of any wise man's mouth. For though that in
judgment, men must presume a thing is true which two good, honest persons sworn and examined depose and testify, that themselves have seen the deed, or heard the words spoken by the mouth of the person which for such deed or saying is accused—yet saith no man, for all that, that because two men say it and swear it too, therefore it is so. For as to the necessary consequence of the deed... this argument is very faint that this man maketh: Two men say it is so; ergo, it is so.

Then, upon this argument such as you see, he sendeth me to inquire, and then I shall, he saith, find that there be many more 15 than two that say so. That may well hap now, by occasion of his book of Division. But what if I inquired of them, and I should hap to find not only many more than two, but also many more than two hundred, that would say that the spiritual men for such evil affections as this good Pacifier surmiseth have 20 great desire to abjure men or note them of heresy? Yet while all they could, among them all, lay no proof at all... but always the truth proved contrary—both by that that in far the most part of this realm, and take Wales thereto, there have not been before his book of *Division* five men abjured in fifteen years, 25 and in those that have been... rigor hath not been used more than necessary, but there hath been used more than necessary favor... and that this hath been already proved ofter than once before the King's honorable Council—I would not esteem the babbling of two hundred (no, not though they were two thousand, 30 and yet many more) to the mountenance of two straws, for anything that I would regard any good man the worse. But I would for their own parts be sore ashamed to hear them, and clearly perceiving that they so lewdly lied—I would be sore ashamed to tell the tale again after them. And this, I say, if I should with inquiry 35

1 but: unless 2 run into the slander: incur the ill repute 4 pretty: fine 5 wise: sensible 6 judgment: a trial 7 honest: honorable 7 sworn: put under oath 8 themselves: they themselves 9 for: of 10 because: since 12 faint: weak 19 spiritual men: clergymen 20 affections: dispositions 21 note them of: brand them with // while: when 20 *surmiseth*: alleges 22 all they: they all // lay: put forth 23 far the most: by far the largest 24 take . . . thereto: add . . . to that 26 rigor: severity; harshness 28 favor: leniency 28 *ofter*: more often 29 esteem: rate 31 mountenance: value 31–32 for . . . worse: i.e., toward my thinking the worse of any good person 32–33 for their own parts: as for their own selves 33, 34 sore: terribly 34 lewdly: evilly

10

15

20

30

35

thus hap to find, as I verily trust I should not if I did inquire.

But, now, his "some say" being so false as it is, it is a world yet to see what a fond shift he findeth, that he would not yet by his will have that lie lost. For he saith that "though the truth be not so, yet the tale is not lost to say that some men say so"; for he saith that "then it shall put the bishops and spiritual rulers in mind that they are bound in conscience to help them that say so all that they can, from the danger that they run in by so saying."

What good, I pray you, can this false "some say" do? For what can the spiritual men do for their help that so belie them, any other than advise them to leave such lying? And that had been a better part for this good Pacifier to have played himself, and so to have told them upon whose tale he wrote it, than to the reproach and rebuke of so many good, worshipful men make a book of division, and therein write every lewd word that any lewd folk or any false shrews would tell him. Whose evil tongues the spiritualty can never appease... but if to please them, they should displease God... and without letting heresies grow and go forth, should themselves rather *do* evil than let lewd folk *speak* evil.

And now, to the intent, good readers, that you may the more clearly see to how little purpose the Pacifier hath in this point answered me—ye shall understand that my words in mine

Apology which he would seem to answer well here were 25 these (folio 257):

But yet is this Pacifier not so favorable toward folk suspected of heresy as to take away the power of the bishop forever, of arresting them, and to drive the ordinaries forever to sue citations against heretics and process of excommunication; but will have, he saith, the bishops' power of arresting no longer suspended than as long as spiritual men have that great desire to cause men abjure or to have them punished for heresy—as though he had well proved that they have so, because he saith that some men say so.

But, now, if "some say" be no sufficient proof... then is his tale lost. For then he showeth no cause why that power of theirs should in any case be more suspended now than in any time herebefore. And on the other

1 thus hap to find: i.e., find it to be the case that thousands of people were telling this story 3 world: marvel 4 fond shift: silly tactic 4–5 by his will: willingly; if he can help it 5 lost: wasted 11 their . . . them: the help of those who thus slander them 12 leave: cease; desist from // had: would have 14 upon: on the basis of 15 worshipful: respectable // make: write 16 of division: about dissension 16, 17, 20 lewd: vile 17 false shrews: lying scoundrels 18 spiritualty: clergy 18 but if: unless 19–20 *letting* . . . *forth*: preventing heresies from arising and advancing 29 sue: seek to obtain // citations: subpoenas 32 spiritual men: clergymen 32 cause: make 34 *so*: that 35 tale lost: talk in vain

10

15

20

25

30

35

side, if "some say" be a good proof... then the suspending will be as long as a depriving forever, since there shall never be any time in which there shall lack one or other "some say" to say more than truth.

Lo, good readers, here you see that unto the second part of these words of mine, he answereth nothing at all. And then have you seen before that unto the first, his answer is so feeble that it had been better for him to have done therewith as he doth with the other, leave it unanswered too.

But now goeth he further and saith:

Then saith Master More yet further, that "which is a light suspicion and which is a heavy," and "which witness be sufficient and which not," must "be weighed by the spiritual judges"; and "upon their weighing of the matter for light or heavy," to "follow the arrest of the party or the leaving of the arrest." Now, verily in this point methinketh that Master More maketh a right good motion—that is to say, that the matter should be examined before the arrest. For it hath been said in times past that in such case the arrest hath many times gone before the examination. Nevertheless, under what manner the examination and the arrest should be made in such case, I will make no device at this time: for haply Master More would anon find a default at it; and therefore I will leave it to them that have authority, to treat further of it, and to devise how to avoid the "maze" that Master More speaketh of in his said forty-sixth chapter.

Now, good readers, this man maketh here as though I had given him in my words some great advantage to ground some great matter upon. And therefore I shall rehearse you what my words were, that yourselves may see how sore I oversaw myself therein, and what he meaneth by the "maze" that he nameth here. These are, lo, my words in mine *Apology* (folio 257):

Yet is he content at the last, lest every man might spy the peril of his device, to temper his device in such wise that till the spiritualty have left their cruel desire of abjuring and punishing folk for heresy, they should not be suffered to arrest folk for every light suspicion, or every complaint, of heresy. Howbeit, he granteth that where one is openly and notably suspected of heresy, and sufficient record and

1 good: valid 11 heavy: weighty; serious 14 leaving: leaving undone 15 motion: proposal 17, 19 case: i.e., cases 17 gone: come 19 make: formulate; come up with 19, 31 device: plan; arrangement 20 anon: soon 20 default at: fault with 25 ground: base 26 matter: thing // rehearse: relate to 27 sore: badly // oversaw myself: blundered 28 *nameth*: mentions 30 *peril*: dangerousness 31 *temper*: modify // *spiritualty*: clergy 32 *left*: given up 33 *suffered*: allowed 34 *complaint*: accusation 35 one: someone // record: testimony witness against him, and besides all that, a doubt that he would flee, whereby he might infect others: then he granteth it convenient that he should be arrested by the body. And therein he bringeth in the Clementine and the statute by which the ordinaries have power to arrest folk for suspicion of heresy; and would, as far as I perceive, have the King reform them 5 after his device. But yet, since which is a light suspicion and which is a heavy, and which is a light complaint and which is a heavy, and which is an open suspicion and which but a privy, and which suspicion is notable and which is not notable, and which witnesses be sufficient 10 and which be not sufficient, be things that must be weighed by the spiritual judges; and upon their weighing of the matter for light or heavy must follow the arresting of the party or the leaving of the arrest: we be come again, as in a maze, to the point where we began that, be the matter great or small, lest all the while they be cruel they should judge light heavy and small great, their arresting of any at all must be 15 suspended from them, and send them to sue by citation, till men see that same mind of theirs of desiring men's abjuration and punishment utterly changed and cease; that is to say, till there be no man left that will so much as say that some men say that they have not left that mind yet, and make a lie again of them then as those "some" have done 20 that have so said already to Sir John "Some Say" now. And long will it be, I warrant you, ere ever all such folk fail.

And therefore—since in the mean season, by this Pacifier's good device, heretics may go unarrested—I cannot believe that if his way were followed, it would be any good means to make that willful offenders in 25 heresy should not pass unpunished, as fast as, both in the end of this chapter and the other before also, he calleth upon the King's Highness and his Council, and his Parliament, to look upon this matter after his good advertisement, and never cease till they bring it to effect.

Here you see, good readers, because this man with his devices
bringeth himself into a maze out of which he cannot see how
to get, he would now set other folk to study thereabout. And
would make them very careful about a thing little needful.
For it hath well appeared, and well been proved too, that the spiritual
judges have yet hitherto, in arresting for heresy, right well examined
and considered first both the cause and the necessity,
and have been rather therein many times too slow... than any

2 convenient: (to be) appropriate 3 by the body: bodily; physically 3 the Clementine: canon "Ut inquisitionis" from the Constitutiones Clementinae 6 after his device: according to his plan 7 complaint: accusation 8 *open*: public // privy: private 12–13 leaving of the arrest: leaving the arrest not done 14 cruel: severe; rigorous 15 judge . . . great: i.e., be judging a slight offense to be a serious one, and a small one to be a great one 16 sue: proceed // citation: subpoena 17 *mind*: mentality 19 left: given up; ceased to have 20 make: tell // of: about 22 warrant: guarantee // fail: are lacking 23 mean season: meantime 23, 30 *device(s)*: arrangement(s) 26 pass: go // fast: earnestly 28 upon: at // matter: thing // after: according to 29 advertisement: instruction 33 careful: solicitous 34 *spiritual*: ecclesiastical 35 hitherto: up till now

time over hasty. And therefore I may and will say here again as I said there, that I little doubt but that if the King's Highness do as I doubt not but His Highness will do—maintain and assist the spiritualty in executing of the laws, even those that are already made against heresies... and command every temporal officer under him to do the same for his part—though there were never more new laws made therefor, yet shall both innocents be saved harmless well enough and offenders punished too.

To this cometh forth this good man in this wise:

Now, verily, to those words of Master More I dare say thus: that 10 Master More, ere he had spoken those words, had occasion by reasonable conjecture to have doubted more at the matter than he hath done, and to have thought it very likely that if the same laws should stand as do now in every point concerning heresy, that many innocents that be not guilty might upon suspicion of heresy be 15 driven to purge themselves after the will of the ordinary—and yet be not guilty. Yea, and over that, Master More might have reasonably doubted, and, as I suppose, in conscience he ought to have doubted more than he hath done, that sometimes innocents might happen upon the suit Ex officio, or upon light complaints by favor of 20 officers, or upon malice or displeasure, be arrested before examination, and yet Master More himself assenteth that the examination should be before the arrest. And he might have doubted also that some innocents might by such perjured persons as be above rehearsed in this chapter be sometimes condemned. And therefore the 25 said words of Master More whereby he taketh upon him to say, as it were in his own authority to perform it, that innocents by the same laws as be already made for heresy shall "be saved harmless well enough" might happen to be of small effect to help an innocent man or woman that should happen to be wrongfully troubled in time 30 to come against his words before rehearsed.

Now, verily, to all these words of this good man I dare say thus: that I when I wrote the words had, and yet have, very good conjectures to put little doubt therein. For though I might think

```
1 over: too
               3 maintain: support
                                       4 spiritualty: clergy // even: precisely
5 temporal: secular
                       8, 28 saved harmless: kept unharmed
11–12 by reasonable conjecture: on reasonable grounds
12 doubted more at: had more fear about
                                            16 after the will: at the discretion
17 over: besides
                    18, 23 doubted: feared
                                              20 light complaints: trivial accusations
20 favor: aid; support
                       21 be: i.e., to be
                                              24 by: by means of
24, 31 rehearsed: mentioned
                                25 condemned: convicted; found guilty
26–27 as . . . perform it: as if he had the authority to make it be the case
30 troubled: gotten into trouble
                                   31 against: with respect to
                                                                  34 conjectures: reasons
```

10

15

20

25

30

that this harm and this harm might hap: yet since I have well seen it proved that the spiritual judges have used themselves in these matters not only so truly, but, over that, so favorably, that no man can prove in this realm such harms to have happed yet—but whereas such things have been of late surmised, the truth hath been well proved contrary before the King's honorable Council—I had and have very good cause to think that as they have done well hitherto, so shall they well do hereafter.

And since all this good man's ground is no more, to take away well-approved laws with, but that harm may hap sometime to some good man thereby—which reason he may make against the best law that all the world can make—I dare be bold to warrant that that cold reason so fervently set forth in such a weighty matter is not well worth a rush.

And if men would go about to change these old long-approved laws: I would, as my duty is, pray God give them the grace to make the changes good; but for that little wit that I have, I verily believe and think that if any changes be made rather more slack than straiter—then shall the changes be made rather far worse than better. And thus end I, good readers, this good man's seventeenth chapter.

The Eighteenth Chapter

His eighteenth chapter beginneth folio 69. Wherein he beginneth first with the *ca. Ut inquisitionis negotium* (and 51.6), "whereby it appeareth that . . . all lords and rulers temporal be prohibited that they shall not in any manner take knowledge or judge upon heresy." And upon this, himself addeth unto it in his book of *Division* that "he that inquireth of heresy taketh knowledge of heresy," and that himself saith not so alone, but that *Summa rosella* saith so too; and hereupon he concludeth that it should seem that "all the justices of the peace be excommunicated," and "all stewards in leets," and all inquests too, as many as meddle withal. For whether in leets they may or may not—that, he saith, he doubteth,

2 used: conducted 3 truly: justly // favorably: kindly 5 whereas: wherever 5 surmised: alleged 8 done well: acted rightly // hitherto: up till now 12, 14 reason: argument 11 well-approved: well-established 12 may: could 13–14 be . . . warrant: venture to guarantee 14 cold: lame 15 rush: straw 16 long-approved: long-established 20 straiter: more rigorous 29 inquireth of: investigates 30-31 Summa rosella: See note for 83/14-15. 33, 34 *leets*: misdemeanor courts 33 meddle withal: deal therewith

10

15

20

35

but he saith that I say they may; but he telleth not where I say so, nor, as I verily think, he never found it in any book of mine. I say in mine *Apology*, folio 227, that in every leet they *do* so; whether they lawfully so may do or not, thereof speak I nothing—albeit I think they may well enough, both without offense of the King's law or peril of accursing either.

For I little doubt but that there were of the clergy at the making of the statute more men than one that understood *Summa rosella* as well as this good man doth, if *Summa rosella* were then made and in men's hands.

And I doubt also as little but that there were at those days in the clergy more than one, that were of counsel in the making of the statute, that understood the chapter *Ut inquisitionis* as well as this man doth, and as well as he that made *Summa rosella*, too. And that they well understood that the said chapter meant of such inquisitors, and such inquisitions as they make, that are in the corps of the law called *inquisitores haereticae pravitatis*... of which there are in some places special officers to inquire, proceed, and do therein as the ordinaries do; and meant not of such inquirers and such inquisitions as do none otherwise inquire but only by way of information to bring the matter to the ordinaries' knowledge.

For as for the minor of this good man's argument—that he that inquireth of heresy taketh knowledge of heresy—so doth every denouncer, every accuser, and, in a manner, every witness too, take upon them knowledge of heresy in some manner wise: for they take upon them, as they well may, that this thing or that thing is heresy. But this is not the knowledge that the law forbiddeth; but the knowledge that we call "holding plea" upon it, which our inquisitions do not—but only serve to bring the matter to the ordinaries' hands, which else should peradventure not have heard thereof.

And for this cause, to be sure that by these inquisitions no man should fall in danger of any excommunication, it was substantially provided in the said statute that the inquisition and

6 offense: violation // peril of accursing: danger of excommunication
10 were then made: was already written at that time
13, 15 chapter: i.e., chapter of canon law
14 he that made: whoever wrote
15 meant: was speaking
17–18 inquisitores . . . pravitatis: investigators of heretical depravity
19 ordinaries: bishops
20 meant not of: was not referring to
23 minor: i.e., minor premise
24 inquireth of heresy: holds heresy inquests
27 manner wise: kind of way
29–30 "holding plea" upon: taking jurisdiction over
31–32 ordinaries' . . . peradventure: the hands of the ordinaries, who otherwise would perhaps
34 in: into // substantially: thoroughly

10

15

35

the indictment of heresy should serve the ordinary nothing to the proceeding in the matter, but that he should begin his process against the party afresh, without laying that indictment unto his charge.

And therefore whereas this good man, by the high authority of *Summa rosella*, denounceth here all the justices of peace accursed, I dare be bold by the high authority of *Summa angelica* to denounce them all assoiled again. And therefore whereas this good man, weening that he had well won his spurs in this point, triumpheth upon me and saith—

And to this law Master More answereth not, but passeth it over, as a thing that, as it seemeth, he little regardeth... but only that he saith that the laws of this realm and of holy Church in heresies "may well stand together" for aught that he seeth. And yet it appeareth that upon this law they do not agree nor stand together. And therefore methinketh it would not be so lightly passed over as Master More doth pass it over. For it is a dangerous thing to fall into the least censure of the Church...

—there were two causes for which I answered him not: one a general cause, concerning all his matters of laws of the 20 Church wherein he findeth faults, of which I shall speak afterward. Another special cause there was concerning this excommunication. And that was that me thought, and yet think, that he spoke therein so childishly that I was ashamed on his behalf to meddle with it... and to make open his childish 25 handling thereof.

But now since I see him count for so great a conquest that he put me to silence therein—what purpose can he devise for which I *should* have answered anything to that point? Had I made any profession to prove every word wrong that he said in all his book? He knoweth that I said not that I would meddle... but with those certain things that I there speak of.

But now suppose that there were in that law such fault as he allegeth—what could mine answer amend the matter, or his book of *Division* either? If men were accursed, as he mistaketh

2 nothing: not at all; in no way 6, 8 denounce(th): declare(s) 6, 35 accursed: excommunicated 7 be bold: venture 7 Summa angelica: A dictionary of moral theology, titled Cases of Conscience by its author, Blessed Angelo Carletti. 8 assoiled: absolved from excommunication 9 weening: thinking 13–14 may well stand together: are quite compatible; can harmoniously coexist 14 *appeareth*: is evident 22 special: specific 23 yet: still 25 meddle: deal 25 open: obvious 28 devise: come up with 30 profession: promise

186/35—187/1 mistaketh it: erroneously says they are (for holding heresy inquests)

10

15

20

25

30

35

it, could my book or his book take away the curse? "No, but we may put the Parliament in mind to make a law." His book alone is as able to put them in remembrance thereof as his and mine together. And yet for that point neither needeth mine nor his neither. For the Parliament hath made already a law for these inquisitions. Which if they might lawfully make in such form as they have (as I am sure they might), then am I sure that they fall not in excommunication for it. Now, if they might not lawfully make it, and thereby fell therein, what could the Parliament farther add unto it, that might deliver them of it? And therefore I cannot, in good faith, see to what purpose he wrote of that point himself.

"No, but this law is one great cause of division between the spiritualty and the temporalty." That would I very fain wit how. For temporal men be not, I wot well, so far overseen as to be angry with the spiritual men here now, for that law that a pope made at Rome ere they were born. And the spiritual men have also as little cause again of any grudge against the temporalty for the matter. And therefore why he should put it in his book of *Division* for a cause of division, I can devise no reason. For as for that that he would should seem a cause here, is too unreasonable, where he saith:

As long as that law standeth so, unrepealed... some priests that see it will say that they that do against it... be accursed; and so may lightly fall thereby into a wrongful and untrue judgment... which though it be no great offense (unless it be of pride... by despising of the temporal power in that behalf), yet it would be eschewed. And also, if they that be so noised to be accursed hear of it, they will be discontented. And so grudges and variances may rise and increase by occasion of it.

This is a very cold tale, and as dead as ever was doornail. For before himself brought in this babbling of his own about that law (which babbling is yet, as I have showed you, to no purpose at all), I never heard any man talk any such word of that law in my days, nor, in good faith, no more I ween did he neither.

1 curse: excommunication 4 needeth: is needed 6, 7 might: could 8 fall not in: do not incur 10 deliver . . . of: release . . . from 11 in good faith: in all honesty 13, 20 division: discord 14 spiritualty: clergy 14, 19 temporalty: laity 14–15 very fain wit: very much like to know 15 wot: know // overseen: gone wrong 16, 18 spiritual men: clergymen 18 *grudge*: complaint 19 *for*: over 21 devise: think of 22 is: i.e., it is // unreasonable: irrational 24 they that do: those who act 24, 28 accursed: excommunicated 24 *lightly*: easily 25 wrongful: erroneous 26 offense: sin // despising: scornful bypassing 25 untrue: unfair 27 be eschewed: i.e., would be better to avoid 28 so noised: thus rumored 28 discontented: unhappy 29 grudges and variances: resentments and conflicts 30 cold tale: unpersuasive speech

10

15

20

25

30

35

Nor, I dare say, he heareth nowhere yet any priests say that the justices of the peace be accursed for inquiring against heresies—none, I dare say, but such priests as be heretics. And therefore this whole tale of his, save for the malice that it meaneth... is even a very trifling.

For as for the motion that he maketh so often to have that law repealed because it is, he saith, against the laws of the realm: except he mock, I wot ne'er what he meaneth. For if the realm here may repeal it—then by that the law is here made to the contrary (if it were contrary, as it is not), it is repealed already. And if he think that the realm here cannot repeal it—then whereto writeth he and printeth that piece in his book of *Division*, as a thing for which the temporalty and the spiritualty of this realm should fall in variance for, where neither the making nor the repealing lieth in neither nother of their hands?

But surely the repealing, though it be the thing that is spoken of, is not yet the thing that is meant in this matter, as it appeareth in these words:

And therefore methinketh it would not be so lightly passed over as Master More doth pass it over. For it is a dangerous thing to fall into the least censure of the Church. And if it be said that the said law "is void, because the Church had no authority to make it"; and that it "is therefore not to be feared." And I will yet say thereto, that though it were void, that yet as long it standeth so, not repealed, it were good to eschew it, and not to fall willfully into the danger of it; and therefore it were better to repeal it than to let it stand still and rather do hurt than good.

Here you may see, good readers, that whereas otherwise to repeal that law than it *is* repealed lieth not in our hands if our law were against it; and whereas of truth it needeth no repealing at all (but the law of the realm standeth therewith well enough), he maketh as though all the justices of peace were accursed thereby, as often as they give the juries in charge to inquire of heresy: therefore, lest *they* should willfully fall into

8 mock: is joking // wot ne'er: have no idea 6 motion: proposal 9 may: can 12 whereto: to what purpose 9 that: the fact that 13 temporalty: laity 14 spiritualty: clergy // in variance for: into dissension over 23, 25 *void*: not legally binding 25 though: even if 26, 27 were: would be 26 eschew: steer clear of 26, 35 willfully: deliberately 27 stand still: remain in effect 28 hurt: harm 32–33 standeth . . . enough: is plenty compatible with it 34 accursed: excommunicated 35 inquire of: investigate // they: i.e., the juries

10

15

20

the censures of the Church (whereof, as he saith, the least is a dangerous thing), ye may plainly see that these wily shrews which abuse his labor mean in all this matter nothing else but that *they* would not have heresies inquired of. And yet they need not so greatly to care therefor, for any great things that by such inquisitions are in heresies presented. But yet thus declare they their good wills, these wily shrews that thus deceive this good simple soul and set him so evil a work.

If he fear so much the censures of the Church as he maketh for, and understand and believe *Summa rosella* so surely as he pretendeth: it had been better for him to examine well his book of *Division*, and this his second book also, by the titles of *Summa rosella*, and see well whether himself vary not from *Summa rosella*, and be by the sentence of *Summa rosella* fallen in the censures of the Church himself, by some such manner of writing as his said books have.

But now cometh this good Pacifier forth with a goodly piece; and to declare himself indifferent, and to show also a great oversight used upon my part—thus the good man "Some Say" saith:

And therefore it seemeth right expedient that the said law be repealed. And in like wise it were good to repeal all such laws spiritual as be made contrary to the King's laws and the custom of the realm. And if it be said that it were good also... that such statutes and laws... as be made and used by the temporal power to the 25 grief of the people were also reformed... and that if I were indifferent... I would make some motion so to have it—and so, it seemeth, Master More doth partly move that I ought to have done, and to have found as well default in the temporal law as in the spiritual law; howbeit, because he would bear no blame of the temporal law 30 in that motion, it seemeth that he somewhat mitigateth his sentence therein and saith... that if I do so... and that then I "handle them" (that is to say, the temporal laws), and find defaults at them, as "truly" as I do at these (that is to say, at the spiritual laws): that then I should "make two lies for one"; and yet, as I suppose, I have assigned some 35

2, 7 *shrews*: scoundrels 3 which abuse: who exploit 4 they: i.e., the scoundrels 4 inquired of: investigated 5 care therefor: worry about that 6, 18 declare: show 10 maketh for: makes himself out to 8 simple: naïve; gullible 11 pretendeth: claims to 11 had: would have 12 by: in the light of 13 titles: chapters 13-14 vary not from: is not in conflict with 14 sentence: judgment 15 in: into 18, 26 *indifferent*: impartial; unbiased 18–19 great oversight used: big omission made 21 right expedient: very advisable 22, 24 were: would be 22-23 laws spiritual: Church laws 27, 31 motion: proposal 26 grief: harm 28 move: submit; claim 29 default: fault // in: with 29, 30, 33 *temporal*: secular 29 spiritual: Church 30 bear: tolerate // blame: criticism 31 sentence: dictum 33 defaults: defects 33, 34 at: in 33 truly: truthfully 35 assigned: pointed out

10

15

20

defaults in the spiritual law... which Master More cannot tell how they should be excused.

As to his repealing, I see, as I have said, no substance in his words. For we repeal them as far as I see we can, when we keep them not but make our own laws to the contrary. And therefore, as far as I see, all that he speaketh of these repealings, save only for setting forth of his division, is else but a very vain tale.

But, now, where he saith that I would have him, and seem to move him, to find faults in the temporal law too: I wot ne'er whether his words have herein more falsehood or more folly; but surely they have both twain, and either the one or the other double.

For first, every man may see by his own words even here, that I move him not to use as for indifference to find faults in the temporal laws as he hath done with the spiritual laws, when himself here showeth that I say that if he so did, he should make double lies. This showeth that he useth in this saying plain and open untruth. And since his own untruth appeareth upon his own showing, this showeth also that he useth open folly.

And where he saith that he hath assigned some defaults in the spiritual laws which I cannot tell how they should be excused: I answer him again that unto *all* laws, or *all* matters that he list to babble of, am I not bound to meddle with; but 25 of these spiritual laws that were made for the repressing of heresies, with which our temporal laws are also conformable and concurrent, with which this good, wise man, for the ease of heretics, hath now found such "faults" as a wise man may be ashamed to speak of, I have clearly declared that they need not to be excused... but that, for the finding of such "faults," his folly to be much accused. This have I proved so plainly that he can find no great cause of glory when he looketh back upon it.

```
1, 22 defaults: defects
                           1, 23, etc. spiritual: Church
                                                           2, 24, 31 excused: defended; justified
6 speaketh of: says about
                             7 setting forth: promoting
                                                            10 move: exhort
10 wot ne'er: don't know
                              11, 21, 32 folly: foolishness
                                                              12 both twain: both of the two
14 may: can // even: right
                                15 move him not: do not exhort him // use: make it a habit
15 indifference: impartiality
                                 16, 27 temporal: civil
                                                           17 himself: he himself
17 showeth: states
                       19, 20 untruth: untruthfulness
                                                          20 showing: telling
                                                 25 list: wants // of: about // meddle: deal
22 assigned: pointed out
                             24 again: back
27 conformable: compatible
                                28 concurrent: consistent
                                                               29 ease: advantage
30 declared: shown
```

But now, to the intent you may, good readers, see that either this man is not so simple in himself as he seemeth or else that some wily shrews shamefully do deceive him: I beseech you consider a little either the folly or the craft that the man useth here.

He hath brought you forth words of mine which I speak, he saith, of the laws, whereas of truth I speak them not of the laws at all, as yourselves shall well see. For though he dissemble the place because he would not have you read it—yet have I sought it out for you, in the 99th leaf of mine *Apology*; and there, lo, these are my words:

And this Pacifier aggrieveth—as much as in him lieth—the clergy of England for use of the laws not made by themselves, but be common laws of all Christendom. If he will say that he blameth but their abuses thereof, the truth appeareth in some place otherwise in his book. And yet, since he proveth that point but by a "some say"... he might with the same figure lay like faults in the temporalty concerning the laws of this realm, and prove it in like wise with a great "some say" too. And therein he showeth himself not indifferent, when he bringeth in the one and leaveth the other out. And on the other side, if he bring in the other too—then shall he make two faults for one. For if he handle them as truly as he handleth these—then shall he make two lies for one.

Lo, good readers, consider here, I beseech you, the manner of this good man. To the first piece of these words of mine—in which case is also the law that we be now in hand with, *Ut inquisitionis*, wherewith he would in his book of *Division* aggrieve the clergy of this realm, which never made the law—he answereth not in all his book one word. And yet in his such manner of aggrieving he useth a very sinful, and in his not answering, a very shameful, way.

Then in the remnant you see, good readers, yourselves, that I speak not of the laws. For when I say thus—"If he will say that he blameth but their abuses thereof: yet since he proveth that point but by a 'some say'... he might by the same figure lay like faults in the temporalty too, concerning the laws of this realm"—

2 simple: dim-witted 7 of the: about the // of truth: actually 8 dissemble: omit mention of 12 aggrieveth: attacks // in him lieth: he is able to 16 might: could 19 indifferent: impartial; unbiased 20 side: hand 21 truly: truthfully 25 Ut inquisitionis: See 184/25–28. 31 remnant: rest

5

10

15

20

25

30

35

10

15

is it not here plain that I lay blame in *him*, for his belying of the *ministers* of the spiritual laws under a figure of "some say," as though they *abused* the spiritual laws in mishandling of heretics (whereof I speak more after)? And I say that by a like figure of "some say" he might defame all the temporal ministers too, and bring them in grudge and obloquy of the people with like lies of abusing the temporal laws too.

Now consider, good readers, either how falsely this honest man hath himself, or else how foolishly he hath suffered false shrews, to make him turn and change the sentence of my words from the men to the laws, to bring in his matters upon, and say that I move him to find faults in the temporal laws and put them in print abroad as he doth in the other, whereas you plainly see I speak not of the laws but of the ministers... nor yet advise him to use such fashion with the temporal ministers neither, lest he make two lies for one.

Is not now this change of my sentence that he maketh here a very shameless dealing, either of himself or of some shrewd counsel of his?

And now knitteth he to this handling the remnant of the
said eighteenth chapter, and showeth that he speaketh first of the
spiritualty because the causes of the division specially be
grown by them... and layeth forth a sort of griefs, some
part very trifles, and some part remedied before his book of

Division made, and some part very foolish, and some part,

25
for all his "some say"s, undoubtedly very false.

He hath there two leaves, in the end of that chapter, which any wise man that readeth them shall, I suppose, judge a very dreaming tale. And therein it seemeth that as he hath begun with the spiritual laws, so he will after proceed in the temporal 30 laws too. And fain would the man make me so fond as to be his fellow therein... and saith if I know any such made as "the Parliament had none authority to make," or whereupon "the people have just cause to complain," it were "well done" that I should "show them." And so he thinketh "verily" that "charity should compel" me to do, seeing that I am, he saith, "learned in the laws of the realm."

Verily if I knew any such—yet would I not follow neither this

```
1 belying: slandering
                         2, 5, etc. ministers: judicial officers
                                                                 2, 3, 30 spiritual: Church
5 might: could
                   5 temporal: secular
                                           6 in grudge: into the ill will
6 obloguy: vituperative speech
                                  7, 30 temporal: civil
                                                            8 falsely: dishonestly
8 honest: honorable
                        9 suffered: allowed
                                               9–10 false shrews: lying scoundrels
10, 17 sentence: focus
                          11 matters: allegations
                                                      12 move: exhort
                                        19 shrewd: devious / malicious // counsel: adviser
13 in print abroad: out there in print
21 showeth: claims
                       22 spiritualty: clergy
                                                 22, 25 division: discord
22–23 specially . . . them: come from them in particular
                                                           23 sort of griefs: set of grievances
25 made: was written
                         28 wise: sensible
                                               29 dreaming: illusive; out of touch with reality
29 tale: speech
                 31 fain would the man: the man would much like to // fond: idiotic
32 fellow: accomplice 34 were: would be // well done: i.e., a good thing to do
35 show: tell
```

10

15

good man's holy exhortation nor his godly example neither, to do in the one as he hath done in the other, but if I liked his doing a little better than I do.

And if I be learned in the temporal laws, the less will I follow his counsel. For the better that I were learned in them, the less would I ween it would become me to print and put abroad among the people a slanderous book of them to shame them.

And unto this point, good readers, I have answered and showed my mind in mine *Apology* before, whereto this man giveth a deaf ear always. And here, upon a sought occasion, with a fond wily change of my words, exhorteth me to the thing to which I made answer already. And what I before said therein—that he dissembleth, and saith not one word thereto. But in mine *Apology*, good readers, the 159th leaf, these were in this point my words:

His other murmurs and grudges that he saith he cannot now rehearse, he rehearseth after many of them in his other chapters... which I will pass over untouched, both for that the more part of them be such as every 20 wise man will, I suppose, answer them himself in the reading, and satisfy his own mind without any need of my help therein, and for that some things are there also therein that are very well said; and some also that be they good or bad, I purpose not to meddle much with, as are the things that touch any laws or statutes already made, be they of the Church or of the realm; defend them I am content to do, if I think them 25 good. But on the other side, if I think them naught... albeit that in place and time convenient I would give mine advice and counsel to the change, yet to put out books in writing abroad among the people against them, that would I neither do myself nor in the so doing commend any man that doth. For if the law were such as were so far 30 against the law of God that it were not possible to stand with man's salvation... then in that case the secret advice and counsel may become every man; but the open reproof and redargution thereof may not, in my mind, well become those that are no more spiritual than I. And surely if the laws may be kept and observed without peril of soul, though the 35 change might be to the better: yet out of time and place convenient to put the defaults of the laws abroad among the people in writing, and

2 but if: unless 6 ween: think 7, 28, 37 *abroad*: out there 7 of: about 8 shame: discredit 9–10 showed my mind: made known my thinking 12 fond: foolish 14 dissembleth: ignores 17 grudges: complaints 17, 18 rehearse(th): relate(s) 18 after: later 19 untouched: (leaving them) undiscussed 19, 21–22 *for that*: because 19 *more part*: majority 23 meddle: involve myself 24 touch: concern; have to do with 25 content: willing 26 naught: bad 27, 36 convenient: appropriate 31–32 it . . . salvation: i.e., it would be a mortal sin to obey it 32 secret: private (giving of) 33 reproof: criticism // redargution: reprehension; censure 34 *mind*: opinion 35 though: even if 37 defaults: defects

25

30

without any surety of the change give the people occasion to have the laws in derision under which they live—namely since he that so shall use to do may sometime mistake the matter and think the thing not good whereof the change would be worse—that way will I not, as thus advised, neither use myself nor advise no friend of mine to do. And therefore I will, as I say, leave some things of his book untouched, whether he say well or evil.

Here you see, good readers, mine answer to this point concerning the finding of faults and putting them abroad in print; which answer he dissembleth, and again provoketh me to the same, as though he had never heard it; which answer 10 I will therefore be had as repeated in every place where he provoketh me hereafter to the same point. And thus you see, good readers, that whereas he hath not in any one chapter of his brought forth any reason yet—yet hath he brought forth least in this his eighteenth, in which he boasteth most. For by this hath he 15 plainly declared that he neither understandeth the law *Ut inquisitionis*, that he allegeth, nor so much as the poor summa called Summa rosella, neither. For that good man that made it undoubtedly never meant of such inquisitions as ours are, of which manner he had haply never known none. And as 20 for the law, the very first words thereof, to him that understandeth

ordinaries, or other the spiritual inquisitors; and not such knowledge as we take by our inquisitions, that only serve to help the other forth and bring the matter to their hands.

And therefore, since I see well that this man in the Latin laws and summas hath so little understanding, I shall be the more content in his laws and his summas so much the less to dispute or

The Nineteenth Chapter

them and considereth them well, sufficiently do declare that that law forbiddeth laymen to meddle with such manner knowledge of heresy as should be a let and impediment to the

meddle with him.

In his nineteenth chapter he declareth what he meaneth by "confederacies" of the spiritualty... and saith he meaneth "confederacies

1 surety of the change: i.e., assurance that they will be changed 1–2 *have . . . derision*: hold in derision the laws 2 namely: especially // use: be wont 4 advised: considered 6 untouched: undiscussed // evil: badly 8 abroad: out there 9 dissembleth: ignores 9–10 provoketh me to the same: issues to me the same challenge 11–12 *provoketh* . . . *to*: challenges . . . on 13 whereas: while 14 reason: rationality 16, 22 declare(d): show(n) 15 boasteth: proudly claims 16 Ut inquisitionis: See 184/25–28. 17 allegeth: cites (as his authority) 18 Summa rosella: See note for 83/14–15. // made: wrote 19 meant of: had in mind 20 haply: perhaps 23 meddle: concern themselves 24 let: hindrance 25 ordinaries: bishops // other the spiritual inquisitors: the other ecclesiastical examiners 31 meddle with: concern myself 33 declareth: explains 34 spiritualty: clergy

10

15

20

whereby spiritual men pretend to maintain" some such "laws of the Church," and some such constitutions provincial, as are "against the King's laws and the old customs of the realm"... and putteth for an example the putting of priests to answer before temporal judges, and the statute made De silva caedua, and the statute of mortuaries.

As for conventing of priests before secular judges, truth it is that one time the occasion of a sermon made the matter come in communication before the King's Highness. But neither any times since nor many years before, I never heard that there was any business about it. And yet was that matter ceased long before any word sprang of this great general division, that his book maketh as though there were such, in a manner general through the whole realm.

And divers statutes have there since been made, concerning the same point. And many priests convented as they were wont to be before; and no business made by the spiritualty therefor, that I heard of, nor, I trow, himself neither.

And in like wise, men cut down their woods every year, in one place and other of the realm... and either is there not asked the tithe against the statute... or if some parson would with good will get it, and therefore ask it, he getteth it not yet indeed.

For where he saith that if I would "remember" myself "well how often the . . . constitution provincial made [against the statute De silva caedua] hath been put in execution . . . of late days, to the 25 grief of many laymen," I would "not have said so generally that there is not any one constitution provincial," that he speaketh of, "to any man's grief or grudge put in execution in the time of any of the prelates that are now living"; and affirmeth that the same "constitution hath of late . . . in the time of 30 divers of the same prelates that now be, been put in execution, to the grief and grudge of many persons within this realm": first, as touching mine own remembrance—in good faith, I cannot remember one. And as to his own remembrance, upon which he affirmeth it to have been done so lately, to the grudge 35 and grief of so many: he shall pardon me though I believe him not till he prove it, or at the leastwise name them that have had the winning, and them also that have borne the loss... so that I may myself prove whether it be true or not. For except he do the

1 pretend: attempt // maintain: uphold; keep in force 2, 24, 27 provincial: pertaining to an ecclesiastical province 5 to answer: on trial 5–6, 25 De silva caedua: "About Cut Wood" (about the tithing of timber). 6 mortuaries: gifts customarily claimed by the parish priest from a deceased person's estate 8-9 in communication: under discussion 7 *conventing*: summoning 11, 17 business: commotion; to-do 11 yet . . . ceased: that thing was even over with 12 sprang: arose // division: dissension 15, 31 divers: several 17 spiritualty: clergy // therefor: over that 18 I trow: I'm sure 21 with good will: happily 21, 24 against: with respect to

^{23 &}quot;remember" myself: recollect 28, 32, 35 grudge: objection 25 of late: in recent

³¹ *prelates that now be*: current prelates 33 as touching: as regards 36 though: if

38 winning: gain 39 prove: establish // except: unless 195/39—196/1 the one: either the one thing or the other

one, else have I good cause, in the meanwhile, in this point to give no great credence to him.

For first, I can scantly believe that upon the parson's bare word, for allegation of the constitution provincial, his parishioner would let him have it. And if there happed any man that would—yet am I sure they were so few that it were double folly to lay that for any cause of division... which were done both but by a few and also not without the party's will, and rather of his own private devotion than for any fear of compulsion.

Now, if the parson would take it of his parishioner by force—I see the common experience therein such that I dare boldly say the whole parish would not suffer him. And yet if it were taken indeed—neither should the parson enjoy the profit nor the parishioner bear the loss... but should at the King's common law recover a right large amends. For well ye wot his damages should be taxed him, not by twelve priests, but by twelve temporal men, and his costs by the King's judges, that are no priests neither.

Now, if this man will say that many of the parsons have in the time of the prelates that now be living, or that were living at the time that himself wrote those words, recovered in any of the spiritual courts the tithe of such woods, against the statute, by force of that provincial constitution: I will see this man prove it ere I believe him in it. For the danger of that suit may be peradventure more than I suppose the parson will put in peril for his tithes. And also, the parishioner may soon stop the suit in the beginning by the King's prohibition... whereby the King's judges shall see whether the parson sue for such tithes or not, and will not therein suffer him to proceed.

And therefore till this good man make me better proofs of this
matter than his own bare saying, he giveth me no cause,
against so many lets to the contrary, therein to believe his
word. But I durst well warrant it that if he come once to the
naming of the parties, so that the specialties of the matters may
be sought out and made appear: you shall surely find it untrue.

35

Now, then, to maintain, withal, his great word of "confederacies" he bringeth forth that some priests say still that

```
3 scantly: scarcely
                       3, 31 bare: mere
                                             4 allegation: invoking
                                                                        6 were: would be a
7 lay: allege // division: discord
                                       10 of: from
                                                       12 suffer: let
15, 17 his: i.e., the parishioner's
                                     16 taxed: assessed against // him: i.e., the parson
                              22 spiritual: ecclesiastical // against: in virtue of
17 temporal men: laymen
26 put in peril: take a chance on
                                     26, 34 may: can
                                                          26 soon: readily
                                                                               27 stop: block
27 by the King's prohibition: i.e., by obtaining a writ of prohibition
                                                                        29 suffer: allow
32 lets to the contrary: contraindicating impediments
33 durst well warrant: would well dare guarantee
                                                      34 specialties: particulars
                      35 sought: searched // made appear: brought to light
34 matters: cases
36 maintain: defend // withal: along with the rest
```

10

15

those tithes and mortuaries also, for all the statutes, be their duties still, and that they which pay them not be accursed. I have espied this good man is a man of sadness, and no great gamer. For if he were, he would never be angry for an angry word spoken by a man that is on the losing side. It is an old courtesy at the cards, pardie, to let the loser have his words. And in good faith, in this matter I hear no such talking at all. And verily this device of his, to put this for a cause of division, is in my mind a very childish thing.

But then goeth he further: that priests make "particular confederacies" to "maintain" obits and priests' wages, and to "have more at burials" than they have been wont to have, "or else to show themselves not content"; that is to say, to ask more than they can get... and because they cannot get it, show themselves not content... that is to wit, lour and look angrily, and say they be not pleased. Be not these high matters and meet for that heinous name of "confederacies"?

And yet goeth he further, with another heinous confederacy—
that "if a priest have a business to do in some counties,
other priests will, as it is said, so confederate with him at arbitraments
and other meetings... or else make them such friends privily,
that the other party, though he be of right good substance and have
also good right... yet shall he sometimes have much ado to obtain it."

Is not here, good readers, a wonderful heinous work, and well worthy the name of confederacies of the spiritualty... that 25 but in some counties—nor there, neither, of any certainty, but as some say—some priests in the business of another priest will, and yet but sometimes neither, at arbitraments confederate with their good word to help forth their fellow, or else to make him friends? Yea, and then what a mischief he showeth that ensueth thereupon! The other party hath, he saith, much ado to obtain his right; and yet that but sometimes neither. But as for *lose* his right by their means, he saith not that any man doth. Be not these heinous confederacies, and things meet for this man to make a book of division for? And yet, as though

1 mortuaries: See note for 195/6. // be their duties: are debts owed to them 2 accursed: excommunicated 3 sadness: sedateness // gamer: gamester 6 *pardie*: by George 6–7 have his words: have his say; say whatever he wants to 8 device: scheme 9, 35 division: discord 9 mind: opinion 11 *obits*: annual memorial Masses 12 have more: receive more 15 lour: scowl 16 high matters: serious things 16, 34 *meet*: fit 20, 28 arbitraments: arbitrations 21 privily: secretly 22 be of right good substance: have quite good resources 24 wonderful: terribly // work: business 25 worthy: deserving of // spiritualty: clergy 29 fellow: colleague 30 mischief: calamity

he had very well acquitted himself, he knitteth it up with these words:

And these be some of the confederacies of priests that I meant of; and not the gathering together of the clergy at the convocations.

In good faith, I saw not how he should mean any other 5 thing, nor that neither well. For the name of "confederacies" taken to an evil part, as this man taketh it, doth signify a meeting and gathering together and a determination of certain evil folk, conspiring together about an evil thing to be done, with a covenant and promise by each of them 10 made unto other, each to stand with other therein. Now, whereas at convocations good men come together to do good, and therefore he could not call them confederacies, as he now saith he meant not to do—yet I doubted somewhat whether he so meant or not, because the convocations be at the leastwise common 15 assemblies together, whereof he might hap, I thought, to give a good thing an evil name. But these matters that he now speaketh of, I could not imagine that ever he meant to call them confederacies, wherein he neither seeth assemblies nor can assign and prove any conspiracy and mutual promise in assisting 20 each other about the procurement of anything at all, good or bad. For whereas he saith that these be "some" of the confederacies that he meant. I am sure no man doubteth but that these be either all the confederacies that he findeth, or else at the leastwise the greatest. And then are those that he calleth here "particular 25 confederacies" so childish that, in good faith, I much marvel that his heart could serve him for very shame to speak of them. And then the others, that he taketh for general confederacies—he neither seeth nor assigneth so much as any assembly about them, or promise or abetment to procure and 30 pursue them. And therefore—though some priests would here or there speak of them as their own affection leadeth them—this is far from the nature and name of confederacy. And yet, when he hath altogether done, while he proveth nothing at the uttermost (though all that he layeth were as 35

1 knitteth it up: finishes it off 3 meant of: was referring to 7 to an evil part: in a bad sense 9, 17 evil: bad 14 doubted: wondered 16 whereof: for which reason 19, 29 assign(eth): pinpoint(s) 27 serve: permit 27 for very shame: i.e., to be so shameless as 31, 35 though: even if 32 affection: inclination 34 altogether: the whole thing 34 while: since 35 layeth: alleges

10

15

20

25

30

true as it is not) but that they would fain have the tithe of timber still, and that they would fain have the mortuaries still, and that some would fain have greater wages, and some would fain have more money at the burials, than for all their fain willing they can get; when they would only *fain* have it, and yet indeed get naught of it, nor other folk nothing lose: to make now so great a matter of this and call it a heinous name of "confederacies" is, as meseemeth, somewhat like to him that would needs have an action against his neighbor because his neighbor's horse stood and looked over his hedge. For he said that he saw by his countenance that he would have eaten his grass if he could have gotten to it. For as for that that the hedge letted him, was little thank to him; for his will was never the less. And thus his nineteenth chapter, you see, good readers, how little reason is in it.

The Twentieth Chapter

His twentieth chapter, beginning in the 76th leaf, hath so little effect and substance in it, and so faintly defendeth his former matter which it pretendeth to defend, that I purpose to make no long work about it.

For if you read first his words as they lie in mine *Apology*, folio 159 (in the second side, beginning at these words "And here methinketh I might say"), ye shall there, good readers, find that I rehearse those words of his even whole, with those words in them which he would in the beginning of this his twentieth chapter make men believe that I had withdrawn—as though they were words of such substantial effect that I would not have it appear in my book that he had written so pithily.

Afterward, in another place where they be rehearsed again (folio 162), the printer of likelihood left them out of oversight and haste. And surely they be not of so great weight but that if the author had himself left them out in his book of *Division*, it had made little matter. And if he had, over that, left out the whole clause—then had he left in his book one lie the less, and his

1, 2, 3, 4 fain: love to 5 fain willing: strong wanting 6 indeed get naught: actually don't get any 7 so great a matter: so big a deal 8 meseemeth: it seems to me 11 his countenance: the look on his face 13 that that: the fact that // letted: prevented 13-14 was . . . him: he didn't deserve much credit for that 14 never: not at all 19 *pretendeth*: professes 24, 29 *rehearse(d)*: quote(d) // 24 even: quite 28 appear: be shown 30 of oversight: due to carelessness 32–33 had . . . matter: would have made little difference 33 over: beyond 33 *clause*: passage

10

15

20

book the better by so much. For whereby proveth he that the spiritual rulers pretend themselves to be so clean and pure that there is no default in them, but all in the people alone, and in themselves no manner fault at all? Where heard he ever any spiritual man say this, by the whole spiritualty or by any one man thereof?

They confess themselves to be men and sinners. And they confess and acknowledge also that the very cause of this chief mischief that now beginneth to make division—that is to wit, the execrable heresies which mischiefs this good man's evil devices with change of good laws were likely to maintain, if men would follow them—did both begin, and is also set forth and advanced forward, by those ungracious folk that are such among the spiritualty as Judas was among the apostles; and this not in this realm only, but in other countries too. As by Friar Luther, and priest Pomerane, Otto the Monk, and Friar Lambert, Friar Huessgen, and Zwingli; and here in England Tyndale, Friar Barnes, George Joye, and some others such as with the seed of seditious heresy have sown and set forth division.

This thing the spiritualty both knoweth and acknowledgeth.

And therefore they do *not* pretend, as this Pacifier saith they do, that there hath been no fault among them, but all among the people. And therefore this good man, where he saith that I left out three words in that clause of his (which yet I did put in indeed)—

himself had somewhat amended his matter, with leaving in of one lie the less, if he had left out the whole clause altogether.

As to that that he saith I changed his words in the end from these words, "the light of grace that is spoken of before 30 will not appear," into these words, "the light of grace that is spoken of before be with you now and evermore, amen": therein he saith very true. For since he was fallen into preaching, I not only in the first place rehearsed him as he spoke himself, but afterward also in the second place I took the pain for him 35

1 whereby: how 2 spiritual: Church 2, 22 pretend: profess 3 default: fault 5 spiritual man: clergyman // by: about 5, 14, 21 spiritualty: clergy 9, 20 division: discord 8 *very*: real; actual 9, 10 *mischief(s)*: evil(s) 11 evil: bad 11 were: would be 12 follow: go along with 13 ungracious: ungodly; wicked 16 Pomerane: Johannes Bugenhagen, who was from Pomerania; Luther called him "Doctor Pomeranus." 17 Otho the Monk: Otto Brunfels. // Huessgen: Johannes Oecolampadius. 25, 27 clause: passage; section 33 was fallen: had gotten 34, 35 place: (quoted) passage 34 rehearsed: quoted 35 pain: trouble

10

15

20

30

35

to amend his collation in that point and make it end somewhat more like a sermon, with a good, gracious prayer.

Then goeth he forth, and in the same leaf and the next following, he maketh a suspicious matter, and "cannot tell" what mind I was of in changing his word "spiritual rulers" into this word "prelates." But look, good readers, upon the place, and you shall see that I did it of good cause. For I do not there say that he *saith* "prelates," but I say there that peradventure he *will* say so. And also, besides this—that there is no very great difference between these words, the "prelates" and the "spiritual rulers"—the change from this word the "spiritual rulers" into this word "prelates" seemed me the more meet and more proper for the matter that the Pacifier speaketh in that place, where he speaketh of authority that they pretend, and obedience that they claim.

Howbeit, rather than I would give any cause of division against me, to him that useth to make great divisions upon small grounds... I shall be content to give him his own word again. And therefore I pray you, good readers, every of you amend your books... and in the stead of "prelates" in that place, put in "spiritual rulers." And when you so have done, the change shall for the matter not be very great... and yet so much as it shall be, shall more serve me than him.

But yet, to make me sorry that ever I was so far overseen as to take away his gay golden word of "spiritual rulers" from him,
he beginneth, as it were, with a great threat, and saith:

What Master More meaneth, to change these words "spiritual rulers" into "prelates," I cannot tell. But now, by occasion of the words that Master More hath spoken, I will say farther in the matter than I had thought to have done.

How happy was I, lo, that I had not the grace to let his own word stand! For now will he say farther in the matter than ever he had thought to have done! "And that is," saith he, "this":

... that I think verily that if so great an oversight fell into prelates and spiritual rulers that they would take upon them to preach heresy, that they would that the people should believe them therein... and to

1 collation: discourse 2 gracious: godly 4 maketh . . . matter: makes something out to be suspicious 5, 6, etc. word(s): term(s) 5, 10, etc. *spiritual*: ecclesiastical; clerical 6 upon the place: at the passage 7 of good cause: for good reason 8 *peradventure*: perhaps 9 so: that 12 me: i.e., to me // meet: fitting 14 pretend: claim to have 15 claim: demand as their due 16, 17 *division(s)*: dissension(s) 17 useth: is wont to 18 content: willing 19 again: back // pray you . . . every: ask of you . . . that each 24 overseen: out of line 25 gay: brilliant 26 great: big 31 *happy*: fortunate 35 oversight: obliviousness to what is right 37 would . . . believe: would have the people believe

10

15

30

take it to be Catholic that they preached. For who would preach anything but such as they would have their audience believe?

Believe me, good readers, that this man weeneth he saith well-favoredly in this point... wherein he taketh such pleasure that afterward (folio 79) he falleth into the same again, and saith thus:

[Master More] goeth about only to prove that all my tale is lost because prelates pretend not to be believed if they preach heresy, as he taketh it that I should say they do. And yet I said not so indeed. And if I did say so... I said but truly. For if they did preach heresy, it is certain that they would look to be believed, as I have said before; yea, and if they would preach and say that if they preached heresy, that they would the people should not believe them—yet if they did after preach heresy indeed, they would look that the people should believe them. For they would say that they were no heresies that they preached. For who will confess that he preacheth heresy?

Now, good readers, here have I joined you together this good man's gay words in two places wherein I perceive he pleaseth himself right well. But to the intent that you may see whether he have so good cause as he weeneth, consider well his words and mine before, whereupon he cometh to this point. For he maketh as though I without occasion given of his words had written that the prelates pretend not to be believed if they would preach heresy. Wherein whether he say true or not 25 you shall see by his own words, which are these:

The light of grace will not come as long as the spiritual rulers pretend that their authority is so high, and so immediate of God, that the people are bound to obey them, and to accept all that they do and teach, without arguments, resistance, or grudging.

Now, good readers, first consider well here, in these words of his, what wisdom the man hath showed in making such a mumbling of changing "spiritual rulers" into "prelates." For when he saith here that the "spiritual rulers" pretend that their

1 Catholic: orthodox 3, 21 weeneth: thinks 3 saith well-favoredly: speaks handsomely 7 all my tale is lost: all I've said is in vain 8, 24 pretend not: do not aspire 16 confess: admit 19 gay: brilliant 23 of: by 28, 34 pretend: claim 28 immediate of: straight from 29 bound: obliged 30 grudging: grumbling 33 mumbling of: muttering about

10

15

35

authority is so *high*—what doubt is there but though he mean other rulers more besides, whom he calleth no prelates, yet he meaneth prelates too... yea, and prelates *especially* too. And then when he saith that the prelates and the other spiritual rulers pretend this or that—may I not well say that he saith the prelates pretend this? Yes, verily that I may. And yet in so changing his word—I change it to his advantage and not into mine, in that I make his odious saying much less, and nothing more. And thus first you see, good readers, this man's much oversight in finding of that fault.

Now consider farther, good readers, that he saith in those words, not that the spiritual rulers (that is to say, both the prelates and all the remnant too) pretend their authority to be so high and so immediately derived from God that the people are bound to obey them in this thing or that thing, one, or twain, or ten, or twenty... but utterly to accept and obey not only all their teachings, but also all their doings, too... and neither argue, resist, nor grudge at any manner thing that they would either teach or do.

This general thing he saith. And therefore—though I deal, 20 as you see, so favorably with him in my twenty-seventh chapter of mine Apology as to divide the matter and ask whether he meant it by their whole authority or part—I might well upon these words of his have taken it that he had very shamefully belied them, and had said that they had pretended to have their whole authority immediately 25 of God, every whit. For if I would so have said... his general words would well have warranted mine. Also, since his saying is so general, and extendeth utterly not only to all their teachings, but also to all their doings, too... and saith that they pretend that by God's immediate ordinance the people should 30 accept altogether both all that ever they say and all that ever they do—by how many manner things might I have confuted his saying, and have proved it false?

But yet, his saying being such, I took but one thing... and that was such as, for the matter that we both specially spoke of, was next at

^{4, 5, 13} pretend: claim 5, 6 *may*: can 5, 23 well: rightly; justifiably 8 nothing: in no way 9 much: great // oversight: heedlessness; lack of consideration 13 remnant: rest 14, 25, 30 *immediate(ly)*: direct(ly) 14 *derived*: obtained 18 *grudge at*: grumble about 20, 27, 28 general: sweeping; generalizing 22 *matter*: thing // it by: by it 23 *upon*: on the basis of 24 belied: lied about 25, 30 pretend(ed): claim(ed) 26 of: from 35 specially spoke of: were speaking specifically about // next: nearest

10

15

20

25

hand. And therefore I said that they pretend not to have such an authority that men should obey them in *all* things... for they pretend not to have authority to bind men to believe and obey them if they would preach heresies; but they plainly profess that if they so would, men should not believe them nor obey them therein.

Here you see that where he saith that he meant not that the prelates *would* preach heresy, he speaketh all beside the purpose. For I said not that he either so said or so meant. But I said, and yet say, that in those words he said that *if* they would preach heresies, they do now pretend that by the authority which God hath given them, the people were then therein bound to believe and obey them. And in his so saying I there said and yet say that he saith very far untrue, and that they pretend it not, but plainly pretend the contrary. And thus in this point that he maketh a matter without ground or cause, and that himself with his own words gave me good occasion to write the thing that I wrote—this you see, good readers, proved very plain.

But now consider his other words wherein he liketh himself so well, and weeneth that he proveth that the spiritual rulers of the realm pretend that if they would preach heresy, the people were by God's ordinance bound to believe and obey them therein, because they would then say that it were no heresy. In this point his reasoning hath, I promise you, a little more subtlety than substance... and yet but simple subtlety neither.

First, as for his case, that if all "the spiritual rulers" would preach heresy—if he had meant of the spiritual rulers of all Christendom, I would have admitted his case none otherwise but as men put and admit a case impossible, to see what might some thereon if it were possible; as Saint Paul putteth the case that if an angel came from heaven and preached a contrary gospel, yet the same angel should not be believed. But, now, since he putteth it but by the spiritual rulers of one realm, I admit the case as possible... but yet as such a case as I trust in God this good man shall see the sky fall first and catch larks ere it happen, though

^{1, 3} pretend not: do not claim 8 he... purpose: everything he says is beside the point 11, 15, 22 pretend: claim 16 in... that: i.e., that in this point // a matter: an allegation 21 weeneth: thinks 21, 27, etc. spiritual: ecclesiastical; clerical 26 subtlety: craftiness 26 simple: foolish 28 meant of: meant 31–33: See Galatians 1:8–9.

10

15

20

it may be likely enough to happen in some one or twain, or some few, against whom the remnant shall preach and teach the truth.

But now saith this good man thus: "If it so happened in them all—then would they all pretend that by their authority given them of God, the people were bound therein to believe and obey them. For they would then say that their heresies were no heresies."

I am content, lo, to grant him all this... and I ask him now, what then? For all this, good readers, proveth (you see very well) no more but that if that case happened that they all so preached, they would then all so pretend. But all this proveth never a whit that the spiritual rulers either now do, or at any time have done, pretended their authority such. Now consider, then, for what purpose he speaketh of such pretending. He layeth (you wot well) their pretending of their authority to be so great that the people should obey them without argument, grudge, or contradiction in all that ever they either say or do. This he layeth, I say, for so sore a cause of this division which he maketh in his book, that he saith the light of grace will not come to cease it till they cease so to pretend.

And therefore, good readers, since this is the thing that he saith, and the purpose that he saith it for—making it a cause of division present—how can he maintain his saying with a case feigned, whereby it may be that they will so pretend hereafter... 25 whereas ever hitherto himself saith not nay but that they both have pretended and yet pretend the contrary? Can he maintain that the temporalty is at division with the spiritualty now, already, because it may peradventure hap hereafter, by a far-fetched possibility, that they may then, no man wotteth 30 when, pretend peradventure a thing whereof they presently pretend the contrary... and protest also that if the case should so mishap hereafter, they desire now for then that no man should therein then believe them? Saw you ever, good readers, any man with such a simple subtlety cast all his matter in 35 the dust so shamefully?

2 remnant: rest 5, 12, etc. pretend: claim 6 of: by 9 content: willing 10 what then: so what 12-13 never a whit: not one bit 15 layeth: alleges 16, 30 *wot(teth)*: know(s) 18 grudge: grumbling 19 sore: serious // division: discord 20 maketh: postulates 24 maintain: defend // saying: assertion 24–25 case feigned: hypothetical case 26 ever hitherto: always up till now 26 not nay: i.e., not otherwise 27 vet: still 28 temporalty: laity // spiritualty: clergy 35 simple subtlety: foolish craftiness // cast all his matter: throw his whole case

Now, where he saith, to maintain his matter here with, that "it is not to suppose that spiritual rulers will pretend that such authority as they have of the grant of princes is immediately . . . of God": I say that therein he saith truth, and that I suppose that they will not. But yet let himself look well in his own book of 5 Division, and he shall find that himself saith the contrary there of that he now saith here... and showeth some things which he both saith that they have but by the means of princes and the good mind of the people, and yet saith also that they pretend to have the same things immediately of God. As, for example, 10 both their authority to have the tenth part for tithe, and the thing which they enjoy by the name of the liberties of the Church, whereby their persons be in many things privileged in this realm before the person of a layman. These things himself saith that they have but by a mean and not immediately 15 of God. And yet he saith in this same twentieth chapter that the things which they call the liberties of the Church, they pretend to have immediately of God; and for all that, he saith now that it is not to suppose that they will pretend so. And thus you may see, good readers, that for the defense of this place, he is 20 driven to a shrewd narrow strait, when to defend one fault he is fain to make twain.

Now, whereas he saith I might have satisfied myself well enough, and that the letter of his words were plain—you see that in the rehearsing again of his own words (folio 80), he is fain to 25 suppress and steal away these his own general words, "all that they do or teach," to make his words *seem* plain. For as you see, they standing still, his words are plain against him. For himself now confesseth that they pretend not to do by authority immediate from God such things as they do by authority given 30 them by princes.

But because I would fain fully satisfy him—I shall now show you that with his new declaring that his words were well enough, he hath made his matter out of all measure worse.

For now read his words again (folio 80), and there you shall see that he saith that he meaneth only of such authority as the spiritual

```
2, 9, 17, 19 pretend: claim
                               3, 8, 31 princes: sovereigns
3, 10, etc. immediate(ly): straight; directly
                                               4, 10, 16, 18 of: from
                                                                         7 showeth: mentions
15 mean: intermediary
                           21 shrewd narrow strait: tough tight predicament
22, 25 is fain to: is forced to; has to
                                        24 letter: literal meaning(s)
25 rehearsing: quoting
                           26 general: sweeping; generalizing
28 standing still: remaining in effect
                                         29 confesseth: acknowledges
29 pretend not: do not claim
                                 32 would fain: would like to; wish to
33 declaring: explaining // well: proper
                                              34 matter: case
34 out of all measure: immeasurably
                                         36 meaneth: speaks
```

10

15

20

25

30

rulers pretend to have immediately of God. And yet after, he declareth it further and better, on the second side of the same leaf, in the fourteenth line, that he meaneth only such authority, not as they pretend to have, but as they have indeed, immediately of God. And to the intent men might see that he meaneth not of authority falsely pretended, but truly had immediately of God, he putteth for the example their authority in administration of the sacraments.

This is his own exposition of his own words, which he would have taken for so plain that he is angry with me that I could not spy it, and so satisfy myself before.

Well, go to, now: let us rehearse his own words again as himself for his own advantage (folio 80) rehearseth them, and let us plant in his own exposition with them, to make his sentence the more clear... and then shall we see to what good conclusion he bringeth all in conclusion. For then cometh his whole tale to this:

"As long as the spiritual rulers will pretend that their authority is so high and so immediately derived of God, in such things as they have their authority immediately of God indeed (as in the administration of the sacraments and such other things like), that the people are bound to obey them without argument or resistance: so long the light of grace will not appear."

Now, good readers, here be now his own words, with his own exposition therein. And how like you them now? For now the sentence hath he brought at last, with much work, to none other but that the light of grace will not appear as long as the spiritual rulers pretend to be obeyed and not resisted in the administration of the sacraments, and such other things like, because they have their authority therein immediately of God indeed. But then on the other side, whensoever they will not pretend their authority so high therein, nor so immediately derived of God, as to be obeyed therein, but will be content that men grudge and argue and resist them therein, and

1, 4, etc. pretend: claim// immediately of: straight from1 after: afterward2 declareth: explains9, 14, 25 exposition: explication12 go to: come on12, 13 rehearse(th): quote(s)14, 26 sentence: meaning16 tale: speech19 derived of: obtained from28 pretend: aspire34 grudge: grumble

10

15

20

25

30

35

pull them from the altar, and suffer them to administer no sacraments nor any such other things like—then shall, by this good man's new declaration, the light of grace appear by and by. Hath not this Pacifier here, good readers, with much labor at last brought this matter to a wise conclusion?

If he will now go from this again, and put in his other general words again... which for his advantage he left out in that place: then is all gone again that he goeth about... and all mine answer made (as I have showed you) good, and all his own words naught.

In the leaf also 81 these are his words:

... where I say that as long as the spiritual rulers will pretend that their authority is so high and so immediately derived of God that the people are bound to obey them without argument or resistance, etc. By these words I confess that they have authority immediately derived from God. But as I said before in the seventh chapter, Master More hath a right great and a right inventive wit, whereby he can lightly turn a sentence after his appetite. And so he doth here [etc.].

What high wit or inventive I have to turn a sentence, let the readers judge. But surely the height of my wit cannot reach so high as to perceive in those words of his the sentence that himself turneth them to... nor, I trow, no man's else... till these words, "They have authority," and these words, "They pretend to have authority," be both one thing, which they were never yet. And therefore *before* his confession that he now maketh here *new*, I might *then* well take that exception which I have brought there, to a little better effect than he doth his here, which, with all his wrestling and all his new declarations, bringeth altogether ever the longer unto the worse conclusion.

For now, to color this his oversight with, he telleth us which manner of pretenses he meant in those words which he would here so fain defend. And then, instead of "pretending to be by God's ordinance believed and obeyed in all things as well words as deeds," he bringeth forth here a few amounting in a sum total to the infinite number of four.

1 *pull*: remove // *suffer*: allow 2 by: according to 3 *declaration*: explanation 3 by and by: immediately 5 wise: brilliant 6 go from this again: go back on this 6–7 in . . . again: his other generalizing words back in 9 made . . . good: proved . . . valid 10 naught: worthless 12, 23 pretend: claim 17 wit: mind 18 *lightly*: readily 18, 19, 21 sentence: meaning 18, 19 *turn*: alter 18 after his appetite: as he pleases; to suit himself 24 one: the same 25 confession: admission; acknowledgment 26 new: for the first time // well: rightly 28 which: who // declarations: explanations 30 color: cover 30 this his oversight: this blunder of his 31 manner: kind // pretenses: aspirations 32 pretending: aspiring

10

15

20

25

30

35

The first is that the order and disposition of the "things that are to be disposed of the Church" be to be disposed by the priests: which point to put as for a matter that hath made division between them and us is a point of small reason, as far as my reason can give me. For I remember not of any variance that ever arose between them and us for that point.

The second is that all "princes must subdue their executions to bishops', and not to prefer them above them." I cannot tell you whether there be any such law made or not. But I can tell you well that though there be, this point will not serve his purpose the value of a blue point. For I am sure he never saw in his days any bishop in this realm use that pretense against the king, or that ever there arose any division thereupon.

The third is that "no charge should be set upon clerics by lay power." I never heard yet any division rise upon this point in my days; nor he neither in his, I dare say. For I never saw the day yet, nor he neither, but that when any need of the king and the realm required it, they have evermore been ready to set taxes upon themselves, as liberally and as largely as any man well might with any good reason require.

The fourth is, he saith, that "if a secular judge be negligent in doing of justice," that then, after "monition to amend it" given to the judge, "if he will not, then the spiritual judge may compel him to it, or else supply his room and hear the cause."

If I should look now for these four laws, it might peradventure happen that I should find that this man had mistaken some of them, as well as he hath misunderstood some of the others that he hath spoken of before. But since that I never knew grudge or division rise here upon any of them, me needeth never to look more for the matter. For since this man never saw that any spiritual judge hath enterprised in default of justice to give any such monition or to supply the room: were that law never so unreasonable, yet to say that upon that law the temporalty hath here conceived such grudge as it hath been a cause of division, this pacifier of division may be much ashamed that ever he devised it. For I dare say that as well this fourth cause as many of all his others be such as the people

```
1 disposition: regulation
                             2 disposed: regulated // of: by
3–4 made division: created dissension
                                          4 of small reason: that makes little sense
5 remember not of: can't think of
                                     6 variance: conflict // for that point: on that score
7 princes: sovereigns // subdue: subject
                                             8 executions: administrative actions
8 prefer them above: put them ahead of
                                           10 though: even if
                                                13, 16, etc. division: dissension
12–13 use that pretense: exercise that claim
21 reason: reasoning // require: ask them to
                                                  22 negligent: remiss
23, 33 monition: admonitory counsel
25 supply his room: discharge as a substitute his office; take his place // cause: case
27-28 mistaken some of them: gotten some of them wrong
                                                             30, 35 grudge: ill feeling
31 for the: i.e., into the 32 enterprised: undertaken
32 default: (a case of) failure
                                 34 never so: no matter how // upon: on the basis of
```

36 pacifier: appeaser 37 devised: came up with

10

15

35

never neither talked of nor thought upon... nor, before his own book, had never read nor heard of. And therefore by the putting in of such things, every child, as I said in mine *Apology*, may soon perceive that his books labor and intend not to quench but rather to kindle division.

And therefore verily—with his laying here, even in the end and conclusion, such causes of his division which causes but by himself the people never heard of—I may well say once again, good readers: is not this gear by this good Pacifier brought unto a wise conclusion?

To those words written in mine *Apology* (the 169th leaf), this good man answereth thus:

And now to this conclusion of Master More I will say thus: that I beseech Almighty God that the end of all these matters may come to this conclusion—that the very groundly causes of these divisions that now be not only in this realm, but also, in manner, through all Christian realms, may come to perfect knowledge. For surely I do not take it that they began either by heresies or apostasies, as Master More in his *Apology* meaneth that they should do.

Here you may see, good readers, that this good man would be loath that
it should appear that the division, peril, and harm have anywhere
sprung upon heresies begun and set forth by false apostates,
wedded friars and monks, as clearly as it is known that by the occasion
thereof, there have been slain in Almaine, within these very
few years, above eighty thousand persons in one summer, and yet since
among the Swiss, when Zwingli was slain, many thousands
killed too... and the war begun by the heretics, and
the lash by God's great goodness laid in their own necks—as
falsely as Frith belieth the Catholics and, against the plain
and open-known truth, would with shame enough to himself
make men ween that the Catholics began the war.

And if Master More will needly endeavor himself to hide the truth therein, as it seemeth he hath done in this chapter and divers other

But then goeth he further and saith:

places of his *Apology*, by keeping secret such abusions and pretenses

1 *upon*: about 9 *gear*: business 10 *wise*: brilliant 15 *very*: real

15 *groundly*: root 16 in manner, very nearly 19 meaneth; imagines

15 groundly: root 16 in manner: very nearly 19 meaneth: imagines 20 may: can 22 false: despicable 24 Almaine: Germany 27 begun: i.e., was begun 28 in their own necks: on their own shoulders 29 falsely: abominably // belieth: slanders 31 ween: believe 33 needly: painstakingly 34 divers: several 35 abusions: wrongdoings

35 pretenses: pretensions

10

15

20

25

30

as in my conscience have been most principal causes of this division, whereof part be recited in the said treatise and part in this answer, but not all . . .

Of these there had need indeed to be more, and some more true, and some of a little more substance, too, than be the most part of these that this good man hath laid forth yet.

Now, here he saith that I keep secret such abusions and pretenses as be the principal causes of the division, whereof himself hath, he saith, showed some—either he meaneth that those which I kept secret be those that himself hath written, or others besides them. If he mean others: then either himself knoweth them or not. If he know them not: how knoweth he that I know them, or that there be any such at all? If himself know them and show them not: then he hideth them and keepeth them secret himself as well as I. Now, if he mean but those that himself hath written: how can I keep those secret that he hath written? Can I both gather up all his books and go hide them, and also make them that have read them go unread them again, or forget what they have read?

But now after this, likewise as he is wont, when reason faileth him, to fall to preaching—so here, because reason faileth him, he falleth to praying... and therein thus he saith:

I beseech Almighty God that he have no power to do it, but that the truth may come to light therein, though he resist it all that he can. For if it were known... and the faults charitably reformed—all these divisions would shortly have an end.

Nay, pardie, this man seeth well enough that though the faults of the spiritualty were never so fully reformed, yet could not all that suffice to bring all divisions to an end but if one thing be done which will never be done, whereof (which he forgetteth) I gave him warning in the 116th leaf of mine *Apology*, in these words:

But now if this Pacifier, to cease and quench this division, *could* find the means to make all the whole clergy good: yet for all that—since

2 the said treatise: i.e., the Division 2–3 this answer: i.e., the Debellation 27 pardie: indeed 29 but if: unless 31 forgetteth: disregards 30–31 whereof... I gave him warning: to which... I called his attention

he layeth for causes of this division that some men say this by the clergy, and some men say by them that—were all the clergy never so good indeed, and served God never so well, this division, by his own tale, yet could not for all that cease... except he could provide farther that no piteous Pacifier should, in lamenting of division, put forth a book and say that some laymen say that some of the clergy be naught, and love their ease and their wealth... and that some say that those that seem best and take most labor and pain be but hypocrites for all that, and serve God but for vainglory, to get themselves laud and praise among the people.

10

5

Also, if defaults should be *charitably* reformed, as this man saith he would have them—it would be need, then, to set a little more charitable folk about it than those have been that have beguiled this good man with evil counsel in his books... and have made him, under pretext of pacifying division, set forth and increase division with devising and spreading abroad causes of murmur and grudge, making in some of them an elephant of a gnat, and for old grudges bringing forth some such as the people never had heard of till they read his books; and some of the very worst, which were most effectual causes if they were true, bringing forth by heaps with a figure of "some say," and very plain lies indeed. Is this the way, good readers, for a pacifier to make peace with, and put away divisions?

15

And now, himself handling the matter thus... he taketh of his charity great thought lest I go about to hinder his holy purpose. And therefore saith:

25

20

I doubt me very sore that Master More goeth about rather to mar all than to endeavor himself to make all well.

30

Which be the likelihoods now, good readers, that lead this good man into this great fear? Because I make open the shrewd mind of his demure countenance, and the harmful intent and purpose of his holy, wholesome words. Because I would have the temporalty and the spiritualty as the body and the soul of one man love well together and agree, and neither of

35

^{1, 3,} etc. *division(s)*: dissension(s) 1, 2 by: about 3 tale: account 4 except: unless 6 naught: wicked 5 piteous: pious / plaintive 11 *defaults*: failings 14 evil: bad 15 pacifying: settling 17 grudge: ill feeling 18 grudges: grievances 20 were: would be 21 effectual: valid 22 figure: figure of speech 28 doubt me very sore: very strongly fear 28-29 mar all: bring everything to ruin 30 which be the likelihoods: what are the indications 31 open: manifest 31–32 *shrewd mind*: devious purpose 32 countenance: demeanor 35 love well together: have a good mutual love // agree: live in harmony; get along

10

15

20

25

30

35

them be glad to hear evil of other, nor to give ear to false, seditious slander, but the good folk of either party draw both by one line, according to both the laws, to repress and keep under the bad... and, among other vices, especially such pestilent heresies as else would oppress the Catholic faith, and provoke the displeasure of God, and first sow division, and afterward rear rebellion in the realm, as they have done before this time both here and in other places; and that I to this intent give mine advice to keep still those good laws that both this realm and all the corps of Christendom have long used and approved. Because I thus do—lo, therefore this good man feareth that I go about to mar all.

But while his books go about, on the other side, to make the world ween that heresies be no causes of division; and, to have heretics live in the less fear, with many malicious "some say"s falsely slandereth the ordinaries of cruel, wrongful handling of the people, to drive them, by dread or by shame or other tedious business, to let heretics alone; and go about with bald reasons, the best not worth a rush, to put away the good laws that have been made against them; and under color of a fervor to the faith, exhort men to go win the Holy Land... and in the meanwhile yet, with such wily ways, labor with heretics to fill up the streets at home, and by the decay of the Christian, Catholic faith, provoke the wrath of God upon all our heads, which our Lord rather turn upon theirs that so would have it: his books busily going about this gear, himself goeth about (ye see well, pardie) to make allthing well.

But now will I finish up his twentieth chapter, wherein he goeth forward thus:

And in this chapter Master More layeth divers other objections to prove the said letter unreasonable, which were very tedious to rehearse at length. And therefore I shall as shortly as I can... touch some of them.

Ye know well enough why they be tedious to rehearse. Surely because they be very tedious to answer. But whereas he saith he will rehearse some of them—he beginneth first to show that I had no

```
2 slander: vilification
                         3 both the laws: i.e., civil and ecclesiastical
6, 14 division: discord
                          10 all the: the whole
                                                  12 mar all: bring everything to ruin
13 side: hand
                 14 ween: believe
                                      16 slandereth: accuses
                                                                 18, 31, 34 tedious: irksome
18 business: trouble 19 bald reasons: flimsy arguments // rush: straw
19 put away: do away with
                              20 color: pretext
                                                   23 decay: erosion
                                                                          26 gear: stuff
27 pardie: by George 31 letter: text (see 201–202) // were: would be
32, 34, 36 rehearse: relate 32 shortly: briefly // touch: discuss
```

10

cause to doubt of his words wherein he saith that the spiritual rulers pretend their authority to be so high and so immediately derived from God, etc. I had, saith he, no cause to doubt of what authority he meant. For he saith that his words were plain enough, that he meaneth only of such authorities as they pretend to have immediately from God.

To this I say plainly that then are his words plain false. For his words be that they "pretend that their authority is so high and so immediately derived from God that the people are bound to obey them, and to accept all that they do and teach, without argument, resistance, or grudge." Now knoweth every man very well that they do not pretend to have authority immediately from God to do allthing that they now lawfully do and may do in which the people are now bound to accept and obey them. For as I said in mine *Apology*, in many such 15 things they pretend and claim their authority derived from princes. And therefore ye see that and he labor about it this seven years, he can never defend his words, but that I answered him truly... and, with the necessary distinction that I there made, answered every part. And this himself seeth well enough... 20 and therefore in the 80th leaf, in the beginning of the second side, where he rehearseth his words again, he leaveth out these words of his own: "and to accept all that they do and teach." Upon which words the point of the matter hangeth. And therefore here you see now that, whereas in the beginning of 25 this chapter, he would make it seem that I steal two or three words of his (which I neither did nor needed for any strength that was in them), here was himself fain to steal away his own words, to beguile the reader upon the reading of the place, and make him pass over his fault for the while 30 unmarked.

And thus, good reader, you see that to save his own words upright, and to impugn mine—in those two leaves 80 and 81 he bestowed his labor in vain.

- 1, 3 doubt of: be in doubt about 1 spiritual: ecclesiastical
- 2, 6, etc. pretend: claim; profess // immediately: directly
- 3, 9, etc. *derived*: (to be) obtained 5 *meaneth*: is speaking 10, 14 bound: obliged 17 princes: sovereigns // and he: if he 11 *grudge*: grumbling 19 *truly*: rightly
- 22 rehearseth: quotes 26 *steal*: surreptitiously remove 28 fain: constrained
- 32-33 save his own words upright: make his own statements stand 30 fault: error

But then goeth he farther and toucheth these words of mine *Apology*, written in my said twenty-seventh chapter, folio 165:

Surely in such things as the whole clergy of Christendom teacheth and ordereth in spiritual things, as be divers of those laws which this Pacifier in some places of this book toucheth, being made against 5 heretics... and albeit that they be, and long have been, through the whole corps of Christendom, both temporalty and spiritualty, by long usage and custom ratified, agreed, and confirmed, yet he layeth some lack in them, calling them very sore: in those things I say that—since I nothing doubt in my mind but in that congregation to God's honor 10 graciously gathered together, the good assistance of the Spirit of God is, according to Christ's promise, as verily present and assistant as it was with his blessed apostles-men ought with reverence, and without resistance, grudge, or arguments, to receive them. And if a provincial council err... there are in Christ's church ordinary ways to reform 15 it. But in such things as any spiritual governors, after a lawful order and form, devise for the spiritual weal of their souls that are in their charge, and which things are such as good folk may soon perceive them for good: in these things, at the leastwise, should the good not give ear to the bad folk and froward, that against the best 20 thing that can be devised can never lack a fond froward argument.

To these words this good man answereth me thus:

Then to show my mind in some things that Master More hath touched yet farther in the said chapter: I will first agree with Master

More... that in such things as the whole clergy of Christendom

25 teacheth and ordereth in spiritual things... and which of long time have been by long usage and custom through the whole corps of

Christendom, spiritualty and temporalty, ratified, agreed, and confirmed, ought with reverence to be received; but yet if the same things, through long continuance and through abusions that rise

30 by occasion of them, prove hurtful and over grievous to the people to bear—then may the people grudge and complain lawfully to their superiors... and desire that they may be reformed... as lawfully as they may do to have temporal laws reformed when need requireth.

7, 28 temporalty: laity // spiritualty: clergy 1 toucheth: discusses 5 toucheth: criticizes 8 layeth: alleges // lack: defect 9 sore: sorry / harsh 10 nothing doubt: have no doubt 11 graciously: piously; devoutly 14 grudge: grumbling // receive: accept 15 ordinary: regular; conforming to order and rule 16 after: according to 17 weal: well-being // their souls that: the souls of those who 20, 21 *froward*: perverse; contrary 21 fond: foolish 24 touched: discussed 30 abusions: abuses 31 *over*: too 32 *grudge*: grumble 33 desire: request 34 temporal: civil

20

25

As unto this, because he is so genteel to agree with me, I shall as genteelly agree with him again; but yet he getteth naught thereby.

For since the laws against which he writeth, made for the correction of heretics, as I have in the fifteenth, sixteenth, and seventeenth chapters plainly proved against him (and reproved his objections therein), be good and very reasonable; and that abusions (by occasion whereof he would make it now seem that in long continuance they become hurtful) he proveth not one in this world but by false, slanderous "some say"s surmised against the ordinaries, and divers times found false before the King's honorable Council: this answer here of his helpeth nothing his matter.

Then goeth he farther and saith in this wise:

I will also agree that in the congregation of the clergy, to God's honor graciously gathered together, the good assistance of the Spirit of God, according to Christ's promise, will be as verily present and assistant with them as it was with his blessed apostlesif they order themselves in meekness and charity and put all their trust in God, as the apostles did. But if they will trust in their own wit and in worldly policy—then may they lightly lose the Spirit of God. And whether it were so at the making of the laws which Master More speaketh of concerning heresy or not, I cannot tell; but this will I say: that if they were not good and reasonable in themselves at the first making, that they were never made by the assistance of the Spirit of God. And surely I cannot then see how the usage and long continuance of them can ratify or confirm them. For as it is of an evil custom, that the longer it is used, the greater is the offense: so is it of an evil law. And like as an evil custom is to be put away, so it is of an evil law.

Of what strength the general councils be, and whether we
may in any of them by lawful order gathered together put any
diffidence or mistrust—and if we may, then in what manner
things, and in what wise they bind, and whom, and how long—I shall
not need for this matter to dispute with this good man. And all
his doubt concerning the said laws, whether they be reasonable
or not, and whether the continuance of them be good or

1 to: as to 2 again: in return // getteth naught: gains nothing
4 correction: punishment 5 reproved: proved erroneous 6 abusions: abuses
8 hurtful: harmful 9 surmised: trumped up
12 helpeth nothing his matter: in no way helps his case 18 order: conduct
20 policy: cunning // lightly: well 26, 28, 29 of: with 27, 28, 29 evil: bad
28 put away: done away with 30 general: ecumenical

10

15

20

not: in all these things have I so confuted this good man already, that these words of his can serve of naught. But yet, to make it seem that he said somewhat... and that no law of the Church which he hath here impugned, made against heretics, was either ratified or approved in this realm—ye shall hear how properly he proveth. Lo, good readers, these are his words:

And the laws affirmed by usage and agreement of the people be the laws of fasting and keeping of holy days, and such others as the people of their free agreement accept and agree unto; but these laws made for punishment of heresies were never agreed by a common assent of the people, but that some particular persons—whereof some have been guilty... and some peradventure not guilty—have been punished thereby right sore against their wills. And that cannot be a confirmation of them that so agree against their will. But as to them that do the correction, it is a confirmation; for they do it with their good will. And though that correction were a sufficient confirmation as against them that be so punished—yet it cannot be a confirmation

I cannot see, therefore, that any ratifying, agreeing, or confirming of the people can be proved in those laws concerning the correction for heresy.

to make the law approved for all the residue of the people.

Did ever any man, good readers, hear such another reason as this is? He denieth not but that the suit ex officio, and the order taken in the general council, and the other farther 25 proceedings against heretics according to the common-received spiritual laws, have been, usually, long accustomed in this realm; and by the princes of the same and generally by all the people by common usage accepted—and over that, by plain Parliament laws and orders made for all temporal officers to assist 30 the ordinaries therein, and to put the offenders in execution thereupon—and knowing well all this, he dissembleth it every whit, and saith not one word thereto... but argueth that it was never ratified in this realm, because the heretics that are for heresy punished be burned against their will, and 35

2 serve of naught: be of no use 3 said somewhat: said something; i.e., had something there 6 properly: admirably 11 agreed: acquiesced to 14 right sore: quite strongly 15, 20 of: by 15 agree: acquiesce 16, 17, 21 *correction*: punishing 16–17 with their good will: quite willingly 17 though: even if 18 as against: with respect to 27 usually: generally speaking 23 reason: argument 28 princes: sovereigns 31 in execution: into the legal system; i.e., under arrest 32-33 dissembleth it every whit: ignores every bit of it

10

15

20

agree not themselves thereto. This reason will I never labor to confute. For if any man be so mad to like it, I were almost as mad as he if I would reason with him.

After this he resorteth again to the unreasonableness of the laws... and proveth them unreasonable by the sentence of his own conceit. For these are his words:

And then whether the laws in themselves be good and indifferent or not, I will remit the judgment in that behalf to them that have authority. But to show my conceit therein, I shall with good will, even as my conscience moveth me to; and that is, that I could never see that it was reasonable to be accepted as a law... that a man should be accused and know not his accuser. And that it is yet more unreasonable that a man should be condemned... and know not the witness that condemned him. Also, that a man upon suspicion should be driven to make his purgation at the will of the ordinary or be accursed; or that a perjured witness should condemn him that he had cleared before; that a great offender and a less offender should have one like punishment, if they renounced, or be alike arrested and put in prison: I never saw no indifference in it.

Now, good readers, as for the "conceit" that the good "conscience" of this man hath conceived, is of very truth but even a very poor conceit... as in the said chapters the fifteenth, the sixteenth, and the seventeenth every man may soon perceive.

Howbeit, in the last point that he findeth so great a fault—
that a greater offender and a less offender should have one
like punishment—this man looked not well about him when he
wrote that word. For when the thing is well looked on... the
weight of his reason will fall upon the wrong side, and all
against his mind. For wheresoever a greater offender and a
less offender be both punished alike: if the greater offender
have no more pain than the less hath deserved, there is the
order somewhat less sharp than it should be... but yet not
unrighteous. For if it were, then were the laws of this realm
unlawful that hang up him that doth but rob a man as

1 reason: reasoning // will I never labor: I will make no effort
2 to like: as to approve of // were: would be 5 sentence: verdict
6, 9, etc. conceit: thinking 9 show: make known
9 with good will: quite willingly (do) // even: just 15 accursed: excommunicated
19 indifference: impartiality; lack of bias 21 is: it is // even: only
27 word: assertion 28 reason: argument 31 have . . . pain: get no more punishment
32 order: established procedure // sharp: severe

10

15

20

25

30

35

well as him that robbeth him and killeth him too. Now, so is it in the spiritual law that when two do both renounce their heresy, and abjure and bear faggots both, if the one held ten heresies and the other but twain, the greater offender hath no more pain than the less deserveth. And therefore if this man in that case complain—this complaint (as I said) turneth on the other side... and findeth the fault in that that where the less offender beareth one faggot, the greater beareth not five, if their bodies be like of strength.

Howbeit, good readers, all this tale of his is to no purpose at all. For in the spiritual law, they weigh the offenses... and consider the circumstances, and enjoin the penance after the weight or gravity of the trespass... and for imprisoning, use to put no man to it but where good reason would not suffer him walk abroad. And therefore I suppose... that when the man was writing this... his wit was walking toward the Holy Land. For if he would say that he meaneth by the less offender and the more offender such twain as abjure both, and bear faggots both, where the one was worthy and the other not worthy at all: I say that neither his words will maintain any such meaning (for he speaketh generally of the less offender and the more), nor also he proveth none such but by his slanderous "some say"s, which have been plain proved false.

Then goeth he further and knitteth up all the chapter with this goodly conclusion:

And if any man will say that these reasons will give a boldness to heretics—truly, I will not fully make answer thereto. But this will I say: that I think verily that they will give a boldness to truth and true men. And verily I have heard say that it were better to suffer an offender go unpunished than to punish him unrighteously and against due order of justice.

Mark, good readers, here, for our Lord's sake, what manner of reason this is. The thing that himself very well perceiveth to be the very weight and pith of all the matter, and therefore at last objecteth it against himself, as a thing that had need to be assoiled: what answer doth he make unto it? He saith he will not

¹² after: according to 14–15 suffer him walk abroad: allow him to be at large 19, 20 worthy: deserving (of this punishment) 20 maintain: support 24 knitteth up: finishes off // all the: the whole 26, 33 reasons(s): argument(s) 27 truly: actually 28 truth: orthodoxy; right thinking / truthfulness; honesty / uprightness 29 true: orthodox; right-thinking / truthful; honest / upright 30 unrighteously: unrightly 36 assoiled: refuted

10

15

20

25

30

answer it "fully." In faith, that is spoken very dully. Well, since so great weight hangeth on it, if he would not answer it fully, he should have answered at the leastwise half. If not half, a fourth part yet, or a fifth part at the least. For this that he saith answereth no part at all. For two things he saith: one, that though he cannot say nay but that his reasons, if they be followed, shall give a boldness to heretics—yet he thinketh they shall also give boldness to troth and true men. And by my troth, I think verily on the other side—that if heretics have boldness given them, and (as they thereby soon shall) take courage and much increase, they shall make the troth shrink, and many true men afeard. And if the giving boldness to falsehood shall give boldness to troth—assay, then, and give boldness to thieves... and then look whether true men shall wax the bolder by it.

The second thing that he saith is this—which yet he doth not affirm, but saith he hath heard it said—that "it were better to suffer an offender go unpunished than punish him unrighteously and against due order of justice."

This were somewhat prettily said, if this good man had proved that heretics might not be punished by those laws but unrighteously and against the order of justice. But then how hath he proved that? By no means in this world but twain. The one, that it is not righteous nor indifferent that a greater offender and a less offender should be punished, imprisoned, or arrested alike; which unreasonable reason oppugneth plainly, in all criminal causes almost, all the laws of this realm, and yet helpeth not his matter, but impaireth it much, as a little herebefore I have well and clearly proved.

His other reason is his general reason that is his whole ground whereupon he buildeth against all those laws all his whole matter: that is to wit, that by those laws which are made for punishment of heretics, it may sometime fortune that a man may be punished which is no heretic indeed.

1 dully: inexactly; imprecisely 7 followed: gone along with 8, 13 *troth*: uprightness / right thinking 8, 12, 14 true: upright / right-thinking 8–9 *by my troth*: upon my honor 11 troth: right thinking; orthodox belief 18, 22 unrighteously: unrightly 13 assay: go ahead 14 look: see 15 wax: become 20 were: would be // prettily: aptly 21 might: could 24 righteous: right 24 indifferent: fair 26, 30 reason: argument 26 *unreasonable*: irrational 27 causes: cases 28, 32 *matter*: case 29 well and: quite 26 *oppugneth*: assails 31 *all his whole*: his whole entire 33 *fortune*: happen

10

Now is this reason so unreasonable to be laid for a reason to take away a law, that if it were admitted for reason, it could suffer neither in this realm nor in any realm else any law stand in this world that all the wits in this world could imagine or devise for any manner punishment of ungracious folk. And albeit that of such laws some may be reformed from the worse unto the better... though never fully to such point but that an innocent may take harm: yet, both by reason and experience, it appeareth plainly that these laws which he would have changed and made more easy can never have any good change but by making them more strait.

And thus hath this good man sore overseen himself more, I trow, than twenty times in his twentieth chapter.

The Twenty-first Chapter

In his twenty-first chapter (beginning in the 84th leaf), because

I said in mine *Apology* that there be few parts in his book of *Division* that shall, if they be well considered, appear so good at length as they seem to some men at the first sight and at superficial reading, he provoketh me to show what other faults I find therein. And then, to prick me forward, he

bringeth forth two or three things which he saith it seemeth most likely that I should mean. But wherefore it should be most likely that I should mean those things... thereof showeth he nothing...

but leaveth folk occasion to think that his own mind misgiveth him in those things. For me hath he never

25 heard make any business of them.

And afterward, in the leaf 91, again he provoketh me to the same. And there he reciteth how many chapters of his I meddle not with; wherein he might have made a shorter work if he would have let them stand that I touched not... and have spoken 30 of them only that I touched—for they were very few—as he that was very unwilling to have touched any one at all, save for the much evil that covertly was cloaked in them. And for the withdrawing of that cloak, that men might the better see what it meant, I touched the first chapter for a show, and the seventh and 35

5 ungracious: wicked 10 easy: soft 11 strait: severe 12 sore overseen himself: badly blundered 13 trow: think 19 provoketh: challenges 19 show: tell 20 faults: flaws // prick me forward: egg me on 22 wherefore: why 23 thereof showeth he: on that he says 25 misgiveth him in: makes him apprehensive about 26 business of: to-do about 27–28 provoketh . . . same: issues to me the same challenge 28 reciteth: lists // meddle: deal 30, 31, etc. touched: discussed 35 a show: an example

10

15

20

25

30

the eighth for that they labored, to the great decay of the Catholic faith, to put away or change into worse the most especially good laws, both of the whole Church and of this realm, that have been made and observed long for the preservation thereof. And the first chapter was in effect nothing else but by false, slanderous surmises against the ordinaries (as though they mishandled men for heresy) a shrewd preparative to it. And therefore, leaving his other trifles alone—I answered in effect only these, of which so much harm might grow. Which things if they had been out of his book, all the remnant, good and bad together, should have gone forth for me; and therefore yet so shall they. For I purpose not to embusy myself with confuting of every fault that I find in every man's book. I should have then overmuch ado.

Nor I will not dispraise or deprave anything that I think good either in his book or in any man's else. And therefore I have in mine *Apology* said expressly that he saith some things well. But forasmuch as there be many things naught, too: I give therefore the reader warning not to walk away with them over-hastily, but read them with judgment and advise them well... and not believe every spirit, but prove whether it be of God or not... and that that is good, take... and that that is evil, let it go to the devil.

I well allow, therefore, and like not a little, the great good mind of Salem toward the vanquishing of the great Turk... and conquering of the Holy Land, wherein he spendeth the other three chapters of his book. But I mislike much, again, that as he would dilate the faith by force of sword in far countries hence—so he laboreth to change and take away the good and wholesome laws whereby the faith is preserved here at home.

I like also marvelously well that such points of the Catholic faith as heretics now labor to destroy, as praying to saints, pilgrimage, and purgatory, and the sacraments, and especially the Blessed Sacrament of the Altar, whereof in the 86th leaf he speaketh so well that, as help me

1 for that: because // decay: detriment 2 put away: do away with 7 shrewd: devious; cunning 10 grow: come 11 remnant: rest 11–12 for me: for all I cared 13 fault: flaw 15 dispraise: deprecate 15 *deprave*: disparage 18 naught: bad 21 advise: consider; reflect on 21 prove: test 23 evil: bad 24 allow: approve of 27 mislike: dislike 28-29 far countries hence: countries far away from here 28 *dilate*: spread 31 *marvelously*: extremely 35 as: so

35

God, it did me good to read it—this, I say, liketh me marvelously well: that the right faith of these points, he confesseth so well and so fully for his own person. But the better opinion that I have of his own person therein, the more sorry am I to see that his books are, by some shrewd counsel, handled in such wise as if they were followed... would make the faith decay and perish in many other folk. This is the great thing that in his books grieveth me.

For as for the point that he speaketh of in the leaf 91, of that that the priests should eat no flesh from Quinquagesima to Easter: 10 I take it for a matter as small as he doth. But then he asketh me wherefore in the thirty-first chapter of mine Apology, beginning in the 175th leaf, I make so great a matter of it. Whoso list to read the chapter shall see that I wrote it not all in vain, nor show myself unwilling that the priests should do it, neither, 15 though they be not bound to it. But the less that the weight of the matter was... the more cause this man gave me to speak thereof. For the more was he to blame to put that, and other such small matters as that is, for causes of so great a division as he surmiseth that this is. This was, lo, the cause that made me to speak 20 thereof. Which cause this man gave himself... and therefore needeth not to marvel as he doth, wherefore I spoke thereof.

And therefore thus have I, good readers, now replied to every chapter of his book by row, save only the last three, which go about a good voyage into the Holy Land, a great way far off 25 from me. And I have not leaped to and fro, now forward, now backward, in such manner as he playeth in his answer made unto me, without either order kept or cause appearing wherefore, save only the cause that every man may spy: that he would not have it seen what places he left untouched. Which is, in a manner, the most part of altogether that in my book is touched of the three chapters of his. And I have, on the other side, not left any one piece unproved that myself spoke of before, or that anything pertained unto me.

And therefore whereas, in the beginning of the twenty-second chapter, Simkin Salem giveth his sentence upon the said answer

```
2 faith of: belief concerning
1 liketh: pleases
                                                    5 shrewd: bad
6 followed: gone along with
                               7 decay: disintegrate
                                                        10 flesh: meat
10 Quinquagesima: the Sunday before Ash Wednesday
                                                          12, 22, 28 wherefore: why
13 whoso list: whoever cares
                                16 though: even if
                                                       19 division: discord
20 surmiseth: alleges
                         24 by row: in order, one after another
                                                                  30 places: passages
30 untouched: undiscussed // in a manner: as it were
                                                          31 most: greater // altogether: all
31 touched: discussed
                                           33 unproved: unexamined // anything: at all
                          32 side: hand
36 Simkin: Simple Simon // sentence: pronouncement
```

10

15

20

25

30

35

to the said apology, and alloweth the said answer well: methinketh that if he considered not only how much he hath left unanswered, and how much of his own words undefended which he nothing hath touched at all... but over that, how feebly he hath defended those things that he hath touched here—Salem being indifferent had been like to have allowed it but a little.

For, setting aside for the while all the remnant, if he go but to the very principal point alone—wherein he laboreth to change and put away those good laws... the change whereof (such as he deviseth) the decay of the Catholic faith and the increase of heresies would follow—in that point alone, I say we lay against him the common consent of this realm. And he layeth his own reason against it. We lay against him the consent of the general council. And against this he layeth his own reason. We lay against him the general approbation of all Christian realms. And against this he layeth his own reason. And what is his own irrefragable reason that he layeth against all this? Surely no more, as you see, but that by those laws an innocent may sometime take wrong. Against this reason we lay him that if this reason should stand, then against malefactors there could no law stand. We lay against it also that by his devices, if they were followed, by the increase of heresies many innocents must needs take much more wrong.

To this answereth he that he will not answer that. And now, when Salem seeth that he *cannot* answer that, and seeth that all the weight of the matter hangeth upon that: then Sim Salem giveth sentence that he hath answered very well. But surely if such answering be well... I wot not which way a man might answer ill.

And therefore whereas Simkin Salem saith that if this good man will, he will cause a friend of his answer all the remnant—he may do this good man a much more friendly turn if he make his friend answer this better first, that this good man hath answered already. Howbeit, if they list thus to

1 alloweth: accepts 2 methinketh: it seems to me 4 *nothing*: in no way 6 *indifferent*: impartial; unbiased // had been like: would have been likely 11 decay: decline 6 *allowed*: praised 8, 33 remnant: rest 10 put away: do away with 14, 16, etc. *reason*: reasoning 18 *irrefragable*: irrefutable 20, 24 take: suffer 21 malefactors: evildoers 20, 24 wrong: injustice 23 followed: gone along with 27, 31 Sim(kin): Simple Simon 29 wot: know 28 sentence: pronouncement 31–32 if . . . man will: if this good man wants (him to) // cause: have 33 *may*: can 35 list: choose

10

15

20

give over this, and assay what they can say better to any other piece—let them in God's name hardily go to, for me. And if they say anything meetly to the matter, I will put no friend to pain to make them answer... but at leisure convenient shall answer them myself. And where they say well... I will not let to say so. And where they say wrong... I will not let to tell them. But on the other side, if they go no better to work, nor no nearer to the matter, than this man hath done—I shall peradventure let them even alone... and let them like their writing themselves, and no man else.

But now letting pass all the special points—I shall answer the generalities that this good man speaketh of. For in the leaf 90 these are his words:

And now shall I say somewhat farther in a generality, as Master More hath done... and that is this: that all that I speak in the said treatise was to *appease* this division... and not to begin any, nor to continue it. And therefore how they can salve their conscience that say I did rather intend a division than agreement, I cannot tell; their own conscience shall be judge. And I intended also somewhat to move that might be occasion to put away abusions, evil examples, and heresies—and not to increase them or maintain them, I dare boldly say.

To this I answer that it neither was nor is my mind that men should think that he meant evil himself, as I have in many places of mine *Apology* testified. But verily I thought, and yet

25 think, that by some wily shrews his book was so mishandled that *it* meant naught though *he* meant well. For whereas he saith that with his book of *Division* all his purpose was to appease division—I will not contend with him upon his own mind. But surely this will I say: that if I had been of the

30 mind to sow and set forth division—I would have used even the selfsame ways to kindle it that he used (as he saith) to quench it.

Then goeth he farther and saith:

2 go to: get to work; have at it // for me: for all I care 1 assay: see 3 meetly: fairly 3, 8 *matter*: point 4 pain: trouble 5, 6 let: forbear 9 let them even: just let them 4 *convenient*: suitable 11 special: specific 14 *somewhat*: something 16, 28 appease: settle 16, 18, etc. division: discord 19-20 somewhat to move: to propose something 20 put away: put an end to // abusions: abuses // evil: bad 21 maintain: support 24 evil: ill 26 shrews: scoundrels 27 naught: badly 28 all his purpose: his whole intention 31 even: exactly

And farther, as Master More knoweth better than I, "Mentire est contra mentem ire"; that is to say, "To lie is when a man saith against his own mind." And in good faith, in all that treatise, I speak nothing but that I thought was true.

To this I answer that indeed such a thing I have read,
and, as I remember, in Aulus Gellius. Which thing though I
have now no leisure to look for, yet two points I remember
thereof. One, that it is there "mentiri," and not "mentire"... which
infinitive mode in what book of grammar this good man hath
found, I cannot tell. I was afeard it had been overseen in the
printing. But I have looked the corrections, and there
find I no fault found therein.

The other point I remember: that there is a difference put between "mentiri" and "mendacium dicere"; that is, as we might say, between him that wittingly lieth and him that telleth a 15 lie weening that it were true. And there it is said, "Wittingly not to tell a lie pertaineth to a good man. And not to tell a lie unawares is the part of a wise man." And surely, since the Scripture saith that he that shortly believeth is over light: this good man to believe so many lies so soon, and with so many "some say"s 20 to set them forth in print, to the rebuke and slander of the spiritual judges, and make men ween they mishandled men for heresies—though the man's innocent mind made the sin the less, yet was the thing at the least no less than a very great lightness; yea, and also a great proof toward the 25 reproof of his words that follow next, where he goeth farther thus...

And farther, I will ascertain Master More, as far as in me is, that I neither had any "subtle shrews' counsel" nor *any* evil counsel at the making of the said treatise which he calleth the "book of 30 *Division*" (as is said before).

To this I answer that albeit this good man and I be at much variance here in divers things—yet for the good and plain profession of the Catholic faith that I find in him, in good faith I much better love him than in that point to believe

35

3 all that: that whole 11 looked: checked 10 overseen: i.e., a mistake made 15 wittingly: knowingly 16-17 wittingly not to: not to knowingly 17 pertaineth to: is a part of being 18 part: province 18-19: See Proverbs 14:15; 2 Thessalonians 2:1-3; 1 John 4:1. 19 shortly believeth: is quick to believe // over light: too unthinking 21 slander: vilification 22 spiritual: ecclesiastical // ween: think // mishandled: mistreated 25 *lightness*: unthinkingness 26 *reproof*: disproof; refutation 28 ascertain: assure 33 *variance*: disagreement 35 in good faith: in all sincerity

him. For if he said therein true, then were all the faults only his own... in which, as I have often said, I much rather think that some subtle shrews have deceived him.

And besides sundry other things that lead me so to think,
one very strong thing is this, that every man may well
5 see by his book: that all such as have resorted to him to tell him
any such things as under "some say"s he put out again, have
always told him evil... and never told him good. And of mishandling
for heresies have ever told him lies, and never
told him true. For whereas the punishment for heresies
hath been very little anywhere, save even here at hand—and
here but right done to them, and that with much favor, too—
they have made him, good, seely soul, believe that ordinaries
mishandle men for heresy in manner throughout the realm.

Also, whereas such slanderous clamor hath been sundry 15 times of late, in all that ever complained, plainly proved false before the King's most honorable Council, not one man came to tell him nothing thereof, nor not one "some say" thereof written in all his book; and over this, whereas mine own self have plainly told him the same things in mine Apology by writing— 20 yet (which most marvel were of all, save for such wily shrews) every man may well see that he never read it. For he saith not one word thereto. And therefore it is easy to perceive, whatsoever himself say, which is loath of his goodness to put other folk in fault, that there be some wily shrews so much about 25 him that they neither suffer him anything to hear but that themselves list to tell him, nor yet anything to read but where themselves list to turn him.

And now, since I have here answered these generalities of
his—I will not long encumber you with any generalities of mine
own, but generally I would that all were well. And so help me my
Savior, and none otherwise, but as I would wish no heretic one
halpworth harm, that had clearly left his heresy and were
well turned to God. But on the other side, whoso stick still
therein: rather would I wish him sorrow to his sin, whereby

35
there are many folk many times amended, than prosperously
to proceed in his mischief to the loss of his own soul and

6 resorted: gone 11 save even here at hand: except right here close by 13 seely: simple 14 *in manner*: practically 15 slanderous: defamatory 16 complained: filed charges 19 over: on top of 20 by: in 21 most marvel were: would be the most amazing thing 24-25 other folk in fault: blame on other folk 22 *may*: can 26 suffer . . . that: allow him to hear anything but what they 27, 28 list: choose 27 yet: even 33 *halpworth*: halfpenny's worth (of) 33 *clearly*: completely 33 left: given up 35 sorrow to: physical suffering for 37 mischief: evildoing

20

25

other men's too. And toward that point, against all malefactors in the spiritualty and the temporalty too, would I wish all good folk of both parties to agree, and each love other well, and stick fast to the faith, which were likely sore to decay by the change of these good laws that this good man goeth about to

destroy. For whose unreasonableness therein the better to be perceived, with the danger and peril that would ensue thereon: I will desire you, good readers, to resort to mine *Apology*... and beginning at the leaf 270, read unto the leaf 287, wherein you shall, I trust, be well and fully satisfied. And

unto all that ever is in all that spoken—this man hath nothing said.

And whereas in confuting the faults that this man findeth in the suit *ex officio* and the laws made against heretics, I have used some examples of the common law, which this man hath labored to prove unlike... and I have therein clearly confuted him afresh: it may peradventure happen that he will now take another way therein, and say that in such points those spiritual laws may be reformed, and those temporal, too.

Howbeit, if he so say: but if men forget what hath been said before, else shall they see that his saying will not serve him.

For first, as I have said ofter than once already, the same things in the common law be not to be changed. For if they be, there shall come thereof more harm than good. And if it happen one innocent to take harm by the law—there shall five for one take more harm by the change.

Moreover, if we should for that cause change those temporal laws—that is to wit, because some innocent may sometime

30 take harm by them—we must change, by the same reason, all that old-used law that a man may be arrested, and remain in prison till he find sureties for the peace, upon the bare oath of his enemy that saith he is afeard of him. For by that law may sometime an innocent take harm too. And yet must that

35 law stand if we do well. For else shall there, by the change, more innocents take more harm.

1 malefactors: evildoers 2 spiritualty: clergy // temporalty: laity
4 were . . . decay: would likely be badly eroded 8 desire: ask // resort: go
10 well and: good and; quite 19 spiritual: ecclesiastical 19, 29 temporal: civil
21 but if: unless 22 saying: assertion 24 ofter: more often
27, 28, etc. take: suffer 31 reason: reasoning
32 all . . . law: that whole law in force from of old 33 sureties for the peace: bond posters
33 upon the bare: merely upon the

10

15

20

25

What trouble have there many men in Wales, by that they be compelled to be bound to the peace, both for themselves and for their servants and other friends too? And yet is the order there so necessary that in many lordships it may not be forborne.

And surely if we fall to changing laws upon that simple ground—we must then change so many that it would not be well.

Besides this, if men should reform and change a law because that an innocent may sometime take harm thereby—then must they when they have changed it, change it yet again... and after that change, yet change it again... and so forth, change after change, and never cease changing till the world be all changed at the Day of Doom. For never can all the wits that are in it make any one penal law... such that none innocent may take harm thereby.

Howbeit, if a new law were drawn and put forth to be made against any such mischief as would else do much harm: good reason it were to take an exception to the bill, and show that innocents might be much harmed by this point or that... and therewith provide the remedy and put it in the law, and stop as many such gaps as then could be spied. Yea, and if after the law made, men found notable harm, that good folk were much wronged by it... and the law such that it either might be forborne or else the means found to be changed to the better: good reason would it to make provision for it.

But surely to come forth as this man cometh here, against so good laws, so well made, and by so great authority, so long approved through the whole corps of Christendom, in this realm ratified specially by Parliament (and that upon a proof not without great ground and cause), ever since found so profitable for preservation of the faith, and proved so necessary, upon this man's own devices, that without great increase of heresies they cannot be forborne... nor never can be changed but either to the straiter or else to the worse—to 35 come now forth and, for appeasing of division, sow first a

2 bound to the peace: served with restraining orders 3 friends: acquaintances 3 order: established procedure 6 fall to: start 6–7 simple ground: sole basis 10, 16 take: suffer 14 the Day of Doom: Judgment Day 19 good reason it were: it would make good sense // take an exception: add a caveat 19 show: state 23 made: i.e., was made 25, 34 forborne: dispensed with 26 good reason would it: good sense it would be 30 specially: expressly 35 straiter: more severe 36 appeasing of division: settling of dissension

10

15

20

25

slander that may *make* division; and then labor to change those laws, upon none other ground but only that an innocent may hap to take harm by means of false judges; and then prove not any wrong done... but by false "some say"s only, against which false "some say"s the truth is proved contrary, both by just examination before the King's Council and, over that, plainly by this one point also, which no man can deny... that there is no law provided against so great a crime, by which lawless people have in this realm been punished—therefore to come now thus, as this good man doth, and procure the change of these laws so old, so good, and so necessary, and to make them more easy, wherewith heretics would wax bold, which thing himself (as you see) denieth not in the end: what is this, good Christian readers, but to procure that the Catholic, Christian faith might fade and fall away?

And yet, as for this man himself, to tell you for conclusion what I think: albeit there are, as you see, right evil and perilous things in his books, with devices that would make heresies increase—yet since he professeth so plainly the Catholic, Christian faith, and by his exhortation also toward the conquest of the Holy Land, declareth his mind zealous and fervent toward it, I rather believe, though himself thereto say nay, that in those things which he writeth so perilous and so naught, some wily shrews beguile the good, innocent man, than that himself in his own mind mean all that harm.

But yet, forasmuch as in this point, without sight of man's heart, we can but go by guess... and whoso goeth by guess may be deceived (for, as himself saith, a wolf may look simply,

lapped in a sheep's skin), I shall therefore trust the best, and leave the truth to God. And concerning such evil writings, since it must needs be that he wrote them either deceived by some shrews or else but of himself... I can no more do for him but heartily pray for him thus. If shrews deceive him:

God send them shortly from him. If he wrote them of his own mind: then, since the things be naught, he wrote them

3 false: corrupt 8–9 a crime: i.e., that of making slanderous allegations 12 easy: soft 13 wax: grow 22 declareth: shows 25, 37 naught: bad 25, 35 shrews: scoundrels 26 mean: intend 29–30 be deceived: make a mistake 30 look simply: have a guileless appearance 31 trust: believe 32 evil: bad 37 mind: accord

either of evil will or of oversight. If he wrote them of malice: God give the evil man more grace. If he wrote them of folly: God give the good man more wit.

And thus I beseech our Lord send us every one, both the spiritual and the temporal too, both wit and grace to agree together 5 in goodness, and each to love other, and each for other to pray... and for those that of both parties are passed into purgatory, and there pray for us as we pray here for them, that they and we both, through the merits of Christ's bitter Passion, may both with our own prayers and the intercession 10 of all holy saints in heaven, avoiding the eternal fire of hell, have pity poured upon us in the very fire of purgatory, which in those two places verily burneth souls. And finally, for our faith and good works, which his grace (working with the wills of those that wit have) giveth each good man here: 15 God give us in heaven, together, everlasting glory.

Printed by W. Rastell in
Fleet Street in Saint
Bride's Churchyard, the
year
of
our Lord
1533.
Cum privilegio... 25

1, 2 evil: bad 3, 15 wit: sense 5 agree together: get along with one another 25 cum privilegio: with due authorization